### A letter of Response to Reviewers

We thank the three reviewers for their valuable comments. This manuscript has been improved significantly by addressing these comments. Below are the point-to-point responses to all of the comments. The revision in the manuscript related to the comments was marked in yellow color in the copy of the revised manuscript.

### **Response to the Reviewer 1:**

This work describes the long-term emission inventories for seven pollutants throughout Guangdong Province, one of most developed regions in China, which is highly significant. However, the paper still suffers for two detail problems. 1) The single and plural forms for source categories in the article are not very uniform. For example, the emission source –"dust sources" in line 147 is a plural form, but "dust source" is presented in Figure 4. There is an example taken here, which have also been the same problems in the paper. 2) The abscissa of figure 4(d)  $PM_{2.5}$  is diagonal. However, those for the other pollutants are vertical.

**Response**: Thanks for the positive feedback. For the two helpful comments, we accepted and revised on the manuscript.

- Accepted. We unified single and plural forms for source categories. The major categories normalized as power plants, industrial combustion, residential combustion, on-road mobile source, non-road mobile source, dust source, industrial process source, industrial solvent use, non-industrial solvent use, storage and transportation, agricultural source, biomass burning, and other sources. In response to the comment, we revised the description in the manuscript. For example, source categories were revised in Lines 250-253 as "including power plants, industrial combustion, residential combustion, on-road mobile source, non-road mobile source, industrial process source, industrial solvent use, storage and transportation, agricultural solvent use, non-industrial solvent use, storage and transportation, agricultural source, biomass burning, and other sources, were estimated."
- 2) Accepted. The figure 4(d) PM2.5 was replaced with the vertical abscissa in the manuscript (Fig. 4).







(e) VOCs

2008 2009 2010

2007

2006

2012 2013

2011

100%

90% 80%

70%

60%

50%

40%

30%

20%

10%

0%







Figure 4. Source emission evolutions in Guangdong Province for (a) SO<sub>2</sub>, (b) NO<sub>X</sub>, (c)  $PM_{10}$ , (d)  $PM_{2.5}$ , (e) VOCs, (f) CO and (g) NH<sub>3</sub> from 2006 to 2015.

### **Response to the Reviewer 2:**

*General comments:* This paper calculated a multi-year emission inventory (from 2006 to 2015 and a future year 2020) using the method of activity data and the emission factors. And then the author discusses the emission trends, source contributions and pick out some examples to explain the background reasons. This is a good try to show the audience a data set and comparison. However, this paper is more like a government report instead of a top scientific research paper. There are no sound scientific findings in the manuscript. The results of the manuscript are almost a repeat or quite similar to previous publications:

(1). Zhong Z. (2018) Recent developments of anthropogenic air pollutant emission inventories in Guangdong province, China, Science of Total Environment.

(2). Yin, X. H., Huang, Z. J., Zheng, Y., Yuan, Z. B., Zhu, W. B., Huang, X. B., and Chen, D.H.: Source contributions to PM2.5 in Guangdong province, China by numerical modeling: Results and implications, Atmospheric Research.

Zhong's paper is comparing with 2006, 2010 and 2012 GuangDong emission inventory while the current manuscript is analyzing the data from 2006 to 2015. The source categories of these two papers are more or less the same, although the author claimed in the manuscript that the source categories follows another publication: Pan et al. 2015 (line 144). The unabated emission factors of current manuscript are more or less the same with that in Zhong's paper. Moreover, there is inconsistency in factor values or total emission amount for a corresponding source/pollutants using the same model such as IVE model for mobile source. In terms of the emission validation using observation and satellite data, it is a good way to validate the bottom-up emission inventory utilizing this kind of data. However, the sparsity of the satellite needs to be considered. The carelessness comparison in this manuscript is very simple, not much extra information. Finally, although the manuscript is evaluating the control measures, The main results (figure 9) is more like a repeat of section 2.3 Evolution of source emissions in Guangdong Province for the 2 year 2006 to 2015. To sum up, I recommend a direct rejection because no meaningful results or new scientific findings can be found through the manuscript.

**Response**: We would like to thank the reviewer's valuable time and effort in reviewing the manuscript.

1) "This paper is more like a government report instead of a top scientific research paper. There are no sound scientific findings in the manuscript". Such an impression might be raised when we introduced the emissions and their trends in Section 2.3 and 2.4, which is somehow inevitable in a data-intense paper. However, it does not necessarily mean that it cannot be a top scientific research paper. The importance of long-term historical emission inventories in air pollution research have been widely recognized by the academic community (Li et al., 2017; Zhang et al., 2018; Hosely et al. 2018; Jin et al. 2017; Li et al. 2017; Lei et al. 2011; Ohara et al. 2017). Here, we advance the understanding of long-term air pollutant emissions in China. The study area, Guangdong province, is one of the three largest city clusters in China. It plays an important role in China's air pollution research frontiers and mitigation efforts. Surprisingly, no attempts have been made to estimate its historical emissions. Some studies have estimated the emissions of the Pearl River Delta (PRD) region, but the emissions of PRD cannot fairly represent Guangdong as a whole. To our best

knowledge, this work provides the first long-term record of anthropogenic air pollutant emissions of Guangdong. It provides robust data to assess the effectiveness of control measures and unveil the primary cause of air quality change and fills an important gap in China's air pollution research. In fact, our team had used the long-term emission data and numerical simulation to reveal the dominant cause of ozone changes in PRD (not published yet). Thus, it is potentially highly cited by future work in South China. Moreover, this work observes the phenomenon of 'emission leakages' from developed cities to less developed ones. Emissions in Non-PRD (the other less-developed cities in Guangdong) are becoming increasingly important with some emerging sources such as industrial processes. A new clue or an alarm is putting forward, in sharp contrast to the current mitigation efforts focusing on developed regions. Even so, we still carefully revised the manuscript and enhanced the discussions and analysis regarding the evolution of source emission in GD (section 2.3).

See Lines 551-593 for instance: "In PRD, SO2 emissions steadily declined, from 0.788 Tg in 2006 to 0.292 Tg in 2015. The decline was dominated by power plants and industrial combustion, accounting for 50.0% and 46.8% of the total decrease, respectively (Fig. 5a). The decline of SO2 emissions from power plants and industrial combustion is highly associated with the control measures enacted during the 11th FYP and 12th FYP. In response to the SO2 emission cap in 11th FYP, Guangdong province required the elimination of small thermal power units with high energy consumption and outdated combustion technology in 2007. By the end of 2011, 12.2 million kilowatts of small thermal power units were eliminated during the 11th FYP. In addition, action plan for air pollution prevention and control in Guangdong province (2014-2017) (GDEP, 2014) released in the 12th FYP further strengthen the emission control of power plants. As a result, the flue gas desulfurization (FGD) penetration in coal-fired power plants rose to 87% in 2013. For the industrial combustion, its fuel consumption in PRD decreased by 47.5% during 2006-2015, which can be explained by energy structural adjustment regulations, including the "total amount control of coals" and "changing fuel from coal to natural gas" control measures (Fig. S7). The detailed regulations on energy structural adjustment are summarized in Table S1.

In NPRD, on the contrary, SO2 emission increased until 2010, then saw a downturn. Before 2010, the SO2 emission growth was mainly associated with the increase of industrial combustion and non-road mobile source (Fig. 5b). These two sources still maintained a slight rise after 2010, but their increased emissions were offset by a plunge of emissions from power plants. To reveal the cause of emission growth from industrial combustion in NPRD, we compared the standard fuelconsumption trends from industrial combustion in PRD and NPRD (Fig. 6). In PRD, the fuel consumption from industrial combustion in PRD steadily dropped by 47% during 2006-2015, with an average annual descending rate of 6.9%. In NPRD, by contrast, the fuel consumption increased by 99%. In fact, the average annual growth rates of fuel consumption in NPRD was only 3.2% before 2010, but after that, the increase accelerated, with an average annual growth rate of 11.9% during 2011-2015. Particularly, the growth rate peaked in 2011 (17.1%) and 2012 (14.5%). Meanwhile, the descending rates of fuel consumption in PRD also reached its peak in 2011 (9.9%) and 2012 (11.4%), when the shift of industries implemented. This fact indicates the existence of emission leak from PRD to NPRD due to the policy of "vacate the cage and change birds" that brought many energyintensive industries from PRD to NPRD. Statistical data showed that the NPRD region had undertaken 33 industrial parks that migrated from PRD, as shown in Table S10 (GDEI, 2014). Consequently, the industrial shift might, in turn, promote the emission of power plants in NPRD to

some extent."

2) "The results of the manuscript are almost a repeat or quite similar to previous publications (Zhong et al., 2018; Yin et al., 2017)". We appreciate reviewer's efforts in literature review, but we have to point out that our work is quite different from them regarding methodologies, study areas and findings. Zhong et al. (2018) summarized recent updates of regional emission inventories in Guangdong in terms of the emission source supplement, spatiotemporal distribution refinement and estimation method. Yin et al (2017) used an atmospheric model to quantify the source contributions to ambient PM<sub>2.5</sub> other than PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions while the 2012 Guangdong emission inventory was used as model input. In comparison, our study applied a dynamic technology-based methodology to develop a long-term (2006-2015) emission inventory in Guangdong and analyzed its emission trends, spatial variations, source-contribution variations, and emission reduction potentials. The study area is another difference. While Zhong et al. (2018) compared the PRD emission inventories using different estimation methods as an example (not the Guangdong emission inventories as claimed by the reviewer: Zhong's paper is comparing with 2006, 2010 and 2012 Guangdong emission inventory), this study estimated long-term emissions for Guangdong using self-consistent methodologies. Also, this study compared the emission evolution between the PRD and Non-PRD regions, and found that the emission evolution in the Non-PRD is quite different from their counterparts in PRD, which are not revealed by two previous studies. Therefore, it is arbitrary and hasty to conclude that our work is a 'repeat' of Zhong et al (2018) and Yin et al (2017).

3) "The source categories of these two papers are more or less the same although the author claimed in the manuscript that the source categories follows another publication: Pan et al. 2015 (line 144). The unabated emission factors of current manuscript are more or less the same with that in Zhong's paper. Moreover, there is inconsistency in factor values or total emission amount for a corresponding source/pollutants using the same model such as IVE model for mobile source". In fact, Zhong et al. (2018) updated the source categories based on Pan et al. (2015). Therefore, it is not surprising that the source categories of our study and Zhong et al. are similar. However, I am afraid that the classification similarity does not mean these papers are repetitive. Instead, a similar source category is beneficial to the evaluation of our study with previous studies. In response to the comment, we made a clarification in the method section 1.1 (Lines 253-257). "On the basis of Zhong et al. (2018), and 70 sub-categories based on Pan et al. (2015) and the guidelines for the development of an air-pollutant emission inventory for Chinese cities (MEPC, 2017), the 13 major categories were further broken down into 70 sub-categories to improve emission estimation." Regarding the vehicle emission factors, the inconsistency arises because the base years of unabated emission factors in this study is 2007, rather than 2006 in Zhong et al. (2018).

4) "In terms of the emission validation using observation and satellite data, it is a good way to validate the bottom-up emission inventory utilizing this kind of data. However, the sparsity of the satellite needs to be considered. The carelessness comparison in this manuscript is very simple, not much extra information." In this study, the evaluation of a long-term emission inventory focus on its emission trend, rather than the amount or high-resolution spatial pattern. Therefore, the sparsity of the ground-level observations is not a concern in the evaluation. For satellite data, it is gridded and has the same domain coverage with emissions. Therefore, there is no issue regarding the sparsity

in satellite data. In fact, similar evaluation was also adopted by Zhang et al. (2018), which compared the trends in  $PM_{2.5}$  precursor emissions in China with satellite and ground-based  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations, indicating the evaluation is acceptable.

In response to the questioning, we explained the revised the method section 1.2 (Lines 436-444) "We focused on the evaluation of emission trends. Therefore, we mainly compared annual observations averaged over the PRD/GD region with annual emissions in PRD/GD. Also, emissions and satellite observations in PRD and NPRD region were compared. Since emissions mainly concentrated in urban areas, where ground-level observations located, the sparsity of ground-level observations was ignored in the evaluation."

5) "the main results (figure 9) is more like a repeat of section 2.3 Evolution of source emissions in Guangdong Province". We're afraid the conclusion is improper. Section 2.3 compares how the emissions in PRD and non-PRD are evolving in different ways. Figure 9 studies how might the emission changes in the absence of control measures and reduction potentials if actions have been taken, under the future projection of activity level. Combining section 2.3 and Figure 9 could provide a better understanding of emission trends. For example, we observed a slight change of mobile VOC emissions in Section 2.3. In fact, control measures were effective in reducing mobile VOC emissions in the past decade. Nevertheless, the emission reduction was compensated by the growth of the vehicle population as revealed by Figure 9. Emission potentials are also quantified in Figure 9, which is not included in Section 2.3. For clarification, we revised the description of method in section 2.4 (Lines 805-809) "To evaluate the efficiencies of the control measures enacted in GD and to provide implications for future policies, we decomposed the emission changes into two categories: (1) changes resulting from change of activity level (activity-driven emission) in the absence of control measures and (2) changes due to the implementation of pollution controls (control-driven emission reduction) (Zheng et al., 2018)."

**References:** Zheng, B., Tong, D., Li, M., Liu, F., Hong, C., Geng, G. N., Li, H. Y., L., X., Peng, L. Q., Qi, J., Yan, L., Zhang, Y. X., Zhao, H. Y., Zheng, Y. X., and He, K. B.: Trends in China's anthropogenic emissions since 2010 as the consequence of clean air actions, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 18, 14095-14111, doi: 10.5194/acp-18-14095-2018, 2018

#### **Detailed comments:**

 Abstract section: Line 39-43: "The declines of SO2, NOx, PM2.5, and PM10 emissions are mainly attributed to the control-driven emission reductions in the Pearl River Delta (PRD) region, especially from power plants, industrial combustion, on-road mobile sources, and fugitive dust, and partly to the shift of industries from the PRD to the non-PRD (NPRD) region in GD." It does not show any new findings here, especially the idea of "shift of industries from the PRD to the non-PRD (NPRD) region in GD" comes from a published paper on Atmospheric Research (AR) titled: "Source contributions to PM<sub>2.5</sub> in Guangdong province, China by numerical modeling: Results and implications" by X. Yin (2017).

**Response:** We are afraid that this is a misunderstanding. In Yin et al. (2017), the atmospheric modeling results showed that emissions in NPRD could contribute to the  $PM_{2.5}$  pollution in

PRD. Therefore, they suggested that relocating industries from PRD to NPRD region cannot help ease the pollution in PRD. In short, Yin et al. (2017) discussed one possibility of emission control and proved that it might not work. In our study, emission leakages from PRD to NPRD are observed through a multi-year record of emissions, which is not revealed by Yin et al. (2017).

Line46-48: "this might be one of the reasons that led to the slight upward trends of ozone concentrations in GD." is this finding a reliable result or just a guess? It is not appropriate to put an ambiguous answer in the central part of the abstract.

**Response:** Thanks for the comment. Ou et al. (2016) revealed that  $O_3$  formation in most parts of PRD was VOC-limited in autumn and winter. This indicates that the growing VOC emissions and the decreasing NO<sub>X</sub> emissions, which was observed in this study, might contribute to the growth of ozone concentrations in PRD. However, this does not mean that the emission change is the dominant cause of ozone growth. Further studies using numerical simulations are required to verify the guess. In fact, our preliminary simulations confirm that the growing VOC emissions and the decreasing NO<sub>X</sub> emissions account for about 90% of the ozone growth in PRD in the past decade. Since this result has not yet been published, we removed this sentence from abstract. Also, we revised the abstract in the revised manuscript.

Lines 40-87: "Guangdong province (GD), one of the most prosperous and populous regions in China, still experiences haze events and growing ozone pollution despite of substantial air quality improvement in recent years. Integrated control of fine particulate matter (PM<sub>2.5</sub>) and ozone in GD calls for a systematic review of historical emission. In this study, emission trends, spatial variations, source-contribution variations, and reduction potentials of sulfur dioxide (SO<sub>2</sub>), nitrogen oxides (NO<sub>X</sub>), PM<sub>2.5</sub>, inhalable particles (PM<sub>10</sub>), carbon monoxide (CO), ammonia (NH<sub>3</sub>), and volatile organic compounds (VOCs) in GD from 2006 to 2015 were examined using a dynamic methodology, taking into account economic development, technology penetration, and emission controls. The relative change rates of anthropogenic emissions in GD during 2006-2015 are -48% for SO<sub>2</sub>, -0.5% for NO<sub>X</sub>, -16% for PM<sub>2.5</sub>, -22% for PM<sub>10</sub>, 13% for CO, 3% for NH<sub>3</sub>, and 13% for VOCs. The declines of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>x</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, and  $PM_{10}$  emissions in the whole province are mainly resulted from the stringent emission control in the Pearl River Delta (PRD) region, where most previous control measures focused on, especially from power plants (SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>X</sub>), industrial combustion (SO<sub>2</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub>), onroad mobile source ( $NO_X$ ), and dust source ( $PM_{2.5}$  and  $PM_{10}$ ). Emissions from other areas (the non-PRD, NPRD), nevertheless, remain relatively stable due to the lax control measures and rapidly growing energy consumption. In addition, emission leaks of SO2 and NOx from industries are observed from the PRD to NPRD in 2010 and 2011. As a result, emissions in NPRD are increasingly important in GD, particularly those from industrial combustion. Contribution of NPRD to the total SO<sub>2</sub> emissions in GD, for example, increased from 27% in 2006 to 48% in 2015. On-road mobile source and solvent use are the two key sources that should receive more effective control measures in GD. Current emission reductions from on-road mobile source are neutralized by the substantial growth of vehicle population, while VOC emissions in GD steadily increase due to the growth of solvent use and the absence of effective control measures Besides, future work could focus on power plants and industrial combustion in GD and industrial process source in NPRD, which still have large emission reduction potentials. The historical emission inventory developed in this study not only helps to

understand the emission evolution in GD, but also provides robust data to quantify the impact of emission and meteorology variations on air quality and unveil the primary cause of significant air quality change in GD in the recent decade."

**Reference:** Ou, J. Y., Yuan, Z. B., Zheng, J. Y., Huang, Z. J., Shao, M., Li, Z. K., Huang, X. B., Guo, H., and Louie, P. K. K.: Ambient Ozone Control in a Photochemically Active Region: Short-Term Despiking or Long-Term Attainment? Environmental Science & Technology, 50(11):5720-5728, doi: 10.1021/acs.est.6b00345, 2016.

#### 2. Introduction section:

**Overall review:** For a publication in a top journal such as ACP, the research motivation of the current manuscript is not strong enough. The literature review is too weak. Too many self-cited references were present.

**Response:** Thanks for the comment. The study area, Guangdong province, is one of the three largest city clusters in China. It plays an important role in China's air pollution research frontiers and mitigation efforts. Subsequently, Guangdong has experienced significant air quality improvement, particularly the Pearl River Delta region, which is the first region to meet China's national 35  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard for four consecutive years. Understanding the emission evolution and assessing the effectiveness of control measures call for a systematic review of historical emissions in Guangdong. Surprisingly, no attempts have been made to estimate Guangdong's historical emissions. In this study, we developed a long-term historical emission inventory in Guangdong. To our best knowledge, this work provides the first long-term record of anthropogenic air pollutant emissions of Guangdong.

In response to the comment, we rewrote the Introduction to highlight the research motivation of this study and removed some self-cited references. The new introduction is shown below.

Lines 91-240: "Guangdong Province (GD), comprising nine major cities in the Pearl River Delta (PRD) region and eleven less developed cities in the Non-PRD (NPRD), is the most prosperous and populous regions adjacent to the coast of southern China (Fig. S1 in the Supplementary Material). With only 1.9% of China's land coverage, GD contributed 10.0% of China's gross domestic product (GDP) and 8.0% of the population in 2017 (GDPBS, 2016-2017). Particularly, the PRD region, dubbed 'the world factory' and embracing a wide variety of industries, represented about 80.0% and 53.4% of GD's total GDP and population, respectively (GDPBS, 2016-2017). Benefited from China's opening-up policies, GD has experienced rapid economic growth accompany with serious and complex air pollution issues.

To improve air quality, great efforts to have been made to formulate various control measures and policies, especially after 2013, when the Action Plan on the Prevention and Control of Air Pollution (PCAP, 2013-2017) was launched. The PCAP required the PRD region to reduce  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration by 15% by the year 2017 compared with the 2013 levels. These policies and control measures, which were summarized in Table S3 of SI, partly alleviated regional air pollution in GD. Ground-level observations showed that GD saw an obvious air quality improvement, with SO<sub>2</sub> and  $PM_{10}$  concentrations decreasing by 63.3% and 17.7%, respectively, from 2006 to 2017 (EPGD, 2006-2017). In particular, the PRD region is the first region to meet China's national standard of  $PM_{2.5}$  standard (35 µg/m<sup>3</sup>) for three consecutive years (34 µg/m<sup>3</sup> in 2015, 32 µg/m<sup>3</sup> in 2016 and 34 µg/m<sup>3</sup> in 2017).

However, air pollution in GD is still a major concern. The annual  $PM_{2.5}$  levels still far exceed WHO's  $PM_{2.5}$  guideline value of 10 µg/m<sup>3</sup> (World Health Organization, 2006) and haze events frequently occur in winter (Tao et al., 2017). Also, the ambient ozone concentrations have been growing in recent years. The 90<sup>th</sup> percentile of the maximum 8-hour average ozone concentration (90%-8h-ozone) in the PRD region increased by 24% since 2015, reaching 165 µg/m<sup>3</sup> in 2017 (GDEMC, EPDHK, EPBMC, 2018).

On contrast to the need for further air quality improvement, the unclear causes of recent air quality change in GD hinders the development of evidence-based air quality control strategies. Although several studies had assessed the impact of emission and meteorology change on air quality, their results are inconsistent with each other. For instance, Lin et al. (2018) suggested that emission controls helped improve local air quality in the PRD region, according to a high consistency of ambient  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations and emissions. However, Mao et al. (2018) argued that meteorological and climate conditions rather than PM emissions dominate the interannual variabilities and trends of winter haze days in PRD based on an observation-based approach. Yang et al. (2019) concluded that the inappropriate NOx/VOC control ratio within the PRD over the past years is likely responsible for the ozone increase, while Li et al. (2018) argued that the decrease of  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration is the main driver.

Further mitigation of air pollution in GD calls for a systematic review of historical emissions. First, the long-term historical emission data could help policymakers understand the evolution of emissions, quantify the cuts in emissions that have been achieved by control measures, and identify those sources with the greatest potential for large future emission reductions (Gurjar et al., 2004; Ohara et al., 2007; Zhong et al., 2013). This is particularly important for GD whose potential for further emission reduction are shrinking as control measures tighten. Second, with the use of atmospheric chemical transport models (CTMs), the historical emission can be used to examine the linkages between air quality improvements and control measures, and thus identify the main causes of air quality change and key control measures. All this information is crucial to guide future air-quality management and formulate robust evidence-based policies.

GD is one of the first areas to compile its own emission inventories in China (Zhong et al., 2013). However, no attempts have been made to estimate the historical emissions of GD. Most of the previous emission studies mainly focused on the PRD region, but ignored the NPRD region that also has increased emissions. For instance, Zheng et al. (2009) developed the first high-resolution emission inventory for the PRD region in 2006, followed by emission inventories for speciated volatile organic compounds (VOCs) (Zheng et al., 2009), biogenic VOCs (Zheng et al., 2010), ammonia (NH<sub>3</sub>) (Yin et al., 2015), biomass burning (He et al., 2011, Zhang et al., 2013), sea salt (Liu et al., 2015) and multiple-year anthropogenic sources (Lu et al., 2013). Due to the strengthened emission controls in PRD, relocation of industries are in courses for those sectors that are energy intensive, or highly polluting, or have excess production capacity from the PRD region to non-PRD (NPRD) areas (Chun, 2012; Yin et al., 2017) (Fig. S2). As a result, emissions in the PRD and NPRD regions have experienced substantial changes in recent years. This means that the emissions of PRD cannot fairly represent Guangdong as a whole. Although several emission inventories in GD were developed recently (Huang et al., 2015; Pan et al., 2015; Liu et al., 2017; Zhong et al., 2018), they were carried out in a single year and limited in spatial coverage, and source categories. Therefore,

there is a need to develop a long-term historical emission inventory in GD using a consistent methodology and the same underlying driver data to fill the data gaps and to assist with future air pollution control measures.

Line 84-91: I do not see the long-term emission inventory comparison could resolve the controversial issue of whether the emission or the meteorology plays the main role of pollution. Please explain how the long-term emission inventory could help differentiate the causes of the emission or the meteorology?

**Response:** Thanks for the comment. A long-term emission inventory alone could not identify the cause of air quality change. However, combining with atmospheric chemical transport models (CTMs), the impact of emission change and meteorological variation on air quality can be quantified. For instance, by combining a long-term emission and the WRF-CMAQ (Weather Research and Forecasting Model and Community Multiscale Air Quality) model, Cheng et al (2018) found that the rapid decrease in PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in Beijing during 2013-2017 was dominated by local and regional emission reductions, rather than meteorology variation. For clarification, we revised manuscript in the Lines 154-157"Second, with the use of atmospheric chemical transport models (CTMs), the historical emission can be used to examine the linkages between air quality improvements and control measures, and thus identify the main causes of air quality change and key control measures."

**Reference:** Cheng, J., Su, J. P., Cui, T., Li, X., Dong, X., Sun, F, Yang, Y. Y., Tong, D., Zheng, Y. X., Li, Y. S., Li J. X., Zhang. Q, and He, K, Dominant role of emission reduction in PM<sub>2.5</sub>; air quality improvement in Beijing during 2013-2017: a model-based decomposition analysis, Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics Discussions, 19, 6125-6146. <u>https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-2018-1145</u>, 2019

Line 96-112 introduces the history of emission inventory development in PRD and GD. Too many self-cited papers are included. Due to differences in source categories or data sources for different geometry, using a unified method to calculate a multi-year emission inventory is fine, but what is new here? Is the technique original or are the data sources new? What are the advantages/Strength of the method/data in this manuscript comparing with the previous publications? Only calculation of a multi-year EI seems too weak to be published in a top journal ACP.

**Response:** Thanks for the comment. Following previous long-term emission papers (Lu et al. 2012, Zheng et al. 2018), we applied a dynamic technology-based methodology that considers economic development, technological penetration, and emission controls to estimate the long-term emission inventory in Guangdong in this study. It is true that the methods and data sources are not new. However, these methods satisfy the requirement of developing a reliable long-term emission inventory. Although new data sources, such as AIS data and satellite data, can promote emission inventories, obtaining new data spanning a long-term period is challenging. For this study, like most long-term emission inventory papers, the scientific value lies in revealing the long-term emission evolution pattern, assessing the effectiveness of past control measures and

providing guidelines for future control measure development. Also, this study provides the first long-term record of anthropogenic air pollutant emissions of Guangdong, the three largest city clusters in China, and advances our understating of air pollutant emissions and control measures in Guangdong. For instance, this study observes the phenomenon of 'emission leakages' from the PRD region to the Non-PRD region, which received less attention of air quality control compared with the PRD, indicating that emissions in Non-PRD (the other less-developed cities in Guangdong) are becoming increasingly important in Guangdong. In addition, this study found that past control measures for vehicle source and solvent use source are not stringent enough because emission reduction driven by these measures cannot cover the emission growth due to the increasing vehicle population and solvent use. Finally, combining with atmospheric chemical transport models (CTMs), the long-term emission data developed in this study could help identify the dominant cause of air quality change in Guangdong. In fact, our team had used the long-term emission data and numerical simulation to reveal the dominant cause of ozone changes in PRD (not published yet).

In response to the comment, we clarified why we used the top-down method in the revised manuscript (Lines 263-273). Also, we highlighted the scientific significant in the revised abstract and introduction. "this study provides the first long-term record of anthropogenic air pollutant emissions of Guangdong, the three largest city clusters in China, and advances our understating of air pollutant emissions and control measures in Guangdong.", "The historical emission inventory developed in this study not only helps to understand the emission evolution in GD, but also could also help to reveal the dominant causes of air-quality change in PRD." and so on.

Lines 263-273: "Unlike the single-year emission inventory, the estimation of a long-term emission inventory is generally more complicated since it requires the data sources, estimation method and source category for all years are consistent. Although top-down methods or on-line estimation methods based on big data can promote the estimation, obtaining the long-term activity data, such as Automatic Identification System (AIS) data for ship emission and Global Positioning System (GPS) data for on-road mobile source, is challenging. Therefore, most studies (Streets et al., 2006; Zhang et al., 2007; Lu et al., 2012; Zheng et al., 2018), still generally applied the top-down method to develop long-term emission inventories. Following previous studies, we applied a dynamic technology-based methodology that considers economic development, technological penetration, and emission controls to estimate the anthropogenic emission trends in GD."

#### **References:**

- Streets, D. G., Zhang, Q., Wang, L. T., He, K. B., Hao, J. M., Wu, Y., Tang, Y. H., and Carmichael, G. R.: Revisiting China's CO emissions after the Transport and Chemical Evolution over the Pacific (TRACE-P) mission: Synthesis of inventories, atmospheric modeling, and observations, Journal of Geophysical Research Atmospheres. 111, doi: 10.1029/2006JD007118, 2006.
- Zhang, Q., Streets, D. G., He, K. B., Wang, Y. X., Richter, A., Burrows, J. P., Uno, I., Jang, C. J., Chen, D., and Yao, Z. L., NOX emission trends for China, 1995–2004: The view from the ground and the view from space, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 112, doi: 10.1029/2007JD008684, 2007.

- Lu, Q., Zheng, J. Y., Ye, S. Q., Shen, X. L., Yuan, Z. B., and Yin, S. S.: Emission trends and source characteristics of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub> and VOCs in the Pearl River Delta region from 2000 to 2009, Atmospheric Environment, 76, 11-20, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.10.062, 2013.
- Zheng, B., Tong, D., Li, M., Liu, F., Hong, C., Geng, G. N., Li, H. Y., L., X., Peng, L. Q., Qi, J., Yan, L., Zhang, Y. X., Zhao, H. Y., Zheng, Y. X., and He, K. B.: Trends in China's anthropogenic emissions since 2010 as the consequence of clean air actions, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 18, 14095-14111, doi: 10.5194/acp-18-14095-2018, 2018.

#### 3. Methodology section.

**General review:** No new method or new data sources were found in this manuscript comparing with the previous Emission Inventory publications in the PRD region. The calculation of marine emission is outdated, and its uncertainty is considerable. The validation method of the emission totals is too simple to be believed.

Response: Thanks for the comment. Unlike the single-year emission inventory, the estimation of a long-term emission inventory is generally more complicated since it requires the data sources, estimation method and source category for all years are consistent. Although new estimation methods and new data sources can promote emission inventories, obtaining new data span a long-term period is challenging. We understand that the bottom-up estimation method based on AIS data can generate reliable ship emission inventories. However, obtaining 10-year AIS data is a considerable work. Moreover, the spatial coverage of AIS data in China before 2012 is limited. Instead, long-term ship fuel consumption data or cargo volumes can be easily obtained. Although the method based on fuel consumption might underestimates marine emissions, due to the absence of passing ships that traveled through the study domain but did not call at any port in mainland China. However, the underestimation is slight since the passing ships only accounted for about 7% of the total fuel consumption in China (Li et al.2018). Therefore, the top-down method based on fuel consumption or cargo volumes is more feasible than the bottom-up method based on AIS data in the long-term emission estimation. Another example is the satellite data for biomass burning. For the satellite-derived method, the burned area or fire radiative power (FRP) are key parameters used to estimate the amount of fuel combustion. These parameters can be rapidly updated and better reflect temporal and spatial variations. However, satellite data generally have larger uncertainty since they overlook small fires due to the low spatial resolution of the burned area product or the limitation of overpass time of the orbiting satellite. Moreover, long-term emission inventories generally focus on emission trend, sectoral evolution and emission projection, rather than the high-resolution spatial distribution. Therefore, most studies (Streets et al. 2006, Zhang et al, 2007, Lu et al. 2012, Zheng, et al. 2018) still generally applied the top-down method to develop long-term emission inventories. In this study, we applied a dynamic technology-based methodology that considers economic development, technological penetration, and emission controls to estimate the long-term emission inventory in Guangdong. Also, we used interpolation method and fuel consumption estimation method to estimate some missing data, make sure all activity data during 2006-2015 are comparable. For clarification, we added the explanation why the method was used in this study, as shown below.

Lines 263-273: "Unlike the single-year emission inventory, the estimation of a long-term emission inventory is generally more complicated since it requires the data sources, estimation method and source category for all years are consistent. Although top-down methods or on-line estimation methods based on big data can promote the estimation, obtaining the long-term activity data, such as Automatic Identification System (AIS) data for ship emission and Global Positioning System (GPS) data for on-road mobile source, is challenging. Therefore, most studies (Streets et al., 2006; Zhang et al., 2007; Lu et al., 2012; Zheng et al., 2018), still generally applied the top-down method to develop long-term emission inventories. Following previous studies, we applied a dynamic technology-based methodology that considers economic development, technological penetration, and emission controls to estimate the anthropogenic emission trends in GD."

Lines 1059-1078: "This study applied a top-down method to develop long-term emission inventories. This method is feasible for two reasons. On one hand, long-term emission inventories generally focus on emission trend, sectoral evolution and emission projection, rather than the high-resolution spatial distribution. On the other hand, obtaining long-term activity data for top-down method is more readily accessible. Therefore, most previous studies (Streets et al. 2006, Zhang et al, 2007, Lu et al. 2012, Zheng et al., 2018) also applied the same method to develop long-term emission inventories."

#### **References:**

- Streets, D. G., Zhang, Q., Wang, L. T., He, K. B., Hao, J. M., Wu, Y., Tang, Y. H., and Carmichael, G. R.: Revisiting China's CO emissions after the Transport and Chemical Evolution over the Pacific (TRACE-P) mission: Synthesis of inventories, atmospheric modeling, and observations, Journal of Geophysical Research Atmospheres. 111, doi: 10.1029/2006JD007118, 2006.
- Zhang, Q., Streets, D. G., He, K. B., Wang, Y. X., Richter, A., Burrows, J. P., Uno, I., Jang, C. J., Chen, D., and Yao, Z. L., NOX emission trends for China, 1995–2004: The view from the ground and the view from space, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 112, doi: 10.1029/2007JD008684, 2007.
- Lu, Q., Zheng, J. Y., Ye, S. Q., Shen, X. L., Yuan, Z. B., and Yin, S. S.: Emission trends and source characteristics of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub> and VOCs in the Pearl River Delta region from 2000 to 2009, Atmospheric Environment, 76, 11-20, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.10.062, 2013.
- Zheng, B., Tong, D., Li, M., Liu, F., Hong, C., Geng, G. N., Li, H. Y., L., X., Peng, L. Q., Qi, J., Yan, L., Zhang, Y. X., Zhao, H. Y., Zheng, Y. X., and He, K. B.: Trends in China's anthropogenic emissions since 2010 as the consequence of clean air actions, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 18, 14095-14111, doi: 10.5194/acp-18-14095-2018, 2018.
- Li, C., Jens, B., Zheng, J. Y., Yuan, Z. B., Ou, J. M., Li, Y., Wang, Y. L., and Xu, Y. Q.: Decadal evolution of ship emissions in China from 2004 to 2013 by using an integrated AIS-based approach and projection to 2040, Atmo. Chem. Phys., 18, 6075-6093, doi: 10.5194/acp-18-6075-2018, 2018.

Table S5: is the table for PM10? Please be specific.

**Response:** Yes. We revised the typo error in supplementary information "Table S5.  $PM_{10}$  emission factors for power plants, industrial combustion and dust source"

Line 212 - 215: The dealing method of marine may under-estimate the marine emissions, which are quite important for Guang Dong coastal cities.

**Response:** Thanks for the comment. It is true that the top-down method based on fuel consumption from statistic yearbook might under-estimate the marine emissions due to the absence of passing ship that traveled through the study domain but did not call at any port in mainland China (Li et al., 2018). These passing ships accounted for about 7% of the total fuel consumption in China. To fix the underestimation, the AIS data can be used to calibrate the total fuel consumption in GD. In response to the comment, we discussed the underestimation of marine emissions in the conclusion section. (Lines 1066-1071) "However, this study can be further improved in following aspects. First, a method based fuel consumption might underestimates marine emissions, due to the absence of passing ships that traveled through the study domain but did not call at any port in mainland China (Li et al., 2018). In China, the passing ships accounted for about 7% of the total fuel consumption. To fix the underestimation, the AIS data can be used to calibrate the total the study domain but did not call at any port in mainland China (Li et al., 2018). In China, the passing ships accounted for about 7% of the total fuel consumption. To fix the underestimation, the AIS data can be used to calibrate the total fuel consumption in GD."

**References:** Li, C., Jens, B., Zheng, J. Y., Yuan, Z. B., Ou, J. M., Li, Y., Wang, Y. L., and Xu, Y. Q.: Decadal evolution of ship emissions in China from 2004 to 2013 by using an integrated AIS-based approach and projection to 2040, Atmo. Chem. Phys., 18, 6075-6093, doi: 10.5194/acp-18-6075-2018, 2018.

Line 222-223: Please specify how typical are the annual average vehicle kilometers? How many cities and what types of roads in GuangDong were involved in the field survey?

**Response:** Thanks for the comment. We obtained eight cities and 111 roads by types in Guangdong province in the field survey. The road type includes arterial road, secondary arterial road, and branch, covering most road types in Guangdong. For clarification, we revised the manuscript in lines 348-353 "For on-road mobile sources, population data of different vehicle types (i.e., passenger trucks, buses, taxis, and motorcycles) and the gross weight (heavy and light duty) from the 2006-2015 statistical yearbooks, and annual average vehicle kilometers traveled from a field survey of 8 cities and 111 roads by types (i.e., arterial road, secondary arterial road and branch) in GD were used to characterize the annual change of activity level."

Line: 225-227: The vehicle ratios of fuel use used in this manuscript is too outdated to be used. Moreover, the vehicle ratios should be differentiated for PRD and NPRD. The pattern of the vehicle population in GD changed quite a lot from 2009 to 2015.

**Response:** Thanks for the comment. In fact, we considered the annual change of vehicle ratios of fuel use based on the field survey of vehicle ratios that covered eight cities in Guangdong for the years of 2010, 2012, 2014, and 2015 and published data from Che et al. (2009) for the year of 2006. For other years, we estimated the vehicle ratios using an interpolation method. We agree that the vehicle ratios between PRD and NPRD are different. However, due to the limited survey data, we used the same vehicle ratio for PRD and NPRD regions, which could bring

uncertainty in emission estimation. In response to the comment, we clarified the data and discussed the limitation in the revised manuscript.

Lines 353-359: "We further divided the vehicle type into diesel and gasoline vehicles to obtain a more accurate estimate, based on the vehicle ratios (diesel/gasoline) from our previous study (Che et al., 2009) in 2006 and the field survey covered 8 cities in the years of 2010, 2012, 2014, and 2015. The vehicle ratios in other years (2007-2009, 2011, and 2013) were estimated using an interpolation method."

Lines 1059-1078: Second, the annual average vehicle kilometers traveled and the ratio of diesel vehicles to gasoline vehicles were obtained from a field survey, which only cover 8 cities and 111 roads in GD. These survey data cannot well represent each city in GD and thus might bring uncertainties in characterizing emission evolution of on-road mobile source. To better reflect the temporal pattern and differentiate emissions between different cities in GD, more field survey of vehicle types, fuel consumption, and emission standard should be conducted to better differentiate vehicle emissions between different cities in GD.

**Reference**: Che, W. W., Zheng, J. Y., and Zhong, L. J.: Vehicle Exhaust Emission Characteristics and Contributions in the Pearl River Delta Region, Research of Environmental Sciences, 22, 456-461, 2009.

#### 4. Results section

**General review:** It is just the description of the changes and the sectoral contribution of the multi-year emission inventory. Relevant policy measures were used to explain the sharp drops or increases. It is more like a government report instead of a research paper published in a top journal.

Response: Thanks for the comment. Such an impression might be raised when we introduced the emissions and their trends in Section 2.3 and 2.4, which is somehow inevitable in a dataintense paper. However, it does not necessarily mean that it cannot be a top scientific research paper. The importance of long-term historical emission inventories in air pollution research has been widely recognized by the academic community (Li et al., 2017; Zhang et al., 2018; Hosely et al. 2018; Jin et al. 2017; Li et al. 2017; Lei et al. 2011; Ohara et al. 2017). Here, we advance the understanding of long-term air pollutant emissions in China. The study area, Guangdong province, is one of the three largest city clusters in China. It plays an important role in China's air pollution research frontiers and mitigation efforts. Surprisingly, no attempts have been made to estimate its historical emissions. Some studies have estimated the emissions of Pearl River Delta (PRD), but the emissions of PRD cannot fairly represent Guangdong as a whole. To our best knowledge, this work provides the first long-term record of anthropogenic air pollutant emissions of Guangdong. It provides robust data to assess the effectiveness of control measures and unveil the primary cause of air quality change and fills an important gap in China's air pollution research. Thus, it is potentially highly cited by future work in South China. Moreover, this work observes the phenomenon of 'emission leakages' from developed cities to less developed ones. Emissions in Non-PRD (the other less-developed cities in Guangdong) are becoming increasingly important with some emerging sources such as industrial processes. A new clue or an alarm is putting forward, in sharp contrast to the current mitigation efforts focusing on developed regions. In response to the comment, we revised the introduction and summary section to highlight scientific significance (see previous response). Also, we added more discussions and analysis in Section 2.3 to highlight the "emission leakages" from PRD to NPRD and the cause of emission evolution, as marked in yellow color in the revised manuscript.

#### **References:**

- Li, M.; Liu, H.; Geng, G.; Hong, C.; Liu, F.; Song, Y.; Tong, D.; Zheng, B.; Cui, H.; Man, H.; et al. Anthropogenic Emission Inventories in China: A Review. *Natl. Sci. Rev.* 2017, 4 (6), 834–866.
- Hoesly, R. M.; Smith, S. J.; Feng, L.; Klimont, Z.; Janssens-Maenhout, G.; Pitkanen, T.; Seibert, J. J.; Vu, L.; Andres, R. J.; Bolt, R. M.; et al. Historical (1750-2014) Anthropogenic Emissions of Reactive Gases and Aerosols from the Community Emissions Data System (CEDS). Geosci. Model Dev. 2018, 11 (1), 369–408.
- 3. Jin, Q.; Fang, X.; Wen, B.; Shan, A. Spatio-Temporal Variations of PM2.5 Emission in China from 2005 to 2014. Chemosphere 2017, 183, 429–436.
- Li, J.; Li, Y.; Bo, Y.; Xie, S. High-Resolution Historical Emission Inventories of Crop Residue Burning in Fields in China for the Period 1990-2013. Atmos. Environ. 2016, 138, 152–161.
- 5. Lei, Y.; Zhang, Q.; He, K. B.; Streets, D. G. Primary Anthropogenic Aerosol Emission Trends for China, 1990-2005. Atmos. Chem. Phys. 2011, 11 (3), 931–954.
- Ohara, T.; Akimoto, H.; Kurokawa, J.; Horii, N.; Yamaji, K.; Yan, X.; Hayasaka, T. An Asian Emission Inventory of Anthropogenic Emission Sources for the Period 1980–2020. Atmos. Chem. Phys. 2007, 7, 4419–4444.
- Zheng, B, Dan, T., Meng, L., Fei, L., Chaopeng, H., & Guannan, G., et al. (2018). Trends in china's anthropogenic emissions since 2010 as the consequence of clean air actions. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics Discussions, 1-27.

Line 343: I did not see "emission trends in PRD and NPRD are shown in Fig. 2", Fig 2 only show the trend of PRD instead of NPRD. Please specify.

**Response:** Thanks for pointing out this. The wrong expression for NPRD was removed in the manuscript. We revised the expression in the line 510 "emission trends in PRD are shown in Fig. 5".

Line 346-348: PM2.5 was not shown in figure 2. Please specify.

**Response:** Thanks for pointing out this. We made a typo error and changed "PM2.5" to "PM10" in the revised manuscript. We revised the expression in the lines 512-514 "For PM<sub>10</sub> emissions, the declining trend also closely followed the fluctuant downward trend of ambient PM<sub>10</sub> concentrations and AOD".

Line 349-365: Spatial maps of differences between different years (Figure 3) for the validation are better to see the changes. In term of calculating the emission changes, did you count all the grids or just the typical points in PRD and NPRD region? Please specify.

Response: Accepted, we replotted the spatial maps accordingly. Regarding the calculation of

emission changes, we count all the grids in the PRD and NPRD region. We clarified the calculation method in the manuscript (lines 411-413) "In this study, satellite observations, including  $SO_2$ ,  $NO_2$  and AOD column, and ground-level observations ( $SO_2$ ,  $NO_2$  and  $PM2_{.5}$  concentrations) in PRD were used to evaluate the long-term total emission in GD area." Also we provided the maps in Figure 3 as below.



Figure 3. Changes in spatial patterns of satellite observations over GD in 2007, 2011 and 2015 base on 2006 for (a)-(c) SO<sub>2</sub>, (d)-(f) NO<sub>2</sub>, and (g)-(i) AOD. The legends represent a gradual increase in emissions from top (blue) to bottom (red). Central zone inside the inner black line presents the PRD region, outside presents the NPRD region.

Line 395: figure 5a is showing the result of PRD, not GD. Please specify. **Response:** Accepted. We changed the wrong ordinal number in the sentence (line 599) "The source contribution of to SO<sub>2</sub> emissions in GD also changed (Fig. 4a)."

Line 437: "On-road mobile was also a major contributor to NOX emissions in GD (Fig. 5b)." Fig. 5b is showing results of SO2 for NPRD. Please double check.

**Response:** Thanks for pointing this. We changed the wrong ordinal number in the sentence (line 650) "On-road mobile was also a major contributor to NOX emissions in GD (Fig. 4b)." Line 673: it should be 2.4.4

Response: Accepted. We corrected the number in the manuscript (Line 927) "2.4.4 VOCs".

### **Response to the Reviewer 3:**

This paper shows the long-term evolution  $(2006 \sim 2015)$  of anthropogenic emissions in Guangdong Province of China, to reveal the causes of source-contribution changes during this periods. The

conclusions obtained in this paper are of great significance for the deep understanding of regional pollution emission characteristics, and have important guiding for co-control strategies on regional atmospheric pollution. The datasets produced by the article are conducive to the in-depth study of scientific issues in related fields. Therefore, this paper is strongly recommended for publication.

**Response:** Thanks for your positive comments.

# Supplement of

Evolution of Anthropogenic Air Pollutants Emissions in Guangdong Province, China from 2006 to 2015

**Evolution of Anthropogenic Air Pollutant Emissions in** Guangdong Province, China, from 2006 to 2015 Yahui Bian<sup>a</sup>, Jiamin Ou<sup>b</sup>, Zhijiong Huang<sup>c\*</sup>, Jiamin Ou<sup>b</sup>, Zhuangmin Zhong<sup>a</sup>, Yuanqian Xu<sup>a</sup>, Zhiwei Zhang<sup>a</sup>, Xiao Xiao<sup>a</sup>, Xiao Ye<sup>a</sup>, Yuqi Wu<sup>a</sup>, Xiaohong Yin<sup>a</sup>, Liangfu Chen<sup>d</sup>, Min Shao<sup>c</sup>, Junyu Zheng<sup>a,c,\*</sup> <sup>a</sup> School of Environment and Energy, South China University of Technology, Guangzhou 510006, China <sup>b</sup> School of International Development, University of East Anglia, Norwich NR4 7TJ, UK <sup>c</sup> Institute for Environmental and Climate Research, Jinan University, Guangzhou 510000, China <sup>d</sup>State Key Laboratory of Remote Sensing Science, Institute of Remote Sensing and Digital Earth, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100101, China Corresponding author: Zhijiong Huang Phone: +86-20-37336635 fax: +86-20-37336635 e-mail: bmmj@163.com address: Institute for Environmental and Climate Research, Jinan University, Guangzhou 510006, China Junyu Zheng Phone: +86-20-37336635 fax: +86-20-37336635 e-mail: zhengjunyu work@hotmail.com address: Institute for Environmental and Climate Research, Jinan University, Guangzhou 510006, China 

# 41 Abstract

42	Guangdong province (GD), one of the most prosperous and populous regions in China,
43	still experiences haze events and growing ozone pollution, despite of although it has
44	seen substantial air quality improvement in recent years. Co- <u>Integrated</u> control of fine
45	particulate matter (PM <sub>2.5</sub> ) and ozone in GD calls for a systematic review of historical
46	emission-patterns. In this study, emission trends, spatial variations, source-contribution
47	variations, and reduction potentials of sulfur dioxide (SO2), nitrogen oxides (NOx),
48	$PM_{2.5}$ , inhalable particles ( $PM_{10}$ ), carbon monoxide (CO), ammonia ( $NH_3$ ), and volatile
49	organic compounds (VOCs) in GD from 2006 to 2015 are were revealed examined
50	using a dynamic methodology, taking into account economic development, technology
51	penetration, and emission controls. The relative change rates of anthropogenic
52	emissions in GD during 2006-2015 were are _48% for SO <sub>2</sub> , -0.5% for NO <sub>X</sub> , -16% for
53	$PM_{2.5}$ , -22% for $PM_{10}$ , 13% for CO, 3% for NH <sub>3</sub> , and 13% for VOCs. The declines of
54	SO <sub>2</sub> , NO <sub>X</sub> $\times$ , PM <sub>2.5</sub> , and PM <sub>10</sub> emissions are-in the whole province are mainly-attributed
55	to resulted from the control-drivenstringent emission reductions control in the Pearl
56	River Delta (PRD) region, where most previous control measures focused on,
57	especially from power plants (SO <sub>2</sub> and NO <sub>X</sub> $\times$ ), industrial combustion (SO <sub>2</sub> , PM <sub>2.5</sub> and
58	PM <sub>10</sub> ), on-road mobile source (NO <sub>X</sub> *)s, and fugitive dust source (PM <sub>2.5</sub> and PM <sub>10</sub> ).
59	Emissions from the other areas (the non-PRD, NPRD), nevertheless, remain relatively
60	stable Unlike the PRD region, the non-PRD (NPRD) region see relatively small
61	emission declines, due to the lax control measures and rapidly growing energy
62	consumption. AlsoIn addition, $SO_2$ and NOx emission leaks of $SO_2$ and NOx from
63	<del>power plants and industries were</del> are observed from the PRD to the NPRD were
64	observed duringin 2010 and 2011. As a result, Consequently, eemissions in NPRD,
65	are increasingly important in GD, particularly those from industrial combustionsources.
66	Contribution of NPRD to the total NOx-SO2 emissions in GD, for example, has
67	increased– from <del>*3</del> 27 <del>2</del> % in 2006 to *481% in 2015 <del>, taking NOx_emissions as an</del>
68	example. On-road mobile source and solvent use are the two key sources that should
69	receive more effective control measures in GD. Current Although plenty of control
70	measures were released in the past decade, some of them are not effective, or not
71	enough. Control-driven eemission reductions from on-road mobile source in GD-are
72	neutralized by the substantial growth of light-duty gasoline vehicles population,
73	increased by * times during 2006-2015, while VOC emissions in GD steadily
74	increase, and partly to the shift of industries from the PRD to the non-PRD (NPRD)
75	region in GD. NPRD also contributed to part of the emission decline, but it was only

76	effective until 2011 when GD's Clean Air Action of 12th Five Year was implemented.
77	<u>Bdue to the growth of solvent use and the absence of effective control measures Besides.</u>
78	f, VOC emissions in PRD and NPRD both steadily increased, and this might be one of
79	the reasons that led to the slight upward trends of ozone concentrations in GD. To
80	further reduce emissions, future work should could focus on power plants and industrial
81	combustion in GD and industrial process source in NPRD, which still have large
82	emission reduction potentials. The historical emission inventory developed in this study
83	not only helps to understand the emission evolution in GD, but alsofor emissions of
84	SO2, NOx, and particulate matter, and on solvent use and on-road mobile sources for
85	VOC emissions. This study provides solid scientific support for further air quality
86	improvement in GD. In addition, it provides robust data to quantify the impact of
87	emission and meteorology variations on air quality and unveil the primary cause of
88	significant air quality change in the PRD _ <u>GD</u> region in the recent decade.
89	Keywords: emission trends; source contribution; Guangdong Province; emission
90	reductions

# 91 Introduction

92	Guangdong Province (GD), comprising nine major cities in the Pearl River Delta
93	(PRD) region and eleven under-developmentless developed cities in the Non-PRD
94	(NPRD), is the most prosperous and populous regions embedded inadjacent to the coast
95	of southern China (Figure. S1 in the Supplementary Material). In 2017, occupying
96	With only 1.9% of China's land coverage, GD contributed 10.0% of China's gross
97	domestic product (GDP) and 8.0% of the population in 2017 (GDPBS, 2016-2017).
98	Particularly, the PRD region, dubbed 'the world factory' and embracing a wide variety
99	of industries, represented about 80.0% and 53.4% of GD's total GDP and population,
100	respectively (GDPBS, 2016-2017). Benefited from China's opening-up policies, GD
101	has experienced rapid economic growth but also alongaccompany with serious and
102	complex air pollution issues.
103	In order to To improve-curb the deterioration of its air quality, GD's government
104	agencies have made great efforts to have been made to formulate various control
105	measures and policies, especially after 2013, when the Action Plan on the Prevention
106	and Control of Air Pollution (PCAP, 2013-2017) was launched. The PCAP required the
107	PRD region to reduce $PM_{2.5}$ concentration by 15% by the year 2017 compared with the
108	2013 levels. These policies and control measures, which were summarized in Table S31
109	of SI, helpedpartly alleviated regional air pollution problems in GD. Ground-level
110	observations showned that GD saw an obvious air quality improvement, with $SO_2$ and
111	$PM_{10}$ concentrations decreaseing by 63.3% and 17.7%, respectively, from 2006 to 2017
112	(DEPGEPGD, 2006, 20187). In particular, the PRD region is the first region to meet
113	China's national standard of $35 \ \mu g/m^3$ -PM <sub>2.5</sub> standard (35 $\mu g/m^3$ ) for three consecutive
114	years (34 μg/m <sup>3</sup> in 2015, 32 μg/m <sup>3</sup> in 2016 and 34 μg/m <sup>3</sup> in 2017). <del>China, the world's</del>
115	most prolific emitter of anthropogenic air pollutants, has been working on ways to curb
116	the deterioration of its air quality in recent decades. After the launch of the "Clean Air
117	Action Plan" (CAAP) in 2013, China has seen a dramatic reduction in emissions,
118	mainly driven by control measures in power plants and industrial sources. In 2017, the
119	Ministry of Environmental Protection declared that China had achieved the desired
120	targets of CAAP. Average fine particulate matter (PM2.5) concentrations fell 35% in 74
121	cities across China from 2013 to 2017 (Zheng et al., 2017). China's Guangdong
122	Province (GD), which is one of the most prosperous and populous provinces in China
123	(Fig. S1), is one of the regions that has experienced significant air quality improvement
124	in recent years. Particularly the Pearl River Delta (PRD) region, known as the hub of
125	the "World Factory," is the first region to meet China's national 35 $\mu$ g/m <sup>3</sup> PM <sub>2.5</sub>

126	standard for three consecutive years (34 μg/m <sup>3</sup> in 2015, 32 μg/m <sup>3</sup> in 2016 and 34 μg/m <sup>3</sup>
127	in 2017).
128	However, air pollution in GD is still a major concern. First, tThe annual $PM_{2.5}$
129	<mark>levels still f</mark> ar exceed WHO's PM <sub>2.5</sub> guideline value of 10 μg/m³ (World Health
130	Organization, 2006) and far exceed stricter air-quality standards, such as the WHO IT-2
131	<del>(25 μg/m<sup>3</sup>). Also,</del> haze events frequently occur in winter (Tao et al., 2017). <del>Second<u>Also</u>,</del>
132	the ambient ozone concentrations have been growing in recent years, <u>a phenomenon</u>
133	also observed in northern China. The 90 <sup>th</sup> percentile of the maximum 8-hour average
134	ozone concentration (90%-8h-ozone) in the PRD region increased by 24% since 2015,
135	reaching <del>was</del> 165 μg/m <sup>3</sup> in 2017 <del>,</del> 14% and 9% higher, respectively, than those in 2015
136	and 2016 (GDEMC, EPDHK, EPBMC, 2018).
137	On <del>the contrast to the need for further air quality improvement, the unclear causes</del>
138	of recent air quality change in GD Moreover, the main causes of air quality change in
139	GD is not clarified yet, which mighthinderinsg the development of evidence-based air
140	quality control strategies <del>measures</del> . Although several studies had assessed the impact of
141	emission and meteorology change on air quality, their results are inconsistent with each
142	other. For instance, Lin et al. (2018) suggested that emission controls helped to-improve
143	local air quality in the PRD region, according to a high consistency of ambient $PM_{2.5}$
144	concentrations and emissions. However, Mao et al. (2018) argued that meteorological
145	and climate conditions rather than PM emissions are in control of dominate the
146	interannual variabilities and trends of winter haze days in PRD based on an observation-
147	based approach. Yang et al. (2019) concluded that the inappropriate NOx/VOC control
148	ratio within the PRD over the past years is likely responsible for the ozone increase,
149	while Li et al. (2018) argued that the decrease of PM <sub>2.5</sub> concentration is the main driver.
150	Further mitigation of air pollution in GD calls for a systematic review of historical
151	emissions. First, the long-term historical emission data could help policymakers
152	understand the evolution of emissions, quantify the cuts in emissions that have been
153	achieved by control measures, and identify those sources with the greatest potential for
154	large future emission reductions (Gurjar et al., 2004; Ohara et al., 2007; Zhong et al.,
155	2013). This is particularly important for GD whosethat have less potential for further
156	emission reduction are shrinking as control measures tighten. Second, with the use of
157	atmospheric chemical transport models (CTMs), the historical emission can be used to
158	examine theestablish linkages between air quality improvements and control measures,
159	and thus identify the main causes of air quality change and key control measures. All
160	this information is crucial to guidinge future air-quality management and formulating e
161	robust evidence-based policies.

162	As the pioneer of air pollution research in China, GD is one of the first areas to
163	compile its own emission inventories in China (Zhong et al., 2013). However, no
164	attempts have been made to estimate the historical emissions of GD. Most of the
165	previous emission studies mainly focused on the PRD region, but ignored the NPRD
166	region that also has increased emissions. For instance, Zheng et al. (2009) developed
167	the first high-resolution emission inventory for the PRD region in 2006, followed by
168	emission inventories for speciated volatile organic compounds (VOCs) (Zheng et al.,
169	2009), biogenic VOCs (Zheng et al., 2010), ammonia (NH <sub>3</sub> ) (Yin et al., 2015), biomass
170	burning (He et al., 2011, Zhang et al., 2013), sea salt (Liu et al., 2015) and multiple-
171	year anthropogenic sources (Lu et al., 2013). Due to the strengthened emission controls
172	in PRD, relocation of industries are in courses for those sectors that <u>and the shift of</u>
173	industries that are are energy intensive, or highly polluting, or have excess production
174	capacity from the PRD region to non-PRD (NPRD) areas (Chun, 2012; Yin et al., 2017)
175	(Fig. S2), As a result, emissions in the PRD and NPRD regions have experienced
176	substantial changes in recent years. This means that the emissions of PRD cannot fairly
177	represent Guangdong as a whole. Although several emission inventories in GD were
178	developed recently; (Huang et al., 2015;; Pan et al., 2015;; Liu et al., 2017;; Zhong et
179	al., 2018), they were carried out in a single year —orand—in a— limited in spatial
180	coverage <del>region, or</del> and considering limited source categories <del>, so that they vary in</del>
181	methodology and source classification. Therefore, there is a need to develop a long-
182	term historical emission inventory in GD using a consistent methodology and the same
183	underlying driver data to fill the data gaps and to assist with future air pollution control
184	measures. Further mitigation of air pollution in GD calls for a systematic review of
185	historical emissions, which could help policymakers understand the evolution of
186	emissions, quantify the cuts in emissions that have been achieved by control measures,
187	and identify those sources with the greatest potential for large future emission
188	reductions (Gurjar et al., 2004; Ohara et al., 2007; Zhong et al., 2013). This is
189	particularly important for those regions that have less potential for further emission
190	reduction as control measures tighten. In addition, it is essential to achieve a long term
191	emission inventory to reveal the main causes of changes in air quality, a step that is
192	controversial at present. For instance, Lin et al. (2018) suggested that emission controls
193	helped to improve local air quality in the PRD region, since there was a high
194	consistency of ambient PM <sub>2.5</sub> concentrations and emissions in that region. However,
195	Mao et al. (2018) argued that meteorological and climate conditions rather than PM
196	emissions are in control of the interannual variabilities and trends of winter haze days
197	in PRD based on an observation-based approach. Using atmospheric chemical transport

198	models (CTMs) and long-term emission data, the impacts of emission changes and
199	control measures on air quality can be quantified. Coupled with other models, the
200	corresponding impacts on climate change and population exposure can also be assessed.
201	All this information is crucial to guiding future air-quality management and formulating
202	robust air-quality policies.
203	Guangdong province was one of the first areas in China to compile emission
204	inventories (Zhong et al., 2013). The local government has published PRD regional
205	emission inventories for the base years of 1997, 2001, and 2003 using a top-down
206	approach to support air-quality management. Zheng et al. (2009) developed the first
207	high-resolution emission inventory for the PRD region in 2006. This inventory included
208	six major categories and seven pollutants. Subsequently, emission inventories for black
209	carbon (BC), organic carbon (OC), ammonia (NH3), and biogenic volatile organic
210	compounds (VOCs) in PRD were developed for different base years (Yu et al., 2011;
211	<del>Yin et al., 2015; Li et al., 2016). Huang et al. (2015) expanded the 2006-based emission</del>
212	inventories in PRD to provincial inventories in GD. Pan et al. (2015) updated the GD
213	emission inventories by advancing the base year to 2010 and including additional
214	emission sources. More recently, Zhong et al. (2018) updated the 2012-based GD
215	emission inventories by source classification, emission methods, emission factors, and
216	spatial-temporal surrogates. Regarding the emission trend, Lu et al. (2013)
217	characterized anthropogenic emission trends and their variations in the PRD region
218	from 2000 to 2009. Liu et al. (2017) developed long term vehicle emissions in GD from
219	<del>1994 to 2014</del>
220	One limitation of the above-mentioned studies is that most of them were carried
221	out in a single year or in a limited region, or considering limited sources, so that they
222	vary in methodology and source classification. Furthermore, most of these studies
223	focused mainly on the PRD region due its notable economic growth and urbanization,
224	but ignored the NPRD region that generally had less emissions. However, due to the
225	strengthened emission controls in PRD and the shift of industries that are energy
226	intensive, or highly polluting, or have excess production capacity from the PRD region
227	to non-PRD (NPRD) areas (Chun, 2012; Yin et al., 2017) (Fig. S2), emissions in the
228	PRD and NPRD regions might have experienced substantial changes in recent years.
229	Therefore, there is a need to develop a long term historical emission inventory in GD
230	using a consistent methodology and the same underlying driver data to fill the data gaps
231	and to assist with future air pollution control measures.
232	In this study, we developed a multi-year anthropogenic emission inventory for $SO_2$ .
233	NOx, PM <sub>10</sub> , PM <sub>25</sub> , CO, VOCs, and NH <sub>3</sub> for the years from 2006 to 2015 using a

234 dynamic methodology that considers economic development, technological penetration, and emission controls. The emission trends were validated by ground-based 235 measurements and satellite observations. Based on the long-term historical inventory, 236 237 the emission changes, contribution variations, possible causes for the observed air quality improvement, and reduction potentials in 2020 in PRD and NPRD were 238 analyzed and compared, which could provide scientific evidence for future air quality 239 240 regulations in GD. Also, tThe long-term emission inventories developed in this study 241 are also essential data to evaluate the effectiveness of emission control measures and identify the dominant cause of significant air quality change in the PRD regionGD. 242 243 244

245 **1 Methodology and data** 

### **1.1 Methods for emission estimations**

247 In this study, we applied a dynamic technology-based methodology that considers economic development, technological penetration, and emission controls to estimate 248 249 the anthropogenic emission trends in GD, following previous studies on emission trends 250 (Streets et al., 2006; Zhang et al., 2007; Lu et al., 2013). We estimated emissions of 7 pollutants (SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, VOCs, CO, and NH<sub>3</sub>) from 13 major categories, 251 including power plants, industrial combustion, residential combustion, on-road mobile 252 source, non-road mobile source, dust source, industrial process source, industrial 253 254 solvent use, non-industrial solvent use, storage and transportation, agricultural source, biomass burning, and other sources, were estimated. On the basis of Zhong et al. (2018), 255 and 70 sub-categories based on Pan et al. (2015) and the guidelines for the development 256 of an air-pollutant emission inventory for Chinese cities (MEPC, 2017), the 13 major 257 categories were further broken down into 70 sub-categories to improve emission 258 259 estimation. Detail categories applied in this study are listed in Table S<del>12 of SI. . The</del> major categories include power plants, industrial combustion, residential combustion, 260 on-road mobile source, non-road mobile\_source, dust sources, industrial 261 processesindustrial process source, industrial solvent use, non-industrial solvent use, 262 storage and transportation, agricultural sourcesagricultural source, biomass burning, 263 264 and other sources (Table S1). Unlike the single-year emission inventory, the estimation of a long-term emission 265 266 inventory is generally more complicated since it requires the data sources, estimation

267 <u>method and source category for all years are consistent. Although top-down methods</u>
 268 <u>or on-line estimation methods based on big data can promote the estimation, obtaining</u>

269 the long-term activity data, such as Automatic Identification System (AIS) data for ship emission and Global Positioning System (GPS) data for on-road mobile source, is 270 challenging. Therefore, most studies (Streets et al., 2006;; Zhang et al., 2007;; Lu et al., 271 2012; Zheng, et al., 2018), still generally applied the top-down method to develop long-272 273 term emission inventories. Following previous studies, we applied a dynamic technology-based methodology that considers economic development, technological 274 penetration, and emission controls to estimate the anthropogenic emission trends in GD, 275 following previous studies on emission trends (Streets et al., 2006; Zhang et al., 2007; 276 277 Lu et al., 2013).

Except for on-road mobile and construction dust sources, emissions of most anthropogenic sources were calculated as follows:

280 
$$E_{i,n} = \sum_{i,j,k} A_{i,j,k,n} \sum_{m} (X_{i,j,k,m,n} EF_{j,k,m,n}) \sum_{z} [C_{z,n}(1-\eta_z)]$$
(1)

281 where *i*, *j*, *k*, *m*, *n*, and *z* represent the city, the emission source, the type of fuel or product, the production technology, the year, and the control technology, respectively, 282 283 A represents the activity level (such as the fuel consumption or material production), X represents the percentage of fuel or production for a sector consumed or produced by a 284 specific technology *m*, *EF* is the unabated emission factor,  $EF \sum_{z} [C_{z}(1 - \eta_{z})]$  is the 285 net EF after applying control technology, C is the penetration of the control technology 286 287 z,  $\eta$  is the removal efficiency of the control technology z, and S and SR represent the sulfur content in fuel and the sulfur retention in ash, respectively. For fuel combustion, 288 289 the EF of SO<sub>2</sub> was estimated using the following equation:

290

$$EF = 2 \times S \times (1 - SR) \tag{2}$$

For on-road mobile sources and construction dust, emissions were estimated by Eqs. (3) and (4), respectively. The methods from previous studies employed for the other emission sources are listed in detail in Table S2 in the Supplementary Material (SI).

295 
$$E_{i,n} = \sum_{i,j} (P_{i,j,n} \times VKT_{i,j,n} \times EF_{j,n})$$
(3)

$$E_{i,n} = \sum_{i} \left( S_{i,n} \times T_{i,n} \times EF_{i,n} \right) \tag{4}$$

where *i*, *j*, and *n* represent the city, the vehicle type, and the year, respectively, *P* is the vehicle population, and *VKT* is annual average vehicle kilometers traveled. *i* and *n* represent the city and the year, respectively. *S* is the construction area, and *T* is the construction cycle.

301

296

The annual emission mainly depends on activity data, emission factors, and

302 removal efficiencies of emission controls. Therefore, An accurate representation of the
 303 annual change of activity data and emission factors is critical for <u>estimating long-term</u>
 304 characterizing the emission-<u>strend</u>. Here, we provided a detailed description of activity
 305 data and emission factors applied in this study.

306

## **307 1.1.1 Activity data**

308 The estimation of a multiyear emission inventory is complicated since it requires 309 consistent and accurate activity data and EFs (Zhang et al., 2007). Most of the activity 310 data during 2006-2015 in this study were obtained from officially released statistics or 311 relevant reports. Either surrogate data or data interpolation was used to fill in the data 312 for some sources that lack continuous and consistent long-term activity data. Notably, 313 the activity data that specifies an individual industry or power plant, defined as point 314 data, were preferentially used, since these data generally have detailed information on 315 the location, technical level and control measures. Otherwise, activity data at the city 316 level, known as areal data, were adopted as a second choice. In this study, for power 317 plants and industrial combustion, we used a combination of point data and areal data to 318 characterize the activity level, while the other sources all relied on areal data. The 319 detailed data sources are summarized in Table <u>\$2\$3</u>. Here, we describe the processing 320 of activity data for some major sources, e.g., industrial combustion, construction dust, 321 marine and on-road mobile sources.

322 For industrial combustion, we used the total consumption of different energy types 323 during 2006-2015 from the GD Statistical Yearbook (GDPBS, 2007-2016) to represent 324 the activity level of each city. Also, we used a detailed dataset from GD pollutant statistical reports to estimate consumption value of different energy types, the averaged 325 326 sulfur contents, and removal efficiencies of industrial combustion in each city. This 327 dataset, which records the annual fuel consumption, sulfur contents, control devices, 328 removal efficiencies, product output, and the geographic location of each plant, contains about 85% of the plants in GD and covers the years of 2006, 2010, 2012, 2014, 329 330 and 2015. For the years that lack a detailed dataset, the averaged sulfur contents and 331 removal efficiencies were estimated by linear interpolation and emission control policy.

For construction dust sources, we used the total annual construction area and construction cycle time to represent the activity level. The construction area data were derived from the GD city statistical yearbook (GDPCSY, 2007-2016), and the construction cycle time was determined by the time requirement required for different construction phases, i.e., earthwork excavation, foundations, earthwork backfill, and general construction. Considering the effect of rainfall in suppressing dust sources, we revised the construction cycle time by combining our previous study (Yang, 2014) with
rainfall information for each year obtained from the GD Meteorological Service
(GDMS, 2007-2016).

341 Regarding marine sources, the characterization of activity level was based on 342 heavy and diesel fuel consumption. However, it is challenging to acquire detailed consumption of various fuel types directly. Thus, we used the method described in Li 343 344 et al. (20172018) to convert the cargo volumes and transport distances of major 345 navigation routes into fuel consumption data via fuel consumption rates. Fuel 346 consumption rates were taken from the IMO report (IMO, 2009). The cargo volumes in 347 each city were obtained from GD Statistical Yearbooks (GDPBS, 2007-2016). Transport distances of major navigation route data were measured by the historical AIS-348 349 based digital map.

350 For on-road mobile sources, population data of different vehicle types (i.e., passenger trucks, buses, taxis, and motorcycles) and, the gross weight (heavy and light 351 duty) from the- 2006-2015 statistical yearbooks, and annual average vehicle 352 kilometers traveled from a field survey of some-8 cities and 111 roads by types (i.e., 353 354 arterial road, secondary arterial road and branch) in GD were used to characterize the annual change of activity level. We further divided the vehicle type into differentiated 355 diesel and gasoline vehicles to obtain a more accurate estimate, based on the , but this 356 information was not available from the official statistics. Not only vehicle ratios (diesel/ 357 358 gasoline) from our previous study (Che et al., 2009) in 2006 and -were considered, but 359 also-the field survey covered 8 cities in the years of 2010, 2012, 2014, and 2015-were carried out to obtain those information. The vehicle ratios in other years (2007-2009, 360 361 2011, and 2013) were estimated using an interpolation method. However, subjected to the availability and continuity of data, vehicle ratios in some absent years were deduced 362 according to the known years. Therefore, we distinguished the vehicle population based 363 364 on test results regarding the vehicular ratios of fuel use in GD (Che et al., 2009) following a method in our previous study (Lu et al., 2013). 365

366

## **1.1.2 Emission factors (EFs)**

EFs could have changed with the implementation of emission controls in GD during 2006-2015 (Table S3), which involve technological penetration and evolution. To deal with that possibility, we developed a dynamic method to reflect the response of EFs to control measures and technological penetration. First, we established the unabated EF of each source to represent what that the emission level would have been without any treatment. The unabated EFs for most emission sources of various

pollutants (i.e., NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, VOCs, CO, and NH<sub>3</sub>) used in this study are listed in 374 375 Tables S4-9, and are based mainly on the latest research results and values 376 recommended in related manuals of air-pollutant emission coefficients. Next, we 377 estimated the net EFs of each source according to the corresponding processing 378 technologies, control technologies, and removal efficiencies that might vary with years. In this study, we applied the dynamic method to all emission sources. In the following 379 380 subsection, we mainly describe their application to major sources that have received 381 intensive control measures in the past decade: including power plants, industrial 382 combustion, VOCs-related sources, and on-road mobile sources.

383 The net EFs of SO<sub>2</sub> for industries and power plants in GD were determined based on removal efficiencies and fuel sulfur content. The annual removal efficiencies and 384 385 sulfur content in 2006, 2010, 2012, 2014, and 2015 were obtained from GD pollutant statistical reports (GDPSR, 2006, 2010, 2012, 2014, 2015) for industries; those 386 parameters for power plants in 2006-2014 were obtained from power-plant reports 387 388 (CSPG, 2006-2014). For years without these documented data, an interpolation method 389 that considers newly released regulations of SO<sub>2</sub> emission controls and expert judgment were used to estimate the removal efficiency and sulfur contents (2007-2009, 2011, and 390 391 2013 for industries and 2015 for power plants). For instance, the sulfur content of coal and oil in industrial sources can be estimated as <0.7% and 0.8%, respectively, 392 393 according to the Guangdong industrial boiler pollution remediation program (2012-394 2015) released in 2012.

395 For VOCs-related sources, such as industrial solvent use, non-industrial solvent 396 use, and industrial process sources, the net EFs of VOCs were determined based on the installation rate of VOC control technologies and the removal efficiencies, which were 397 acquired by an on-site investigation of VOCs-related industries in GD. Additionally, 398 399 the new VOC emission standards were also used to determine in which year VOC control technologies were implemented. For example, emission standards for furniture 400 401 surface coating and shoemaking were implemented in 2010 (Emission standard of volatile organic compounds for furniture manufacturing operations (DB44/814-2010), 402 Emission standard of volatile organic compounds for shoe-making industry 403 (DB44/817-2010)). Thus, we estimated the net VOC EFs for furniture surface coating 404 and shoemaking with the consideration of VOC removal efficacies since 2010. For the 405 vehicular EFs, we used the same method employed in our previous study (Lu et al., 406 407 2013). The vehicular EFs were calculated based on the 2007 International Vehicle Emissions (IVE) model (ISSRC, 2008), while the EFs for other years were derived from 408 2007-based EFs in consideration of emission standards, fuel standards, and vehicle 409

### 411

### 412 **1.2 Data for validation**

413 In this study, satellite observations, including SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub> and AOD column, and 414 ground-level observations (SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub> and PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations) in PRD were used to evaluate the long-term total emission in GD area (the total emission in GD area). To 415 validate the multi-year emissions in GD, we compared the emission trends with 416 satellite-based data. The SO<sub>2</sub> column amount (OMSO2e v003) and the NO<sub>2</sub> 417 tropospheric column (OMNO2d v003) were retrieved from the Ozone Monitoring 418 Instrument (OMI) with a spatial resolution of 0.25°×0.25° (available at 419 https://giovanni.gsfc.nasa.gov/giovanni/). Aerosol optical depth (AOD) data were taken 420 from the Moderate-Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer (MODIS) aerosol product 421 422 MOD04 resolution of 10 with а high km (available at 423 https://ladsweb.modaps.eosdis.nasa.gov/). The ground-level observations in PRD during 2006-2015 were obtained from the PRD Regional Air Quality Monitoring 424 425 Network (RAQMN) (GDEMC, EPDHK, EPBMC, 2007-2016)In addition, ground-426 level observations obtained from the PRD air-quality monitoring network (GDEMC, 427 EPDHK, EPBMC, 2007-2016) were also used to validate emission trends in PRD. The 428 RAQMN, which came into operation at the end of 2005 and has provided accurate air quality data to local governments and the public, was adopted because of the high 429 reliability of the operating procedures on quality assurance and quality controls 430 (QA/QC). We also collected the ground-level observations averaged over the GD from 431 432 annual reports of Guangdong Provincial environment published by the department of 433 environmental protection of Guangdong province. However, this data is less representatives since the ground-level stations in NPRD are much sparser and the 434 435 QA/QC procedures are not well implemented in NPRD. The air-quality monitoring network came into operation at the end of 2005 and has 436

provided accurate air quality data to local governments and the public. These data from 437 438 the PRD air quality monitoring network were adopted because of the high reliability of 439 the operating procedures on quality assurance and quality controls. We focused on the 440 evaluation of emission trends. Therefore, we mainly compared annual observations 441 averaged over the PRD/GD region with annual emissions in PRD/GD. Also, emissions 442 and satellite observations in PRD and NPRD region were compared. Also, emissions and satellite observations in PRD and NPRD region were compared to briefly evaluate 443 the spatial variation of emissions in GD. -444

445Since emissions mainly concentrated in urban areas, where ground-level446observations in RAQMN located, the sparsity of ground-level observations was447ignored in the evaluation.

- 448
- 449

# 450 **2 Results and discussion**

### 451 **2.1 Overall emission trends**

452 The overall emission trends of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, VOCs, CO, and NH<sub>3</sub> in 453 GD during 2006-2015 are presented in Fig. 1. From 2006 to 2015, anthropogenic emissions decreased by 48% for SO<sub>2</sub>, 0.5% for NO<sub>X</sub>, 16% for PM<sub>2.5</sub>, and 22% for PM<sub>10</sub>, 454 but increased for CO, NH<sub>3</sub>, and VOCs, by 13%, 3%, and 33%, respectively. Specifically, 455 456 SO<sub>2</sub> emissions fell steadily during 2006-2015, which might be due to the strict controls on SO<sub>2</sub> emissions implemented in the 11th Five Year Plan (FYP) (2006-201504) and 12th 457 458 FYP (2011-2015). These two FYP all required the total national SO<sub>2</sub> emission to be cut by 105%, relative to the 2005 and 2010 level, respectively. NO<sub>X</sub> emissions overall 459 showed an upward trend in the early period, reaching a peak in 2011. After the 460 implementation of the Planning for Guangdong province environmental protection and 461 ecological construction in 12th FYP (PGGP, 2011) in 2011, in which NO<sub>X</sub> emission 462 caps of all industrial sectors were proposed, NO<sub>X</sub> emissions decreased, declining by 9% 463 in 2015. The PM<sub>10</sub> and PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions showed an increasing trend during 2006-2009 464 but then decreased steadily. Similarly, CO emissions showed a small rise during 2006-465 2013, followed by a sharp decline. NH<sub>3</sub> emissions changed a little, while VOC 466 emissions steadily increased over the 2006-2015 period, mainly fueled by the absence 467 of effective emission-control measures. 468

469 Although emissions of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM, and CO declined in recent years, the per capita GDP, fuel consumption, and vehicle population in GD, which account for most 470 anthropogenic pollution activity, saw growth from 2006 to 2015, as shown in Fig. 1. 471 From 2006 to 2015, the per capita GDP and vehicle population significantly increased, 472 by 135% and 66%, respectively. Obviously, anthropogenic emissions in GD were 473 decoupling from economic and energy consumption growth. This means that the 474 emission regulations and control measures enacted in GD have alleviated emissions 475 despite the growth of economic activity. For instance, NO<sub>X</sub> emissions are closely related 476 477 to fuel consumptions because a large proportion of their emissions are from industries or power plants that consume a great deal of fuel. However, the trends of NO<sub>X</sub> emissions 478 and fuel consumption have deviated from each other since 2011 when low NO<sub>X</sub>-479

combustion (LNB) control measures and flue gas denitrification technology (i.e.,
selective catalytic reduction (SCR) and selective non-catalytic reduction (SNCR)) in
power plants were enacted.

483 We have also compared emission trends in PRD and NPRD (Fig. S3). Since 484 emissions in GD were mainly concentrated in the PRD region, emission trends in PRD were similar to those in GD, except NO<sub>X</sub> emissions, which started off steady until 2012 485 and then fell slightly. Compared with 2006, the 2015 emissions of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, 486 and PM<sub>10</sub> in PRD decreased by 63%, 14%, 35%, and 27%, respectively, while CO and 487 488 VOCs emissions increased by 2% and 35%, respectively. In NPRD, SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, 489 and PM<sub>10</sub> emission trends differed from those in PRD. Compared with 2006, the 2015 emissions of SO<sub>2</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, and PM<sub>10</sub> in NPRD decreased by only 8%, 8%, and 5%, 490 491 respectively, but emissions of VOCs, NH<sub>3</sub>, CO, and NO<sub>X</sub> significantly increased —by 492 30%, 10%, 31%, and 29%, respectively. The discrepancy of emission trends between 493 PRD and NPRD was expected. This israised because these two regions achieved 494 different levels of progress on air quality management in the past decade-due to the 495 discrepancy in economic development. Overall, most previous control strategies (Table 496 S3) still focused mainly on PRD (Table S31) while the NPRD region received little 497 attention. In Table S31, all of these 11 control strategies involve PRD, while only 6 of 498 them cover NPRD. -Moreover, initiated by due to the policies of "vacate the cage and 499 change birds" (in Chinese, Teng Long Huan Niao) initiated by the Guangdong 500 provincial government in 2008 (Li & Fung, 2008; Yang, 2012), many low-tech 501 industries in PRD were relocated to NPRD. As a result, emissions of NPRD is becoming 502 more and more obvious in GD. For instance, the contribution of NPRD to SO<sub>2</sub> 503 emissions in GD has increased from 27.1% in 2006 to 48.2% in 2015 (Table 1). For 504 NO<sub>xX</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> emissions, the proportions increased from 31.6% to 40.6%, from 49.5% to 56.0% and from 50.3% to 54.0%, respectively. The statistical results showed 505 506 33 industrial parks were undertaken in NPRD until 2014 (GDEI, 2014). Detailed emission evolutions and the corresponding causes are discussed in Sec. 2.3. 507

508

## 509 2.2 Validation of emission trends

510 In this section, we validate emission trends in PRD using ground observations and 511 satellite data (Fig. 2). The comparison of emission trends with measurements in GD 512 also presented in Fig. S4. In general, these two data sources are consistent for emission 513 trends of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, and PM<sub>10</sub>. During 2006-2015, SO<sub>2</sub> emissions in PRD decreased by 514 63% (emission trends in PRD and NPRD are shown in Fig. 25), slightly less than the 515 68% and 86% observed in ground-level and satellite data, respectively. NOx emissions and observations all showed a declining trend during 2006-2015. For  $PM_{10}$  emissions,

- 517 the declining trend also closely followed the fluctuant downward trend of ambient
- 518 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations and AOD. The fluctuations of observations were associated with
   519 PM<sub>2.5</sub> formation influenced by annual variations of meteorology.
- 520 The change in the spatial variation of emissions in GD was also evaluated using satellite measurements. Here, the relative change of column concentrations of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub>, 521 and AOD in 2007, 2011, and 2015 to 2006 were illustrated in Fig. 3. The annual column 522 changes based on 2006 in column concentrations of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>2</sub>, and AOD for GD in the 523 years 2007, 2011, and 2015 were applied, as illustrated in Fig. 3 (the changes of column 524 525 concentrations in the remaining years during 2006-2015 are all displayed in Fig. S45. The spatial patterns of satellite observations of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, and AOD are displayed in 526 527 Fig. S5 and. eEmission spatial variation of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, and PM<sub>2.5</sub> during 2006-2015 are displayed in Fig. S4 and Fig. S57, respectively). Overall, the spatial patterns of the 528 satellite measurements also reveal the different emission trends between PRD and 529 530 NPRD. For example, SO<sub>2</sub> column concentration in PRD decreased by 71% from 2007 531 to 2011, but in NPRD increased by 26%. This agrees with the emission trends, in which SO<sub>2</sub> emissions in PRD decreased by 39% while those in NPRD increased by 15%. From 532 2011 to 2015, SO<sub>2</sub> column concentration decreased by 31% and 42% in PRD and NPRD, 533 respectively, and SO<sub>2</sub> emissions decreased by 32% and 20% in PRD and NPRD, 534 respectively. From 2007 to 2011, NO2 column concentration decreased by 16% in PRD 535 but increased by 16% in NPRD. These trends also coincided with emission changes, 536 which NO<sub>X</sub> emissions in PRD decreased by 13% but increased by 36% in NPRD. From 537 538 2011 to 2015, NO<sub>2</sub> column concentration and NO<sub>X</sub> emissions both decreased in PRD and NPRD. AOD displayed a decrease of approximately 23% in PRD and NPRD from 539 2007 to 2015. A similar pattern was also found in PM2.5 emission trends, with decreases 540 of 35% in PRD and 9% in NPRD. 541
- 542 Overall, the above-mentioned validations using satellite observations and ground 543 measurements demonstrate that emission trends of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, and PM estimated in this 544 study are reliable.
- 545

## **2.3 Evolution of source emissions in Guangdong Province**

547 To further understand the evolution of emissions in GD, we estimated the changes 548 of anthropogenic emissions by emission category in PRD and NPRD during 2006-2015. 549 Here, we examine the PRD and NPRD regions separately since these two regions may 550 have experienced diverse emission evolutions due to their different levels of progress 551 on air-quality management. The annual source contributions during 2006-2015 are also presented in Fig. 4 (GD) and Fig. <del>S5</del>-<u>S67</u> (PRD and NPRD).

# **2.3.1 SO**<sub>2</sub>

555	In PRD, SO <sub>2</sub> emissions steadily declined, from 0.788 Tg in 2006 to 0.292 Tg in
556	2015. The decline was dominated by power plants and industrial combustion,
557	accounting for 50.0% and 46.8% of the total decrease, respectively (Fig. 5a). The
558	decline of SO <sub>2</sub> emissions from power plants and industrial combustion is highly
559	associated with the control measures enacted during the 11 <sup>th</sup> FYP and 12 <sup>th</sup> FYP. which
560	decreased by 0.247 Tg and 0.232 Tg, respectively, in this period (Fig. 5a).In response
561	to the SO <sub>2</sub> emission cap in 11 <sup>th</sup> FYP, Guangdong province required the elimination of
562	small thermal power units with high energy consumption and outdated combustion
563	technology in 2007. By the end of 2011, 12.2 million kilowatts of small thermal power
564	units were eliminated during the 11 <sup>th</sup> FYP. In addition, action plan for air pollution
565	<u>prevention and control in Guangdong province (2014-2017) (GDEP, 2014) —the</u>
566	"Action plan for air pollution prevention and control in Guangdong province" released
567	in the 12 <sup>th</sup> FYP further strengthen the emission control of power plants. As a result, the
568	flue gas desulfurization (FGD) penetration in coal-fired power plants rose to 87% in
569	2013. For the industrial combustion, its fuel- consumption in PRD decreased by 47.5%
570	during 2006-2015, which can be explained by energy structural adjustment regulations,
571	including the "total amount control of coals" and "changing fuel from coal to natural
572	gas" control measures (Fig <del>ure</del> . S87). The detailed regulations on energy structural
573	adjustment are summarized in Table S1.
574	- This indicates that flue-gas desulfurization, the control of sulfur content of fuels,
575	and boiler renovation of SO <sub>2</sub> emission controls in the 11 <sup>th</sup> FYP were effective. In NPRD,
576	on the contrary, SO <sub>2</sub> emission increased until 2010, when it <u>then</u> saw a downturn. Before
577	2010, the SO <sub>2</sub> emission growth was mainly associated with the increase of industrial
578	combustion and non-road mobile sources (Fig. 5b). These two sources still maintained
579	a slight rise after 2010, but their increased emissions were offset by a sharp-plunge of
580	emissions from power plants, which resulted mainly from tightening desulfurization
581	technology. To reveal the reason for cause of the emission growth from of industrial
582	combustion in NPRD, we compared the standard_fuel-consumption trends from
583	industrial combustion in PRD and NPRD <u>(Fig. 6)</u> . As shown in Fig. 6, t <u>In PRD, t</u> he fuel
584	consumption from industrial combustion in PRD steadily dropped by 47% during 2006-
585	2015, with an average annual descending rate of 6.9%. By contrast, In NPRD, by
586	contrast, the fuel consumption it-increased by 99%, mainly after 2010In fact, the
587	average annual growth rates of fuel consumption in NPRD was only 3.2% before 2010,

588 but after that, the increase accelerated, with an average annual growth rate of 11.9% during 2011-2015. Particularly, the growth rate peaked in 2011 (17.1%) and 2012 589 590 (14.5%). Meanwhile, the descending rates of fuel consumption in PRD also reached its peak in 2011 (9.9%) and 2012 (11.4%), when the shift of industries implemented. This 591 592 fact indicates the existence of emission leak from PRD to NPRD due to the policy of "vacate the cage and change birds" that brought many energy-intensive industries from 593 594 PRD to NPRD. Statistical data showed that the NPRD region had undertaken 33 industrial parks that migrated from PRD, as shown in Table S10 (GDEI, 2014). 595 Consequently, the industrial shift might, in turn, promote the emission of power plants 596 597 in NPRD to some extent.

598 This might be closely associated with the policy of "vacate the cage and change 599 birds" that brought many energy-intensive industries from PRD to NPRD. Emissions 600 and emissions per unit GDP of industrial waste gases increased \_\_by 63.1% and 53.3% 601 in NPRD during 2008-2013, respectively, due to industrial relocation in GD, far more 602 than those in PRD (Liu, 2016).

The source contribution of to SO<sub>2</sub> emissions in GD also changed (Fig.5a4a). In 603 604 GD, the contribution of power plants dropped from 43% to 27%. By contrast, the contribution of industrial combustion remained stable, in the range of 36% to 41%. 605 606 Therefore, industrial combustion took over from replaced power plants to and became became the largest SO<sub>2</sub> emission source in GD. The PRD and NPRD regions also had 607 similar changes (Fig. S5aS76a-b). Note that the contribution of non-road mobile 608 sources to SO<sub>2</sub> emissions both increased both in PRD (from 13% to 29%) and NPRD 609 (from 8% to 17%), due to the absence of effective emission control measures. Also, the 610 611 contribution of industrial process source slightly increased in NPRD, from 5% to 11%. Therefore, future work should be focused on non-road mobile source to further reduce 612 SO<sub>2</sub> emissions in GD. In addition, in NPRD, industrial combustion also might have 613 potential for reduction, since its contribution slightly increased, from 5% to 11%. 614

615

### 616 **2.3.2 NO**X

As with SO<sub>2</sub> emissions, the evolution of NO<sub>X</sub> emissions also differed between PRD and NPRD. In PRD, NO<sub>X</sub> emissions dropped overall from 0.926 Tg in 2006 to 0.797 Tg in 2015, especially after 2012-2011, when NO<sub>\*X</sub> was put on the list of pollutant control, NO<sub>X</sub> emissions saw a noticeable downturn (Fig. 5c). Power plants were the principal-primary sources leading to emission reduction. This expected because the local government had released—"—"the implementation plan for nitrogen reduction and denitrification project for power plants in Guangdong province"—"into respond

response to the explicit reduction target of reducing NO<sub>X</sub> emissionss in the 12<sup>th</sup> FYP 624 (2011-2015). As a result, -a large number of power plants had installed NO<sub>X</sub> removal 625 626 equipment since 2011. Thus, iBy the end ofn 2015, NO<sub>X</sub> emissions from power plants declined by 54.0% compared withwere 0.214 Tg less than in 2006 due to the increasing 627 628 installment of flue gas denitration facility since 2011. However, a part of the NO<sub>X</sub> emission reductions\_-from power plants in PRD was still-canceled out by the growth 629 in emission growth from non-road mobile source, which increased by 65.7% during 630 2006-2015<del>s, an increase of 0.452 Tg; and on-road mobile sources, with a slight increase</del> 631 of 0.012 Tg. Despite the intensive control measures for urban vehicle exhaust, NOx 632 633 emissions from on-road mobile source still kept a slowly growing trend, indicating that these control measures were Recent control measures have focused on vehicle exhaust, 634 635 but it is unlikely to offset the increasing vehicle population in PRD, which increased by 88% during 2006-2015. Consequently, on-road mobile sources (growing from 32% in 636 2006 to 38% in 2015) overtook power plants (growing from 43% to 23%) as the largest 637 638 contributor to  $NO_X$  emissions in PRD since 2010 (Fig. <u>S5eS67c</u>).

- 639 Unlike in PRD, NO<sub>X</sub> emissions in NPRD rebounded in 2008 and grew sharply 640 until 2012. The emission changes were mainly from industrial combustion, non-road 641 mobile sources, and power plants (Fig. 5d). Among these three sources, NO<sub>X</sub> emissions 642 from industrial combustion and non-road mobile sources both showed an upward trend, increasing by 159% and 84%, respectively, during 2006-2015. These trends can be 643 644 explained by the shift of energy-intensive industries from PRD to NPRD and the 645 absence of catch-up emission controls for industries and non-road mobile sources. In 646 fact, most of the control measures for non-road mobile source were released after 2015. 647 Since 2011, possibly due to the implementation of denitrification technology, NO<sub>X</sub> emissions from power plants steadily went down and offset the slight increase in 648 649 emissions from industrial combustion and non-road mobile sources. Consequently, the 650 contribution of power plants to the total NOx emissions in NPRD, which was once a 651 large contributor, decreased from 44% in 2006 to 28% in 2015. By contrast, 652 contributions of industrial combustion and non-road mobile sources increased from 14% 653 to 29% and from 16% to 23%, respectively (Fig. S6756d).
- 654 On-road mobile was also a major contributor to NO<sub>X</sub> emissions in GD (Fig. <u>5b4b</u>). 655 Although the total NO<sub>X</sub> emissions of on-road mobile sources changed slightly in 2006-656 2015, their sectoral contribution showed significant change, especially in PRD (Fig. 657 S<u>5676</u>c). Here, we further analyze the trends of NO<sub>X</sub> emissions from on-road mobile 658 sources and the vehicle population from 2006 to 2015 for PRD (Fig. 7a) and NPRD 659 (Fig. 7b). Overall, on-road mobile NO<sub>x</sub>-NO<sub>X</sub> emissions in PRD were approximately

660	three times higher than those in NPRD, but their trends were similar. In both PRD and
661	NPRD, Although the heavy-duty diesel truck (HDDT) population slightly grew until
662	2014 in both PRD and NPRD, $NO_{X}$ emissions from HDDT still dropped by 10.0%
663	and 30.8% during 2006-2015, respectively, which NOx emissions from heavy-duty
664	diesel truck (HDDT) slightly decreased although the HDDT population showed growth
665	before 2014. Apparently, this was closely related to the improvement in vehicular
666	emission and fuel standards. During the study period, the emission standard for vehicles
667	raised from China III–III (2008) to China IV–IV (2013), while the oil standard
668	improved from China III–III (2009) to China V–V– (2014). The proportion of China
669	III HDDT vehicles increased by over 50% in both PRD and NPRD (Liu et al. 2017).
670	$\mathrm{NO}_{\mathrm{X}}$ emissions from heavy-duty diesel vehicle (HDDV) also dropped, partly due to the
671	reduced_decreased_HDDV vehicles_population. Unlike the HDDT and HDDV, the
672	population of light-duty gasoline vehicle (LDGV) increased significantly, by a factor
673	of 5 and 6 in PRD and NPRD, respectively. This inevitably led to the obvious growth
674	of $NO_{X}$ * emissions from LGDV, despite of the enhancement of vehicle emission
675	standard and weed out of yellow label vehicles The upsurge of the LDGV population
676	outpaced the new standards on vehicle emission enacted since 2009 (PGGP, 2009),
677	leading to growth of NO <sub>X</sub> -emissions from LGDV.
678	Consequently, the contribution of LGDV to NOx emissions in PRD surged from

679 12% in 2006 to 34% in 2015.

Based on the above analysis, it can be concluded that the NO<sub>X</sub> emission trend in 680 GD is dominated by the decline of power plants in PRD and the increase of non-road 681 682 mobile source and industrial combustion in PRD and NPRD. Particularly, the 683 contribution of non-road mobile source and industrial combustion to  $\frac{NO_x}{NO_x}$ emissions in GD increased from 13% in 2006 to 23% in 2015 and from 12% to 20%, 684 685 respectively (Fig. 4b), indicating that these two sources should receive more attention in future emission-control measures, especially industrial combustion in NPRD. 686 687 Regarding on-road mobile sources, the largest contributor to NO<sub>XX</sub> emissions in PRD, LDGVs, should require more attention in the future. 688

689

### 690 2.3.3 PM<sub>10</sub>/PM<sub>2.5</sub>

691 As shown in Fig.  $4e_{5e}-dh$ , the main sectoral changes between PM<sub>10</sub> and PM<sub>2.5</sub> 692 emission were somewhat similar to each other. Therefore, we focused mainly on the 693 analysis of PM<sub>10</sub> emissions. <u>PM<sub>10</sub> emissions in PRD</u> and NPRD showed similar <u>PM<sub>10</sub></u> 694 emission variations regarding emission trends and source contributions. They both 695 topped out in 2009 and then decreased monotonically. Compared with 2006, PM<sub>10</sub>

696 emissions in 2015 dropped by 27% and 6% in PRD and NPRD, respectively. Dust 697 sources, power plants, and industrial process sources were the major contributors to the 698 change of PM<sub>10</sub> emissions in PRD and NPRD. However, emission trends of these three 699 sources in PRD and NPRD were slightly different, particularly the industrial 700 processes industrial process source. In PRD, PM<sub>10</sub> emissions from industrial 701 processes industrial process source -\_ steadily declined after 2010, while in NPRD, PM<sub>10</sub> 702 emissions from industrial processes industrial process source -kept an upward trend during 2006-2015. One possible reason for the difference is that control measures for 703 704 PM<sub>10</sub> emissions in PRD were stricter than those in NPRD. In 2010, the local 705 government issued two air action plans and regulated emission control measures for 706 non-metallic minerals industries (Table S1), one of the major PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> emission 707 sources in GD. For instance, all cement plants, glass manufacturers and other nonmetallic minerals industries that still outdated production processes were eliminated by 708 709 <u>the end of 2012.–</u> 710

- Speed up the elimination of high energy consumption and seriously polluted old fashioned
   production processes. By the end of 2012, eliminate completely backward cement production
- 713 capacity, and "horizontal sheet process" backward flat glass production capacity.

714

715

—However, these control measures are limited to the PRD region. —

In PRD and NPRD, fugitive dust source increased during 2006-2010 and showed a decrease during 2011-2015. The downturn in the later years was due to the implementation of emission control technologies of dust sources in response to the release of the *clean air action plan for the Pearl River Delta in Guangdong province* in 2010.

721 As emissions from industrial processes industrial process source, dust sources, and power plants changed dramatically, the major sources contributed to PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> 722 emissions also changed accordingly (Fig. 4c-d, S<sup>5676g-je-h</sup>). For PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions in 723 724 GD, contributions from dust sources and power plants declined slightly, from 17% in 2006 to 11% in 2015, and from 12% to 7%, respectively. The contribution from 725 726 industrial processes industrial process source, the largest contributor, also slightly 727 decreased from 38% to 33%. For PM<sub>10</sub> emissions in GD, the contribution of industrial processes industrial process source increased, from 28% to 34%. Particularly in NPRD, 728 729 it replaced dust sources as the largest contributor since 2012. In PRD, fugitive dust was 730 still the largest PM<sub>10</sub> emission source. Based on the above-mentioned analysis, PM 731 emission controls for dust sources, especially in PRD, and for industrial processes industrial process source, especially in NPRD, should be a priority of the agenda in the next stage of emission controls. Also, PM<sub>2.5</sub> emissions from cooking cannot be neglected in GD; this is because the removal of cooking oil fumes from homes and restaurants was not strictly enforced, although some regulations and emission standards regarding cooking emissions were enacted gradually.

737

### 738 2.3.4 VOCs

739 As shown in Fig. 5i-j, the sectoral changes of VOC emissions in PRD and NPRD 740 were similar. The total emissions in these two regions both showed a rising trend during 741 2006-2015, increasing by 35% and 30% in PRD and NPRD, respectively. The steady increase mainly originated from the growth of industrial-solvent use and non-industrial 742 solvent use, whose emissions in GD respectively increased by 99% and 69% during 743 2006-2015 (Fig. 4e). Industrial solvent use was a large increasing source, especially in 744 PRD where most industrial sources are concentrated. This is expected because solvent 745 use required by industrial sources was growing, but control measures were insufficient. 746 747 Several VOC control technologies had been adopted since 2010. For instance, the use of low VOC-containing raw materials for printing, shoemaking, furniture 748 manufacturing, and other industries was first proposed at the *clean air action plan for the* 749 Pearl River Delta in Guangdong province in 2010. Although these measures slowed an 750 751 increasing trend of VOC emissions in PRD (VOC emissions from industrial solvent use 752 in PRD increased by 18% during 2006-2010 while they increased by 6% during 2011-753 2015 (Fig. S76)), the control efficiencies were still low., According to a field survey, 754 only 40% of VOC-emitting industries had removal equipment in GD in 2014 according to a field survey (Wang et al., 2018). Noted that t 755

756 The contribution from industrial solvent used in the NPRD increased from 11% in

2006 to 17% in 2015, and two of significant increase was from partly driven by the
 electronics coating (0.5% of industrial solvent in 2008 rise to 17% in 2011) and

appliance coating (14% to 30%) (Fig. S78). Which This coincided with yang Yang<sup>2</sup> s-at

al. (2014) study that electronic equipment and appliance manufacturing accounted for

761 23% of 457 transferred enterprise until 2011(Yang et al., 2014). The increasing VOC

emissions from industrial-solvent use made it become the largest contributor to VOC emissions in GD in 2015 (Fig. 4e), with a percentage of 32%. Therefore, the implementation of policy and upgrade of control technologies are still required to reduce VOC emissions, especially in PRD. In NPRD, non-industrial solvent use was also a major contributor to the increase of VOC emissions. In particular, it became the largest contributor to VOC emissions in NPRD in 2015, with a percentage of 22%, slightly larger than on-road mobile sources (21%) (Fig. S<u>5676</u>j).

769 Since on-road mobile sources wereas also a major contributor to VOC emissions, 770 the evolution of their VOC emissions is also discussed here (Fig. 89). In both PRD and 771 NPRD, VOC emissions from motorcycles, the largest contributors to VOC emissions 772 from on-road mobile, went down in the past decade due to the relatively strict ban on motorcycles. They decreased by 55% and 38% in PRD and NPRD, respectively. By 773 774 contrast, VOC emissions from LDGV increased by 118% and 197% in PRD and NPRD, respectively, likely due to the upsurge of the LDGV vehicle population. Particularly in 775 776 PRD, LDGV's became the largest contributor to vehicle-related VOC emissions since 777 2008, which might also happen in NPRD according to the current trend.

778

### 779 2.3.5 CO/NH<sub>3</sub>

As shown in Fig. 5k-l, CO emissions in PRD and NPRD both increased steadily 780 781 during 2006-2013, and then decreased after 2013. However, the sectoral changes were 782 different in these two regions. In PRD, the growth of CO emissions during 2006-2013 783 is-was mainly attributed to industrial combustion and on-road mobile sources, while in 784 NPRD, it is associated principally withwas from the industrial combustion and industrial processes industrial process source. The difference exists because on-road 785 786 mobile sources were was primarily concentrated in PRD while iron and steel sectors, the largest CO emitters among industrial process sources, were located mainly in NPRD. 787 Notably, production of the iron and steel sectors soared during 2006-2015, increasing 788 789 by almost 95% in GD (GDPBS, 2007-2016), but emission controls fell behind. As to 790 the decline of CO emissions during 2013-2015 in PRD, on-road mobile was the major 791 reason. By contrast, the slight downturn in NPRD was mostly due to declining 792 emissions from on-road mobile sources and biomass burning. All these sectoral changes 793 made industrial combustion (35% in 2015) become the largest contributor to CO 794 emissions in GD (Fig. 4f). In NPRD, the contribution of industrial process sources also 795 increased. In contrast, the contribution of on-road mobile to CO emissions in NPRD 796 decreased by 19% in 2015 compared with that in 2006.

As shown in Fig. 4<u>g and Fig. 5m-n</u>, <u>agricultural sourcesagricultural source</u> constituted most to the change of NH<sub>3</sub> emissions, as they accounted for 86%-87% of the total NH<sub>3</sub> emissions in GD. However, their annual changes were different in PRD and NPRD (Fig. 5m-n). In NPRD, NH<sub>3</sub> emissions by <u>agricultural sourcesagricultural</u> <u>source</u> increased by 11% during 2006-2015, partly as the result of <u>the</u> growth of fertilizing and livestock to meet the increasing demand for food. Another reason was the absence of effective emission controls on <u>agricultural sourcesagricultural source</u> in 804 China. By contrast, in PRD, NH3 emissions by agricultural sources agricultural source 805 remained stable.

#### 806

#### 2.4 Evaluation of emission control measures and policy 807 implications 808

809 To evaluate the efficiencies of the control measures enacted in GD and to provide implications for future policies, we decomposed the emission changes into two 810 categories: (1) changes resulting from change of activity level (activity-driven emission) 811 in the absence of control measures and (2) changes due to the implementation of 812 813 pollution controls (control-driven emission reduction) (Zheng et al., 2018) Emission 814 changes can be divided into two categories: (1) changes resulting from change of 815 activity level (activity-driven emission) in the absence of control measures and (2) changes due to the implementation of pollution controls (control-driven emission 816 reduction) (Zheng et al., 2018). In this study, these two categories of emission changes 817 were quantified to help evaluate the efficiencies of the control measures enacted in GD 818 819 and to provide implications for future policies. We estimated the unabated emissions if 820 pollution control had been frozen at the 2006 level. In other words, we assumed that there were no new control measures adopted since 2006. Then the control-driven 821 emission reduction was estimated by comparing the unabated emissions and the actual 822 823 emissions, and the activity-driven emission was estimated by calculating the annual 824 changes of unabated emissions. Also, we projected the actual emission to 2020 to help 825 understand the potential for more emission control. Here, the planned emission controls 826 before 2020 were assumed to be completely implemented in 2020. These related 827 regulations for SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>, and VOC emissions controls are summarized in Table 828 \$3\$1. The control-driven and activity-driven emissions of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>, and VOCs 829 in 2007, 2009, 2011, 2013, and 2015 in addition to the predicted emissions in 2020 in 830 PRD and NPRD are presented in Fig. 910.

831

Figure 9 studies how might the emission changes in the absence of control measures and 832 reduction potentials if actions have been taken, under the future projection of activity level.

2.4.1 SO<sub>2</sub> 833

834 During 2007-2011, the decline of SO<sub>2</sub> emissions in PRD was driven by emission controls. The control-driven SO<sub>2</sub> emission reductions in PRD dramatically grew from 835 836 0.120 Tg in 2007 to 0.568 Tg in 2011 (Fig. 9a10a), mainly attributable to stringent SO<sub>2</sub> 837 emission control regulations on industrial combustion and power plants-e.g., shutting down small coal-fired thermal power units, phasing out small boilers, installing flue-838 839 gas desulphurization (FDG) equipment and limiting the sulfur contents of fuel. SO2 840 emission reductions from industrial combustion and power plants account for 57%-75% and 25%-37% of the total emission reductions, respectively. The activity-driven 841 842 emissions increased by 0.178 Tg during 2007-2011, but their increments were far less 843 than the control-driven emission reductions. The control-driven emission reductions 844 flattened out in recent years. During 2013-2015, the control-driven emission reductions only increased by 4%, which owes much to the effectiveness of SO<sub>2</sub> emission controls 845 in earlier years and the shrinking of control measures in recent years. Nonetheless, SO<sub>2</sub> 846 847 emissions in PRD still steadily declined, partly due to the decrease of activity-driven 848 emissions. By contrast, activity-driven emissions in NPRD kept rising, similar to Fig.6, 849 which might also be associated with the transfer of energy-intensive industries from PRD to NPRD - (Fig. 9b10b). Even so, the control-driven emission reductions 850 dramatically increased and outweighed the activity-driven emissions since 2011, when 851 852 stricter control measures were implemented. Similar to the situation in PRD, pollution 853 control-driven emission reductions in NPRD were mainly attributed to industrial 854 combustion and power plants.

855 Although SO<sub>2</sub> emissions dramatically decreased since 2006, there is potential for further reduction in 2020. On the basis of control-driven emission reductions in 2015, 856 SO<sub>2</sub> emission reduction potentials in PRD and NPRD in 2020 are projected to be 0.10 857 Tg (34% of the total SO<sub>2</sub> emissions in 2015) and 0.29 Tg (approximately equal to the 858 total SO<sub>2</sub> emissions in 2015), respectively. These reductions can be achieved by 859 technical innovations, including ultra-low-emission measures in power plants, a series 860 of actions regarding boiler management, sulfur content controls in fuels, and flue-gas 861 desulfurization in industries. Most of these emission reductions are from industrial 862 combustion and power plants. Particularly for NPRD, 60% of the reductions can come 863 from industrial combustion, more than that in PRD. This is because SO<sub>2</sub> removal 864 865 efficiencies in industries are still-relatively low in NPRD. SO<sub>2</sub> emission contribution from non-road mobile sources in GD previously presented an increasing trend (Fig. 4a). 866 This reminds us that non-road mobile sources still have has a high potential for SO<sub>2</sub> 867 emission reduction. In PRD, it could account for approximately 20% of the total SO<sub>2</sub> 868 emission reductions in 2020. Thus, future measures should be focused on industrial 869 870 combustion and non-road mobile sources for controlling SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>X</sub> emissions (NO<sub>X</sub> 871 also presented a similar result in the subsequent analysis).

872

### 873 **2.4.2 NO**<sub>X</sub>

874 In PRD, the decline of NO<sub>X</sub> emissions was driven by emission controls, and was 875 significantly enhanced in 2011 when the  $11^{\text{th}}$ - $12^{\text{th}}$  Five Year Plan was enacted in GD,

876 including the application of technology for flue-gas denitrification and low NO<sub>X</sub> 877 combustion (LNB) in industries and power plants (Kurokawa et al., 2013), the 878 elimination of yellow-label cars, and progressive advancements in vehicle emission and fuel standards. These mitigation measures yielded 0.315 Tg NO<sub>X</sub> emission reductions 879 880 in 2011, and offset the growth of activity-driven emissions. During 2007-2015, power 881 plants and on-road mobile sources were the two major contributors, accounting for 882 34%-59% and 38%-60% of the total control-driven emission reductions, respectively. Industrial combustion also contributed 2%-14% of the total control-driven emission 883 884 reductions. Unlike in PRD, NPRD's new clean-air actions only mostly focused on 885 power plants, and these measures were not stringent enough to cover the growth of NO<sub>X</sub> emissions before 2011. After 2011, the control measures of NO<sub>X</sub> emissions from power 886 887 plants in NPRD were strengthened, leading to a significant increase of control-driven NO<sub>X</sub> emission reductions. Consequently, the total NO<sub>X</sub> emissions slightly declined. 888 889 Apart from power plants, on-road mobile sources and industrial combustion also partly 890 contributed to the control-driven emission reductions in NPRD in recent years.

- 891 On the basis of control-driven emission reductions in 2015, NO<sub>X</sub> emissions in 2020 could be further reduced by 0.24 Tg both in PRD (30% of the total NO<sub>X</sub> emissions 892 in 2015) and NPRD (43% of the total NO<sub>X</sub> emissions in 2015). Most of these projected 893 894 reductions could come from industrial combustion and power plants as a result of the 895 implementation implement of stricter regulations, e.g., ultra-low emissions for power plants, boiler management, and flue-gas denitrification for industries. In PRD, on-road 896 897 and non-road mobile sources also have a relatively high potential for NO<sub>X</sub> emission 898 reduction. Particularly, on-road mobile sources, especially LDGV, requires more 899 effective control measures. Although current control measures have alleviated the amount of vehicle emissions in recent decades, it still cannot cover the increased 900 901 emissions driven by the rapid growth of vehicle population, as shown in Fig. 55cb. 902 Further reduction of on-road mobile NO<sub>X</sub> emissions can be achieved by the 903 implementation of control regulations.
- 904

### 905 **2.4.3 PM<sub>10</sub>**

The activity-driven emission of  $PM_{10}$  in PRD and NPRD both steadily increased during 2006-2015 due to growth in activity. From 2006 to 2015, the gross industrial output value increased by 48% (GDPBS, 2007-2016), but control measures were not implemented until 2009, leading to a slight increase of  $PM_{10}$  emissions during 2006-2009. After 2009, the installation of dust removal equipment dramatically increased with the stricter implement of PM control measures, such as special requirements

912 limiting soot emission in power plants, boiler management with smaller capacity, and 913 a series of pollution controls for non-metallic minerals industries. These measures boost 914 the control-driven emission reductions, which can counterbalance the growth of 915 activity-driven emission of PM<sub>10</sub> in PRD and NPRD. In PRD, the control-driven 916 emission reductions dramatically improved, from 0.024 Tg in 2009 to 0.318 Tg in 2015, 917 while in NPRD, they improved from 0.014 Tg in 2009 to 0.258 Tg in 2015. In both the 918 PRD and NPRD region, industrial combustion, power plants, and dust sources were the 919 three major contributors to the control-driven emissions reductions.

920 Compared with control-driven emission reductions in 2015, PM<sub>10</sub> emissions in 921 2020 in the PRD and NPRD could be further reduced by 0.31 Tg (60% of the total PM<sub>10</sub> emissions in 2015) and 0.33 Tg (49% of the total  $PM_{10}$  emissions in 2015), respectively. 922 Fugitive dust is the most significant contributor, accounting 45% and 31% of the total 923 reductions in PRD and NPRD, respectively. This can be achieved by applying online 924 monitoring technology for supervising construction dust (Sun et al., 2016) and more 925 advanced measures, such as achieving a "6 100%" target for construction sites and 926 927 increasing machine cleaning ratio for road dust. Industrial process sources, power plants, 928 and industrial combustion also have major potential to achieve emission reduction, in 929 emissions especially industrial process sources in the NPRD.

930

## 931 **2.4.<u>3-4</u> VOCs**

932 For VOCs, control-driven emission reductions in PRD and NPRD were slight in the past decade. Although VOC emission-control measures, such as promoting emphasis 933 934 on strict end-of-pipe controls and leak detection and repair (LDAR) technology in VOCemitting industries, and strengthening oil and gas recovery in gas stations, have been 935 gradually highlighted since 2014 when action plan for air pollution prevention and 936 control in Guangdong province (2014-2017) (GDEP, 2014) was released, the regulation 937 has not been well executed. Emission reductions from solvent sources, the largest 938 939 contributor to VOC emissions in PRD (Fig. S5iS676i), were 0.075 Tg in 2015, highly 940 associated with the use of low-VOC products and environmental-friendly paints that 941 contain low or even no VOCs. However, these emission reductions only accounted for 10%-35% of the total VOC emission reductions. In fact, 65%-86% of the control-driven 942 943 VOC emission reductions were from on-road mobile sources, which is mainly attributed to the improvement of emission standards and oil quality for vehicles, 944 945 management of yellow label cars, and the popularization of green traffic. Even so, the control-driven VOC emission reductions (from 0.016 Tg in 2007 to 0.294 Tg in 2015) 946 were far outweighed by the activity-driven growth in emissions (from 0.699 Tg in 2007 947

to 1.172 Tg in 2015), resulting from the growth of vehicle populations and increasing
use of solvents, which consequently drove up VOC emissions in PRD and NPRD (Fig.
5i-j).

951 In 2020, if the existing emission control regulations were fully implemented, VOC 952 emissions in PRD would decrease by 30% relative to the emission level in 2015. The emission reduction potentials are 0.61 Tg in PRD (69% of the total VOC emissions in 953 2015) and 0.56 Tg in NPRD (0.2 times higher than total VOC emissions in 2015), 954 respectively, much larger than the emission reduction potentials of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, and PM<sub>10</sub>. 955 956 Reduced solvent use is the largest factor. This is because current VOC end-of-pipe 957 removal efficiency in GD is still low. Therefore, VOC emissions from solvent use could 958 be greatly reduced by improving end-of-pipe removal efficiency. In fact, VOC emission 959 controls on solvent use and industrial process source were particularly prioritized 960 during the 13<sup>th</sup> FYP (2016-2020). If the VOCs end-of-pipe removal efficiencies achieve their control targets in the 13<sup>th</sup> FYP, VOCs emission reductions from solvent use will 961 be 0.388 Tg and 0.257 Tg in PRD and NPRD, respectively, accounting for 43% and 38% 962 963 of the total VOC emission reductions. Another source with large potential for emission 964 is on-road mobile sources.

965

## 966 **3 Summary and conclusions**

967 This study provided the first long-term record of anthropogenic air pollutant emissions in GD, the three largest city clusters in China, and advanced our understating 968 of air pollutant emissions and control measures in Guangdong. In this study, we provide 969 970 a detailed examination of anthropogenic emission of a wide variety of pollutants in GD 971 from 2006 to 2015 using a technology-based methodology. The emission trends and their spatial variation were validated by ground-based observations and satellite data. 972 973 Anthropogenic emissions of most pollutants in GD generally saw downward trends over the 2006-2015 decade, with NH<sub>3</sub> and VOC emissions being the exceptions. In that 974 975 decade, emissions of SO<sub>2</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>, and NO<sub>X</sub> decreased by 48%, 22%, 16%, and 976 0.5%, respectively, despite the significant growth of economic and anthropogenic activity. The decoupling of anthropogenic emissions from economic and energy 977 978 consumption growth means that emission regulations and control measures on power 979 plants, industrial combustion, on-road mobile sources, and dust sources enacted over 980 the past decade have alleviated emissions. By contrast, because of the absence of effective control measures, NH3 emissions remained stable while VOC emissions 981 steadily increased by 33% during 2006-2015. 982

983	Because of their differences discrepancies in economic and industrial structure and
984	in their implementation of emission control measures progresses, PRD and NPRD
985	showed different emission trendsevolutions. Overall, emissions of SO2, NOx, PM2.5,
986	and $PM_{10}$ in the PRD region showed significant downward trends during the period of
987	2006-2015, while emission from NPRD remained relatively stable due to the lax control
988	measures. Specially, industrial combustion and industrial process presented opposite
989	trends between PRD and NPRD. In PRD, emissions from industrial combustion
990	declined consistently during 2006-2015 while in NPRD, these emissions continued to
991	show an upward trend. Similar to the industrial combustion, emissions from industrial
992	process source also declined in PRD but increased in NPRD during 2006-2015. As a
993	result, emissions in NPRD were increasingly important in GD. The contribution of
994	NPRD to SO <sub>2</sub> emissions in GD dramatically increased from 27% in 2006 to 48% in
995	2015. By the end of 2015, emissions of $PM_{10}$ (56%), $PM_{2.5}$ (54%) and $NH_3$ (68%) in
996	NPRD already accounted for more than 50% of the total emissions in GD. Particularly,
997	industrial emission leaks from PRD to NPRD were observed in this study, which partly
998	enhanced the significance of emissions in NPRD. Although the shift of industries
999	reduced PRD emissions, it might not effectively alleviate the air quality in PRD since
1000	industrial emissions also have a certain influence on the RPD region, particularly in
1001	winter season (Yin et al., 2017). In PRD, SO2 and NO <sub>X</sub> emissions exhibited a downward
1002	trend during 2006-2015, but in NPRD, these emissions grew before 2010. Most of the
1003	increased emissions were from power plants, industrial combustion, and non-road
1004	mobile sources, highly associated with the shift of industries and power plants from
1005	PRD to NPRD and the lack of stringent emission control measures in NPRD. The
1006	evolution of sources also showed differences between PRD and NPRD. In PRD,
1007	emissions from industrial combustion declined consistently during 2006-2015 owing to
1008	stringent control measures e.g. phasing out small boilers, installing flue gas
1009	desulphurization (FDG) equipment, and limiting the sulfur contents of fuel while in
1010	NPRD, these emissions continued to show an upward trend, even though some
1011	emissions from industrial combustion had been reduced by control measures. Similar
1012	to the situation with industrial combustion, emissions from industrial
1013	processes <u>industrial process source</u> also declined in PRD but increased in NPRD during
1014	2000-2015. The above mentioned trends mevitably changed the relative contribution
1015	of different sources, industrial combustion surpassed power plants as the largest
1016	contributor to 50 <sub>2</sub> emissions in PKD and NPKD. For NO <sub>X</sub> emissions, on road mobile
1017	sources were was sum the targest source in PKD, but in NPKD, the contribution of
1018	moustrial compusition steadily increased and might replace power plants as the key

- 1019 contributor in the future. As to VOC emissions, industrial solvent use was the largest 1020 contributor in PRD, but in NPRD, the contribution of non-industrial solvent use 1021 increased and became the largest contributor.
- 1022

1023 The historical emission inventory developed in this study not only helps to understand the emission evolution in GD, but also can help to develop robust control 1024 measures for the co-control of PM<sub>2.5</sub> and ozone. In GD, future emission control works 1025 should focus on power plants, industrial combustion, and non-road mobile sources to 1026 1027 further reduce emissions of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, and particulate matter. This can be achieved by 1028 technical innovations consisting of ultra-low emissions in power plants, a series of 1029 actions regarding boiler management, control of sulfur content in fuels, flue-gas 1030 desulfurization in industries, and special pollution controls for non-metallic minerals 1031 industries. In addition, control measures on agricultural sources agricultural source, the 1032 largest contributors of NH<sub>3</sub> emissions, should be highlighted. As revealed by Yin et al. 1033 (2018), the chemical region in PRD might transit to an ammonia-rich region with the a 1034 decrease of SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>X</sub> emissions. In this case, a larger reduction in NH<sub>3</sub> emissions 1035 would be required to further decrease ambient PM<sub>2.5</sub> levels in GD. This is feasible since 1036 NH<sub>3</sub> emissions in GD still have great potential for further reductions. VOC emission 1037 reduction is another concernIn order to achieve co-control of PM2.5 and ozone, future work should also focus on VOC emissions. In fact, the reduction of VOCs emissions is 1038 1039 promising since stringent controls on solvent use was released in Volatile organic 1040 compounds (VOCs) remediation and emission reduction work plan in Guangdong 1041 Province (2018-2020) (GDEP, 2018). Apart from regulating solvent use, control 1042 measures for on-road mobile sources should be enhanced to cover the growth of 1043 emissions induced by the increase of vehicle population.

1044 The historical emission inventory developed in this study not only helps to 1045 understand the emission evolution in GD, but also A long-term historical emission inventory could also help to reveal the dominant causes of air-quality change. I in 1046 1047 PRD. +T he annual averaged PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in PRD showed a decrease in the 1048 2006-2015-decade, from 58  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> in 2007 to 34  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> in 2017. By contrast, the 90thpercentile daily max 8-h average ozone showed a fluctuating increase, from 146  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> 1049 1050 in 2007 to 165  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup> in 2017. Our proposed a long-term historical inventory might be able to explain the change of PM<sub>2.5</sub> and ozone concentrations. As shown in Fig. 5, 1051 emissions of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, and PM<sub>2.5</sub> in PRD all steadily fell in this decade. Particularly, 1052 SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>X</sub> emissions, the two major precursors of PM<sub>2.5</sub> formations, decreased by 1053 63% and 14%, respectively, during 2006-2015. This trend of precursor emissions 1054

1055 agreed with the declining trend of ambient PM2.5 concentrations. VOC emissions in 1056 PRD showed a rising trend, increasing by 35% during 2006-2015. Ou et al. (20172016) 1057 had revealed that most parts of PRD formed a VOC-limited region in autumn and winter. 1058 This suggests that the growing VOC emissions and the decreasing NO<sub>X</sub> emissions 1059 might contribute to the growth of ozone concentrations in PRD. However, this does not mean that emission changes are the dominant cause. Using numerical simulations and 1060 1061 the long-term historical emission inventory developed in this study, we can quantify the 1062 effectiveness of emission control measures and the impact of meteorological change on 1063 air quality in PRD. Consequently, the dominant dominate cause of the increase of 1064 ambient ozone concentrations and the downward trend of PM2.5 concentrations in PRD 1065 in the recent decade can be identified.

1066 This study applied a top-down method to develop long-term emission inventories. This method is feasible for two reasons. On one handFirst, long-term emission 1067 inventories generally focus on emission trend, sectoral evolution and emission 1068 projection, rather than the high-resolution spatial distribution. Seconds, On the other 1069 hand, obtaining long-term activity data for top-down method is more readily accessible. 1070 Therefore, most previous studies (Streets et al. 2006, Zhang et al, 2007, Lu et al. 2012. 1071 Zheng, et al., 2018) also applied the same method to develop long-term emission 1072 inventories. However, this study can be further improved in following aspects.- First, 1073 a method based fuel consumption might underestimates marine emissions, due to the 1074 absence of passing ships that traveled through the study domain but did not call at any 1075 port in mainland China (Li et al., 2018). In China, the passing ships accounted for about 1076 7% of the total fuel consumption. To fix the underestimation, the AIS data can be used 1077 to calibrate the total fuel consumption in GD. Second, the annual average vehicle 1078 kilometers traveled and the ratio of diesel vehicles to gasoline vehicles were obtained 1079 from a field survey, which only cover 8 cities and 111 roads in GD. These survey data 1080 cannot well represent each city in GD and thus might bring uncertainties in 1081 characterizing emission evolution of on-road mobile source. To better reflect the 1082 1083 temporal pattern and differentiate emissions between different cities in GD, more field survey of vehicle types, fuel consumption, and emission standard should be conducted 1084 to better differentiate vehicle emissions between different cities in GD. 1085

1086

# 1087 Authorship Contribution Statement

1088Zheng J. Y., and Huang Z. J. provided writing ideas with Shao M. support. Huang1089Z. J., Bian Y. H., and Ou J. M. carried them out. Huang Z. J., Zheng J. Y., and Ou J. M.

revised and polished the article. Bian Y. H., Zhong Z. M., Xiao X., Ye, X. and Wu Y. Q.
developed the decadal emission inventories and contributed to discussions of results.
Chen, L. F., Xu, Y. Q., Zhang, Z. W. and Yin, X. H. helped with verification of satellite
data. All authors have made substantial contributions to the work reported in the
manuscript.

1095

## 1096 **Competing interests**

1097 The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

1098

## 1099 Acknowledgments

This study was supported by the National Key R&D Program of China (No. 2018YFC0213902), the NSFC National Distinguished Young Scholar Science Fund (No. 41325020) and the National Key Technology Research and Development Program of the Ministry of Science and Technology of China (No. 2014BAC21B02). The authors thank the Institute of Remote Sensing and Digital Earth, Chinese Academy of Sciences, for providing the satellite data.

# 1106 Appendix A. Supplementary information

1107 Attached please find supplementary information associated with this article.

## References

Che, W. W., Zheng, J. Y., and Zhong, L. J.: Vehicle Exhaust Emission Characteristics and Contributions in the Pearl River Delta Region, Research of Environmental Sciences, 22, 456-461, 2009.

China Southern Power Grid (CSPG): Power plants ( $\geq 6000$ kw • h) and technology& economy indexes in Guangdong province, 2006-2014.

Chun, Y.: Restructuring the export-oriented industrialization in the Pearl River Delta, China: Institutional evolution and emerging tension, Applied Geography, 32, 143-157, doi: 10.1016/j.apgeog.2010.10.013, 2012.

EPGP: Action plan for air pollution prevention and control in Guangdong province (2014-2017). http://www.gdep.gov.cn/dqwrfz/201403/t20140318 168294.html, 2014.

EPGP: Volatile organic compounds (VOCs) remediation and emission reduction work planinGuangdongprovince(2018-2020),

 $http://www.gdep.gov.cn/dqwrfz/201806/t20180628\_239875.html, 2018.$ 

EPGD: Reports on the state of Guangdong Provincial environment, http://www.gdep.gov.cn/hjjce/gb/,2006-2017.

Fu, X. X., Wang, X. M., Guo. H., Cheung, K., Ding. X., Zhao, X. Y., He, Q. F., Gao, B., Zhang, Z., and Liu, T. Y.: Trends of ambient fine particles and major chemical components in the Pearl River Delta region: Observation at a regional background site in fall and winter, Science of the Total Environment, 497-498, 274-281, doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2014.08.008, 2014.

<u>GDEI:</u> Industrial park transferred from PRD to NPRD in Guangdong province. http://www.gdei.gov.cn/zwgk/bmfw/201212/t20121210 109359.htm, 2014.

GDEMC, EPDHK, EPBMC: Guangdong-Hong Kong-Macao Pearl River Delta Regional Air Quality Monitoring Network Reports of Monitoring Results in 2017, http://www.gdep.gov.cn/hjjce/kqjc/?sTop=0, 2018.

GDMS: Guangdong Meteorological Statistical Yearbook, China Statistics Press, Beijing, 2007-2016.

GDPBS: Guangdong Statistical Yearbook, China Statistics Press, Beijing, 2007-2016.

GDPCSY: Guangdong Provincial 21 City Statistical Yearbooks China Statistics Press, Beijing, 2007-2016.

GDPSR: Guangdong provincial pollutant statistical reports, 2006, 2010, 2012, 2014, 2015.

Gurjar, B. R., Van Aardenne, J. A., Lelieveld, J., and Mohan, M.: Emission estimates and trends (1990–2000) for megacity Delhi and implications, Atmospheric Environment, 38, 5663-5681, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2004.05.057, 2004.

He, M., Zheng, J. Y., Yin, S. S., and Zhang, Y. Y.: Trends, temporal and spatial characteristics,

and uncertainties in biomass burning emissions in the Pearl River Delta, China, Atmospheric Environment, 45, 4051-4059, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2011.04.016, 2011.

Huang, Z. J., Wang, S. S., Zheng, J. Y., Yuan, Z. B., Ye, S. Q., and Kang, D.: Modeling inorganic nitrogen deposition in Guangdong province, China, doi: doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2015.03.014, Atmospheric Environment, 109, 147-160, 2015

International Maritime Organization (IMO): Information on North American Emission Control Area 25 under MARPOL Annex VI, http://www.imo.org, 2010.

International Sustainable Systems Research Center (ISSRC): IVE model user's manual version 2.0, http://www.issrc.org/ive/, 2008.

Kurokawa, J., Ohara, T., Morikawa, T., Hanayama, S., Janssens-Maenhout, G., Fukui, T., Kawashima, K., and Akimoto, H.: Emissions of air pollutants and greenhouse gases over Asian regions during 2000-2008: Regional Emission inventory in Asia (REAS) version 2, Atmo. Chem. Phys., 13, 11019-11058, doi: 10.5194/acp-13-11019-2013, 2013.

Lei, Y., Zhang, Q., He, K. B., and Streets, D. G.: Primary anthropogenic aerosol emission trends for China, 1990–2005, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 11, 931–954, doi: 10.5194/acp-11-931-2011, 2011.

Li, C., Jens, B., Zheng, J. Y., Yuan, Z. B., Ou, J. M., Li, Y., Wang, Y. L., and Xu, Y. Q.: Decadal evolution of ship emissions in China from 2004 to 2013 by using an integrated AIS-based approach and projection to 2040, Atmo. Chem. Phys., 18, 6075-6093, doi: 10.5194/acp-18-6075-2018, 2018.

Li, C., Yuan, Z. B., Ou, J. M., Fan, X. L., Ye, S. Q., Xiao, T., Shi, Y. Q., Huang, Z. J., Ng, S. K. W., and Zhong, Z. M.: An AIS-based high-resolution ship emission inventory and its uncertainty in Pearl River Delta region, China, Science of the Total Environment, 573, 1-10, doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.07.219, 2016.

Li, Y., Lau, A. K. H. L., Wong, A., and Jimmy, C. H. F.: Decomposition of the wind and nonwind effects on observed year-to-year air quality variation, Journal of Geophysical Research, 119, 6207-6220, doi: 10.1002/2013JD021300, 2014.

Lin, C. Q., Li, Y., Lau, A., Li, C. C., and Fung, J. C. H.: 15-year PM2.5 trends in the Pearl River Delta region and Hong Kong from satellite observation. Aerosol and Air Quality Research, 18, 2355-2362, doi: 10.4209/aaqr.2017.11.0437, 2018.

Liu, Y. M., Zhang, S. T., Fan, Q., Wu, D., Chan, P., Wang, X. M., Fan, S. J., Feng, Y. R., and Hong, Y. Y.: Accessing the Impact of Sea-Salt Emissions on Aerosol Chemical Formation and Deposition over Pearl River Delta, China, Aerosol and Air Quality Research, 15, 2232-2245, doi: 10.4209/aaqr.2015.02.0127, 2015.

Liu, Y.: Industrial Resettlement and Environmental Pollution in Guangdong Province: An Empirical Study on Twenty-one Prefecture-level Cities by DID, Review of Industrial Economics,

#### 4, 2095-7572, doi: 10.19313/j.cnki.cn10-1223/f.2016.04.009, 2016.

Liu, Y. H., Liao, W. Y., Li, L., Huang, Y. T., and Xu, W. J.: Vehicle emission trends in China's Guangdong Province from 1994 to 2014, Science of the Total Environment, 586, 512-521, doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.01.215, 2017.

Li & Fung Centre Research.: China's industry relocation and upgrading Trends: implications for sourcing business, China Distribution & Trading, 56, 2008.

Lu, Q., Zheng, J. Y., Ye, S. Q., Shen, X. L., Yuan, Z. B., and Yin, S. S.: Emission trends and source characteristics of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub> and VOCs in the Pearl River Delta region from 2000 to 2009, Atmospheric Environment, 76, 11-20, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.10.062, 2013.

Lu, Z., Zhang, Q., and Streets, D. G.: Sulfur dioxide and primary carbonaceous aerosol emissions in China and India, 1996-2010, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 11, 9839-9864, doi: 10.5194/acp-11-9839-2011, 2011.

Lv, B. L., Hu, Y. T., Chang, H. H., Russell, A. G., and Bai, Y. Q.: Improving the accuracy of daily PM<sub>2.-5</sub> distributions derived from the fusion of ground-level measurements with aerosol optical depth observations, a case study in north China, Environ Sci Technol., 50, 4752-4759, doi: 10.1021/acs.est.5b05940, 2016.

Mao, L., Liu, R., Liao, W. H., Wang, X. M., Shao, M., Chen Liu, S., and Zhang, Y. H.: An observation-based perspective of winter haze days in four major polluted regions of China, National Science Review, doi: 10.1093/nsr/nwy118, 2018.

Marilena, K., and Elias, C.: Human health effects of air pollution, Environmental Pollution, 151, 362-367, doi: 10.1016/j.envpol.2007.06.012, 2008.

MEPC: The guideline of air pollutant emission inventory development for Chinese cities, http://www.mep.gov.cn/, 2017.

NBS: The ranks of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and population of Guangdong province in the nation, http://data.stats.gov.cn/mapdata.htm, 2006-2015.

Ohara, T., Akimoto, H., Kurokawa, J., Horii, N., Yamaji, K., Yan, X., and Hayasaka, T.: An Asian emission inventory of anthropogenic emission sources for the period 1980-2020, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 7, 4419-4444, doi: 10.5194/acpd-7-6843-2007, 2007.

Ou, J. Y., Zheng, J. Y., Li, R. R., Huang, X. B., Zhong, Z. M., Zhong, L. J., and Lin, H.: Speciated OVOC and VOC emission inventories and their implications for reactivity based ozone control strategy in the Pearl River Delta region, China, Science of the Total Environment, 530, 393-402, doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.05.062, 2015.Ou, J. Y., Yuan, Z. B., Zheng, J. Y., Huang, Z. J., Shao, M., Li, Z. K., Huang, X. B., Guo, H., and Louie, P. K. K.: Ambient Ozone Control in a Photochemically Active Region: Short-Term Despiking or Long-Term Attainment? Environmental Science & Technology, 50(11):5720-5728, doi: 10.1021/acs.est.6b00345, 2016. Pan, Y. Y., Li, N., Zheng, J. Y., Yin, S. S., Li, C., Yang, J., Zhong, L. J., Chen, D. H., Deng, S. X., and Wang, S. S.: Emission inventory and characteristics of anthropogenic air pollutant sources in Guangdong Province, Acta Scientiae Circumstantiae, 59, 133-135, doi: 10.13671/j.hjkxxb.2014.1058, 2015.

PGGP: Planning for Guangdong province environmental protection and ecological construction in 12th Five-Year, http://zwgk.gd.gov.cn/006939748/201108/t20110805\_201861.html, 2011.

PGGP: The National III standard was implemented in Guangdong province since July 1. http://www.gd.gov.cn/gdgk/gdyw/200904/t20090424\_90255.htm, 2009.

Shen, J., and Huang, S. S.: Impact of Environmental Regulation on the Migration of Pollution-Intensive Industries in Guangdong Province, Tropical Geography, 35, 745-752, doi: 10.13284/j.cnki.rddl.002762, 2015.

Streets, D. G., Zhang, Q., Wang, L. T., He, K. B., Hao, J. M., Wu, Y., Tang, Y. H., and Carmichael, G. R.: Revisiting China's CO emissions after the Transport and Chemical Evolution over the Pacific (TRACE-P) mission: Synthesis of inventories, atmospheric modeling, and observations, Journal of Geophysical Research Atmospheres. 111, doi: 10.1029/2006JD007118, 2006.

Sun, M., Gao, X., Liu, M. H., Zhang, J., Zhan, X. H., Liu, J. H., and Xu, Y.: Application of On-line Monitoring in Construction Site Dust Supervision, Environmental Science and Management, 41, 2016.

Tao, J., Zhang, L. M., Cao, J. J., and Zhang, R. J.: A review of current knowledge concerning PM2.5 chemical composition, aerosol optical properties, and their relationships across China, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 2017: 1-70, doi: 10.5194/acp-2017-271, 2017.

Wang, T., Nie, W., Gao, J., and Xue, L. K.: Air quality during the 2008 Beijing Olympics: Secondary pollutants and regional impact, Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 10, 7603-7615, doi: 10.5194/acp-10-7603-2010, 2010.

Wang. X. L., Yu, Y. F., Huang, Z. J., Cai, H. H., Li, C., Zhou, M., Liu, L. Y., Luo, C., Zhuang, Y. J., and Zheng, J. Y.: Improvement and Research on Industrial VOC Emission Inventory in Guangdong Province Based on the Field Investigation, Acta Scientiae Circumstantiae, xx, 1-12, doi: 10.13671/j.hjkxxb.2018.0431, 2018.

Wu, D. W., Fung J. C. H., Yao, T., and Lau, A. K. H.: A study of control policy in the Pearl River Delta region by using the particulate matter source apportionment method, Atmospheric Environment, 76, 147-161, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.11.069, 2013.

Wu, D., Bi, X. Y., Deng, X. J., Li, F., Tan, H. B., Liao, G. L., and Huang, J.: Effect of atmospheric haze on the deterioration of visibility over the Pearl River Delta, Acta Meteorologica

Sinica, 21, 215-223, doi: 10.1590/S1980-65232010000400013, 2007.

Xing, J., Zhang, Y., Wang, S. X., Liu, X. H., Cheng, S. H., Zhang, Q., Chen, Y., S., Streets, D. G., Jang, C., Hao, J. M., and Wang., W. X.: Modeling study on the air quality impacts from emission reductions and atypical meteorological conditions during the 2008 Beijing Olympics, Atmospheric Environment, 45, 1786-1798, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2011.01.025, 2011.

Xu, Y, Q, Huang, Z. J., Jia, G. L., Fan, M., Cheng, L. X., Chen, L. F., Shao, M., and Zheng, J, Y.: Regional discrepancies in spatiotemporal variations and driving forces of open crop residue burning emissions in China, Science of the Total Environment, 671, 536-547, 2019.

Yang, B. J., and Mao, Y. H.: Industrial Relocation Policy and Firm Migration: an Empirical Analysis from Guangdong Industrial Relocation Survey Data, South China Journal of Economics, 3, 1000-6249, doi:10.19592/j.cnki.scje.2014.03.001, 2014.

Yang, C .: Restructuring the export-oriented industrialization in the Pearl River

Delta, China: institutional evolution and emerging tension, Applied Geography, 32, 143-157, doi: 10.1016/j.apgeog.2010.10.013, 2012.

Yang, L. F., Luo, H. H., Yuan, Z. B., Zheng, J. Y., Huang, Z. J., Li, C., Lin, X. H., Louie, P. K. K., and Chen, D. H.: Quantitative impacts of meteorology and precursor emission changes on the long-term trend of ambient ozone over the Pearl River Delta, China and implications for ozone control strategy, Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics Discussions, (x), 1–26, doi: 10.5194/acp-2019-355, 2019.

Yang, Y.: Character, Level and Regulatory Measures Study of Fugitive Dust Emissions from Building Construction Sites in PRD, South China University of Technology, Guangzhou, China, 2014.

Yin, S. S., Zheng, J. Y., Lu, Q., Yuan, Z. B., Huang, Z. J., Zhong, L. J., and Lin, H.: A refined 2010-based VOC emission inventory and its improvement on modeling regional ozone in the Pearl River Delta Region, China, Science of the Total Environment, 514, 426-438, doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.01.088, 2015.

Yin, X. H., Huang, Z. J., Zheng, J. Y., Yuan, Z. B., Zhu, W. B., Huang, X. B., and Chen, D.
H.: Source contributions to PM<sub>2.5</sub> in Guangdong province, China by numerical modeling: Results and implications, Atmospheric Research. 186, 63-71, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosres.2016.11.007, 2017.

Yu, Y. F., Lu, Q., Zheng, J. Y., and Zhong, L. J.: VOC emission inventory and its uncertainty from the key VOC-related industries in the Pearl River Delta region, China Environmental Science. 31, 195-201, doi: 10.1080/00405000.2010.522047, 2011.

Zhang, Q., Streets, D. G., He, K. B., Wang, Y. X., Richter, A., Burrows, J. P., Uno, I., Jang, C. J., Chen, D., and Yao, Z. L., NOX emission trends for China, 1995–2004: The view from the ground and the view from space, Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres, 112, doi:

10.1029/2007JD008684, 2007.

Zhang, Y. S., Shao, M., Lin, Y., Luan, S. J., Mao, N., Chen, W. T., Wang, M.: Emission inventory of carbonaceous pollutants from biomass burning in the Pearl River Delta Region, China, Atmospheric Environment. 76, 189–199, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.05.055, 2013.

Zheng, B., Tong, D., Li, M., Liu, F., Hong, C., Geng, G. N., Li, H. Y., L., X., Peng, L. Q., Qi, J., Yan, L., Zhang, Y. X., Zhao, H. Y., Zheng, Y. X., and He, K. B.: Trends in China's anthropogenic emissions since 2010 as the consequence of clean air actions, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 18, 14095-14111, doi: 10.5194/acp-18-14095-2018, 2018.

Zheng, J. Y., Shao, M., Che, W. W., Zhang, L. J., Zhong, L. J., Zhang, Y. H., and Streets, D. : Speciated VOC emission inventory and spatial patterns of ozone formation potential in the Pearl River Delta, China. Environmental Science & Technology. 43(22), 8580–8586, doi: 10.1021/es901688e, 2009.

Zheng, J. Y., Zhang, L. J., Che, W. W., Zheng, Z. Y., and Yin, S. S.: A highly resolved temporal and spatial air pollutant emission inventory for the Pearl River Delta region, China and its uncertainty assessment, Atmospheric Environment, 43, 5112-5122, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2009.04.060, 2009.

Zheng, J. Y., Zheng, Z. Y., Yu, Y. F, and Zhong, L. J.: Temporal, spatial characteristics and uncertainty of biogenic VOC emissions in the Pearl River Delta region, China, Atmospheric Environment, 44(16), 1960–1969, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2010.03.001, 2009.

Zheng, J. Y., Zhong, L. Y., Wang, T., Louie, P. K. K., and Li, Z. C.: Ground-level ozone in the Pearl River Delta region: Analysis of data from a recently established regional air quality monitoring network, Atmospheric Environment, 44, 814-823, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2009.11.032, 2010.

Zheng, Y. X., Xue, T., Zhang, Q., Geng, G. N., Tong, D., Li, X., and He, K. B.: Air quality improvements and health benefits from China's clean air action since 2013, Environmental Research Letters, 12, 11, doi: 10.1088/1748-9326/aa8a32, 2017.

Zhong, L. J., Louie, P. K. K., Zheng, J. Y., Yuan, Z. B., Yue, D. L., Ho, J. W. K., and Lau, A. K. H.: Science-policy interplay: Air quality management in the Pearl River Delta region and Hong Kong, Atmospheric Environment. 76, 3-10, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2013.03.012, 2013.

Zhong, Z. M., Zheng, J. Y., Zhu, M. N., Huang, Z. J., Zhang, Z. W., Jia, G. L., Wang, X. L., Bian, Y. H., Wang, Y. L., and Li, N.: Recent developments of anthropogenic air pollutant emission inventories in Guangdong province, China. Science of the Total Environment, 627, 1080-1092, doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.01.268, 2018.



**Figure 1.** Trends in the air pollutant emissions, per capita GPD, fuel consumption and vehicle population in Guangdong Province from 2006 to 2015 (all of data are normalized to the year 2006).









**Figure 2**. Comparison of emission trends with measurements in the PRD from 2006 to 2015. (a) SO<sub>2</sub> (b) NO<sub>X</sub> (c) PM<sub>10</sub> (all of data are normalized to the year 2006).

















Figure 5. Emission evolutions by source in the PRD and NPRD for (a)-(b) SO<sub>2</sub>, (c)-(d) NO<sub>x</sub>, (e)-(f) PM<sub>10</sub>, (g)-(h) PM<sub>2.5</sub>, (i)-(j) VOCs, (k)-(l) CO and (m)-(n) NH<sub>3</sub> from 2006 to 2015. Source emissions in 2006 were subtracted from total emissions for each year to exhibit the additional emissions compared to 2006 (left axle). The total emissions by pollutant during 2006-2015 was also reflected in right axle.



**Figure 6.** Trends of SO<sub>2</sub> emissions and fuel consumption from industrial combustion from 2006 to 2015. (SCE:- represents standard coal equivalent; FC represents: fuel consumption (i.e., coal, fuel oil, coke, and nature gas).): and all of FC data are normalized to the year 2006.



Figure 7. Trends of NO<sub>X</sub> emissions from on-road mobile source and its activity data from 2006 to 2015 in the (a) PRD and (b) NPRD.



contributions of industrial solvent use in the PRD and NPRD from 2006 to 2015.



2006 to 2015 in the (a) PRD and (b) NPRD



Figure-9\_10. Control- and activity-driven emissions of SO<sub>2</sub>, NO<sub>X</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub> and VOCs in 2007, 2009, 2011, 2013, and 2015 in addition to emission predictions in 2020 for the (a) PRD and (b) NPRD. Solvent use here includes industrial solvent use and non-industrial solvent use. The solid black line and the solid blue bar denotes the actual emissions we estimated under control (i.e., the results under the interaction of control- and activity-driven emissions; if control-driven emission dominated, the actual emissions would drop, and vice versa), and the dotted black line denotes the hypothetical emissions without control (i.e., activity-driven emission; if no new control measures were adopted after 2006). The non-solid chromatic bars and pies illustrate the emission reductions for multiple sources (i.e., control-driven emission). The dotted box

<b>Table 1</b> . Proportions of emissions in NPRD to the total emissions in GD.							
Years	$SO_2$	NOx	СО	<b>PM</b> <sub>10</sub>	PM <sub>2.5</sub>	VOCs	NH <sub>3</sub>
2006	27.1%	31.6%	39.4%	49.5%	50.3%	35.2%	64.0%
2007	29.7%	30.5%	40.2%	49.2%	49.8%	35.6%	66.7%
2008	31.3%	30.5%	40.4%	48.9%	49.8%	35.3%	64.5%
2009	35.3%	34.6%	41.9%	49.7%	50.4%	36.3%	65.9%
2010	40.7%	37.3%	41.5%	52.3%	51.9%	34.8%	67.1%
2011	44.1%	38.8%	42.2%	52.5%	50.6%	34.3%	67.7%
2012	44.7%	39.0%	41.6%	55.1%	52.0%	34.5%	67.7%
2013	46.0%	40.6%	43.2%	55.0%	52.0%	34.6%	67.7%
2014	48.7%	41.3%	45.1%	55.6%	53.5%	34.5%	68.1%
2015	48.2%	40.6%	46.9%	56.0%	54.0%	34.5%	68.2%

represents extra emission reductions in 2020 compared to 2015.