#### **Response to Referee #1:**

This is a very well written paper, which provides a thorough analysis of the impacts of gas and PM emission controls on ozone formation across China. The paper is appropriate for ACP and it works well with the companion paper that is also under review with ACPD. As described below, there are a few items that need to be addressed, after which the paper would be suitable for publication in ACP.

Response: We thank the referee for providing a thoughtful and detailed review of our paper. The referee's comments have helped to improve this manuscript. Below, we provide a point-by-point response to the referee's comments and summarize the changes that have been made in the revised manuscript.

#### Major Comments:

[Comment]: 1. Lines 230-232 Here some context needs to be provided for these trends, and some evaluation against observations is warranted. Figure S1 shows that observed ozone increased by 18% across all urban areas with ozone monitors. However, the model indicates that urban ozone increased from 55 to 57 ppbv, which is just a 3.6 % increase, a rate that is five times less than the observed rate. Why are the modeled trends so low compared to the observed trends, and which processes are being missed by the models? To help the readier understand the discrepancy between the model and observations the authors need to directly compare the model to observations. For example they can compare the modeled trend in the grid cell (or cells) above Beijing to all of the monitors with data from 2013-2017. They can make similar plots for the other urban areas of YRD, PRD and SCB

Across all of China the model predicts a very small ozone decrease of 0.6 ppbv, or just 1%. It's difficult to believe that this tiny decrease has any real meaning. How is the p-value (0.006) so low? What kind of statistical test was used? To have such a tiny decrease with such a low p-value indicates that the signal-to-noise ratio is very high, which implies that there is very little interannual variability. But Part I of this study shows that meteorology creates substantial interannual variability.

Response: Thanks for this valuable comment. The simulated MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> increase (~2 ppbv) in the nightlight-classified urban areas from 2013 to 2017 is much lower than the average increase observed at 493 sites in 74 cities (~9 ppbv). The discrepancy can be explained as follows. The urban areas determined using the nightlight data are not exactly the same as those 493 sites and cover some rural areas (with decreasing ozone) and additional small townships (see Fig R1 below). If we match the model output with the observation sites, then the model can capture 57% of the average rate of increase at those sites, as shown in Figure R2 below. We had compared the simulated and observed MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> changes in Beijing (BTH), Shanghai (YRD), Guangzhou (PRD), and Chengdu (SCB) in Section 3.3 of Part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020). The result showed that the model could also generally capture the changes in observed MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> in different cities. We have added some texts in the revised manuscript to clarify this discrepancy.

The p value was calculated using the F-test statistical method. As shown in Fig. 1, the MDA8  $O_3$  mixing ratio across all of China did present a small decreasing trend with a high confidence level (p=0.006). Part 1 of this study showed the large variability of meteorological impacts on  $O_3$  in regions and years, but this regional variability can be 'averaged out' over the whole China, leading to a clearer ozone trend. The very small ozone decreases in China indicated that the ozone concentration has leveled off in recent years, attributable to the decrease in large rural areas due to the NO<sub>x</sub> emission reduction. The recently published studies also supported our model predicted ozone decreases in rural areas of eastern China. Wang et al. (2019) revealed no significant change in  $O_3$  levels observed at a coastal site (Hok Tsui) in South China in the outflow of air mass from eastern China during 2007-2018. Xu et al. (2020) reported decreasing  $O_3$  mixing ratios from 2013 to 2016 at two rural sites in BTH (Shangduanzi) and YRD (Linan).

# Revision in the main text:

# 1) <u>Line 227-242</u>:

"The model predicted that the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio in urban areas increased at a rate of 0.46 ppbv per year (ppbv

 $a^{-1}$ ) (p = 0.001). This simulated increase (~2 ppbv from 2013 to 2017) in the nightlight-classified urban areas is much lower than the average increase observed at 493 sites in 74 cities (~9 ppbv, Fig. S1d). The discrepancy can be explained as follows. The urban areas determined using the nightlight data are not exactly the same as those 493 sites and cover some rural areas (with decreasing ozone) and additional small townships (Fig. S3). When we matched the modeled locations to the 493 observation sites, the model captured 57% of the rate of increase of MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> averaged at those sites (see Fig. S3 in Part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020)). Part 1 also showed a large variability of meteorological impacts on O<sub>3</sub> in different regions (e.g., Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, and Chengdu), and the simulated overall urban O<sub>3</sub> trend with a high confidence level (p = 0.001) suggests that this regional variability in meteorological impact can be 'averaged out', leading to a clearer urban O<sub>3</sub> trend driven by emission changes.

The simulated MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio in rural areas decreased at a rate of 0.17 ppbv  $a^{-1}$  (p = 0.005), which is supported by the recently reported rural ozone trends in China. Wang et al. (2019c) revealed no significant change in O<sub>3</sub> levels observed at a coastal site (Hok Tsui) in South China in the outflow of air mass from eastern China during 2007-2018. More recently, Xu et al. (2020) reported decreasing O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios from 2013 to 2016 at two rural sites in BTH (Shangduanzi) and YRD (Linan). Overall, MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio in China exhibited a slightly decreasing trend (0.15 ppbv  $a^{-1}$ , p = 0.006) due to the decrease in a large rural area, which suggested that the ozone concentration has leveled off in recent years."

Reference:

- Liu, Y., and Wang, T.: Worsening urban ozone pollution in China from 2013 to 2017 Part 1: The complex and varying roles of meteorology, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 2020, 1-28, 10.5194/acp-2019-1120, 2020.
- Wang, T., Dai, J., Lam, K. S., Nan Poon, C., and Brasseur, G. P.: Twenty-Five Years of Lower Tropospheric Ozone Observations in Tropical East Asia: The Influence of Emissions and Weather Patterns, 46, 11463-11470, 10.1029/2019gl084459, 2019c.
- Xu, X., Lin, W., Xu, W., Jin, J., Wang, Y., Zhang, G., Zhang, X., Ma, Z., Dong, Y., Ma, Q., Yu, D., Li, Z., Wang, D., and Zhao, H.: Long-term changes of regional ozone in China: implications for human health and ecosystem impacts, Elem Sci Anth, 8, 13, 10.1525/elementa.409, 2020.



Figure R1 (Figure S3) Spatial distribution of the urban and rural areas in land areas of China identified by using the nighttime light data. The yellow cross "+" represents the locations of 493 environmental monitoring stations in 74 cities since 2013. BTH, YRD, PRD, SCB are the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei, Yangtze River Delta, Pearl River Delta, and Sichuan Basin regions, respectively.



Figure R2 (Fig. S3 in Part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020)) Changes in observed and simulated summer surface MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios averaged in 493 sites of 74 cities during 2013-2017 relative to those of 2013.

[Comment]: 2. This science paper strays into the realm of policy recommendations, as follows: Line 308-310 "The intercity variations in the dominant causes of increases in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations mean that the government should adopt additional, localized emission-reduction measures as part of policies aimed to alleviate urban O<sub>3</sub> pollution (see section 3.5)." Line 343 "3.5 The need for concurrent reduction of anthropogenic VOCs emissions"

Line 370 "Therefore, VOCs emission controls should be implemented together with the PM-targeted measures."

"Line 377-379 We thus conclude that VOCs controls should be implemented in current and future emission-reduction measures to improve the overall air quality."

I understand that the authors want their paper to be beneficial for improving air quality in China, and their results will certainly be useful. However, the recommendations will have to be re-phrased so that this science paper does not sound like a policy document. Fortunately, this is a straightforward editorial process. Instead of saying what the government "should" do, the authors can say something like: "Recent emission controls across China have not reduced ozone and have actually increased ozone in urban areas. If the government wishes to adopt new emissions control policies that will reduce ozone in urban and rural areas we propose the following recommendations for VOC controls. . .." By phrasing it like this, your paper offers very useful options to the government without sounding like a policy paper.

Response: It was our intention to emphasize the policy implications of the results. We understand the referee's viewpoint. In the revised region, we have rephrased these descriptions and made it not reading like a policy paper.

Revision in the main text:

1) <u>Line 316-318</u>:

"The inter-city variations in the dominant causes of increases in  $O_3$  concentrations suggest that if the government wishes to alleviate urban  $O_3$  pollution, they can adopt additional, localized emission-reduction measures as part of policies (see section 3.5)."

2) <u>Line 350</u>:

"3.5 The anthropogenic VOCs emission control to reduce O<sub>3</sub>"

3) Line 376-377:

"Therefore, we suggest VOCs emission controls be implemented together with the PM-targeted measures in order to alleviate the urban  $O_3$  pollution."

4) <u>Line 391-392</u>:

"We thus recommend that VOCs control be implemented in current and future emission-reduction measures to improve the overall air quality."

[Comment]: 3. This study focuses on summer, but did the authors also look at ozone changes during the winter months? TOAR-Climate (Gaudel et al., 2018) compares surface ozone trends at non-urban sites across North America, during 2000-2014, a period of deceasing NO<sub>x</sub> emissions. Ozone decreases across much of the continent in summer, but increases in winter (see their Figures 13, 14 and 15). I wonder if a similar pattern has occurred across China in winter.

Gaudel, A., et al. (2018), Tropospheric Ozone Assessment Report: Present- day distribution and trends of tropospheric ozone relevant to climate and global atmospheric chemistry model evaluation, Elem Sci Anth, 6(1):39, DOI: https://doi.org/10.1525/elementa.291

Response: We had also examined the ozone trend in winter. Figure R3 below depicts the observed ozone changes during the winter months (January, February, and December) from 2013-2017 at the same 493 cities. Like summer, the averaged MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> concentration also presented an overall increasing trend in winter. As the present study focuses on the photochemically active summer season, we do not discuss the winter result.



Figure R3 Variation in observed MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios in 493 environmental monitoring stations of 74 cities in January, February, and December during 2013-2017.

#### Minor Comments

[Comment]: 4. Line 286-288 Here the authors state that, in general, BC has a major impact on photolysis rates. But the overall conclusion from this study is that the impact of PM reductions on ozone production is mainly through the changes in heterogeneous chemistry, with the impact on photolysis rates being secondary. Given the conclusions of the study it would be a good idea to provide some additional context for the impact of BC on photolysis rates and ozone production. Response: Following the referee's suggestion, we have provided some additional context for the impact of BC in the Conclusion section.

Revision in the main text:

1) Line 385-386:

"Among the primary PM components, the emission decrease in BC increased  $O_3$  more than that for OC despite its smaller reduction compared to OC, resulting from BC being a strong absorber of solar radiation."

[Comment]: 5. Line 104 Here and elsewhere, there is no such word as "uptakes". To make it plural you can use "uptake rates"

Response: Thanks for the suggestion. We have replaced the word "uptakes" throughout the manuscript. Revision in the main text:

1) <u>Line 103-104</u>:

"the absorptions of  $NO_2$ ,  $NO_3$ , and  $N_2O_5$  on aerosol surfaces"

- 2) <u>Line 106</u>: "those of HO<sub>2</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>, OH, and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>"
- 3) <u>Line 199-200</u>:
  - "the incorporation of their heterogeneous reactions"
- 4) <u>Line 335-336</u>:"the heterogeneous reactions of NO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>3</sub>, and OH"

[Comment]: 6. Line 143 This sentence would sound better as: "The companion paper (Part 1; (Liu and Wang, 2020)) presented validation results. . ."

Response: Thanks for the suggestion. We have changed "comprised validation results" into "presented validation results" in Line 143 in the revised manuscript.

[Comment]: 7. Line 208 Change "observation" to "observations" Response: Changed in Line 205.

[Comment]: 8. Line 209 Here and throughout the paper, when mentioning a trace gas value in units of ppbv, then the quantity must be referred to as a mixing ratio, and not a concentration, which has units of mass per volume. Response: Thanks for this suggestion. We have changed "concentration" into "mixing ratio" in Line 206 in the revised manuscript. We also carefully went through the document and made similar changes throughout the revised manuscript.

[Comment]: 9. Line 331 has should be was "... where the  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration was high and WAS subject. .." Response: Thanks for the suggestion. We have changed "has subject to" to "was subject to" in Line 338 in the revised manuscript.

#### **Response to Referee #2:**

The authors examined the effects of 2013-2017 changes in anthropogenic emissions on summertime ozone pollution over China, and they found that the emission controls for reducing aerosols have worsened urban ozone through the nonlinear chemistry of ozone and the complex effects of aerosols. The current increasing trend of ozone in China is of great concern and this topic is well within the scope of ACP journal. The authors here present a very comprehensive study, and the manuscript is well structured. The estimated effects of emissions of individual chemical species on ozone are valuable for air quality planning in China. I would recommend it to be accepted after addressing the following comments. Response: We thank the referee for providing a thoughtful review of our paper and the recognition of our work. The referee's comments have helped to improve this manuscript. Below, we provide a point-by-point response to the referee's comments and summarize the changes that have been made in the revised manuscript.

[Comment]: 1. Heterogeneous uptake of ozone. The simulated increases in ozone from this pathway (Fig.5h) are high over regions with high  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations other than regions with high levels of mineral dust. I am wondering if you are applying this effect for all the aerosols or just on dust particles. The uptake of ozone by aerosols are only well documented for mineral aerosol. Bauer et al. (2004) also suggested that the lower limit of uptake coefficient (3x10-6) seems to be more appropriate for global modeling.

Response: We applied an uptake coefficient of  $O_3$  ( $\gamma_{O_3}$ ) of  $1 \times 10^{-5}$  to all aerosols in our model simulations. Previous laboratory and measurement studies indicated that  $\gamma_{O_3}$  varied in a wide range on different aerosols:  $10^{-6}-10^{-4}$  on dust (Michel et al., 2002, 2003; Hanisch and Crowley, 2003), up to  $10^{-4}$  on sodium chloride aerosols (Abbatt and Waschewsky, 1998), and  $10^{-5}-10^{-3}$  on soot particles (Longfellow et al., 2000). Most previous modeling studies adopted  $1 \times 10^{-5}$  (Liao et al., 2004; Liao and Seinfeld, 2005; Pozzoli et al., 2008), while one recommended a lower value ( $3 \times 10^{-6}$ ) for dust particles (Bauer et al., 2004). We think our choice of  $10^{-5}$  is reasonable.

Revision in the main text:

1) <u>Line 134-138</u>:

"Previous laboratory and measurement studies of the heterogeneous reaction of O<sub>3</sub> have given a wide range of ( $\gamma_{O_3}$ , from 10<sup>-6</sup> to 10<sup>-4</sup> on dust (Michel et al., 2002, 2003; Hanisch and Crowley, 2003), up to 10<sup>-4</sup> on sodium chloride aerosol (Abbatt and Waschewsky, 1998), from 10<sup>-5</sup> to10<sup>-3</sup> on soot particles (Longfellow et al., 2000). Most previous modeling studies adopted 1x10<sup>-5</sup> (Liao et al., 2004; Liao and Seinfeld, 2005; Pozzoli et al., 2008), while one recommended a lower value (3×10<sup>-6</sup>) for dust particles (Bauer et al., 2004). We applied 10<sup>-5</sup> to the uptake of O<sub>3</sub> on all the aerosols in our simulation."

#### Reference:

- Abbatt, J. P. D., and Waschewsky, G. C. G.: Heterogeneous Interactions of HOBr, HNO<sub>3</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>, and NO<sub>2</sub> with Deliquescent NaCl Aerosols at Room Temperature, The Journal of Physical Chemistry A, 102, 3719-3725, 10.1021/jp980932d, 1998.
- Bauer, S. E., Balkanski, Y., Schulz, M., Hauglustaine, D. A., and Dentener, F.: Global modeling of heterogeneous chemistry on mineral aerosol surfaces: Influence on tropospheric ozone chemistry and comparison to observations, J Geophys Res-Atmos, 109, 10.1029/2003jd003868, 2004.
- Hanisch, F., and Crowley, J. N.: Ozone decomposition on Saharan dust: an experimental investigation, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 3, 119-130, 10.5194/acp-3-119-2003, 2003.
- Liao, H., Seinfeld, J. H., Adams, P. J., and Mickley, L. J.: Global radiative forcing of coupled tropospheric ozone and aerosols in a unified general circulation model, J Geophys Res-Atmos, 109, 2004.
- Liao, H., and Seinfeld, J. H.: Global impacts of gas-phase chemistry-aerosol interactions on direct radiative forcing by anthropogenic aerosols and ozone, 110, 10.1029/2005jd005907, 2005.

Longfellow, C. A., Ravishankara, A. R., and Hanson, D. R.: Reactive and nonreactive uptake on hydrocarbon soot:

HNO<sub>3</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>, and N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, 105, 24345-24350, 10.1029/2000jd900297, 2000.

- Michel, A. E., Usher, C. R., and Grassian, V. H.: Heterogeneous and catalytic uptake of ozone on mineral oxides and dusts: A Knudsen cell investigation, 29, 10-11-10-14, 10.1029/2002gl014896, 2002.
- Michel, A. E., Usher, C. R., and Grassian, V. H.: Reactive uptake of ozone on mineral oxides and mineral dusts, Atmos. Environ., 37, 3201-3211, https://doi.org/10.1016/S1352-2310(03)00319-4, 2003.
- Pozzoli, L., Bey, I., Rast, S., Schultz, M. G., Stier, P., and Feichter, J.: Trace gas and aerosol interactions in the fully coupled model of aerosol-chemistry-climate ECHAM5-HAMMOZ: 1. Model description and insights from the spring 2001 TRACE-P experiment, 113, 10.1029/2007jd009007, 2008.

[Comment]: 2. The updated model will decrease  $NO_2$  concentration, and it compares better with surface  $NO_2$  in summer 2013. But the model also has low biases for summers 2014- 2017 (in Table 2 of the companion paper). Please have more explanations on this.

Response: In Part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020), we had given one main reason for the low biases of simulated NO<sub>2</sub> for summers 2014-2017, which is related to the fact that the NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in the national observation network were measured using the catalytic conversion method, which overestimates NO<sub>2</sub>, especially during periods of active photochemistry (Xu et al., 2013; Zhang et al., 2017; Fu et al., 2019). Therefore, the updated model has improved simulations for all the years.

# Reference:

- Fu, X., Wang, T., Zhang, L., Li, Q., Wang, Z., Xia, M., Yun, H., Wang, W., Yu, C., Yue, D., Zhou, Y., Zheng, J., and Han, R.: The significant contribution of HONO to secondary pollutants during a severe winter pollution event in southern China, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 19, 1-14, 10.5194/acp-19-1-2019, 2019.
- Liu, Y., and Wang, T.: Worsening urban ozone pollution in China from 2013 to 2017 Part 1: The complex and varying roles of meteorology, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 2020, 1-28, 10.5194/acp-2019-1120, 2020.
- Xu, Z., Wang, T., Xue, L. K., Louie, P. K. K., Luk, C. W. Y., Gao, J., Wang, S. L., Chai, F. H., and Wang, W. X.: Evaluating the uncertainties of thermal catalytic conversion in measuring atmospheric nitrogen dioxide at four differently polluted sites in China, Atmos. Environ., 76, 221-226, 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.09.043, 2013.
- Zhang, L., Li, Q. Y., Wang, T., Ahmadov, R., Zhang, Q., Li, M., and Lv, M. Y.: Combined impacts of nitrous acid and nitryl chloride on lower-tropospheric ozone: new module development in WRF-Chem and application to China, Atmos Chem Phys, 17, 9733-9750, 10.5194/acp-17-9733-2017, 2017.

[Comment]: 3. The simulated decreases in  $NO_3$  and  $N_2O_5$  (Lines 185-195) could be also induced by decreased ozone in the updated simulation.

Response: Thanks for this comment which we agree. We have modified the statements in the revised manuscript.

Revision in the main text:

1) <u>Line 187</u>:

"The simulated NO<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio decreased slightly (~1 pptv) due to the decrease in NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios"

2) Line 192-193:

"the decrease in NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> levels resulted in a decrease in N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>"

[Comment]: 4. The Conclusion section needs to be rewritten. Currently the 9 lines of conclusion are not a good summary of what have been done in the manuscript. Quantitative conclusions should be given in both Abstract and Conclusion section.

Response: We didn't intend to repeat the content of the abstract. Nonetheless, we understand the referee's view and have

added more content in the revised conclusion section.

Revision in the main text:

# 1) <u>Line 379-393</u>:

"This study has quantified the effects of changes in pollutant emissions from anthropogenic activities on the summer surface O3 concentrations over China from 2013 to 2017. The control measures, while successful in reducing the concentrations of primary pollutants and particulate matter, were found to increase urban O<sub>3</sub> but reduce rural O<sub>3</sub>; overall, the NO<sub>x</sub> emission reduction has helped to contain total ozone production in China. The reduction in  $NO_x$ emission and slight increase in VOC emissions led to ozone increase in urban areas due to the non-linear chemistry of  $O_3$ , and the large reductions in PM and  $SO_2$  emissions contributed to urban ozone increase resulting from the complex effects of aerosols on radiation and chemical reactions. Among the primary PM components, the emission decrease in BC increased O<sub>3</sub> more than that for OC despite its smaller reduction compared to OC, resulting from BC being a strong absorber of solar radiation. The dominant causes of the urban ozone increase due to emission change varied among different cities, and they were NO<sub>x</sub> and PM in Beijing, NO<sub>x</sub> and VOC in Shanghai, NO<sub>x</sub> in Guangzhou, and PM and SO<sub>2</sub> in Chengdu. For the aerosol effects, the decrease in heterogeneous uptake of reactive gases was more important than the increase in photolysis rates. Only the CO emission cut helped to decrease urban ozone. Our results show that comparable percentage reductions in anthropogenic VOCs to that achieved for NO<sub>x</sub> could have prevented the increases in urban O<sub>3</sub> concentrations. We thus recommend that VOCs control be implemented in current and future emission-reduction measures to improve the overall air quality. In view of the importance and complexity of the uptake of reactive gases on aerosol surfaces, more research should be conducted in this area."

[Comment]: 5. The manuscript is not clear about the impact of boundary conditions of chemical species on simulated O<sub>3</sub> in China. Ideally the chemical boundary conditions are different for 2013 and 2017, considering the differences in anthropogenic emissions and in meteorology outside the model domain. How would these differences at the boundary influence simulated changes in O<sub>3</sub> in China over 2013-2017? Some discussions can be added in Conclusion section. Response: The impact of boundary conditions has been simulated and discussed in Part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020), so we will not repeat them in the present paper. Briefly, the chemical boundary conditions for the CMAQ model were derived from the results of the MOZART global model, and they varied in 2013-2017. We found that the impact of the long-range transport from outside the CMAQ modeling domain to China contributed to the increase in MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> in China during 2013-2017, especially on the Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau (with an increase of 1 to 4 ppbv). More discussions are presented in Part 1, Section 3.6 (Liu and Wang, 2020).

Revision in the main text:

1) <u>Line 78-80</u>:

"The role of meteorological variation and total emission changes, the effect of changes in individual meteorological factors, and the impact of changes in long-range transport of  $O_3$  and its precursors from outside the modeling domain, are discussed in a companion paper, Part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020)."

Reference:

Liu, Y., and Wang, T.: Worsening urban ozone pollution in China from 2013 to 2017 – Part 1: The complex and varying roles of meteorology, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 2020, 1-28, 10.5194/acp-2019-1120, 2020.

# Worsening urban ozone pollution in China from 2013 to 2017 - Part 2: The effects of emission changes and implications for multi-pollutant control

Yiming Liu<sup>1</sup>, Tao Wang<sup>1</sup>

15

5 <sup>1</sup>Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Hong Kong, 999077, China *Correspondence to*: Tao Wang (cetwang@polyu.edu.hk)

Abstract. The Chinese government launched the Air Pollution Prevention and Control Action Plan in 2013, and various stringent measures have since been implemented, which have resulted in significant decreases in emissions and ambient concentrations of primary pollutants such as SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>x</sub>, and particulate matter (PM). However, surface ozone (O<sub>3</sub>) 10 concentrations have still been increasing in urban areas across the country. In a previous analysis, we examined in detail the roles of meteorological variation during 2013–2017 in the summertime surface O<sub>3</sub> trend in various regions of China. In this study, we evaluated the effect of changes in multi-pollutant emissions from anthropogenic activities on  $O_3$  levels during the same period, by using an up-to-date regional chemical transport model (WRF-CMAQ) driven by an interannual anthropogenic emission inventory. The CMAQ model was improved with regard to heterogeneous reactions of reactive gases on aerosol surfaces, which led to better model performance in reproducing the ambient concentrations of those gases. The model simulations showed that the maximum daily 8-hour average (MDA8) O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio in urban areas increased by 0.46 ppbv per year (ppbv  $a^{-1}$ ) (p = 0.001) from 2013 to 2017. In contrast, a slight decrease in MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> by 0.17 ppbv  $a^{-1}$  (p = 0.005) in

rural areas was predicted, mainly attributable to the NO<sub>x</sub> emission reduction. The effects of changes in individual pollutant emissions on  $O_3$  were also simulated. The reduction of  $NO_x$  emission increased the  $O_3$  levels in urban areas due to the non-20 linear NOx-volatile organic compound (VOC) chemistry and decreasing aerosol effects; the slight increase in VOCs emissions enhanced the  $O_3$  levels; the reduction of PM emissions increased the  $O_3$  levels by enhancing the photolysis rates and reducing the loss of reactive gases on aerosol surfaces; and the reduction of SO<sub>2</sub> emissions resulted in a drastic decrease in sulfate concentrations, which increased O<sub>3</sub> through aerosol effects. In contrast to the unfavorable effect of the above changes in pollutant emissions on efforts to reduce surface O<sub>3</sub>, the reduction of CO emissions did help to decrease the O<sub>3</sub> level in recent

25 years. The dominant cause of increasing O<sub>3</sub> due to changes in anthropogenic emission varied geographically. In Beijing, NO<sub>x</sub> and PM emission reductions were the two largest causes of the O<sub>3</sub> increase; in Shanghai, the reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> and increase in VOC emissions were the two major causes; in Guangzhou, NO<sub>x</sub> reduction was the primary cause; and in Chengdu, the PM and SO<sub>2</sub> emission decreases contributed most to the O<sub>3</sub> increase. Regarding the effects of decreasing concentrations of aerosols, the drop in heterogeneous uptake of reactive gases – mainly  $HO_2$  and  $O_3$  – was found to be more important than the increase

30 in photolysis rates. The adverse effect of the reductions of NO<sub>x</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, and PM emissions on O<sub>3</sub> abatement in Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, and Chengdu would have been avoided if the anthropogenic VOCs emission had been reduced by 24%, 23%, 20%, and 16%, respectively, from 2013 to 2017. Our analysis revealed that the  $NO_x$  reduction in recent years has helped to contain the total  $O_3$  production in China. However, to reduce  $O_3$  levels in major urban and industrial areas, VOCs emissions control should be added to the current  $NO_x$ -SO<sub>2</sub>-PM policy.

#### **1** Introduction

China has experienced severe haze pollution due to high concentrations of particulate matter (PM) in the past decade (e.g., Guo et al., 2014; Huang et al., 2014). To alleviate this air-quality problem, the Chinese government launched the Air Pollution Prevention and Control Action Plan in 2013 and has since implemented various emission control measures (Zhang et al., 2019).

- 40 Anthropogenic emissions of sulfur dioxide (SO<sub>2</sub>), nitrogen oxides (NO<sub>x</sub>), carbon monoxide (CO), and PM<sub>2.5</sub> (PM with an aerodynamic diameter less than 2.5 μm) in China were reduced by 59%, 21%, 23%, and 33% from 2013 to 2017, respectively, while the emission of volatile organic compounds (VOCs) increased slightly (Zheng et al., 2018). As a result, ambient concentrations of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub>, CO, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, and PM<sub>10</sub> (PM with an aerodynamic diameter less than 10 μm) have declined, according to data from national environmental monitoring stations (http://www.mee.gov.cn; Fig. S1). However, surface ozone
- 45 (O<sub>3</sub>) concentrations in urban and surrounding areas increased from 2013 to 2017 (Lu et al., 2018). It is of critical importance to evaluate the effects of the existing control policies on atmospheric O<sub>3</sub> and refine these, if necessary, to improve overall air quality.

Ground-level  $O_3$  is produced by chemical reactions involving  $NO_x$ , CO, and VOCs in the presence of sunlight. The key step in  $O_3$  formation is the oxidation of nitric oxide (NO) by hydroperoxyl (HO<sub>2</sub>) and alkylperoxyl (RO<sub>2</sub>) to form NO<sub>2</sub>, with

- 50 subsequent photolysis of NO<sub>2</sub>. It is well known that the relationship between the concentrations of O<sub>3</sub> and its precursors is non-linear and that NO<sub>x</sub> can either suppress or increase O<sub>3</sub> formation depending on its abundance relative to VOCs (and CO) (e.g., Atkinson, 2000; Wang et al., 2017b). A large body of literature has established that O<sub>3</sub> formation in urban centers is generally VOCs-limited, that is, reducing VOCs emissions leads to a decrease in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations, but reducing NO<sub>x</sub> emissions has the opposite result; in contrast, O<sub>3</sub> formation above rural areas is typically in the NO<sub>x</sub>-limited or transitional
- 55 regime, in which reducing NO<sub>x</sub> emissions results in decreased O<sub>3</sub> (NRC, 1991; Atkinson, 2000; Wang et al., 2017b). Any process that perturbs HO<sub>2</sub> and RO<sub>2</sub> radicals will also affect O<sub>3</sub> production (e.g., Li et al., 2018a). Therefore, elucidating the chemical drivers of O<sub>3</sub> changes requires understanding the abundance and proportions of O<sub>3</sub> precursors and the radicals involved in O<sub>3</sub> formation. Aerosols in the atmosphere can affect O<sub>3</sub> concentrations via altering the solar actinic flux, which photolyzes gases to initiate oxidation (Li et al., 2011; Xing et al., 2017) and via heterogeneous reactions of reactive gases on
- 60 aerosol surfaces (Li et al., 2018a; Stadtler et al., 2018; Lou et al., 2014).
- Several studies have attempted to uncover the chemical drivers of the recent O<sub>3</sub> increase in China. Using a regional chemical transport model (WRF-CMAQ), Wang et al. (2019b) derived the variation of maximum daily 8-hour average (MDA8) O<sub>3</sub> due to emission changes during 2013–2015 by subtracting the simulated changes due to meteorological variations from the total observed changes. They found that the increase in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations in 2014–2015 relative to 2013 was mainly due to the
- 65 emission changes, and speculated that the decrease in PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations and the reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> emission in VOCs-limited regions could be the causes. In their study, however, the effects of emission changes during the study period were not explicitly

simulated with interannual emissions. Li et al. (2019) utilized a global model (GEOS-Chem) to simulate the MDA8  $O_3$  in 2013 and 2017 and conducted sensitivity experiments for the effects of changes in  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations and anthropogenic emissions of  $O_3$  precursors (NO<sub>x</sub> and VOCs). Their results indicated that the drastic decrease in the  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations (~40%) during

- 70 the period, which reduced the uptake of HO<sub>2</sub> on aerosol surfaces, was the main reason for the O<sub>3</sub> increase in the North China Plain (NCP). Wang et al. (2019a) simulated the effect of NO<sub>x</sub> emission reduction during 2012–2016 with the WRF-CMAQ model in eastern China, which indicated increasing surface O<sub>3</sub> in urban areas due to the reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> emissions. Yu et al. (2019) applied the Kolmogorov-Zurbenko filtering technique to the observed MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> during 2013–2017 in the Yangtze River Delta region, and concluded that the changes in O<sub>3</sub> precursor emissions contributed 76.7% to the O<sub>3</sub> increase, compared
- 75 with 22% due to the decrease in  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration.

We have been further investigating the meteorological and chemical driver(s) of the increasing summer surface  $O_3$  in urban areas of China during 2013–2017 using an improved regional chemical transport model (WRF-CMAQ) driven by interannual meteorological data and anthropogenic emission inventories. The role of meteorological variation and total emission changes, the effect of changes in individual meteorological factors, and the impact of changes in long-range transport of  $O_3$  and its

- 80 precursors from outside the modeling domain, are discussed in a companion paper, Part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020). The goal of the present work is to quantify (1) the effect of the changes in anthropogenic emissions of individual pollutants (NO<sub>x</sub>, VOCs, CO, PM, SO<sub>2</sub>, and NH<sub>3</sub>) on urban O<sub>3</sub>, which has not been addressed in the aforementioned studies but is important for further development of mitigation policy and (2) the effects of changes in aerosol concentrations on O<sub>3</sub> using a regional model with up-to-date radical sources and heterogeneous reactions. The improved model should give a more realistic account of gas-
- 85 particle interactions crucial to O<sub>3</sub> formation, compared with its earlier version. In Section 2, we briefly introduce the model system and experiment setting; Section 3 first compares the simulated reactive gases that are subject to significant heterogeneous reactions with the observations reported in the literature. We then quantify the simulated trends of MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> in urban and rural areas during 2013–2017. We further investigate the response of MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> to the changes in individual pollutant emissions from anthropogenic activities from 2013 to 2017. We then examine the effect of aerosols on the O<sub>3</sub> changes by
- 90 altering the photolysis rates and heterogeneous reactions. Lastly, we conduct numerical sensitivity experiments to calculate the magnitude of VOCs emission reductions needed to overcome the adverse effect of other pollutant reductions on the goal of O<sub>3</sub> mitigation. Section 4 gives the conclusions.

#### 2 Methods

## 2.1 Model setting and emission inputs

95 The CMAQ model (version 5.2.1, the latest version) driven by the Weather Research and Forecasting (WRF) model and the interannual multi-resolution emission inventory for China (MEIC; <u>http://www.meicmodel.org</u>) was applied to conduct the

simulations in this study. The model settings and emission inputs are described in the companion paper (Liu and Wang, 2020). The CMAQ model is an off-line chemical transport model (Byun and Schere, 2006) that does not consider the effect of pollutants on meteorology, but applies an in-line method (Binkowski et al., 2007) that uses the aerosol and O<sub>3</sub> concentrations

100 predicted within a simulation to calculate the solar radiation and photolysis rates. As a result, the model takes into consideration the effect of aerosols on O<sub>3</sub> formation via altering the photolysis rates.

#### 2.2 Updating heterogeneous reactions

The heterogeneous reactions in the original CMAQ model (version 5.2.1) include only the absorptions of NO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>3</sub>, and N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> on aerosol surfaces. To faithfully reproduce the effect of aerosols on O<sub>3</sub> via scavenging gaseous pollutants, we updated the

- 105 heterogeneous reaction rate of NO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>3</sub> on the aerosol surface and incorporated additional heterogeneous reactions of gases into the CMAQ model, namely those of HO<sub>2</sub>, O<sub>3</sub>, OH, and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> (refer to Table S2 in the companion paper (Liu and Wang, 2020) for the detailed heterogeneous reactions in the original and updated CMAQ models). The uptake coefficients ( $\gamma$ ) of gases are the key parameters of heterogeneous reactions, but they vary according to factors such as aerosol water content and aerosol composition. In this study, we selected the "best guess" uptake coefficients for the gases, which have been widely
- 110 used in chemical transport models in previous studies.

The uptake coefficient of  $N_2O_5$  in the original CMAQ model was incorporated by Sarwar et al. (2012), based on the parameterization developed by Bertram and Thornton (2009) that considered its dependence on particle liquid water, particulate nitrate, and chloride.

The heterogeneous reaction rate of NO<sub>2</sub> in the original CMAQ model was suggested by Kurtenbach et al. (2001), based on the

- 115 measurements at a relative humidity of 50% under dark conditions. Field and laboratory studies found that the rate not only depends on the relative humidity (Qin et al., 2009; Stutz et al., 2004) but also on sunlight intensity (Ndour et al., 2008; Stemmler et al., 2007). Fu et al. (2019) developed a new parameterization for the NO<sub>2</sub> heterogeneous reaction rate that considered both these factors, which has improved the simulation of the reaction product, nitrous acid (HONO). This parameterization was adopted in the updated CMAQ model.
- Several laboratory studies have shown that the measured  $\gamma_{NO_3}$  ranges from 10<sup>-4</sup> to 10<sup>-2</sup> (Rudich et al., 1996; Exner et al., 1992; Moise et al., 2002). In the original CMAQ model, 10<sup>-4</sup> was adopted as the value for  $\gamma_{NO_3}$  (Mao et al., 2013). A higher value (10<sup>-3</sup>) was recommended by Jacob (2000) and was subsequently widely adopted in chemical transport models to investigate the effect of heterogeneous reactions on O<sub>3</sub> concentrations (Stadtler et al., 2018; Lou et al., 2014). This value was adopted in the updated CMAQ model.
- 125 The uptake coefficients of HO<sub>2</sub> vary widely, depending on the transition metal ions contained in aerosols (George et al., 2013; Huijnen et al., 2014). The heterogeneous reaction of HO<sub>2</sub> can produce either H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> or H<sub>2</sub>O, depending on the particulate compounds in the aqueous phase. Li et al. (2019) conducted sensitivity experiments for the products of this reaction using the

GEOS-Chem model, finding little dependence on the reaction products when assessing the effect of aerosol on O<sub>3</sub> concentrations. Here, we let the heterogeneous reaction of HO<sub>2</sub> produce only H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, and adopt 0.2 for  $\gamma_{HO_2}$ , as recommended

130 by Jacob (2000).

We used the value of 0.1 for the uptake coefficient of OH, based on the laboratory studies of DeMore et al. (1997). This value was also adopted by Zhang and Carmichael (1999) and Zhu et al. (2010) to explore heterogeneous reactions in a chemical transport model.

Previous laboratory and measurement studies of the heterogeneous reaction of O<sub>3</sub> have given a wide range of  $\gamma_{O_2}$ , from 10<sup>-6</sup>

- 135 to  $10^{-4}$  on dust (Michel et al., 2002, 2003; Hanisch and Crowley, 2003), up to  $10^{-4}$  on sodium chloride aerosol (Abbatt and Waschewsky, 1998), from  $10^{-5}$  to  $10^{-3}$  on soot particles (Longfellow et al., 2000). Most previous modeling studies adopted  $1 \times 10^{-5}$  (Liao et al., 2004; Liao and Seinfeld, 2005; Pozzoli et al., 2008), while one recommended a lower value ( $3 \times 10^{-6}$ ) for dust particles (Bauer et al., 2004). We applied  $10^{-5}$  to the uptake of O<sub>3</sub> on all the aerosols in our simulation.
- DeMore et al. (1997) reported that the uptake coefficient of  $H_2O_2$  on sulfuric acid and water surfaces ranged from  $8 \times 10^{-4}$ 140 to 0.18. de Reus et al. (2005) found that using accommodation coefficients of 0.2 and  $2 \times 10^{-3}$  for HO<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>, respectively, ensured agreement between simulated and observed values, under the assumption that H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> was produced in the heterogeneous reaction of HO<sub>2</sub>. Thus,  $2 \times 10^{-3}$  was adopted for the uptake coefficient of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> in this study.

The companion paper (Part 1; (Liu and Wang, 2020)) presented validation results of the updated CMAQ model against the observations of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub>, CO, O<sub>3</sub>, and PM<sub>2.5</sub> from national environmental monitoring stations. In this study, we used the updated and original CMAQ models to simulate the concentrations of gases lost or produced on aerosol surfaces for the summer of 2013 and compared the simulated results with the observations reported in the literature (Table S1).

#### 2.3 Experiment setting

We applied the updated WRF-CMAQ model to conduct simulations for the summer months (June, July, and August) from 2013 to 2017 with anthropogenic emissions. The shipping emissions were kept unchanged in the 5-year simulation, due to a

- 150 lack of data for recent years. In Part 1 of our work (Liu and Wang, 2020), we showed the effect of changes in total anthropogenic emission on O<sub>3</sub> changes by comparing the O<sub>3</sub> levels in 2013 simulated using anthropogenic emissions from different years. In this study, three additional sets of modeling experiments were established. The first was designed to quantify the responses of O<sub>3</sub> to changes in individual pollutant emissions from 2013 to 2017, with the simulation in 2013 being regarded as the baseline experiment. The anthropogenic emissions of NO<sub>x</sub>, VOCs, SO<sub>2</sub>, CO, NH<sub>3</sub>, PM (comprising PM<sub>10</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, and its components),
- black carbon (BC), organic carbon (OC), and combined NO<sub>x</sub>/VOCs in 2013 were changed individually to those for 2017 in each sensitivity experiment (total number of experiments = 10), and the results were compared with those in the baseline experiment (Table S2). The second set of experiments was designed to investigate the effect of changes in aerosols on  $O_3$  levels via altering the photolysis rates and heterogeneous reactions (Table S3). The individual effects of aerosol were deleted in each

sensitivity experiment, and the results were compared with those in the baseline simulation. The corresponding differences

- 160 showed the effects of aerosols on O<sub>3</sub> in 2013 in terms of photolysis rates or with respect to each heterogeneous reaction. A similar method was applied to the simulation of 2013 but with the 2017 anthropogenic emissions, and the difference was the effect of aerosols on the O<sub>3</sub> levels when the anthropogenic emissions of 2017 were applied in 2013. Finally, by comparing the results before and after the change of emissions from 2013 to 2017, the responses of O<sub>3</sub> to changes in aerosols via altering the photolysis rates and each heterogeneous reaction were quantified. Nineteen sensitivity experiments were performed. The third
- set of experiments was designed to calculate the magnitude that the VOCs emissions in 2017 would have had to be reduced by from 2013 to overcome the adverse effect of the changes in other pollutant emissions on O<sub>3</sub> reduction during this period. Based on the simulation of 2013 incorporating the 2017 anthropogenic emissions of all pollutants except VOCs, the VOCs emissions were reduced by 10%, 20%, 30% 40% and 50% in the sensitivity runs and the results were compared with those in the baseline experiment (Table S4). By comparing the response of the 2013 O<sub>3</sub> level to various VOCs emissions reductions, the required reduction of VOCs emissions was quantified.

#### **3** Results

#### 3.1 Comparison of the simulated and observed reactive gases

The simulated mixing ratios of reactive gases that are subject to significant heterogeneous reactions were compared with the observed values for the gases O<sub>3</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>3</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, HONO, CINO<sub>2</sub>, HO<sub>2</sub>, OH, and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> (Table S1). Except for O<sub>3</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub>,

175 which are measured by the regular national air monitoring network, the other gases were measured only in research-focused field campaigns. We compiled literature-reported summer concentrations of these gases for various years and compared these with the model-simulated values for 2013.

The uptake of  $NO_2$  on wet aerosol surfaces can produce HONO in the atmosphere, which is an important source of OH radicals via photolysis. After the update of the CMAQ model, the predicted average  $NO_2$  mixing ratio in China decreased from 19.2

- ppbv to 16.6 ppbv, which came close to the observed value (15.1 ppbv). As a product of NO<sub>2</sub> uptake, the HONO mixing ratios increased significantly and approached the observed values in Beijing (Wang et al., 2017a) and Guangzhou (Qin et al., 2009; Li et al., 2012b). The decrease in NO<sub>2</sub> and increase in HONO were attributed to the increase in heterogeneous reaction rates of NO<sub>2</sub> due to the effects of relative humidity and sunlight intensity in the updated CMAQ model (Fu et al., 2019). Table S1 also presents the observed HONO mixing ratios at two coastal sites in Hong Kong (Li et al., 2018b; Xu et al., 2015), but their
- 185 levels were substantially underpredicted because capturing such coastal characteristics is challenging for the model, due to its low horizontal resolution (36 km).

The simulated NO<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio decreased slightly (~1 pptv) due to the decrease in NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios and the increase in  $\gamma_{NO_2}$  (from 10<sup>-4</sup> to 10<sup>-3</sup>). This decrease in NO<sub>3</sub> value was much smaller than the differences between the simulated and

observed values in Shanghai (Wang et al., 2013) and Guangzhou (Li et al., 2012a). Nevertheless, the simulated NO<sub>3</sub> value

190 moved closer to the observed value in Shanghai (Wang et al., 2013) after the heterogeneous reactions in the model were updated.

The parameterization of  $\gamma_{N_2O_5}$  remains unchanged in the revised model. However, the decrease in NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> levels resulted in a decrease in N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, and thus a decrease in ClNO<sub>2</sub>. The simulated maximum N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> mixing ratio at the Wangdu site decreased by  $\sim$ 50% and thus agreed much better with the observed value (Tham et al., 2016). The simulated maximum ClNO<sub>2</sub> mixing

- 195 ratio decreased slightly, by a margin much smaller than the biases between the simulation and observation. Table S1 presents the observed N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> and ClNO<sub>2</sub> values at a high-altitude site on Mount Tai (Wang et al., 2017c) and a coastal site in Hong Kong (Yan et al., 2019; Tham et al., 2014). Large differences between simulations and observations were found due to the complex terrains at these two sites, which are difficult for our model to simulate.
- The CMAQ model predicted slightly lower the mixing ratios of HO<sub>2</sub> and OH radicals after the incorporation of their 200 heterogeneous reactions. The changes were small, probably due to the scavenging effects of aerosols being counteracted by the increase in radical sources generated by HONO photolysis. The measured value for HO<sub>2</sub> contains an uncorrected contribution from RO<sub>2</sub> (Fuchs et al., 2011), which could explain in part the underestimation of HO<sub>2</sub> that occurred when using the updated and original models. For OH radicals, the mixing ratios simulated by both the original and updated models were comparable with the observed value in Wangdu (Tan et al., 2017), Beijing (Lu et al., 2013), and Guangzhou (Lu et al., 2012).
- The slight decrease in the OH mixing ratio after the update helped bring the simulation closer to the observations. In the original CMAQ model, the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio was overestimated by 11.4 ppby. The bias was reduced to 6.8 ppby with the updated heterogeneous reactions. In addition to the greater uptake of O<sub>3</sub> on aerosol surfaces, the updated model also includes other heterogeneous gas-aerosol reactions, weakening the atmospheric oxidation capacity and thus inhibiting  $O_3$ formation.
- 210 The H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> mixing ratio decreased substantially from  $\sim 0.8$  ppbv to  $\sim 0.2$  ppbv, and the simulated value agreed well with the values recorded in Wangdu (Wang et al., 2016) and Beijing (Qin et al., 2018; Liang et al., 2013) after updating the model. Our results suggest that the chemical transport models are likely to substantially overestimate the  $H_2O_2$  concentration if they do not include the sink of H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> on aerosol surfaces.

In summary, after updating the heterogeneous reactions in the CMAQ model, the simulations agreed better with the observations, especially for NO<sub>2</sub>, HONO, O<sub>3</sub>, and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. 215

#### 3.2 Variations in the urban and rural O<sub>3</sub>

205

As most of the 493 air-quality monitoring sites established in 2013 are located in urban areas (refer to Fig. S1 in Part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020)), the data from these stations mainly reflect the O<sub>3</sub> concentration changes in urban areas. The model simulations for the summer months from 2013 to 2017 over China give a comprehensive picture of the O<sub>3</sub> variations over the

- entire land areas of the country. Our previous analysis based on model simulations revealed that different trends in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations existed in urban and rural areas (Liu and Wang, 2020). In this study, we further quantified the O<sub>3</sub> trends in urban and rural areas over China using the nighttime light data from the Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite (VIIRS) Day/Night Band (DNB) (Fig. S2). We allocated the nighttime light data to the CMAQ modeling domain and averaged the values in each modeling grid cell. An urban area (rural area) was regarded as a grid-point with an averaged light-value  $\geq$  (<) 2
- 225 nanowatts  $cm^{-2} sr^{-1}$ . Fig. S3 shows the spatial distribution of the urban and rural areas in China. The rates of changes in the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios in urban and rural areas from 2013 to 2017 were then quantified based on the simulation results (Fig.

1). The model predicted that the MDA8  $O_3$  mixing ratio in urban areas increased at a rate of 0.46 ppbv per year (ppbv a<sup>-1</sup>) (p = 0.001). This simulated increase (~2 ppbv from 2013 to 2017) in the nightlight-classified urban areas is much lower than the average increase observed at 493 sites in 74 cities (~9 ppbv, Fig. S1d). The discrepancy can be explained as follows. The urban

- areas determined using the nightlight data are not exactly the same as those 493 sites and cover some rural areas (with decreasing ozone) and additional small townships (Fig. S3). When we matched the modeled locations to the 493 observation sites, the model captured 57% of the rate of increase of MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> averaged at those sites (see Fig. S3 in Part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020)). Part 1 also showed a large variability of meteorological impacts on O<sub>3</sub> in different regions (e.g., Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, and Chengdu), and the simulated overall urban O<sub>3</sub> trend with a high confidence level (p = 0.001) suggests that
- this regional variability in meteorological impact can be 'averaged out', leading to a clearer urban O<sub>3</sub> trend driven by emission changes.

The simulated MDA8  $O_3$  mixing ratio in rural areas decreased at a rate of 0.17 ppbv a<sup>-1</sup> (p = 0.005), which is supported by the recently reported rural ozone trends in China. Wang et al. (2019c) revealed no significant change in  $O_3$  levels observed at a coastal site (Hok Tsui) in South China in the outflow of air mass from eastern China during 2007-2018. More recently, Xu et

240 al. (2020) reported decreasing O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios from 2013 to 2016 at two rural sites in BTH (Shangduanzi) and YRD (Linan). Overall, MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio in China exhibited a slightly decreasing trend (0.15 ppbv a<sup>-1</sup>, p = 0.006) due to the decrease in a large rural area, which suggested that the ozone concentration has leveled off in recent years.

#### 3.3 Response of O<sub>3</sub> to changes in multi-pollutant emissions

Fig. 2 presents the spatial distribution of changes in individual pollutant emissions in 2017 relative to 2013 (http://www.meicmodel.org). Significant reductions in anthropogenic emissions of NO<sub>x</sub>, CO, SO<sub>2</sub>, NH<sub>3</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, BC, and OC were found in eastern China, while the emissions in western China decreased slightly, and even increased in some areas. NH<sub>3</sub> emission, which is primarily from agriculture (Fig. S4e), generally decreased across eastern China but increased in large areas in Neimenggu and northwestern China and some scattered areas in eastern China. VOCs emissions, which have not been subject to effective control measures, increased at scattered points (mostly industrial sites) over eastern China, except for

250 Shandong province, where VOCs emissions decreased across the region. In summary, the emissions of NOx, CO, SO<sub>2</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>,

PM<sub>2.5</sub>, BC, and OC over mainland China were reduced by 21%, 24%, 61%, 38%, 33%, 29%, 34% in summer from 2013 to 2017, respectively (Fig. S4). In contrast, NH<sub>3</sub> emissions only decreased by 4%, and VOCs emissions increased by 5% during the same period.

Fig. 3 shows the spatial distribution of the effect of changes in these pollutant emissions on the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> levels over China
between 2013 and 2017. The average changes in O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios in urban and rural areas (see Fig. S3 for their locations) are shown in Fig. 4a and 4b, respectively. The decrease in NO<sub>x</sub> emissions caused an increase in O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios in urban and industrial hot spots but a decrease in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations across a large swathe of rural areas (Fig. 3a). Quantitatively, the MDA8
O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio increased by 0.30 ppbv in urban areas and decreased by 1.08 ppbv in rural areas, due to the NO<sub>x</sub> emission reductions (Fig. 4a and b). In view of the small effects of changes in other pollutant emissions on rural O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios (Fig.

- 4b), the decreasing trend of  $O_3$  levels from 2013 to 2017 in rural areas was mainly ascribed to the reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> emissions, consistent with the fact that  $O_3$  formation in rural areas in China is generally limited by NO<sub>x</sub> (e.g., Xing et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2017b). The increase in  $O_3$  levels in urban areas due to NO<sub>x</sub> reductions can be explained by two factors. First, most urban areas are in the VOCs-limited regime, where the reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> emissions reduces the NO titration effect on  $O_3$ , resulting in increased  $O_3$  concentrations. Second, the decrease in NO<sub>x</sub> emissions can reduce the NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> concentration and increase  $O_3$  via
- weakening the aerosol effects.

In the simulation of VOCs emission changes, the spatial distribution of the O<sub>3</sub> levels closely tracked the changes in VOCs emissions (Fig. 3b). Specifically, the increase in VOCs emission caused an increase in the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios across eastern China, except for Shandong province, where O<sub>3</sub> levels decreased due to the substantial reduction of VOCs emissions from the transportation sector according to the MEIC emission inventory (http://www.meicmodel.org). The simulation

- 270 predicted an increase of 0.41 ppbv in the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios from 2013 to 2017 due to the increase in VOCs emissions in urban areas (Fig. 4a). When changes in both the NO<sub>x</sub> and VOCs emissions were simulated, it was the changes in NO<sub>x</sub> emissions that primarily contributed to the changes in O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio (Fig. 3c). In the simulation of changing CO emissions, the reduction of CO emissions reduced the O<sub>3</sub> level across China (Fig. 3d). A particularly large decrease in the O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio was found in the NCP region, where both the CO emissions and their corresponding reduction were large. The CO emission
- 275 reductions led to a decrease of 0.41 ppbv in MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> in urban areas (Fig. 4a). CO is an important O<sub>3</sub> precursor and plays a similar role to VOCs in O<sub>3</sub> formation, but the changes in its emission have rarely been discussed in previous studies of the causes of variations in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations. In fact, our results indicated that the reduction of CO emissions was the only government-implemented measure that reduced O<sub>3</sub> levels in recent years.

In addition to the effects of O<sub>3</sub> precursors, the emissions of other pollutants can also affect O<sub>3</sub> concentrations by altering photolysis rates and the loss of reactive gases from heterogeneous reactions. The reduction of SO<sub>2</sub> emissions increased the O<sub>3</sub> levels across China, particularly in northern China and the Sichuan Basin (SCB) (Fig. 3e). Quantitatively, SO<sub>2</sub> emissions reductions led to an increase of 0.75 ppby in the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios in urban areas (Fig. 4a), which was the largest cause of  $O_3$  increases among all the pollutant emissions changes considered in this work. The  $SO_2$  emission was reduced by more than 60% from 2013 to 2017, which resulted in a significant decrease in ambient  $SO_4^{2-}$  concentrations, and increased  $O_3$ 

- 285 concentrations by increasing the photolysis rates and retarding the loss of reactive gases from heterogeneous reactions. The reduction of NH<sub>3</sub> emissions, an important precursor of ammonium, increased the O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio across China in a similar way to the reduction in SO<sub>2</sub> emissions (Fig. 3f), but to a small extent, as the NH<sub>3</sub> emission was only reduced by 4%. Specifically, the increase in the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios in urban areas due to the reduction of NH<sub>3</sub> emissions was only 0.06 ppbv (Fig. 4a), which was an insignificant fraction of the total increases in O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios.
- 290 The reduction of primary PM emissions also enhanced O<sub>3</sub> formation across China, especially in the NCP and SCB regions (Fig. 3g). The MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios increased by 0.72 ppbv due to the PM emission reduction in urban areas (Fig. 4a). The effect of the changes in PM emissions on O<sub>3</sub> levels was comparable with that of the changes in SO<sub>2</sub> emissions, which indicated the significant O<sub>3</sub>-promoting role played by reductions in both primary and secondary aerosols. BC and OC are among the components of direct aerosol emissions, and reductions in both were found to increase the O<sub>3</sub> levels (Fig. 3h and i). Although
- 295 the reduction of BC emissions was smaller than the reduction in OC emissions, the increase in MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> due to the former was more significant. BC is an especially strong absorber of visible solar radiation in the atmosphere (Ramanathan and Carmichael, 2008), and therefore greatly retards photolysis rates by reducing the solar radiation reaching the earth's surface. The dominant cause of O<sub>3</sub> increases due to emission changes varied among regions. Fig. 4 shows the average changes in O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios due to changes in individual pollutant emissions in four megacities, Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, and Chengdu
- 300 (refer to Fig. S1 in part 1 for their locations), which are the representative cities in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei (BTH), Yangtze River Delta (YRD), Pearl River Delta (PRD), and SCB regions, respectively. In Beijing, NO<sub>x</sub> and PM emission reductions were the two largest causes of rising O<sub>3</sub> levels, followed by SO<sub>2</sub> emission reductions. Air quality in the BTH region is a major concern, and strict emission-control measures have been implemented since 2013. As a result, the emissions of NO<sub>x</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, and SO<sub>2</sub> in BTH were reduced by 25%, 44%, and 65% from 2013 to 2017 (Fig. S5), respectively, which were generally larger
- 305 reductions than occurred in other regions (Fig. 2). In Shanghai, the increase in the O<sub>3</sub> level was mainly due to the reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> emissions and increase in VOCs emissions. This result is consistent with the finding of Yu et al. (2019) using the Kolmogorov-Zurbenko filtering technique, who also suggested that the changes in O<sub>3</sub> precursor emissions in the YRD contributed more to O<sub>3</sub> increases than did the decrease in PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. In the YRD, NO<sub>x</sub> emissions decreased by 19%, and that of VOCs increased by 10% from 2013 to 2017 (Fig. S6). Meanwhile, the PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration in Shanghai was
- 310 relatively low in summer. As a result, the effects of the PM and SO<sub>2</sub> emission reductions were smaller than those due to the changes in NO<sub>x</sub> and VOCs emissions. In Guangzhou, the NO<sub>x</sub> emission reduction was the dominant cause of the O<sub>3</sub> increase, while the effects of SO<sub>2</sub> and PM emission reductions on O<sub>3</sub> levels were insignificant. This result can likewise be ascribed to the low concentration of PM<sub>2.5</sub> in summer and relatively large reduction of NO<sub>x</sub> emissions (Fig. S7) in the PRD. In Chengdu, the PM and SO<sub>2</sub> emission reductions contributed most to the increases in O<sub>3</sub> levels. The concentration of PM<sub>2.5</sub> in the SCB was

315 high due to the basin topography and high emissions of both PM and its precursors. The significant reductions of PM<sub>2.5</sub> (35%) and SO<sub>2</sub> (65%) emissions in the SCB (Fig. S8) were thus the two major causes of the O<sub>3</sub> increase there. The inter-city variations in the dominant causes of increases in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations suggest that if the government wishes to alleviate urban O<sub>3</sub> pollution, they can adopt additional, localized emission-reduction measures as part of policies (see section 3.5).

#### 3.4 The effects of aerosol on the O<sub>3</sub> variations

- Aerosols in the atmosphere derived from direct emission and secondary formation can reduce photolysis rates and scavenge reactive gases from heterogeneous reactions, thereby inhibiting O<sub>3</sub> formation. Fig. 5 shows the spatial distribution of changes in the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios due to the changes in the radiative and heterogeneous chemical effects of aerosols from 2013 to 2017 (see Methods). We isolated the effects of changes in seven heterogeneous reactions on the O<sub>3</sub> variations, and the average changes in O<sub>3</sub> levels in urban and rural areas are shown in Fig. 6a and 6b, respectively. As the PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations
- 325 decreased substantially due to the reduction of anthropogenic pollutant emissions, the effects of aerosols on  $O_3$  concentrations also decreased, which led to an increase in  $O_3$  levels. The effects of the decrease in PM concentrations on  $O_3$  were insignificant in western China. Significant increases in  $O_3$  mixing ratios due to the decrease in various aerosol effects were found in urban and industrial areas of eastern China, particularly the NCP and SCB regions, where pollutant emissions were high and subject to a substantial reduction in the past few years. We found that the heterogeneous chemical effect, rather than the radiative
- effect, contributed most to the increase in O<sub>3</sub> levels driven by changes in PM concentrations. Quantitatively, the changes in photolysis rates and heterogeneous reactions increased the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio by 0.30 ppbv and 2.12 ppbv in urban areas, respectively. In rural areas, the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratio increased by 0.87 ppbv via the heterogeneous chemical reactions on aerosols, while the effect of changes in photolysis rates was negligible. As for various heterogeneous reactions, the changes in individual reactions all increased MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> from 2013 to 2017. The decrease in the aerosol-sink effect of HO<sub>2</sub> contributed
- 335 most to the O<sub>3</sub> increase due to changes in PM concentrations, followed by O<sub>3</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>. The effects of changes in the heterogeneous reactions of NO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>3</sub>, and OH on the increase in O<sub>3</sub> levels were small.

The effect of the decrease in aerosol concentrations on O<sub>3</sub> levels varied by city. Significant effects were found in Beijing and Chengdu, where the PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration was high and was subject to a large reduction by the implementation of emission-control measures. In contrast, the PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration was lower in Shanghai and Guangzhou, and their O<sub>3</sub> levels were less affected by the decrease in aerosol concentrations.

340 affected by the decrease in aerosol concentrations.

Li et al. (2019) also investigated the effects of changes in photolysis rates and heterogeneous reactions on  $O_3$  levels, using the GEOS-Chem model incorporating heterogeneous reactions of nitrogen oxides and  $HO_2$ . They quantified the effect of changes in photolysis rates by scaling the aerosol-extinction rate using the satellite-based aerosol optical depth changes, and the effect of changes in heterogeneous reactions by scaling the aerosol surface area using the measurement-based PM<sub>2.5</sub> changes from

345 2013 to 2017. They concluded that the increase in O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios due to changes in PM concentrations could be largely

ascribed to the decrease in the effect of  $HO_2$  heterogeneous reaction. Using a regional model and adopting different experimental settings, our work uncovered a similar and substantial effect of  $HO_2$  uptake on increases in  $O_3$  levels due to changes in PM concentrations. In addition, with more heterogeneous reactions implemented in the CMAQ model, we found that the uptake of  $O_3$  on aerosol surfaces was also important, following  $HO_2$ .

#### 350 3.5 The anthropogenic VOCs emission control to reduce O<sub>3</sub>

355

370

The results in the preceding sections show that although the CO emission reductions contributed to a decrease in O<sub>3</sub> levels, the reductions of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>x</sub>, and PM emissions had a counterproductive effect on O<sub>3</sub> reductions, resulting in a substantial increase in urban O<sub>3</sub> concentrations due to the non-linear NO<sub>x</sub>-VOCs chemistry and the weakening of aerosol effects. To alleviate these negative effects of PM-targeted control policies and thereby reduce ambient O<sub>3</sub> concentrations, we found that anthropogenic VOCs emissions must also be reduced, alongside reductions in emissions of other pollutants.

- Fig. 7 presents the changes in the MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios from its 2013 value, where the 2013 VOCs emissions were decreased from 0% to 50% while the 2017 emissions of other pollutants were retained (see Methods). The MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios in the four studied megacities decrease linearly with the reduction of VOCs emissions, reflecting that O<sub>3</sub> formation in these cities is VOCs-limited. Compared with the O<sub>3</sub> level in 2013, the VOCs emissions would have needed to be reduced by approximately
- 20% to prevent increases in MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> from 2013 to 2017. This suggests that the adverse effects of the reductions of NO<sub>x</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, and PM emissions on urban O<sub>3</sub> could have been avoided with a ~20% reduction of VOCs emissions from 2013 to 2017. The exact reductions of VOCs emissions required vary among the four megacities: Beijing (24%), Shanghai (23%), Guangzhou (20%), and Chengdu (16%). In Beijing (BTH region), the drastic reductions of NO<sub>x</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, and PM emissions would have necessitated a more substantial reduction of VOCs emissions to counteract the O<sub>3</sub> increase. In Shanghai (YRD region) and
- 365 Guangzhou (PRD region), the increase in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations due to the reductions in NO<sub>x</sub> emissions also calls for a significant reduction in VOCs emissions. In Chengdu (SCB region), a smaller VOCs emission reduction is needed because of the relatively small increase in O<sub>3</sub> concentrations due to changes in other emissions. We also found that the required percentage reductions of VOCs emissions in each city were comparable with the actual percentage reductions in NO<sub>x</sub> emissions (25%, 19%, 18%, and 14% for Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, and Chengdu, respectively), suggesting that similar percentage reductions of
- Our results have important implications for air-pollution control policy in the coming years. In 2018, the Chinese government issued a Three-Year Action Plan (2018–2020) mandating further reductions of national SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>x</sub> emissions by at least 15% by the year 2020 compared with those in the year 2015, and an 18% reduction in ambient PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in cities currently not compliant with China's PM<sub>2.5</sub> standards (<u>http://www.gov.cn/zhengce/content/2018-07/03/content\_5303158.htm</u>).

VOCs and NO<sub>x</sub> would have prevented the increase in O<sub>3</sub> levels from 2013 to 2017.

This implies that if VOCs emissions are not reduced in the near future, the O<sub>3</sub> pollution in major cities will continue to worsen. Therefore, we suggest VOCs emission controls be implemented together with the PM-targeted measures in order to alleviate the urban O<sub>3</sub> pollution.

#### 4 Conclusions

This study has quantified the effects of changes in pollutant emissions from anthropogenic activities on the summer surface

- 380 O<sub>3</sub> concentrations over China from 2013 to 2017. The control measures, while successful in reducing the concentrations of primary pollutants and particulate matter, were found to increase urban O<sub>3</sub> but reduce rural O<sub>3</sub>; overall, the NO<sub>x</sub> emission reduction has helped to contain total ozone production in China. The reduction in NO<sub>x</sub> emission and slight increase in VOC emissions led to ozone increase in urban areas due to the non-linear chemistry of O<sub>3</sub>, and the large reductions in PM and SO<sub>2</sub> emissions contributed to urban ozone increase resulting from the complex effects of aerosols on radiation and chemical
- 385 reactions. Among the primary PM components, the emission decrease in BC increased O<sub>3</sub> more than that for OC despite its smaller reduction compared to OC, resulting from BC being a strong absorber of solar radiation. The dominant causes of the urban ozone increase due to emission change varied among different cities, and they were NO<sub>x</sub> and PM in Beijing, NO<sub>x</sub> and VOC in Shanghai, NO<sub>x</sub> in Guangzhou, and PM and SO<sub>2</sub> in Chengdu. For the aerosol effects, the decrease in heterogeneous uptake of reactive gases was more important than the increase in photolysis rates. Only the CO emission cut helped to decrease
- 390 urban ozone. Our results show that comparable percentage reductions in anthropogenic VOCs to that achieved for NO<sub>x</sub> could have prevented the increases in urban O<sub>3</sub> concentrations. We thus recommend that VOCs control be implemented in current and future emission-reduction measures to improve the overall air quality. In view of the importance and complexity of the uptake of reactive gases on aerosol surfaces, more research should be conducted in this area.

### Author contributions

395 T.W. initiated the research. Y.M.L. and T.W. designed the research framework. Y.M.L. modified the model and performed model simulations. T.W. and Y.M.L. analyzed the results and wrote the paper.

# **Competing interests**

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

#### Code/Data availability

400 The code or data used in this study are available upon request from Yiming Liu (yming.liu@polyu.edu.hk) and Tao Wang (cetwang@polyu.edu.hk).

#### Acknowledgments

This work was supported by the Hong Kong Research Grants Council (T24-504/17-N) and the National Natural Science Foundation of China (91844301). We would like to thank Prof. Qiang Zhang from Tsinghua University for providing the

405 emission inventory, and Dr. Xiao Fu from The Hong Kong Polytechnic University for sharing the model codes of HONO sources.

#### References

- Abbatt, J. P. D., and Waschewsky, G. C. G.: Heterogeneous Interactions of HOBr, HNO3, O3, and NO2 with Deliquescent NaCl Aerosols at Room Temperature, The Journal of Physical Chemistry A, 102, 3719-3725, 10.1021/jp980932d, 1998.
- 410 Atkinson, R.: Atmospheric chemistry of VOCs and NOx, Atmos. Environ., 34, 2063-2101, Doi 10.1016/S1352-2310(99)00460-4, 2000.
  - Bauer, S. E., Balkanski, Y., Schulz, M., Hauglustaine, D. A., and Dentener, F.: Global modeling of heterogeneous chemistry on mineral aerosol surfaces: Influence on tropospheric ozone chemistry and comparison to observations, J Geophys Res-Atmos, 109, 10.1029/2003jd003868, 2004.
- Bertram, T. H., and Thornton, J. A.: Toward a general parameterization of N2O5 reactivity on aqueous particles: the competing effects of particle liquid water, nitrate and chloride, Atmos Chem Phys, 9, 8351-8363, DOI 10.5194/acp-9-8351-2009, 2009.
  - Binkowski, F. S., Arunachalam, S., Adelman, Z., and Pinto, J. P.: Examining Photolysis Rates with a Prototype Online Photolysis Module in CMAQ, 46, 1252-1256, 10.1175/jam2531.1, 2007.
- 420 Byun, D., and Schere, K. L.: Review of the governing equations, computational algorithms, and other components of the models-3 Community Multiscale Air Quality (CMAQ) modeling system, Appl Mech Rev, 59, 51-77, 10.1115/1.2128636, 2006.
  - de Reus, M., Fischer, H., Sander, R., Gros, V., Kormann, R., Salisbury, G., Van Dingenen, R., Williams, J., Zöllner, M., and Lelieveld, J.: Observations and model calculations of trace gas scavenging in a dense Saharan dust plume during
- 425 MINATROC, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 5, 1787-1803, 10.5194/acp-5-1787-2005, 2005.
  - DeMore, W. B., Sander, S. P., Golden, D. M., Hampson, R. F., Kurylo, M. J., Howard, C. J., Ravishankara, A. R., Kolb, C. E., and Molina, M. J.: Chemical kinetics and photochemical data for use in stratospheric modeling, National Aeronautics and Space Administration and Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology, California, 1997.
  - Exner, M., Herrmann, H., and Zellner, R.: Laser-Based Studies of Reactions of the Nitrate Radical in Aqueous Solution, 96,
- 430 470-477, 10.1002/bbpc.19920960347, 1992.
  - Fu, X., Wang, T., Zhang, L., Li, Q., Wang, Z., Xia, M., Yun, H., Wang, W., Yu, C., Yue, D., Zhou, Y., Zheng, J., and Han, R.:

The significant contribution of HONO to secondary pollutants during a severe winter pollution event in southern China, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 19, 1-14, 10.5194/acp-19-1-2019, 2019.

Fuchs, H., Bohn, B., Hofzumahaus, A., Holland, F., Lu, K. D., Nehr, S., Rohrer, F., and Wahner, A.: Detection of

- HO<sub>2</sub> by laser-induced fluorescence: calibration and interferences from RO<sub>2</sub> radicals, Atmos.
   Meas. Tech., 4, 1209-1225, 10.5194/amt-4-1209-2011, 2011.
  - George, I. J., Matthews, P. S. J., Whalley, L. K., Brooks, B., Goddard, A., Baeza-Romero, M. T., and Heard, D. E.: Measurements of uptake coefficients for heterogeneous loss of HO2 onto submicron inorganic salt aerosols, Phys Chem Chem Phys, 15, 12829-12845, 10.1039/c3cp51831k, 2013.
- 440 Guo, S., Hu, M., Zamora, M. L., Peng, J. F., Shang, D. J., Zheng, J., Du, Z. F., Wu, Z., Shao, M., Zeng, L. M., Molina, M. J., and Zhang, R. Y.: Elucidating severe urban haze formation in China, P Natl Acad Sci USA, 111, 17373-17378, 10.1073/pnas.1419604111, 2014.
  - Hanisch, F., and Crowley, J. N.: Ozone decomposition on Saharan dust: an experimental investigation, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 3, 119-130, 10.5194/acp-3-119-2003, 2003.
- Huang, R. J., Zhang, Y. L., Bozzetti, C., Ho, K. F., Cao, J. J., Han, Y. M., Daellenbach, K. R., Slowik, J. G., Platt, S. M., Canonaco, F., Zotter, P., Wolf, R., Pieber, S. M., Bruns, E. A., Crippa, M., Ciarelli, G., Piazzalunga, A., Schwikowski, M., Abbaszade, G., Schnelle-Kreis, J., Zimmermann, R., An, Z. S., Szidat, S., Baltensperger, U., El Haddad, I., and Prevot, A. S. H.: High secondary aerosol contribution to particulate pollution during haze events in China, Nature, 514, 218-222, 10.1038/nature13774, 2014.
- Huijnen, V., Williams, J. E., and Flemming, J.: Modeling global impacts of heterogeneous loss of HO<sub>2</sub> on cloud droplets, ice particles and aerosols, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 2014, 8575-8632, 10.5194/acpd-14-8575-2014, 2014.
   Jacob, D. J.: Heterogeneous chemistry and tropospheric ozone, Atmos. Environ., 34, 2131-2159, 2000.
  - Kurtenbach, R., Becker, K. H., Gomes, J. A. G., Kleffmann, J., Lorzer, J. C., Spittler, M., Wiesen, P., Ackermann, R., Geyer, A., and Platt, U.: Investigations of emissions and heterogeneous formation of HONO in a road traffic tunnel, Atmos. Environ., 35, 3385-3394, 10.1016/s1352-2310(01)00138-8, 2001.

- Li, J., Wang, Z., Wang, X., Yamaji, K., Takigawa, M., Kanaya, Y., Pochanart, P., Liu, Y., Irie, H., Hu, B., Tanimoto, H., and Akimoto, H.: Impacts of aerosols on summertime tropospheric photolysis frequencies and photochemistry over Central Eastern China, Atmos. Environ., 45, 1817-1829, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2011.01.016</u>, 2011.
- Li, J., Chen, X. S., Wang, Z. F., Du, H. Y., Yang, W. Y., Sun, Y. L., Hu, B., Li, J. J., Wang, W., Wang, T., Fu, P. Q., and Huang,
- H. L.: Radiative and heterogeneous chemical effects of aerosols on ozone and inorganic aerosols over East Asia, Sci.
   Total Environ., 622, 1327-1342, 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.12.041, 2018a.
  - Li, K., Jacob, D. J., Liao, H., Shen, L., Zhang, Q., and Bates, K. H.: Anthropogenic drivers of 2013-2017 trends in summer surface ozone in China, P Natl Acad Sci USA, 116, 422-427, 2019.

Li, S. W., Liu, W. Q., Xie, P. H., Qin, M., and Yang, Y. J.: Observation of Nitrate Radical in the Nocturnal Boundary Layer

- 465 During a Summer Field Campaign in Pearl River Delta, China, Terr Atmos Ocean Sci, 23, 39-48, 10.3319/Tao.2011.07.26.01(a), 2012a.
  - Li, X., Brauers, T., Häseler, R., Bohn, B., Fuchs, H., Hofzumahaus, A., Holland, F., Lou, S., Lu, K. D., Rohrer, F., Hu, M., Zeng, L. M., Zhang, Y. H., Garland, R. M., Su, H., Nowak, A., Wiedensohler, A., Takegawa, N., Shao, M., and Wahner, A.: Exploring the atmospheric chemistry of nitrous acid (HONO) at a rural site in Southern China, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 10, 1407, 1512, 10, 51044 (2012) 2012.
- 470 12, 1497-1513, 10.5194/acp-12-1497-2012, 2012b.

- Li, Z. Y., Xue, L. K., Yang, X., Zha, Q. Z., Tham, Y. J., Yan, C., Louie, P. K. K., Luk, C. W. Y., Wang, T., and Wang, W. X.: Oxidizing capacity of the rural atmosphere in Hong Kong, Southern China, Sci. Total Environ., 612, 1114-1122, 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.08.310, 2018b.
- Liang, H., Chen, Z. M., Huang, D., Zhao, Y., and Li, Z. Y.: Impacts of aerosols on the chemistry of atmospheric trace gases: a
- 475 case study of peroxides and HO<sub>2</sub> radicals, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 13, 11259-11276, 10.5194/acp-13-11259 2013, 2013.
  - Liao, H., Seinfeld, J. H., Adams, P. J., and Mickley, L. J.: Global radiative forcing of coupled tropospheric ozone and aerosols in a unified general circulation model, J Geophys Res-Atmos, 109, 2004.
  - Liao, H., and Seinfeld, J. H.: Global impacts of gas-phase chemistry-aerosol interactions on direct radiative forcing by anthropogenic aerosols and ozone, J Geophys Res-Atmos, 110, 22, 10.1029/2005jd005907, 2005.
  - Liu, Y., and Wang, T.: Worsening urban ozone pollution in China from 2013 to 2017 Part 1: The complex and varying roles of meteorology, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 2020, 1-28, 10.5194/acp-2019-1120, 2020.
    - Longfellow, C. A., Ravishankara, A. R., and Hanson, D. R.: Reactive and nonreactive uptake on hydrocarbon soot: HNO3, O3, and N2O5, 105, 24345-24350, 10.1029/2000jd900297, 2000.
- 485 Lou, S. J., Liao, H., and Zhu, B.: Impacts of aerosols on surface-layer ozone concentrations in China through heterogeneous reactions and changes in photolysis rates, Atmos. Environ., 85, 123-138, 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2013.12.004, 2014.
  - Lu, K. D., Rohrer, F., Holland, F., Fuchs, H., Bohn, B., Brauers, T., Chang, C. C., Häseler, R., Hu, M., Kita, K., Kondo, Y., Li, X., Lou, S. R., Nehr, S., Shao, M., Zeng, L. M., Wahner, A., Zhang, Y. H., and Hofzumahaus, A.: Observation and modelling of OH and HO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in the Pearl River Delta 2006: a missing OH source in a VOC
- 490 rich atmosphere, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 12, 1541-1569, 10.5194/acp-12-1541-2012, 2012.
  - Lu, K. D., Hofzumahaus, A., Holland, F., Bohn, B., Brauers, T., Fuchs, H., Hu, M., Häseler, R., Kita, K., Kondo, Y., Li, X., Lou, S. R., Oebel, A., Shao, M., Zeng, L. M., Wahner, A., Zhu, T., Zhang, Y. H., and Rohrer, F.: Missing OH source in a suburban environment near Beijing: observed and modelled OH and HO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in summer 2006, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 13, 1057-1080, 10.5194/acp-13-1057-2013, 2013.
- 495 Lu, X., Hong, J. Y., Zhang, L., Cooper, O. R., Schultz, M. G., Xu, X. B., Wang, T., Gao, M., Zhao, Y. H., and Zhang, Y. H.:

Severe Surface Ozone Pollution in China: A Global Perspective, Environ Sci Tech Let, 5, 487-494, 10.1021/acs.estlett.8b00366, 2018.

- Mao, J. Q., Paulot, F., Jacob, D. J., Cohen, R. C., Crounse, J. D., Wennberg, P. O., Keller, C. A., Hudman, R. C., Barkley, M. P., and Horowitz, L. W.: Ozone and organic nitrates over the eastern United States: Sensitivity to isoprene chemistry, J Geophys Res-Atmos, 118, 11256-11268, 2013.
- Michel, A. E., Usher, C. R., and Grassian, V. H.: Heterogeneous and catalytic uptake of ozone on mineral oxides and dusts: A Knudsen cell investigation, 29, 10-11-10-14, 10.1029/2002gl014896, 2002.
  - Michel, A. E., Usher, C. R., and Grassian, V. H.: Reactive uptake of ozone on mineral oxides and mineral dusts, Atmos. Environ., 37, 3201-3211, <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S1352-2310(03)00319-4</u>, 2003.
- 505 Moise, T., Talukdar, R. K., Frost, G. J., Fox, R. W., and Rudich, Y.: Reactive uptake of NO3 by liquid and frozen organics, 107, AAC 6-1-AAC 6-9, 10.1029/2001jd000334, 2002.
  - Ndour, M., D'Anna, B., George, C., Ka, O., Balkanski, Y., Kleffmann, J., Stemmler, K., and Ammann, M.: Photoenhanced uptake of NO2 on mineral dust: Laboratory experiments and model simulations, 35, 10.1029/2007gl032006, 2008.

NRC: Rethinking the Ozone Problem in Urban and Regional Air Pollution, National Academy Press, Washington, DC, 1991.

- 510 Pozzoli, L., Bey, I., Rast, S., Schultz, M. G., Stier, P., and Feichter, J.: Trace gas and aerosol interactions in the fully coupled model of aerosol-chemistry-climate ECHAM5-HAMMOZ: 1. Model description and insights from the spring 2001 TRACE-P experiment, 113, 10.1029/2007jd009007, 2008.
  - Qin, M., Xie, P., Su, H., Gu, J., Peng, F., Li, S., Zeng, L., Liu, J., Liu, W., and Zhang, Y.: An observational study of the HONO-NO2 coupling at an urban site in Guangzhou City, South China, Atmos. Environ., 43, 5731-5742, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2009.08.017, 2009.
  - Qin, M. R., Chen, Z. M., Shen, H. Q., Li, H., Wu, H. H., and Wang, Y.: Impacts of heterogeneous reactions to atmospheric peroxides: Observations and budget analysis study, Atmos. Environ., 183, 144-153, 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2018.04.005, 2018.

520 10.1038/ngeo156, 2008.

500

515

- Rudich, Y., Talukdar, R. K., Ravishankara, A. R., and Fox, R. W.: Reactive uptake of NO3 on pure water and ionic solutions, 101, 21023-21031, 10.1029/96jd01844, 1996.
- Sarwar, G., Simon, H., Bhave, P., and Yarwood, G.: Examining the impact of heterogeneous nitryl chloride production on air quality across the United States, Atmos Chem Phys, 12, 6455-6473, 10.5194/acp-12-6455-2012, 2012.
- 525 Stadtler, S., Simpson, D., Schröder, S., Taraborrelli, D., Bott, A., and Schultz, M.: Ozone impacts of gas-aerosol uptake in global chemistry transport models, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 18, 3147-3171, 10.5194/acp-18-3147-2018, 2018.

Stemmler, K., Ndour, M., Elshorbany, Y., Kleffmann, J., D'Anna, B., George, C., Bohn, B., and Ammann, M.: Light induced

Ramanathan, V., and Carmichael, G.: Global and regional climate changes due to black carbon, Nat Geosci, 1, 221-227,

conversion of nitrogen dioxide into nitrous acid on submicron humic acid aerosol, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 7, 4237-4248, 10.5194/acp-7-4237-2007, 2007.

- 530 Stutz, J., Alicke, B., Ackermann, R., Geyer, A., Wang, S., White, A. B., Williams, E. J., Spicer, C. W., and Fast, J. D.: Relative humidity dependence of HONO chemistry in urban areas, 109, 10.1029/2003jd004135, 2004.
  - Tan, Z., Fuchs, H., Lu, K., Hofzumahaus, A., Bohn, B., Broch, S., Dong, H., Gomm, S., Häseler, R., He, L., Holland, F., Li, X., Liu, Y., Lu, S., Rohrer, F., Shao, M., Wang, B., Wang, M., Wu, Y., Zeng, L., Zhang, Y., Wahner, A., and Zhang, Y.:
    Radical chemistry at a rural site (Wangdu) in the North China Plain: observation and model calculations of OH, HO2 and
- 535 RO2 radicals, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 17, 663-690, 10.5194/acp-17-663-2017, 2017.

- Tham, Y. J., Yan, C., Xue, L. K., Zha, Q. Z., Wang, X. F., and Wang, T.: Presence of high nitryl chloride in Asian coastal environment and its impact on atmospheric photochemistry, Chinese Sci Bull, 59, 356-359, 10.1007/s11434-013-0063-y, 2014.
- Tham, Y. J., Wang, Z., Li, Q., Yun, H., Wang, W., Wang, X., Xue, L., Lu, K., Ma, N., Bohn, B., Li, X., Kecorius, S., Größ, J.,
- 540 Shao, M., Wiedensohler, A., Zhang, Y., and Wang, T.: Significant concentrations of nitryl chloride sustained in the morning: investigations of the causes and impacts on ozone production in a polluted region of northern China, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 16, 14959-14977, 10.5194/acp-16-14959-2016, 2016.
  - Wang, J. Q., Zhang, X. S., Guo, J., Wang, Z. W., and Zhang, M. G.: Observation of nitrous acid (HONO) in Beijing, China: Seasonal variation, nocturnal formation and daytime budget, Sci. Total Environ., 587, 350-359, 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.02.159, 2017a.
  - Wang, N., Lyu, X. P., Deng, X. J., Huang, X., Jiang, F., and Ding, A. J.: Aggravating O-3 pollution due to NOx emission control in eastern China, Sci. Total Environ., 677, 732-744, 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.04.388, 2019a.
    - Wang, P. F., Guo, H., Hu, J. L., Kota, S. H., Ying, Q., and Zhang, H.: Responses of PM2.5 and O-3 concentrations to changes of meteorology and emissions in China, Sci. Total Environ., 662, 297-306, 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.01.227, 2019b.
- 550 Wang, S. S., Shi, C. Z., Zhou, B., Zhao, H., Wang, Z. R., Yang, S. N., and Chen, L. M.: Observation of NO3 radicals over Shanghai, China, Atmos. Environ., 70, 401-409, 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2013.01.022, 2013.
  - Wang, T., Xue, L. K., Brimblecombe, P., Lam, Y. F., Li, L., and Zhang, L.: Ozone pollution in China: A review of concentrations, meteorological influences, chemical precursors, and effects, Sci. Total Environ., 575, 1582-1596, 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.10.081, 2017b.
- 555 Wang, T., Dai, J., Lam, K. S., Nan Poon, C., and Brasseur, G. P.: Twenty-Five Years of Lower Tropospheric Ozone Observations in Tropical East Asia: The Influence of Emissions and Weather Patterns, 46, 11463-11470, 10.1029/2019gl084459, 2019c.
  - Wang, Y., Chen, Z., Wu, Q., Liang, H., Huang, L., Li, H., Lu, K., Wu, Y., Dong, H., Zeng, L., and Zhang, Y.: Observation of atmospheric peroxides during Wangdu Campaign 2014 at a rural site in the North China Plain, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 16,

560 10985-11000, 10.5194/acp-16-10985-2016, 2016.

- Wang, Z., Wang, W., Tham, Y. J., Li, Q., Wang, H., Wen, L., Wang, X., and Wang, T.: Fast heterogeneous N2O5 uptake and CINO2 production in power plant and industrial plumes observed in the nocturnal residual layer over the North China Plain, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 17, 12361-12378, 10.5194/acp-17-12361-2017, 2017c.
- Xing, J., Wang, S. X., Jang, C., Zhu, Y., and Hao, J. M.: Nonlinear response of ozone to precursor emission changes in China:
- a modeling study using response surface methodology, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 11, 5027-5044, 10.5194/acp-11-5027-2011, 2011.
  - Xing, J., Wang, J., Mathur, R., Wang, S., Sarwar, G., Pleim, J., Hogrefe, C., Zhang, Y., Jiang, J., Wong, D. C., and Hao, J.: Impacts of aerosol direct effects on tropospheric ozone through changes in atmospheric dynamics and photolysis rates, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 17, 9869-9883, 10.5194/acp-17-9869-2017, 2017.
- Xu, X., Lin, W., Xu, W., Jin, J., Wang, Y., Zhang, G., Zhang, X., Ma, Z., Dong, Y., Ma, Q., Yu, D., Li, Z., Wang, D., and Zhao,
   H.: Long-term changes of regional ozone in China: implications for human health and ecosystem impacts, Elem Sci Anth,
   8, 13, 10.1525/elementa.409, 2020.
  - Xu, Z., Wang, T., Wu, J. Q., Xue, L. K., Chan, J., Zha, Q. Z., Zhou, S. Z., Louie, P. K. K., and Luk, C. W. Y.: Nitrous acid (HONO) in a polluted subtropical atmosphere: Seasonal variability, direct vehicle emissions and heterogeneous production at ground surface, Atmos. Environ., 106, 100-109, 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2015.01.061, 2015.
- Yan, C., Tham, Y. J., Zha, Q. Z., Wang, X. F., Xue, L. K., Dai, J. N., Wang, Z., and Wang, T.: Fast heterogeneous loss of N2O5 leads to significant nighttime NOx removal and nitrate aerosol formation at a coastal background environment of southern China, Sci. Total Environ., 677, 637-647, 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.04.389, 2019.
- Yu, Y., Wang, Z., He, T., Meng, X., Xie, S., and Yu, H.: Driving factors of the significant increase in surface ozone in the
  Yangtze River Delta, China, during 2013–2017, Atmospheric Pollution Research, 10, 1357-1364,
  10.1016/j.apr.2019.03.010, 2019.
  - Zhang, Q., Zheng, Y. X., Tong, D., Shao, M., Wang, S. X., Zhang, Y. H., Xu, X. D., Wang, J. N., He, H., Liu, W. Q., Ding, Y. H., Lei, Y., Li, J. H., Wang, Z. F., Zhang, X. Y., Wang, Y. S., Cheng, J., Liu, Y., Shi, Q. R., Yan, L., Geng, G. N., Hong, C. P., Li, M., Liu, F., Zheng, B., Cao, J. J., Ding, A. J., Gao, J., Fu, Q. Y., Huo, J. T., Liu, B. X., Liu, Z. R., Yang, F. M., He,
- 585 K. B., and Hao, J. M.: Drivers of improved PM2.5 air quality in China from 2013 to 2017, P Natl Acad Sci USA, 116, 24463-24469, 10.1073/pnas.1907956116, 2019.
  - Zhang, Y., and Carmichael, G. R.: The role of mineral aerosol in tropospheric chemistry in East Asia A model study, J Appl Meteorol, 38, 353-366, 1999.
  - Zheng, B., Tong, D., Li, M., Liu, F., Hong, C., Geng, G., Li, H., Li, X., Peng, L., Qi, J., Yan, L., Zhang, Y., Zhao, H., Zheng,
- Y., He, K., and Zhang, Q.: Trends in China's anthropogenic emissions since 2010 as the consequence of clean air actions,
   Atmos. Chem. Phys., 18, 14095-14111, 10.5194/acp-18-14095-2018, 2018.

Zhu, S., Butler, T., Sander, R., Ma, J., and Lawrence, M. G.: Impact of dust on tropospheric chemistry over polluted regions: a case study of the Beijing megacity, Atmos Chem Phys, 10, 3855-3873, 10.5194/acp-10-3855-2010, 2010.



Figure 1: Trends of simulated MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios averaged in urban and rural areas and all land areas of China in summer (June-August) from 2013 to 2017. See Fig. S3 for the locations of urban and rural areas over China.



600 Figure 2: Spatial distributions of changes in anthropogenic pollutant emissions in the summer of 2017 relative to that of 2013, including (a) NO<sub>x</sub>, (b) VOCs, (c) CO, (d) SO<sub>2</sub>, (e) NH<sub>3</sub>, (f) PM<sub>10</sub>, (g) PM<sub>2.5</sub>, (h) BC, and (i) OC. Emission data are obtained from Multi-resolution Emission Inventory for China (MEIC; <u>http://www.meicmodel.org</u>).



Figure 3: Spatial distribution of the simulated MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios responding to the changes of individual pollutant emissions in summer from 2013 to 2017, including (a) NO<sub>x</sub>, (b) VOCs, (c) NO<sub>x</sub> and VOCs, (d) CO, (e) SO<sub>2</sub>, (f) NH<sub>3</sub>, (g) PM, (h) BC, and (i) OC.



Figure 4: Response of the simulated MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios to the changes in individual pollutant emissions in summer from 2013

610 to 2017 in (a) the urban areas, (b) the rural areas, (c) Beijing, (d) Shanghai, (e) Guangzhou, and (f) Chengdu. See Fig. S1 in part 1 (Liu and Wang, 2020) for the locations of the four megacities.



Figure 5: Spatial distribution of the simulated MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios responding to the changes in the effects of aerosol in summer
 from 2013 to 2017 (see Methods). The aerosol affects O<sub>3</sub> via altering (a) photolysis rates, (b) all heterogeneous reactions, and individual heterogeneous reactions, namely the uptake of (c) NO<sub>2</sub>, (d) NO<sub>3</sub>, (e) N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, (f) HO<sub>2</sub>, (g) OH, (h) O<sub>3</sub>, and (i) H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>.



Figure 6: Response of the simulated MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios to the changes in the effects of aerosols in summer from 2013 to 2017
 in (a) the urban area, (b) the rural area, (c) Beijing, (d) Shanghai, (e) Guangzhou, and (f) Chengdu. The aerosol affects O<sub>3</sub> via altering the photolysis rates (Phot), all heterogeneous reactions (Het), and individual heterogeneous reactions, namely the uptake of NO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>3</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, HO<sub>2</sub>, OH, O<sub>3</sub>, and H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>.



Figure 7: Response of simulated MDA8 O<sub>3</sub> mixing ratios with 2017 emissions (except for VOCs) to the reductions of anthropogenic VOCs from the 2013 level in summer in Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, and Chengdu. The black crosses depict the MDA8 values in 2013 and the required reduction of VOCs emissions in 2017 to maintain the 2013 O<sub>3</sub> level in each city.