

Interactive comment on “Aerosol Mass yields of selected Biogenic Volatile Organic Compounds – a theoretical study with near explicit gas-phase chemistry” by Carlton Xavier et al.

Barbara Ervens (Editor)

barbara.ervens@uca.fr

Received and published: 9 August 2019

I have received a late reviewer comment; see below. I would like to ask you to address it, too, during the revision of your manuscript as it will help improving and clarifying your study.

Reviewer comment: My remaining criticism, which would still lead to rejection for me (or contingency on the publication of their Nature Comms paper), is that the mechanism still not listed in their revision. Moreover, of the 2 references they have stated are in the bibliography that describe PRAM in detail, the Öström one is incomplete and the Ximeng one is missing. I did find a PRAM model listing in Emilie Öström's thesis online

C1

(https://portal.research.lu.se/portal/files/31835271/Emilie_str_m_hela_inkl_omslag.pdf), but it does not seem to correspond to what is in the current Xavier et al. paper, and paper III in the thesis may refer to an old version of what later became the Nature Comms submission. I do not feel that the model description is sufficient to allow publication with the current existing confusion.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-2019-424>, 2019.

C2