

Authors appreciate the editor's comments and we responded to them as follows.

Dear Authors,

After reviewing the changes to your manuscript, I recommend acceptance with 2 minor changes:

1) The idea of invigoration dates to Koren et al., 2005 doi:10.1029/2005GL023187. Please use this as your main reference.

The recommended reference is added as a main one.

2) In the opening sentence, of the abstract, please change the wording to "Using a modeling framework.." (Not "through").

Corrected.

I know that this process has taken longer than hoped but I do believe the papers is much clearer now.

Sincerely,

Graham Feingold