In the following, the text with italicization indicates the Reviewers' comments,

and the normal text is our response.

Replies to Reviewer's comments:

Thank you very much for the insightful comments during the whole process, which

lead to a significant improvement. Here is the item-by-item reply to your latest

suggestions.

Suggestions for technical corrections:

1. 1109: "van Noije"

Response: Corrected.

2. 1193: I think the information that the forcing sensitivity is not correlated with the

effective forcing is important enough to be mentioned here.

Response: Done. The sentences are modified in L179-180: "The ERFaer for each

ESM except MPI-ESM-1-2-HAM is listed in Table 3. The ERFaer is not correlated with

the aerosol-forcing-sensitivity."

3. 1324: Units are required in the Table header.

Response: Done.

1