On the formation of highly oxidized pollutants by autoxidation of terpenes under low temperature combustion conditions: the case of limonene and α-pinene.

Roland Benoit 1, Nesrine Belhadj1,2, Zahraa Dbouk1,2, Maxence Lailliau1,2, and Philippe Dagaut1

1CNRS-INSIS, ICARE, Orléans, France, roland.benoit@cnrs-orleans.fr, nesrine.belhadj@cnrs-orleans.fr, zahraa.dbouk@cnrs-orleans.fr, maxence.lailliau@cnrs-orleans.fr, dagaut@cnrs-orleans.fr
2Université d’Orléans, Orléans, France

Correspondence: Roland Benoit (roland.benoit@cnrs-orleans.fr)

Abstract.

The oxidation of monoterpenes under atmospheric conditions has been the subject of numerous studies. They were motivated by the formation of oxidized organic molecules (OOM) which, due to their low vapor pressure, contribute to the formation of secondary organic aerosols (SOA). Among the different reaction mechanisms proposed for the formation of these oxidized chemical compounds, it appears that the autoxidation mechanism, involving successive events of O₂ addition and H-migration, common to both low-temperature combustion and atmospheric conditions, is leading to the formation of highly oxidized products (HOPs). However, cool flame oxidation (~500-800 K) of terpenes has not received much attention even if it can contribute to atmospheric pollution through biomass burning and wildfires. Under such conditions, terpenes can be oxidized via autoxidation. In the present work, we performed oxidation experiments with limonene-oxygen-nitrogen and α-pinene-oxygen-nitrogen mixtures in a jet-stirred reactor (JSR) at 590 K, a residence time of 2 s, and atmospheric pressure. Oxidation products were analyzed by liquid chromatography, flow injection, and soft ionization-high resolution mass spectrometry. H/D exchange and 2,4-dinitrophenyl hydrazine derivatization were used to assess the presence of OOH and C=O groups in oxidation products, respectively. We probed the effects of the type of ionization used in mass spectrometry analyses on the detection of oxidation products. Heated electrospray ionization (HESI) and atmospheric pressure chemical ionization (APCI), in positive and negative modes were used. We built an experimental database consisting of literature data for atmospheric oxidation and presently obtained combustion data for the oxidation of the two selected terpenes. This work showed a surprisingly similar set of oxidation products chemical formulas, including oligomers, formed under the two rather different conditions, i.e., cool flame and simulated atmospheric oxidation. Data analysis indicated that a subset of chemical formulas is common to all experiments independently of experimental conditions. Finally, this study indicates that more than 45% of the detected chemical formulas in this full dataset can be ascribed to an autoxidation reaction.
1 Introduction

Terpenes are emitted into the troposphere by vegetation (Seinfeld and Pandis, 2006). They can be used as drop in fuels (Harvey et al., 2010; Mewalal et al., 2017; Harvey et al., 2015) which could increase emissions via fuel evaporation and unburnt fuel release. Biomass burning and wildfires can also release terpenes and their products of oxidation into the troposphere (Gilman et al., 2015; Hatch et al., 2019). Wildfires temperature ranges from 573 to 1373 K (Wotton et al., 2012), which covers both the cool flame (~500-800 K) and intermediate to high temperature combustion regimes. Products of biomass burning have been characterized earlier (Smith et al., 2009). Using van Krevelen diagrams, the authors reported H/C versus O/C in the ranges 0.5 to 3 and 0 to 1, respectively. Whereas a large fraction of these products can derive from cellulose, hemicellulose, and lignin oxidation, their formation via terpenes oxidation cannot be ruled out. In a more recent study (Gilman et al., 2015), it was reported that biomass burning emissions were dominated by oxidized organic compounds (57 to 68% of total mass emissions). Wildfires are getting more and more frequent and their intensity increases. In large wildfires, there are many updrafts which can transport a variety of materials ranging from gases to particulates, and even bacteria (Kobziar et al., 2018). Furthermore, it was recently demonstrated that recent wildfires in Australia produced smoke which could reach an altitude of 35 km (Khaykin et al., 2020). Such events could contribute to ozone destruction (Bernath et al., 2022) but also to tropospheric pollution.

Cool flame oxidation is dominated by autoxidation (Bailey and Norrish, 1952; Benson, 1981; Cox and Cole, 1985; Korcek et al., 1972) which involves peroxy radicals (ROO•). Autoxidation is based on an H-shift and oxygen addition which starts with the initial production of ROO• radicals. This mechanism can repeat itself several times and lead to recurrent oxygen additions to form highly oxidized products (Wang et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2018; Belhadj et al., 2020; Belhadj et al., 2021a; Belhadj et al., 2021b): R• + O2 ⇄ ROO• (first O2-addition); ROO• + O2 ⇄ 'OOOH (H-shift); 'OOOH + O2 ⇄ 'OOOOH (second O2-addition); 'OOOOH ⇄ HOOC•OOH (H-shift); HOOC•OOH + O2 ⇄ (HOOC)2'O2O' (third O2-addition); (HOOC)2'O2O' ⇄ (HOOC)2'O'O2'O (fourth O2-addition); etc. There, the formation of highly oxidized products (HOPs) was mainly attributed to autoxidation reactions (Belhadj et al., 2021c; Benoit et al., 2021).

In atmospheric chemistry, it is only relatively recently that this pathway has been considered (Vereecken et al., 2007; Crounse et al., 2013; Jokinen et al., 2014; Berndt et al., 2015; Jokinen et al., 2015; Berndt et al., 2016; Iyer et al., 2021). Also, it has been identified that highly oxidized molecules (HOMs), a source of secondary organic aerosols (SOA), can result from autoxidation processes (Wang et al., 2021; Tomaz et al., 2021; Bianchi et al., 2019).

Modeling studies complemented by laboratory experiments showed that autoxidation mechanisms proceed simultaneously on different ROO• radicals leading to the production of a wide range of oxidized compounds in a few hundredths of a second (Jokinen et al., 2014; Berndt et al., 2016; Bianchi et al., 2019). Recent works have shown that, under certain atmospheric conditions, this autoxidation mechanism could be competitive with other reaction pathways involving ROO• radicals (Bianchi et al., 2019), e.g., the carbonyl channel (ROO• → R• + O + OH), the hydroperoxide channel (ROO• + HOO• → ROOH + O2 and RO• + 'OH + O2), disproportionation reactions (ROO• + R'OO• → RO• + R' + O2 and R• + O + R' + O2), accretion reactions (ROO• + R'OO• → ROOR• + O2), similarity, in terms of observed chemical formulas of products from cool flame oxidation of limonene and atmospheric oxidation of limonene has been reported recently (Benoit et al., 2021). The same year, Wang et al. showed that the oxidation of alkanes follows this autoxidation mechanism under both atmospheric and combustion conditions.
conditions (Wang et al., 2021). Also, that work confirmed that internal H-shifts in autoxidation can be promoted by the presence of functional groups, as predicted earlier (Otkjær et al., 2018) for ROO’ radicals containing OOH, OH, OCH₃, CH₃, C=O, or C=C groups.

To further assess the importance of these pathways, available data must be compared along with their experimental specificities. In laboratory studies conducted under simulated atmospheric conditions, oxidation occurs at near-ambient temperatures (250-300 K), at atmospheric pressure, in the presence of ozone and/or •OH radicals, the NO₃ radical, or the chlorine radical (to name but a few) and with low initial terpene concentrations. In combustion, the •OH radical, temperature, and pressure are driving autoxidation. Initial reactant concentrations are generally higher compared to atmospheric conditions, so as to compensate for the absence of ozone and initiate oxidation, since terpenes, as other hydrocarbons, react very slowly with O₂. Rising temperature increases isomerization rates and favors autoxidation, at the expense of other possible reactions of ROO’ radicals. Indeed, it has been reported earlier that a temperature rise from 250 to 273K does not affect the distribution of HOMs (Quéléver et al., 2019) whereas Tröstl et al. suggested that the distribution of HOMs is affected by temperature, α-pinene or particle concentration (Tröstl et al., 2016). Similarly, the experiments of Huang et al. performed at different temperatures (223 K and 296 K) and precursor concentration (α-pinene 0.714 and 2.2 ppm) suggested that the physicochemical properties, such as the composition of the oligomers, can be affected by a variation of temperature (Huang et al., 2018). The broad range of chemical molecules formed and the impact of the experimental conditions on their character remains a subject for atmospheric chemistry as well as for combustion chemistry studies. Whatever the mechanism of aerosols formation, i.e., oligomerization, addition, or accretion, their composition will be linked to that of the initial radical pool (Tomaz et al., 2021).

In low-temperature combustion, when the temperature is increased, fuel’s autoxidation rate goes through a maximum between 500 and 670 K, depending on the nature of the fuel (Belhadj et al., 2020;Belhadj et al., 2021c). In low-temperature combustion chemistry as in atmospheric chemistry, the oxidation of a chemical compound leads to the formation of several thousands of chemical products which result from successive additions of oxygen, isomerization, accretion, fragmentation, and oligomerization (Benoit et al., 2021;Belhadj et al., 2021b). The exhaustive analysis of chemical species remains, under the current instrumental limitations, impossible. Indeed, this would consist in analyzing several thousands of molecules using separative techniques such as ultra-high-pressure liquid chromatography (UHPLC) or ion mobility spectrometry (IMS) (Krechmer et al., 2016;Kristensen et al., 2016). Nevertheless, it is possible to classify these molecular species, considering only CₓHᵧOᵶ compounds, according to criteria accessible via graphic tools representation such as van Krevelen diagrams, double bond equivalent number (DBE), and average carbon oxidation state (OSc) versus the number of carbon atoms (Kourtchev et al., 2015;Nozière et al., 2015). Such postprocessing of large datasets has the advantage of immediately highlighting classes of compounds or physicochemical properties such as the condensation of molecules (vapor pressure), the large variety of oxidized products (CₓHᵧO₁₋₁₅ in the present experiments) and the formation of oligomers (Kroll et al., 2011;Xie et al., 2020).

In addition to the recent studies focusing on the first steps of autoxidation, a more global approach, based on the comparison of possible chemical transformations related to autoxidation in low temperature combustion and atmospheric chemistry, is needed for evaluating the importance of autoxidation under tropospheric and low-temperature combustion conditions. In order to study the effects of experimental conditions on the diversity of...
chemical molecules formed by autoxidation, we have selected α-pinene and limonene, two isomeric terpenes among the most abundant in the troposphere (Zhang et al., 2018). Limonene has a single ring structure and two double bonds, one of which is exocyclic. α-pinene has a bicyclic structure and a single endo-cyclic double bond. These two isomers with their distinctive physicochemical characters are good candidates for studying autoxidation versus initial chemical structure and temperature. For α-pinene, in addition to the reactivity of its endo-cyclic double bond, products of ring opening of the cyclobutyl group have been detected (Kurtén et al., 2015; Iyer et al., 2021), which could explain the diversity of observed oxidation products. This large pool of oxidation products is increased in the case of limonene by the presence of two double bonds (Hammes et al., 2019; Jokinen et al., 2015).

The present work extends that concerning the oxidation of limonene alone (Benoit et al., 2021). Here, we oxidized α-pinene and limonene in a jet-stirred reactor at atmospheric pressure, excess of oxygen, and elevated temperature. We characterized the impact of using different ionization techniques (HESI and APCI) in positive and negative modes on the pool of detected chemical formulas. The particularities of each ionization mode were analyzed to identify the most suitable ionization technique for exploring the formation of autoxidation products under low-temperature combustion. H/D exchange and 2,4-dinitrophenyl hydrazine derivatization were used to assess the presence of hydroperoxy and carbonyl groups, respectively. Chemical formulas detected here and in atmospheric chemistry studies were compiled and tentatively used to evaluate the importance of autoxidation routes under both conditions.

2 Experiments

2.1 Oxidation experiments

The present experiments were carried out in a fused silica jet-stirred reactor (JSR) setup presented earlier (Dagaut et al., 1986; Dagaut et al., 1988) and used in previous studies (Dagaut et al., 1987; Benoit et al., 2021; Belhadj et al., 2021c). We studied separately the oxidation of the two isomers, α-pinene and limonene. As in earlier works (Benoit et al., 2021; Belhadj et al., 2021c), α-pinene (+), 98% pure from Sigma Aldrich and limonene (R)- (+), >97% pure from Sigma Aldrich, were pumped by an HPLC pump (Shimadzu LC10 AD VP) with an online degasser (Shimadzu DGU-20 A3) and sent to a vaporizer assembly where it was diluted by a nitrogen flow. Each terpene isomer and oxygen, both diluted by N2, were sent separately to a 42 mL JSR to avoid oxidation before reaching 4 injectors (nozzles of 1 mm I.D.) providing stirring. The flow rates of nitrogen and oxygen were controlled by mass flow meters. Good thermal homogeneity along the vertical axis of the JSR was recorded (gradients of < 1 K/cm) by thermocouple measurements (0.1 mm Pt-Pt/Rh-10% wires located inside a thin-wall silica tube). In order to observe the oxidation of these isomers, which are not prone to strong self-ignition, the oxidation of 1% of these chemical compounds (C10H16) under lean fuel conditions (equivalence ratio 0.25, 56% O2, 43% N2), experiments were carried out at 590 K, atmospheric pressure, and a residence time of 2 s. Under these conditions, the oxidation of the two isomers is initiated by slow H-atom abstraction by molecular oxygen. The fuel radicals react rapidly with O2 to form peroxy radicals which undergo further oxidation, characteristic of autoxidation. A 2 mm I.D. probe was used to collect samples. To measure low-temperature oxidation products ranging from early oxidation steps to highly oxidized products, the samples were bubbled into cooled acetonitrile (UHPLC grade ≥99.9, T= 0°C, 250 mL) for 90 min. The resulting solution was stored in a freezer at -15°C. The stability of the products was verified. No detectable changes in the mass spectra were observed after more than one month which is consistent with
previous findings (Belhadj et al., 2021c). UHPLC conditions were: C18 column and mobile phase containing water-ACN mix at a flow rate of 250 μL/min (gradient 5% to 90% ACN, during 33 min).

2.2 Chemical analyses

Analyses of samples collected in acetonitrile (ACN) were carried out via direct sample instillation (rate: 3μL/min and recorded for 1 min for data averaging) in the ionization chamber of a high-resolution mass spectrometer (Thermo Scientific Orbitrap® Q-Exactive, mass resolution 140,000 and mass accuracy <0.5 ppm RMS). Both heated electrospray ionization (HESI) and atmospheric chemical ionization (APCI) were used in positive and negative modes for the ionization of products. HESI settings were: spray voltage 3.8 kV, vaporizer temperature of 150°C, capillary temperature 200°C, sheath gas flow of 8 arbitrary units (a.u.), auxiliary gas flow of 1 a.u., sweep gas flow of 0 a.u.. In APCI, settings were: corona discharge current of 3μA, spray voltage 3.8 kV, vaporizer temperature of 150°C, capillary temperature of 200°C, sheath gas flow of 8 a.u., auxiliary gas flow of 1 a.u., sweep gas flow of 0 a.u.. In order to avoid transmission and detection effects of ions depending on their mass inside the C-Trap (Hecht et al., 2019), acquisitions with three mass ranges were performed (m/z 50-750; m/z 150-750; m/z 300-750). The upper limit of m/z 750 was chosen because of the absence of a signal beyond this value. It was shown that no significant oxidation occurred in the HESI and APCI ion sources by injecting a limonene-ACN mixture. The optimization of the Orbitrap ionization parameters in HESI and APCI did not show any clustering phenomenon for these two isomers. The parameters evaluated were: injection source - capillary distance, vaporization and capillary temperatures, applied difference of potential, injected volume, flow rate of nitrogen in the ionization source. Positive and negative HESI mass calibrations were performed using Pierce™ calibration mixtures (Thermo Scientific). Chemical compounds with relative intensity less than 1 ppm to the highest mass peak in the mass spectrum were not considered. Nevertheless, it should be considered that some of the molecules presented in this study could result from our experimental conditions (continuous flow reactor, reagent concentration, temperature, reaction time) and to some extent from our acquisition conditions, different from those in the previous studies (Deng et al., 2021;Quéléver et al., 2019;Meusinger et al., 2017;Krechmer et al., 2016;Tomaz et al., 2021;Fang et al., 2017;Witkowski and Gierczak, 2017;Jokinen et al., 2015;Nørgaard et al., 2013;Bateman et al., 2009;Walser et al., 2008;Warscheid and Hoffmann, 2001;Hammes et al., 2019;Kundu et al., 2012).

Operating with continuous flow reactor, elevated temperature, and high initial concentration of reagents allows the formation of combustion-specific products, which does not exclude their possible formation under atmospheric conditions. To assess the formation of products containing OOH and C=O groups, as in previous works (Belhadj et al., 2021a;Belhadj et al., 2021b), H/D exchange with D2O and 2,4-dinitrophenyl hydrazine derivation were used, respectively.

3 Data Processing

High resolution mass spectrometry (HR-MS) generates large datasets which are difficult to fully analyze by sequential methods. When the study requires the processing of several thousands of molecules, the use of statistical tools and graphical representation means becomes necessary. In this study, we have chosen to use the van Krevelen diagram (Van Krevelen, 1950) by adding an additional dimension, the double bond equivalent (DBE). The DBE number represents the sum of unsaturation and rings present in a chemical compound (Melendez-Perez et al.,
The interest of this type of representation is to be able to identify more easily the clusters (increase of the DBE number at constant O/C and H/C ratios)

$$\text{DBE} = 1 + C - H/2 - O$$

This number is independent of the number of O-atoms, but changes with the number of hydrogen atoms. Decimal values of this number, which correspond to an odd number of hydrogen atoms, were not considered in this study. Then, duplications of chemical formulas in the O/C vs. H/C space are eliminated. The oxidation state of carbon (OSe) provides a measure of the degree of oxidation of chemical compounds (Kroll et al., 2011). This provides a framework for describing the chemistry of organic species. It is defined by the following equation:

$$\text{OSe} \approx 2 \frac{O}{C} - \frac{H}{C}$$

4 Results and discussion

We studied the oxidation of α-pinene and limonene (C_{10}H_{16}) at 590 K, under atmospheric pressure, with a residence time of 2 s, and a fuel concentration of 1%. Under these conditions, the formation of peroxides by autoxidation at low temperature should be optimal (Belhadj et al., 2021c), even if the conversion of the fuels remains moderate.

4.1 Characterization of ionization sources

First, we have studied the impact of APCI and HESI sources, in positive and negative modes, on the chemical formulas detected. The HESI and APCI sources in positive and negative mode were used and their operating parameters were varied, i.e., temperature, gas flow and accelerating voltage (see Section 2). For each polarity, only ions composed of carbon, hydrogen (even numbers) and oxygen were considered. Molecular duplicates inherent to mass range overlaps were excluded. Chemical formulas with relative intensity less than 1 ppm with respect to the highest mass peak of the mass spectrum were not considered. By following these rules, we obtained a different number of ions depending on the ionization source and the polarity used. Table 1 shows the number of ions according to the experimental conditions and the discrimination rules.

**Table 1. Number of ions detected for each source in positive and negative modes (by protonation or deprotonation, respectively)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ionization source</th>
<th>α-Pinene</th>
<th>Limonene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APCI</td>
<td>646 (R+H)^+</td>
<td>503 (R-H)^-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HESI</td>
<td>594 (R+H)^+</td>
<td>693 (R-H)^-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each combination of ionization sources and polarity generated a set of chemical formulas. To make a meaningful comparison between the positive and negative ions data, the chemical formulas used were the precursors of the ions identified in the mass spectra. These sets have common data, but also specific chemical formulas. For a given ionization source, ~50% of the chemical formulas are common to both polarities, i.e., between 30 and 50% of molecular species are ignored when using a single polarity (since some of them are ionized under a single mode (+or-) depending on their chemical structure). Then, it is essential to use both polarities in order to better describe
all the detectable species. The HESI source data were compared to the APCI data (Supplement, Tables S1 and S2), showing an increase of the number of chemical formulas detected by 20 to 30%. This increase is characterized by a better detection of negatively ionized species and those with a higher unsaturation number (DBE). In order to evaluate further the interest for using these ionization sources, we compiled these data in Venn diagrams and proposed a visualization of these sets with a van Krevelen representation; we added the number of DBE in the third dimension (Supplement, Tables S1 and S2).

In positive ionization mode, independently of the ionization source and in addition to the common molecular formulas, we detected products with an O/C ratio < 0.2 whereas in the negative ionization mode, we detected molecular formulas with an O/C ratio > 0.5. In addition to these observations, we noted that HESI is more appropriate for studying products with a large number of unsaturation (DBE > 5), probably related to the increase in the number of hydroxyl groups. Finally, for an optimal detection of the oxidation products, it is necessary to consider the transmission limits of the C-Trap. Here, we could increase by more than 60% the number of molecular formulas detected using several mass ranges for data acquisition (section 2.2). The most appropriate ionization polarity to be used is tight to chemical functions present in products to be detected. We could increase by 30 to 100% the number of chemical formulas detected by using both positive and negative ionization modes. Using HESI is consistent with previous findings indicating ESI is well suited for the ionization of acidic, polar, and heteroatom-containing chemicals (Kekäläinen et al., 2013). To illustrate the present results, HESI (‒)–MS spectra are provided in the Supplement (Fig. S1).

4.2 Autoxidation products detected in a JSR

In order to compare the oxidation of α-pinene and limonene, we compiled the positive and negative ionization data obtained with APCI (Table S1) and HESI (Table S2) ionization sources to obtain a more exhaustive database. For the APCI and HESI sources, we distinguished three datasets, two of which are specific to the oxidation of α-pinene and limonene and one which is common to both isomers. In the following text, "only" will be used to describe the molecules specific to the oxidation of one of the isomeric terpenes. This common dataset represents more than 77% of the chemical formulas identified in the α-pinene oxidation samples detected with APCI. For limonene, for which the number of identified chemical formulas is greater, this common dataset represents over 93% of the chemical formulas detected after APCI ionization. In these two cases, the relatively low residence time (2 seconds) and the diversity of the chemical formulas obtained show that the oxidation of these two terpene isomers leads to ring opening, a phenomenon also observed in atmospheric chemistry (Berndt et al., 2016; Zhao et al., 2018; Iyer et al., 2021). Concerning the products molecular formulas common to both isomers, Figure 1 shows that they are limited to 10 oxygen atoms. This limit is linked to α-pinene whose oxidation beyond 10 oxygen atoms remains weak (less than 2% of the totality of the identified molecules for this isomer). In the case of limonene, the presence of an exocyclic double bond will increase, in a similar way to atmospheric chemistry (Kundu et al., 2012), the possibilities of oxidation and accretion. It remains however impossible, considering the size of the whole and the diversity of the isomers, to formalize all the reaction mechanisms. Nevertheless, the formation of oxidized species can be described with the help of graphical tools. The number of oxygen atoms per molecule indicates that limonene oxidizes more than α-pinene (Fig. 1a). In the case of limonene, with a HESI source, an oxygen number of up to 15 is measured, with maximum counts recorded for 10 O-atoms (Fig. 1c), whereas it remains mostly less
than or equal to 10 for α-pinene (Fig. 1b). Moreover, for the products specific of limonene oxidation, this graph shows a distribution centered on 11 oxygen atoms with carbon skeletons probably resulting from accretion.

**Figure 1**: Distribution of α-pinene and limonene autoxidation products as a function of their oxygen content (ionization source: HESI, combined positive and negative modes data). (a) α-pinene and limonene HESI(+/-), (b) α-pinene HESI(+/-), (c) limonene HESI(+/-)

To verify this accretion hypothesis, we can plot the OSc as a function of the number of carbon atoms or the O/C ratio at fixed number of C-atoms (Fig. 2). One can visualize the evolution of the molecular oxidation for each carbon skeleton and the formation of oligomers. Species that are unique to one of the isomers, or common to both are differentiated using different colors. In addition to the autoxidation represented by the vertical axis for a given number of carbon atoms (Fig. 2a), we observe mechanisms of fragmentation (C<10), accretion and oligomerization (C>10). These reaction mechanisms contribute to forming classes according to the size of their carbon skeleton. The increase in the number of oxygen atoms, but also of carbon atoms will decrease products volatility. Following a classification proposed in the literature (Kroll et al., 2011), we distinguished four sets of products: low volatile oxidized organic aerosols (LV-OOA), semi-volatile oxidized organic aerosols (SV-OOA), biomass burning organic aerosols (BBOA) and water-soluble organic carbons (WSOC). The two sets of molecules ionized in APCI and HESI sources (+/-) show that nearly 73% of the molecules are linked to each other by a single difference of 2 oxygen atoms, which reflects an autoxidation mechanism. We can measure the extent of autoxidation for each carbon skeleton in the OSc vs. O/C space. For the two terpenes, for which the initial carbon number is equal to 10, one can observe (Fig. 2b) two autoxidation routes with an even and odd number of oxygen atoms, respectively. This parity distinction is initially present for the two main radicals, ROO˚ and RO˚, participating to autoxidation. However, termination and propagation reactions will change the oxygen parity. Then, parity links between radicals and molecules are lost, which prevents interpretation of radical oxidation routes (Fig. 3). Figure 2 (b) illustrates...
the autoxidation routes between molecules resulting from a hydroperoxy radical reaction (arrows). In this case the oxygen parity is not modified and an OH radical is formed. HESI data showed an equivalent distribution of oxygen parities in molecular products (odd: 51%, even 49%) therefore confirming a lack of selectivity of the reaction mechanisms with respect to the oxygen parity of radicals.

Figure 2: Overview of the distribution of limonene and α-pinene oxidation products observed in a JSR: (a) OSc versus carbon number in detected chemical formulas from APCI and HESI data. (b) OSc versus O/C atomic ratio for a carbon number of 10; index of the products: number of hydrogen atoms. Arrows indicate autoxidation from a C10H16 isomer, according to the oxygen parity in products.

Figure 3: Autoxidation radicals reaction mechanisms in combustion (left) and in the atmosphere (left and right). * Indicates a change of oxygen atoms parity.
4.3 Combustion versus atmospheric oxidation

4.3.1 Global analysis

We have explored potential chemical pathways related to autoxidation in the previous Section. For this purpose, we have performed experiments under cool flame conditions (590 K). This autoxidation mechanism is also present in atmospheric chemistry, but it is only recently that it has been found that this mechanism could be one of the main formation pathways for SOA (Savee et al., 2015). Studies have described this mechanism in the case of atmospheric chemistry with the identification of radicals and molecular species (Tomaz et al., 2021). However, previous studies of the propagation of this reaction mechanism mainly focused on the initial skeletons of the C10-terpenes, whereas the other carbon skeletons are also concerned by autoxidation. It is therefore useful to evaluate the proportion of products of autoxidation among the total set chemical species formed.

Here, we propose a new approach which consists in assessing a set of molecules mainly resulting from autoxidation against different sets of experimental studies related to atmospheric chemistry. The objective is to evaluate similarity of oxidation products formed under these conditions. For this purpose, we selected a HESI ionization source, better adapted to the polarity of the oxidized molecules, as well as to higher m/z (detection of 96% of the total chemical formulas observed in autoxidation by APCI and HESI).

Among published atmospheric chemistry studies of terpenes oxidation, we have selected 15 studies presenting enough chemical products of oxidation, 4 for α-pinene and 11 for limonene. The data were acquired using different experimental procedures (methods of oxidation, techniques of characterization). Table 2 summarizes all the experimental parameters related to the selected studies. From that Table, one can note that few studies involved chromatographic analyzes (Tomaz, 2021; Witkowski an Gierczak, 2017; Warscheid and Hoffmann). The data are from the articles or files provided in the Supplement Tables S1 and S2. In these studies, oxidation was performed only by ozonolysis with different experimental conditions that gather the main methods described in the literature: ozonolysis, dark ozonolysis, ozonolysis with OH scavenger, ozonolysis with or without seed particles. We considered that the methods of analysis by mass spectrometry did not modify the nature of the chemical species but only their relative importance, because of the type of ionization and the sensitivity of the instruments. The combination of data obtained using (+/-) HESI gives a rather complete picture of the autoxidation products.

First, we compared the data from ozonolysis studies of each terpene and identified similarities through the Venn diagram. For studies with two ionization sources, duplicate chemical formulas were removed. We selected the four most representative studies, by the number of the chemical formulas detected. Then, we compared the set of chemical formulas identified after ozonolysis to those produced in low-temperature combustion, the objective being (i) to highlight similarities in terms of products generated by the two oxidation modes and (ii) to identify chemicals resulting from autoxidation.
Table 2. Experimental settings of 15 oxidation studies of two terpenes under atmospheric conditions and cool flames (LC stands for liquid chromatography).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Oxidation mode</th>
<th>Sampling</th>
<th>Experimental setup</th>
<th>Concentrations of reactants</th>
<th>Ionization /source</th>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>Chemical formulas</th>
<th>LC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>α-pinene</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y. Deng et al. (2021)</td>
<td>Dark ozonolysis seed particles</td>
<td>online</td>
<td>Teflon bag; 0.7 m$^3$</td>
<td>5.3±0.6 ncp $^{-1}$ $\alpha$-pinene</td>
<td>ESI</td>
<td>ToF-MS</td>
<td>351</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quéléver et al. (2019)</td>
<td>Ozonolysis</td>
<td>online</td>
<td>Teflon bag 5 m$^3$</td>
<td>10 &amp; 50 ppb $\alpha$-pinene</td>
<td>NO$_3$ (CI)</td>
<td>CI-API-TOF</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meusinger et al. (2017)</td>
<td>Dark Ozonolysis</td>
<td>offline</td>
<td>Teflon bag 4.5 m$^3$</td>
<td>60 ppb $\alpha$-Pinene</td>
<td>Proton transfer</td>
<td>PTR-MS-ToF</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Krechmer et al. (2016)</td>
<td>Ozonolysis</td>
<td>offline</td>
<td>PAM Oxidation reactor</td>
<td>Field measurement</td>
<td>ESI (-) and NO$_3$ (CI)</td>
<td>CI-IMS-ToF</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This work</td>
<td>Cool-flame autoxidation</td>
<td>offline</td>
<td>Jet-stirred reactor 42 m$^3$</td>
<td>1%, $\alpha$-pinene</td>
<td>No ozone</td>
<td>Orbitrap® Q-Exactive</td>
<td>820 (APCI 975 (HESI)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Limonene</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Krechmer et al. (2016)</td>
<td>Ozonolysis</td>
<td>offline</td>
<td>PAM Oxidation reactor</td>
<td>not specified</td>
<td>ESI (-) and NO$_3$ (CI)</td>
<td>CI-IMS-ToF</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tomaz et al. (2021)</td>
<td>Ozonolysis</td>
<td>online</td>
<td>Flow tube reactor (18L)</td>
<td>45-227 ppb limonene</td>
<td>NO$_3$ (CI) - Neg</td>
<td>Orbitrap® Q-Exactive</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fang et al. (2017)</td>
<td>DH-initiated photooxidation dark ozonolysis</td>
<td>online</td>
<td>Snog chamber</td>
<td>900–1500 ppb limonene</td>
<td>UV; 10 eV</td>
<td>Time-of-Flight (ToF)</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witkowski and Gierczak (2017)</td>
<td>Dark ozonolysis</td>
<td>offline</td>
<td>Flow reactor</td>
<td>2 ppm, limonene</td>
<td>ESI,4.5 kV</td>
<td>Triple quadrupole</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jokinen et al., (2015)</td>
<td>Ozonolysis</td>
<td>online</td>
<td>Flow glass tube</td>
<td>1–10000 x10$^9$ molec.cm$^{-3}$, limonene</td>
<td>chemical ionization</td>
<td>Time-of-Flight (ToF)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nørgaard et al. (2013)</td>
<td>Ozone (plasma)</td>
<td>online</td>
<td>Direct on the support</td>
<td>850 ppb ozone 15-150 ppm limonene</td>
<td>plasma</td>
<td>Quadrupole time-of-flight (QToF)</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bateman et al. (2009)</td>
<td>Dark and UV radiations ozonolysis</td>
<td>offline</td>
<td>Teflon FEP reaction chamber</td>
<td>1 ppm ozone 1 ppm limonene</td>
<td>modified ESI (+/-)</td>
<td>LTQ-Orbitrap Hybrid Mass (ESI)</td>
<td>924</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walser et al. (2008)</td>
<td>Dark ozonolysis</td>
<td>offline</td>
<td>Teflon FEP reaction chamber</td>
<td>1-10 ppm ozone 10 ppm limonene</td>
<td>ESI (+/-); 4.5 kV</td>
<td>LTQ-Orbitrap Hybrid Mass (ESI)</td>
<td>465</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warscheid &amp; Hoffmann (2001)</td>
<td>Ozonolysis</td>
<td>online</td>
<td>Snog chamber</td>
<td>500-500 ppm limonene</td>
<td>APCT; 3kV</td>
<td>Quadrupole ion trap mass</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hammes et al., (2019)</td>
<td>Dark ozonolysis</td>
<td>online</td>
<td>Flow reactor</td>
<td>15, 40, 150 ppm limonene</td>
<td>$^{10}$ Po $\alpha$-Pinene</td>
<td>HR-ToF-CIMS</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kundu et al. (2012)</td>
<td>Dark ozonolysis</td>
<td>offline</td>
<td>Teflon reaction chamber</td>
<td>250 ppm ozone 500 ppm limonene</td>
<td>ESI; 3.7 and 4 kV</td>
<td>LTQ FT Ultra, Thermo Sct (ESI)</td>
<td>1197</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This work</td>
<td>Cool-flame autoxidation</td>
<td>offline</td>
<td>Jet-stirred reactor 42 m$^3$</td>
<td>5%, limonene</td>
<td>No ozone</td>
<td>Orbitrap® Q-Exactive</td>
<td>1863 (APCI 2399 (HESI)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For $\alpha$-pinene oxidation, the four selected studies 567 chemical formulas were detected, all polarities combined.

Only one study (Meusinger et al., 2017) was performed in positive mode and none of the studies reported data
were obtained with two ionization modes (+/–). For limonene oxidation, the four studies selected identified 1434 chemical formulas. Only one study (Walser et al., 2008) used (+) and (–) ionization modes. In the case of limonene oxidation, for which accretion is more important than for α-pinene, and for which a greater number of chemical formulas were identified, the similarities are more important. These results are presented in Figure 4 where the ionization polarity used in each study is specified.

**Figure 4:** Venn diagrams for comparing the oxidation results from ozonolysis of (a) α-pinene and (b) limonene (see conditions in Table 1). Each digit of the binary numbers in parentheses identifies the datasets being compared.

For α-pinene, no chemical formula is common to all datasets. Different hypotheses can be offered to explain this result. Among them, the number of chemical formulas identified per study remains limited (a few dozen to several hundred) and these small datasets are sometimes restricted to specific mass ranges, e.g. C_{10} to C_{20} (Quéléver et al., 2019). In the case of studies carried out with an NO_3⁻ source, sensitive to HOMS, produced preferentially by autoxidation, we note that nearly 50% of the chemical formulas (10/22; (1010)) are linked by a simple difference of two oxygen atoms.

For limonene, 78 chemical formulas are common to the four studies selected here. In this data set, a large majority of chemical formulas show a similar relationship to autoxidation: 62% (Tomaz et al., 2021), 54% (Walser et al., 2008), 69% (Kundu et al., 2012), 66% (Bateman et al., 2009) and 72% (this study), simple difference of two oxygen atoms. This result seems to indicate that autoxidation dominates.

One can then ask if reaction mechanisms common to atmospheric and combustion chemistry can generate, despite radically different experimental conditions, a set of common chemical formulas and if in this common dataset, a common link, characteristic of autoxidation, is observable? To address that question, we compared all the previous results, for each of these terpenes to those obtained under the present combustion study. The comparisons were made using HESI data. One should remember that the oxidation conditions in a JSR were chosen in order to maximize low-temperature autoxidation. Again, we used Venn diagrams to analyze these datasets composed of 1590 chemical formulas in the case of α-pinene and 5184 chemical formulas in the case of limonene. The results of these analyses are presented in Figure 5.
It turned out that for $\alpha$-pinene, 301 chemical formulas and for limonene 871 chemical formulas were common to oxidation by ozonolysis and combustion. This represents 31% of the chemical formulas for the ozonolysis of $\alpha$-pinene and 36% for those of limonene ozonolysis. For $\alpha$-pinene, the similarities compared to combustion are specific to each study: (Deng et al., 2021) 69%, (Meusinger et al., 2017) 46%, (Quéléver et al., 2019) 7%, (Krechmer et al., 2016) 23%. Chemical formulas common to all studies were not identified. This lack of similarity may be due to a partial characterization of the chemical formulas, a weaker oxidation of $\alpha$-pinene with an ionization mode less favorable to low molecular weights.

For limonene, the similarities with combustion are more important and less spread out. They represent for the different studies: 65% (Kundu et al., 2012), 88% (Walser et al., 2008), 81% (Tomaz et al., 2021), 57% (Bateman et al., 2009). Moreover, there is a common dataset of 78 chemical formulas which can derive from autoxidation mechanisms. It is necessary to specify again that different reaction mechanisms can cause the observed similarities.

However, the preponderance of autoxidation in so-called cool flame combustion is obvious, and in atmospheric chemistry, this reaction mechanism is competitive or dominates (Crounse et al., 2013; Jokinen et al., 2014). If we search for an autoxidation link between these 78 chemical formulas, we observe that 45% of these chemical formulas meet this condition: difference of two oxygen atoms between formulas, at constant number of carbon and hydrogen atoms. More precisely, these molecules are centered in a van Krevelen diagram on the ratios $O/C=0.6$ and $H/C=1.6$, in the range $0.29 < O/C < 0.77$ and $1.33 < H/C < 1.8$. All oxidized molecules associated with this dataset are presented in Figure 6. The dispersion of the chemical formulas, far from being random, remains consistent with an autoxidation mechanism where the numbers of carbon and hydrogen atoms are constant.

**Figure 5:** Venn diagrams comparing the oxidation results from ozonolysis and combustion of (a) $\alpha$-pinene and (b) limonene (see conditions in Table 1).
Figure 6: (a) Van Krevelen diagram showing specific and common chemical formulas detected after to oxidation of limonene by ozonolysis and combustion, insert (b): distributions of the number of carbon and oxygen atoms in the 78 chemical formulas common to all experiments.

A 3-D representation of all limonene oxidation data is given in Supplement (Fig. S2) where DBE is used as third dimension. From that figure, one can note that products with higher DBE (DBE>10) are preferably formed under JSR conditions, i.e. at elevated temperature. The corresponding chemical formulas could correspond to carbonyls and / or cyclic ethers ('QOOH → carbonyl + alkene + OH and / or cyclic ether + OH'). Specificities and similarities of these two oxidation modes (ozonolysis/combustion) were further investigated by plotting the distribution of the number of oxygen atoms in detected chemical formulas (Fig. 7). Indeed, the distribution of the number of oxygen atoms allows, in addition to the Van Krevelen diagram, to provide some additional details on these two modes of oxidation. In ozonolysis, we observed the chemical formulas having the largest number of oxygen atoms. There, oxidation proceeds over a long reaction time where the phenomenon of aging appears by promoting accretion or oligomerization. In combustion, the number of oxygen atoms remains limited to 18, with a lower number of detected chemical formulas compared to the case of ozonolysis. However, it is in combustion that we observed the highest O/C ratios, indicating the formation of the most oxidized products. This difference, however, does not affect the similarities between the chemical formulas detected in the two modes of oxidation. Finally, the analysis of the parities in oxygen atoms, very similar for the three datasets, confirms that the reaction mechanisms presented
in Figure 3 do not allow a simple link to be established between the oxygen parity of radicals and that of molecular products.

![Graph showing oxygen number distribution for all molecules identified for the oxidation of limonene.](https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-2022-635)

**Figure 7:** Oxygen number distribution for all the molecules identified for the oxidation of limonene: only in combustion, only in ozonolysis and common to both processes.

### 4.3.2 Detailed analysis

UHPLC analyzes were carried out in order to characterize isomers in combustion products and their possible similarities with those detected in atmospheric chemistry. We have targeted chemical formulas common to atmospheric and combustion chemistry, corresponding to the first stages of oxidation: $\text{C}_{10}\text{H}_{16}\text{O}_2$ ($10101$) and $\text{C}_{10}\text{H}_{16}\text{O}_3$ ($11101$), in order to limit the number of isomers. In the literature, UHPLC data on these two chemical formulas remain limited both in atmospheric and in combustion (Table 2, LC column). Nevertheless, in atmospheric chemistry, different isomers have been identified for these two chemical formulas. Table 3 presents these isomers for α-pinene and limonene, together with bibliographic references.

The UHPLC analyzes of combustion derived samples showed the presence of several isomers, inevitably coeluted. Here, we have detected the presence of -OH or -OOH and C=O groups through H/D exchange with D$_2$O and derivatization of carbonyls with 2,4-DNPH, respectively. Our results are presented in Fig. 8. They show the presence of several -OH and carbonyl groups. Furthermore, we verified that the main isomers identified in atmospheric chemistry were present (i.e. $\text{C}_{10}\text{H}_{16}\text{O}_5$ ($11111$), $\text{C}_{10}\text{H}_{16}\text{O}_7$ ($11111$), $\text{C}_{10}\text{H}_{16}\text{O}_9$ ($01011$), $\text{C}_{10}\text{H}_{14}\text{O}_8$ ($01011$)), and compatible with an autoxidation reaction mechanism (Fig S3). Unfortunately, coelution did not fully allow exploiting MS/MS fragmentation carried out on the two chemical formulas, and to formally identify the isomers.
Table 3. Isomers of α-pinene and limonene oxidation reported in the literature.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Compound</th>
<th>α-pinene</th>
<th>Limonene</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pinonaldehyde (Fang et al., 2017)</td>
<td>limononaldehyde (Fang et al., 2017; Walser et al., 2008; Bateman et al., 2009)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hydroxyketone (Fang et al., 2017)</td>
<td>Limononic acid (Fang et al., 2017; Witkowski and Gierczak, 2017; Hammes et al., 2019; Walser et al., 2008; Bateman et al., 2009; Warscheid and Hoffmann, 2001)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>α-pinene</td>
<td>Pinonic acid (Fang et al., 2017; Ng et al., 2011; Meusinger et al., 2017)</td>
<td>4-isopropenylmethylhydroxy-2-oxocyclohexane (Fang et al., 2017)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hydroxy pinonaldehydes (Fang et al., 2017; Meusinger et al., 2017)</td>
<td>7-hydroxy-limononaldehyde (Fang et al., 2017; Walser et al., 2008; Bateman et al., 2009; Meusinger et al., 2017)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig 8: Left, C_{10}H_{16}O_{2} chromatogram with D_{2}O exchange and DNPH derivatization. Right, C_{10}H_{16}O_{3} chromatogram with D_{2}O exchange and DNPH derivatization. One should note that no deuterated chemicals could be detected before addition of D_{2}O.
The oxidation of limonene-oxygen-nitrogen and α-pinene-oxygen-nitrogen mixtures was carried out using a jet-stirred reactor at elevated temperature (590 K), a residence time of 2 s, and atmospheric pressure. The products were analyzed by liquid chromatography, flow injection, and soft ionization-high resolution mass spectrometry. H/D exchange and 2,4-dinitrophenyl hydrazine derivatization were used to assess the presence of OOH and C=O groups in products, respectively. We probed the effects of the type of ionization used in mass spectrometry analyses on the detection of oxidation products. Heated electrospray ionization (HESI +/-) and atmospheric pressure chemical ionization (APCI +/-) were used. A large dataset was obtained and compared with literature data obtained during the oxidation of limonene and α-pinene under simulated tropospheric and low-temperature oxidation conditions. This work showed a surprisingly similar set of chemical formulas of products, including oligomers, formed under the two rather different conditions, i.e., cool flames and simulated atmospheric oxidation. Data analysis involving van Krevelen diagrams, oxygen number distribution, oxidation state of carbon, and chemical relationship between molecules, indicated that a subset of chemical formulas is common to all experiments independently of experimental conditions. More than 35% of the chemical formulas detected in combustion chemistry experiments using a JSR have been detected in the studies carried out under atmospheric conditions. Finally, we have outlined the existence of a substantial common dataset of autoxidation products. This result tends to show that autoxidation is indeed inducing similarity between atmospheric and combustion products. Detailed analysis of our data was performed by UHPLC-MS/MS of selected chemical formulas observed in the literature. Nevertheless, final identification was not possible due to coelutions.

The present JSR data could be useful to atmospheric chemists working in the field of wildfire and/or biomass burning induced air pollution. Considering that low-temperature oxidation (cool flame) products, i.e., COVs, can be emitted from biomass burning, wildfires and engine exhausts, the present data should be of interest for the atmospheric chemists because they complement those obtained in atmospheric chemistry literature. It would be interesting to complement the atmospheric relevant data with MS² analyses of products and assessment of the presence of hydroperoxyl and carbonyl groups HOMs. Further MS² characterizations are also needed for the products observed in the present work. Finally, a study of the temperature dependence of products formation would be very useful, both under cool flame conditions and simulated atmospheric oxidation conditions.

Acknowledgements

The authors gratefully acknowledge funding from the Labex Caprysses (ANR-11-LABX-0006-01), the Labex Voltaire (ANR-10-LABX-100-01), CPERS, and EFRD (PROMESTOCK and APPROPOR-e projects) and the French MESRI for a Ph.D. grant. We also thank Matthieu Riva for sharing his experimental data on limonene oxidation.
References


persistent smoke-charged vortex rising up to 35 km altitude, Communications Earth & Environment, 1, 22, 10.1038/s43247-020-00022-5, 2020.


