

Interactive comment on “Investigation of short-term effective radiative forcing of fire aerosols over North America using nudged hindcast ensembles” by Yawen Liu et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 26 June 2017

The major problem is that you should explain your results, not just describe the figures. How is the CRE effect influenced by LWP and CDNC? Why does the non-local effect exist? Especially, why the CRE maximum occurs over the Mexican gulf. These should be discussed and investigated.

Minor comments: L60: studied->study L77-79: You should clarify why the indirect effect of fire aerosol deserves study. L101-103: What's the differences between nudging horizontal wind and temperature. L370: Add "are" between "which" and "possibly"; L384: Same->The same; L297-503: How you can get the conclusion that at least 9 members are needed from Fig. 14. You need to quantify the results.

C1

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/acp-2017-414>, 2017.

C2