1 Dear Dr Sally E. Pusede:

comments below.

2 3 Thanks so much for giving us a chance to revise and submit our manuscript for 4 the potential publication in ACP. According to the reviewer's comment, we realized 5 that more in-depth analysis, especially those studies related to this research and 6 well explained some phenomena proposed in this research should be added. In the 7 revised manuscript, we have added a large body of references and much more 8 discussion and explanation to the revised manuscript according to the comments. 9 All the descriptive discussion in the previous manuscript, has been replaced with 10 more in-depth discussion, as well as the comparison with previous studies. By 11 explaining these previous studies, readers can see that the findings from this 12 research is consistent with and a major extension of previous studies. Meanwhile, 13 for some specific issues raised by the reviewer (e.g. the reason for variations of 14 meteorological influences across China, and the sensitivity of PM<sub>2.5</sub> variations to 15 the change of different meteorological factors, e.g. wind speed and precipitation), 16 we have added some references to explain and prove our suggestions with previous 17 case studies and experiments. By making these revisions, we believe this 18 manuscript has been significantly improved. Thanks again for the valuable 19 comments from you and the reviewer. We are more than willing to further revise 20 this manuscript if additional comments are given. 21 22 With regards

23 Ziyue 24 25 26 General Comments 27 28 The authors have made a good effort to respond to the reviewer comments. My main 29 remaining concern is that I still think that the paper as written is mostly descriptive and I 30 think it would benefit from more in depth discussion of the significance of the work. I've 31 pointed out a few specific areas where I think discussion could be added/improved in the 32

33	
34	R: Dear Reviewer, thanks so much for your valuable suggestions. By revising this
35	manuscript according to your general comments, we believe we have replaced all
36	those descriptive discussion with in-depth discussion, supported by previous
37	studies and the manuscript has been greatly improved. Thanks again for your time
38	and help. We are more than willing to further revise this manuscript if additional
39	comments are given.
40	
41	
42	Specific Comments
43	
44	pp 2, ln 38-42 – I wonder if it would be more effective to frame the opening here in terms of
45	the air pollution itself, rather than haze, which I think of as being one of the side effects of air
46	pollution.
47	R: Thanks so much for this comment. In the revised manuscript, we have replaced
48	the word "haze" with "high PM <sub>2.5</sub> concentrations" or "PM <sub>2.5</sub> pollution".
49	
50	pp 2, In 47 – Similarly, I think the opening would be stronger if you provided more specifics
51	about the health impacts of PM
52	R: This is a very good suggestion. In the revised manuscript, we have added some
53	details concerning specific influence of $\ensuremath{PM_{2.5}}$ concentration on human health as
54	follows:
55	
56	Garrett and Casimiro, (2011) revealed that the relative risk for cardiovascular
57	disease-related mortality for alder groups (>65 years) was 2.39% (95%C.I.
58	1.29%, 3.50%) for each 10 µg/m <sup>3</sup> PM <sub>2.5</sub> increase. Guaita et al. (2011) Qiao et al.
59	(2014) found an interquartile range increment in PM2.5 concentration (36.47
60	$\mu g/m^3)$ led to a 0.57% [95% confidence interval (CI): 0.13%, 1.01%] increase in
61	emergency room visits. Through experiments in nine French cities, Pasca et al.
62	(2014) observed a notable effect of PM <sub>2.5</sub> (+0.7%, [-0.1; 1.6]) on all year
63	non-accidental mortality for all age groups. In five European cities, estimation
64	results suggested that a 12.4 $\mu g/m^3$ increase in the PM_2.5 concentration can lead
65	to 3.0% [- 2.7%; 9.1%] increase in cardiovascular mortality (Lanzinger et al.,
	2

66	2015). Li et al. (2015) found that temperature played an important role in $PM_{2.5}$
67	induced mortality in Beijing. Under the condition of the lowest temperature
68	range (-9.7~2.6 °C), a 10 $\mu g/m^3$ increase in PM2.5 concentration led to an
69	increase of 1.27 % (95 % CI 0.38~2.17 %) in the relative risk (RR) of
70	cardiovascular mortality, which was the highest for all temperature ranges.
71	
72	pp 3, In 68 – Is this ozone and PM or just PM?
73	R: We are sorry that we did not make this part clear. This should PM, ozone and NO2 $$
74	and we have revised this sentence in the revised manuscript.
75	
76	
77	
78	pp 15, ln 352-354 – It would be nice to have some discussion in the paper (not necessarily in
79	this section) of why different factors are more important in different regions.
80	R: Thanks so much for this valuable comment. Yes, we should add more discussion,
81	especially the comparison with existing literatures to better explain this issue. We
82	have added a large body of relevant references and some possible explanations to
83	discuss the reasons why different factors are more important in different regions.
84	The explanation added to the revised manuscript: Firstly, the meteorological
85	conditions varied significantly in different regions across China. Secondly,
86	interactions between meteorological factors and $\ensuremath{PM}_{2.5}$ concentrations can be
87	highly complicated, subject to meteorological conditions and local $\ensuremath{PM_{2.5}}$
88	concentrations. A large body of references and relevant explanation included in the
89	revised manuscript is listed as follows, marked red:
90	
91	
92	The finding from this research was consistent with and a major extension of that
02	

93 from previous studies by quantifying the influence of individual meteorological 94 factors in a large number of cities across China, instead of several scattered cities, 95 using a more robust causality analysis method, other than the correlation 96 analysis. Similar to previous studies, this study also revealed notable differences 97 in meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations at the national scale, the 98 major reason for which was different meteorological conditions and complicated

99 mechanisms of PM2.5-meteorology interactions. Firstly, notable differences 100 existed in meteorological conditions across China. For instance, in winter, the frequency and intensity of precipitation are much higher and stronger in coastal 101 102 areas than those in the North China region, where the frequency of strong winds 103 is high in winter. Therefore, precipitation exerts a large influence on PM2.5 104 concentrations in coastal regions whilst wind is the key influencing factor for 105 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in the North China region in winter. Secondly, in addition 106 to the large variations in the values of correlation coefficients, the interaction 107 mechanisms between individual meteorological factors and PM2.5 concentrations 108 may also vary significantly across regions. For such meteorological influences as 109 wind speed, its negative effect on PM2.5 concentrations was consistent in China 110 (He e al., 2017). On the other hand, He et al. (2017) suggested that temperature 111 and humidity were either positively or negatively correlated with PM2.5 112 concentrations in different regions of China. In terms of humidity, when the humidity is low, PM2.5 concentration increases with the increase of humidity due 113 114 to hygroscopic increase and accumulation of PM2.5 (Fu et al., 2016). When the 115 humidity continues to grow, the particles grow too heavy to stay in the air, 116 leading to dry (particles drop to the ground) (Wang, J., & Ogawa, S. (2015)) and wet deposition (precipitation) (Li et al., 2015b), and the reduction of PM2.5 117 118 concentrations. Similarly, there may be thresholds for the negative influences of 119 precipitations on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations (Luo et al., 2017). Heavy precipitation can 120 have a strong washing-off effects on PM2.5 concentrations and notably reduce 121 PM2.5 concentrations. Meanwhile, slight precipitation may not effectively 122 remove the high-concentration PM2.5. Instead, the slight precipitation may 123 induce enhanced relative humidity and thus lead to the increase of PM2.5 124 concentrations. Meanwhile, the washing-off effect from the same amount of 125 precipitation on PM2.5 concentrations in Xi'an, a city with higher PM2.5 126 concentrations, was lower than that in Guangzhou (Guo et al., 2016), indicating 127 local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations also exerted a key role in the negative effects of precipitation. Meanwhile, temperature can either be negatively correlated with 128 129 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations by accelerating the flow circulation and promoting the 130 dispersion of PM2.5 (Li et al., 2015b), or positively correlated with PM2.5 131 concentrations through inversion events (Jian et al., 2012).

132								
133								
134	pp 15, ln 365-369 – Similarly, I think it would be valuable here to have some discussion of							
135	why winds are important in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei, but less important in summer. I'd							
136	imagine it has to do with having stronger, and more large-scale, circulation in winter?							
137	R: Thanks so much for this suggestions. Yes, you are right. Large –scale circulation							
138	in winter is the major reason for strong winds in winter. We added to two							
139	references to the revised manuscript to prove this.							
140								
141	The results show that the presence of high air pressure in northwest Beijing							
142	(NW-High) generally produced strong northwest winds with clean upwind air. As a							
143	result, the NW-High played an important role in cleaning Beijing's PM <sub>2.5</sub> .(Tie et al.,							
144	2015). In spring and winter, with strong northwesterly synoptic winds, the							
145	sea-breeze circulation is confined in the coastal area, and the MPC is suppressed.							
146	(Miao et.al, 2015)							
147								
148	Miao, Y., XM. Hu, S. Liu, T. Qian, M. Xue, Y. Zheng, and S. Wang (2015), Seasonal							
149	variation of local atmospheric circulations and boundary layer structure in the							
150	Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei							
151	region and implications for air quality, J. Adv. Model. Earth Syst., 7, 1602–1626,							
152								
153	Tie, X., Zhang, Q., He, H., Cao, J., Han, S., & Gao, Y., et al. (2015). A budget analysis							
154	of the formation of haze in beijing. Atmospheric Environment, 100, 25-36.							
155								
156								
157	pp 20, ln 416-420 – Why do you think precip might be more important in places with lower							
158	pollution levels? Is the air cleaner because the regions are wetter, or for another reason?							
159	R: This is a very good point. You proposed a comment above that why							
160	meteorological influences on $\ensuremath{\text{PM}_{2.5}}$ concentrations varies across China. And							
161	precipitation is a good example that exerts different influences on $\ensuremath{\text{PM}_{2.5}}$							
162	concentrations. We have added some relevant references to the revised							
163	manuscript to address the question.							
164								

165 Luo et al. (2017). pointed out that there may be thresholds for the negative 166 influences of precipitations on PM2.5 concentrations Heavy precipitation can have 167 a strong washing-off effects on PM2.5 concentrations and notably reduce PM2.5 168 concentrations. Meanwhile, slight precipitation may not effectively remove the 169 high-concentration PM2.5. Instead, the slight precipitation may induce enhanced 170 relative humidity and thus lead to the increase of PM2.5 concentrations. So either 171 large amount of precipitation or low PM2.5 concentrations can lead to a large 172 influence of precipitation on PM2.5 concentrations. This was also proved by some 173 experiments. Through experiments, it was revealed that the washing-off effect 174 from the same amount of precipitation on PM2.5 concentrations in Xi'an, a city with 175 higher PM2.5 concentrations, was lower than that in Guangzhou, a city with lower 176  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations. (Guo et al., 2016). In this research, we found that 177 precipitation mainly exerted a major role in influencing PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in 178 coastal areas and Yangtze River Basins, which is consistent with these findings. 179 The precipitation in coastal areas and Yangtze River Basins is much larger than that 180 in North parts of China, where the PM2.5 concentrations are higher and thus the 181 washing-off effects of precipitations are significantly limited. Studies in Nanjing 182 (Chen, T. et al., 2016), a mega city in the Yangtze River, and Hong Kong (Fung et 183 al.,), a mega coastal city, also proved that precipitation is the most important 184 meteorological factors for PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations.

185

186 In the revised manuscript, the following text has been added:

187

188 Taking the precipitation as an example. Luo et al. (2017). pointed out that there 189 may be thresholds for the negative influences of precipitations on PM2.5 190 concentrations and Guo et al. (2016) found that the same amount of precipitation 191 led to a washing-off effects in areas with higher PM2.5 concentrations. Hence, 192 precipitation mainly exerts a dominant influence on local PM2.5 concentrations 193 in winter for Yangtze River Basin or coastal cities, where the amount of 194 precipitation is large and the PM2.5 concentration is low, whilst precipitation 195 exerts a limited role in northern China, where the amount of precipitation is 196 small and the PM2.5 concentration is high.

198	pp 22, footnote 6- For completeness, I think you should probably report the correlation
199	coefficients or cite a paper that does.
200	R: Thanks so much for this comment. In the revised manuscript, a reference, Chen
201	et al. (2017), which introduced some calculated correlation coefficients, as well as
202	the p value, has been cited.
203	
204	pp 24, In 548 – 552 – I'm still not convinced of this point. I think there is a difference between
205	showing which meteorological factor is most dominant vs. showing sensitivity to changes in
206	meteorological factors (for example, the anthropogenic greenhouse effect is dominated by
207	CO2, but the atmosphere is much more sensitivity to changes in CH4). You said in your
208	response that you looked at year-to-year variability, but I didn't see any discussion of it in the
209	paper. Did it add any insights?
210	R: Thanks so much for this point. With this comment, as well as some other
211	comments, we realized that we did not make this part clear. And the CCM method
212	itself may not well reveal the sensitivity of $\ensuremath{\text{PM}_{2.5}}$ variations to the change of
213	meteorological factors. So in the revised manuscript, firstly, we added some
214	relevant studies, which employed local scale analysis to prove a similar finding
215	from this research (e.g. the major influencing factor for Beijing in winter is wind
216	speed whilst the factor is precipitation in Yangtze River Basin and coast areas, such
217	as Nanjing, Guangzhou). In addition, some other issues, such as why strong wind is
218	prevailing in Beijing is in winter and why precipitation has a large washing-off
219	effects in coastal areas, has been added as well in above responses. Most
220	importantly, we added several papers that well proved the hypothesis presented
221	here. In terms of wind speed, in North China, PM2.5 concentration is much more
222	
	sensitive to the change of wind speed than that of other meteorological factors
223	sensitive to the change of wind speed than that of other meteorological factors (Gao et al., 2016). Meanwhile, wind-speed induced climate change led to the
223 224	
	(Gao et al., 2016). Meanwhile, wind-speed induced climate change led to the
224	(Gao et al., 2016). Meanwhile, wind-speed induced climate change led to the change of PM2.5 concentrations by as much as 12.0 $\mu$ gm-3, compared with the
224 225	(Gao et al., 2016). Meanwhile, wind-speed induced climate change led to the change of PM2.5 concentrations by as much as 12.0 µgm-3, compared with the change of PM2.5 concentrations by up to 4.0 µgm-3 in south-eastern, northwestern
224 225 226	(Gao et al., 2016). Meanwhile, wind-speed induced climate change led to the change of PM2.5 concentrations by as much as 12.0 µgm-3, compared with the change of PM2.5 concentrations by up to 4.0 µgm-3 in south-eastern, northwestern and south-western China (Tai et al., 2010). Therefore, wind speed is BOTH the
224 225 226 227	(Gao et al., 2016). Meanwhile, wind-speed induced climate change led to the change of PM2.5 concentrations by as much as 12.0 µgm-3, compared with the change of PM2.5 concentrations by up to 4.0 µgm-3 in south-eastern, northwestern and south-western China (Tai et al., 2010). Therefore, wind speed is BOTH the dominant influencing factor and the factor that PM <sub>2.5</sub> variations are most sensitive
224 225 226 227 228	(Gao et al., 2016). Meanwhile, wind-speed induced climate change led to the change of PM2.5 concentrations by as much as 12.0 $\mu$ gm-3, compared with the change of PM2.5 concentrations by up to 4.0 $\mu$ gm-3 in south-eastern, northwestern and south-western China (Tai et al., 2010). Therefore, wind speed is BOTH the dominant influencing factor and the factor that PM <sub>2.5</sub> variations are most sensitive to in North China, and thus meteorological means for encouraging strong winds are

231	washing-off effects for $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations and Guo et al. (2016) revealed that the
232	same amount of precipitation had a stronger washing-off effect in areas with lower
233	$\ensuremath{PM_{2.5}}$ concentrations. Therefore, meteorological means for inducing precipitation
234	are more likely to improve air quality in coastal cities and cities within the Yangtze
235	River basin, where there is a large amount of precipitation and relatively low PM2.5
236	concentrations.

237

In the revised manuscript, the following text has been added to the discussion andconclusion part:

240

241 For the heavily polluted North China region, especially the 242 Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region, the northwesterly synoptic wind (Tie et al., 2015; 243 Miao et al., 2015) is much stronger in winter than winds in summer and exerts a 244 dominant influence on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations (Chen et al., 2017). Furthermore, in 245 North China, PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration is much more sensitive to the change of wind 246 speed than that of other meteorological factors (Gao et al., 2016). Meanwhile, 247 wind-speed induced climate change led to the change of PM2.5 concentrations by as much as 12.0 µgm<sup>-3</sup>, compared with the change of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations by up 248 249 to 4.0 µgm<sup>-3</sup> in south-eastern, northwestern and south-western China (Tai et al., 250 2010). Considering the strong winds in winter, the dominant influence of wind 251 speed on PM2.5 concentrations and the sensitivity of PM2.5 feedbacks to the 252 change of wind speed, meteorological means for encouraging strong winds are 253 more likely to reduce PM2.5 concentrations considerably in North China. 254 Similarly, Luo et al. (2017) suggested that only precipitation with a certain 255 magnitude can lead to the washing-off effect of PM2.5 concentrations whilst Guo 256 et al. (2016) revealed that the variation of PM2.5 concentrations was more 257 sensitive to the same amount of precipitation in areas with lower PM2.5 258 concentrations. Therefore, meteorological means for inducing precipitation are 259 more likely to improve air quality in coastal cities and cities within the Yangtze 260 River basin, where there is a large amount of precipitation and relatively low 261 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations

262

264

265

pp 24-25, conclusions section – I think this section could be deepened by making clear how this study fits in with the existing literature. How do these results compare to the literature, and what new knowledge has been added? As someone who is admittedly not well versed in the literature on air quality-meteorology interactions in China, this was not clear to me.

270 R: Thanks so much for this valuable comment. As explained above, in the discussion 271 part, we have added a large part of literature review, concerning existing research 272 on the correlations between individual meteorological factors and PM<sub>2.5</sub> 273 concentrations. As you can see, previous studies mainly focused on the 274 meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in several specific cities, and 275 thus a comprehensive comparison has yet been conducted. Furthermore, previous 276 studies mainly employed the correlation analysis, which may be biased in 277 quantifying meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. The findings from 278 this research was generally consistent with that from previous studies Firstly, by 279 comparing the results from different studies, one can see that meteorological 280 influences varied significantly in different cities across China, which was further 281 proved by this research conducted at the national scale. Secondly, the extracted 282 dominant meteorological factors for some cities in most polluted winter (e.g. wind 283 for Beijing, precipitation for Nanjing and Hong Kong) were similar to findings from 284 this research. This research is a major extension of previous studies by extending 285 the study sites from scattered cities to 188 cities all over China. In this case, 286 regional similarity in meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations, which 287 cannot be extracted based on local scale case studies, was revealed. Meanwhile, 288 the CCM method provides more reliable quantitative analysis of meteorological 289 influences on  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations, compared with the correlation coefficient. 290 Thirdly, this research analyzed a complete set of eight meteorological factors, 291 whilst previous studies generally focused on a smaller number of meteorological 292 factors. Fourthly, the study period of previous studies conducted in specific cities 293 varied significantly, ranging from weeks to years. Instead, this research used a 294 unified three-year observation data to compare meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> 295 concentrations in different cities, and thus the comparison result is more robust. 296 Finally, some statistics of the general influence of individual meteorological factors

297	(e.g. wind, precipitation) was rarely compared and thus the three major factors,
298	temperature, humidity and wind for $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations all over China, revealed in
299	this research, were a major contribution to the existing literatures.
300	
301	So compared with previous studies, this research further proved the diversity of
302	meteorological influences on $\ensuremath{PM_{2.5}}$ concentrations in China, and revealed some
303	regional patterns which were rarely studied, and provided decision makers with a
304	comprehensive understanding of meteorological influences across China, which is
305	of practical significance for management of local and regional air quality.
306	
307	Thanks again for this valuable comment. By responding to this comment, we
308	reviewed many relevant papers, and better linked this research to other studies.
309	This manuscript, especially the discussion and conclusion part, has been improved
310	significantly.
311	
312	In the revised manuscript, the following text has been added to the discussion and
313	conclusion part:
314	
315	
316	Discussion:
317	Despite the lack of a comprehensive comparison of meteorological influences on
318	PM <sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in different regions, some studies concerning
319	meteorology-PM_{2.5} relationship in specific areas have been conducted and
320	correlations between individual meteorological factors and PM <sub>2.5</sub> concentrations
321	have been analyzed in such mega cities as Nanjing ( Chen, T. et al., 2016; Shen and
322	Li., 2016;), Beijing (Huang et al., 2015; Yin et al., 2016), Wuhan ( Zhang et al.,
323	2017), Hangzhou (Jian et al., 2012), Chengdu (Zeng and Zhang, et al. 2017) and
324	Hong Kong (Fung et al., 2014). These studies mainly employed correlation
325	analysis to quantify the influence of several meteorological factors on $\ensuremath{PM_{2.5}}$
326	concentrations and suggested that meteorological influences on $\ensuremath{PM_{2.5}}$
327	concentrations varied significantly across regions. The dominant meteorological
328	factors for P <sub>2.5</sub> concentrations (presented as the largest correlation coefficients in
329	previous studies and the $^{ ho}$ value in this research ) demonstrated notable regional

330 differences. For Nanjing (Chen, T. et al., 2016), a mega city in the Yangtze River, 331 and Hong Kong (Fung et al.,), a mega coastal city, precipitation exerted the strongest influence whilst wind speed exerted a weak influence on PM2.5 332 333 concentrations in winter. On the other hand, for winter, wind speed was the 334 dominant meteorological factor for PM2.5 concentrations in Beijing (Huang et al., 335 2015.), a mega city in North China, and precipitation played a weak role in 336 affecting local PM2.5 concentrations . These studies generally analyzed and compared 337 the influences of different meteorological factors on PM2.5 concentrations and 338 extracted the dominant meteorological influencing factors for specific areas. However, 339 most studies were conducted at the local scale and few studies have focused on the 340 comparison and statistics of meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations in 341 different areas. Meanwhile, although the correlation coefficient can be used to 342 understand and compare the general magnitude of the influence of individual 343 meteorological factors, the correlation analysis, as explained above, may lead to large 344 bias in quantifying the meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations.

345

#### 346 **Conclusion part:**

347 Previous studies examined the correlation between individual meteorological influences and PM2.5 concentrations in some specific cities and the comparison 348 349 between these studies indicated that meteorological influences on PM2.5 350 concentrations varied significantly across cities and seasons. However, these 351 scattered studies conducted at the local scale cannot reveal regional patterns of 352 meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations. Furthermore, previous 353 studies generally selected different research periods and meteorological factors, 354 making the comparison of findings from different studies less robust. Thirdly, these studies employed the correlation analysis, which may be biased significantly 355 356 due to the complicated interactions between individual meteorological factors. 357 This research is a major extension of previous studies. Based on a robust 358 causality analysis method CCM, we quantified and compared the influence of eight meteorological factors on local PM2.5 concentrations for 188 monitoring 359 360 cities across China using PM2.5 and meteorological observation data from 2014.3 361 to 2017.2. Similar to previous studies conducted at the local scale, this research 362 further proved that meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations were of 363 notable seasonal and spatial variations at the national scale. Furthermore, this

364 research revealed some regional patterns and comprehensive statistics of the

- 365 influence of individual meteorological factors on PM2.5 concentrations, which
- 366 cannot be understood through small-scale case studies.
- 367

368 Technical corrections

- 369 pp 1, ln 20-22 The wording of this sentence is unclear.
- 370 R: This sentence has been revised from "For the heavily polluted North China region, the
- 371 higher PM2.5 concentrations, the larger influences meteorological factors exert on PM2.5
- 372 concentrations."
- 373 To "For the heavily polluted North China region, when PM2.5 concentrations are high,
- 374 meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations are strong."
- 375 pp 2, In 63 should read "ozone concentrations were linearly correlated..."
- 376 R: Corrected.
- 377 pp 3, ln 66 should read "... during the summer monsoon."
- 378 R: Corrected.
- 379 pp 3, ln 86 should read " ... humidity and solar radiation..."
- 380 R: Corrected.
- 381 pp 5, ln 141 should read "8am-8pm"
- 382 R: Corrected.
- 383 pp 9 Figure 1 appears blurry in the pdf file.
- 384 **R: This Figure 1 has been reproduced.**
- 385  $\,$  pp 13, ln 312-313 should read "... are influenced by similar dominant meteorological
- 386 factors..."
- 387 R: Corrected.
- 388 pp 14, ln 318 should read "the higher the local PM2.5 concentrations,"
- 389 R: Corrected.
- 390 pp 14, ln 322 should read "spring and summer are comparatively low."
- 391 R: Corrected.
- 392 pp 20, ln 410-413 this sentence is a bit unclear.
- 393 R: Thanks so much for this. We changed the sentence from, "As a result, when
- analyzing meteorological influences on local  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations for a specific city,
- 395 the influence of meteorological factors that have little influence on  $PM_{2.5}$

396 concentrations at a large scale should be carefully examined at the local scale. "

- 397 to "As a result, when analyzing meteorological influences on local  $PM_{2.5}$
- 398 concentrations for a specific city, meteorological factors that have little influence on
- $399 \qquad PM_{2.5} \ concentrations \ at \ a large \ scale \ should \ also \ be \ comprehensively \ considered"$
- 400

401 pp 22, ln 501 – this wording is unclear.

- 402 R: in the revised manuscript, we changed the sentence from "dynamic statistical models
- 403 comprehensively consider the meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations"
- 404 To "dynamic statistical models additionally consider the meteorological influences on
- 405 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations".
- 406
- 407

408	Understanding meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations across China:
409	a temporal and spatial perspective
410	Ziyue Chen <sup>1,2</sup> , Xiaoming Xie <sup>1</sup> , Jun Cai <sup>3</sup> , Danlu Chen <sup>1</sup> , Bingbo Gao <sup>4</sup> , Bin He <sup>1,2</sup> ,
411	Nianliang Cheng <sup>5</sup> , Bing Xu <sup>3*</sup>
412	<sup>1</sup> College of Global Change and Earth System Science, Beijing Normal University, 19 Xinjiekouwai
413	Street, Haidian, Beijing, 100875, China
414	<sup>2</sup> Joint Center for Global Change Studies, Beijing 100875, China
415	<sup>3</sup> Ministry of Education Key Laboratory for Earth System Modeling, Department of Earth System
416	Science, Tsinghua University, Beijing 100084, China
417	<sup>4</sup> National Engineering Research Center for Information Technology in Agriculture, 11 Shuguang
418	Huayuan Middle Road, Beijing 100097, China
419	<sup>5</sup> Beijing Municipal Environmental Monitoring Center, Beijing 100048, China

## 420 Abstract

421 With frequent haze events in China, growing research emphasis has been put on quantifying 422 meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations. However, these studies mainly focus on 423 isolated cities whilst meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations at the national scale 424 have yet been examined comprehensively. This research employs the CCM (Cross 425 Convergent Mapping) method to understand the influence of individual meteorological 426 factors on local PM2.5 concentrations in 188 monitoring cities across China. Results indicate 427 that meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations are of notable seasonal and regional 428 variations. For the heavily polluted North China region, the higher when PM2.5 concentrations 429 are high, the larger influences meteorological factors influences exert on PM2.5 concentrations 430 are strong. The dominant meteorological influence for PM2.5 concentrations varies across 431 locations and demonstrates regional similarities. For the most polluted winter, the dominant 432 meteorological driver for local PM2.5 concentrations is mainly the wind within the North 433 China region whilst precipitation is the dominant meteorological influence for most coastal 434 regions. At the national scale, the influence of temperature, humidity and wind on PM2.5 435 concentrations is much larger than that of other meteorological factors. Amongst eight factors, 436 temperature exerts the strongest and most stable influence on national PM2.5 concentrations in 437 all seasons. Due to notable temporal and spatial differences in meteorological influences on 438 local PM2.5 concentrations, this research suggests pertinent environmental projects for air 439 quality improvement should be designed accordingly for specific regions.

440 Keywords: PM<sub>2.5</sub>; Meteorological factors; Causality analysis; CCM

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author. Email address: bingxu@tsinghua.edu.cn. Telephone No. 0086(10) 62773906

#### 441 Introduction

442 With rapid social and economic growth in China, both the government and residents are 443 placing more and more emphasis on the sustainability of the ambient environment, and 444 air quality has become one of the most concerned social and ecological issues. Recently, 445 the frequency of haze events the frequency of air pollution episodes with high PM2.5 446 concentrations and the number of cities influenced by PM<sub>2.5</sub> pollutionhaze have 447 increased notably in China since 2013. Statistical records from the national air quality 448 publishing platform (http://113.108.142.147:20035/emcpublish/) revealed that PM2.5 449 induced pollutionhaze events occurred in 25 provinces and more than 100 middle-large 450 cities whilst there were on average 30 days with hazardous haze PM2.5 concentrations for 451 each monitoring city in 2014.

452 Serious hazeHigh PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations not only influences people's daily life (e.g. the 453 cause of severe traffic jam during haze epsiodes), but also severely threatens the health 454 of residents that suffer from polluted air quality. Recent studies (Garrett and Casimiro, 455 2011; Qiao et al., 2014; Pasca et al., 2014; Lanzinger et al., 2015; Li et al., 2015a; etc.) 456 have proven that airborne pollutants, PM2.5 in particular, are closely related to all-cause 457 and cause-specific mortality. Garrett and Casimiro, (2011) revealed that the relative risk 458 for cardiovascular disease-related mortality for alder groups (>65 years) was 2.39% 459 (95% C.I. 1.29%, 3.50%) for each 10  $\mu$  g/m<sup>3</sup> PM<sub>2.5</sub> increase. Guaita et al. (2011) Qiao et 460 al. (2014) found an interquartile range increment in PM2.5 concentration (36.47 µg/m3) 461 led to a 0.57% [95% confidence interval (CI): 0.13%, 1.01%] increase in emergency 462 room visits. Through experiments in nine French cities, Pasca et al. (2014) observed a 463 notable effect of PM2.5 (+0.7%, [-0.1; 1.6]) on all year non-accidental mortality for all 464 age groups. In five European cities, estimation results suggested that a 12.4 µg/m<sup>3</sup> 465 increase in the PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration can lead to 3.0% [- 2.7%; 9.1%] increase in 466 cardiovascular mortality (Lanzinger et al., 2015). Li et al. (2015a) found that temperature 467 played an important role in PM<sub>2.5</sub> induced mortality in Beijing. Under the condition of 468 the lowest temperature range (-9.7~2.6 °C), a 10 µg/m<sup>3</sup> increase in PM2.5 concentration 469 led to an increase of 1.27 % (95 % CI 0.38~2.17 %) in the relative risk (RR) of 470 cardiovascular mortality, which was the highest for all temperature ranges. Due to its 471 strong negative influences on public health, In consequence, scholars have been 472 working towards a better understanding of sources (Guo et al., 2012; Zhang et al., 2013;

1	<b>带格式的:</b> 上标
1	<b>带格式的:</b> 下标
-	<b>带格式的:</b> 上标

带格式的: 上标	
带格式的: 下标	

473 Gu et al., 2014; Liu et al., 2014; Cao et al., 2014), characteristics (Wei et al., 2012;

474 Zhang et al., 2013; Hu et al., 2015; Zhang, F. et al., 2015; Zhen et al., 2016; Zhang et al.,

475 2016) and seasonal variations (Cao et al., 2012; Shen et al., 2014; Yang and Christakos,

476 2015; Wang et al., 2015; Chen et al., 2015; Chen, Y. et al. 2016; Chen, Z. et al., 2016) of

477 PM<sub>2.5</sub> and other airborne pollutants. Meanwhile, large-scale research on the variation and

distribution of PM<sub>2.5</sub> has been conducted using a variety of remote sensing sources and

479 spatial data analysis methods (Ma et al., 2014; Kong et al., 2016.)

480 One key issue for air quality research is to find the source and influencing factors for 481 airborne pollutants. Although quantitative contributions of different sources (e.g. coal 482 burning and automobile exhaust) to airborne pollutants remain controversial, 483 meteorological influences on airborne pollutants have been examined in depth by more 484 and more scholars. Recently, massive studies have been conducted to extract quantitative 485 correlations between meteorological factors and air pollutants. Blanchard et al. (2010) 486 indicated that ozone concentrations was-were linearly correlated with temperature and 487 humidity, and non-linearly correlated with other meteorological factors. Juneng et al. 488 (2011) suggested that such meteorological factors as temperature, humidity and wind 489 speed, dominated the fluctuation of PM10 over the Klang Valley during the summer 490 monsoon. In Melbourne, Pearce et al. (2011) found that local temperature led to strongest 491 responses of different pollutants (PM, ozone and NO<sub>2</sub>), whilst other meteorological 492 factors (e.g. winds, water vapor pressure, radiation, precipitation) affected one or more 493 specific pollutants. In the city of Elche, Spain, Galindo et al. (2011) revealed that 494 fractions of three different PM sizes (PM1, PM2.5 and PM10) were negatively correlated 495 with wind speed in winter, whilst coarse fractions were strongly correlated with 496 temperature and solar radiation. At a site of the Egyptian Mediterranean coast, 497 El-Metwally and Alfaro (2013) found that the wind speed not only influenced the 498 dilution of airborne pollutants, but also affected the composition of airborne pollutants. 499 For a Western Indian location, Udaipur, Yadav et al. (2014) proved that precipitation 500 exerted a stronger influence on PM10 than on PM2.5. High temperature diluted the 501 emission of surface pollutants whilst strong winds diminished the trend of air pollution 502 in May. Grundstrom et al. (2015) suggested that low wind speeds and positive vertical 503 temperature gradients were favorable meteorological conditions for elevated NOx and 504 particle number concentrations (PNC). Zhang et al. (2015b) quantified the correlations 505 between meteorological factors and main airborne pollutants in three megacities, Beijing, 506 Shanghai and Guangzhou, and pointed out that the influences of meteorological factors 507 on the formation and concentrations of airborne pollutants varied significantly across 508 seasons and geographical locations. Chen, Z. et al. (2017) quantified the meteorological 509 influences on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region and 510 revealed that wind, humidity and <u>solar</u> radiation were major meteorological factors that 511 significantly influenced local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in winter.

512 Although correlations between airborne pollutants and meteorological factors have been 513 well studied, analyzing the sensitivity of airborne pollutants to individual meteorological parameters remains challenging (Pearce et al., 2011). This is because different 514 515 meteorological factors are inherently interacting and can thus influence airborne 516 pollutants through direct and indirect mechanisms. Due to the diversity of meteorological 517 factors and complicated interactions between them, Pearce et al (2011) suggested that 518 multiple models and methods should be comprehensively employed to quantify the 519 influence of meteorological factors on local airborne pollutants. Our previous research 520 (Chen, Z., 2017) proved that the CCM (Cross Convergent Mapping) method performed 521 better in quantifying the influence of individual meteorological factors on  $PM_{2.5}$ 522 concentrations than traditional correlation analysis through comprehensive comparison. 523 However, this study mainly focused on the meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> 524 concentrations in a specific region. As pointed out by some scholars, interactions 525 between meteorological factors and airborne pollutants are of great variations for 526 different regions, yet most relevant studies have been conducted at the local or regional 527 scale. China is a large country, including many regions with completely different air 528 pollution levels, geographical conditions and meteorological types. To better understand 529 the variations of meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations, a comparative study 530 at the national scale is required.

531 In accordance with these challenges, this research aims to quantify and compare 532 influences of individual meteorological factors on  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations in different cities 533 across China. Based on the causality analysis, dominant meteorological factors for  $PM_{2.5}$ 534 concentrations can be extracted for each city and spatio-temporal patterns of 535 meteorological influences on  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations across China can be revealed. In 536 addition to its theoretical significance, this research may provide useful reference for evaluating pertinent environmental projects and enhancing air quality throughmeteorological measures.

- 539 2 Materials
- 540 2.1 Data sources
- 541 2.1.1 PM<sub>2.5</sub> data

542 PM<sub>2.5</sub> data are acquired from the website PM25.in. This website collects official data of PM2.5 concentrations provided by China National Environmental Monitoring Center 543 544 (CNEMC) and publishes hourly air quality information for all monitoring cities. Before Jan 1st, 2015, PM25.in publishes data of 190 monitoring cities. Since Jan 1st, 2015, the 545 number of monitoring cities has increased to 367. By calling specific API (Application 546 547 Programming Interface) provided by PM25.in, we collect hourly PM2.5 data for target 548 cities. The daily PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations for each city is calculated using the averaged value 549 of hourly PM2.5 concentrations measured at all available local observation stations. For a consecutive division of different seasons and multiple-year analysis, We collected PM2.5 550 data from March 1st, 2014 to February 28th, 2017 for the following analysis. 551

## 552 2.1.2 Meteorological data

553 The meteorological data for these monitoring cities are obtained from the "China 554 Meteorological Data Sharing Service System", part of National Science and Technology 555 Infrastructure. The meteorological data are collected through thousands of observation stations across China. Previous studies (Zhang et al., 2015b; Pearce et al., 2011; Yadav et 556 557 al., 2014) proved that such meteorological factors as relative humidity, temperature, wind 558 speed, wind direction, solar radiation, evaporation, precipitation, and air pressure may be 559 related to PM2.5 concentrations. Therefore, to comprehensively understand 560 meteorological driving forces for PM2.5 concentrations in China, all these potential 561 meteorological factors were selected as candidate factors. To better quantify the role of 562 these meteorological factors in affecting local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations, these factors are 563 further categorized into some sub-factors: evaporation (small evaporation and large 564 evaporation, short for smallEVP and largeEVP2), temperature (daily max temperature,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> SmallEVP and LargeEVP indicate the evaporation amount measured using small-diameter and large-diameter equipments respectively. Generally, the measured values using the two types of equipment are of slight 18

565 mean temperature, min temperature, and largest temperature difference for the day, short for maxTEM, meanTEM, minTEM and difTEM), precipitation (total precipitation from 566 567 8am-20pm8pm, total precipitation from 20pm8pm-8am and total precipitation for the day, 568 short for PRE8-20, PRE20-8 and totalPRE), air pressure (daily max pressure, mean 569 pressure and min pressure, short for maxPRS, meanPRS and minPRS), humidity (daily 570 mean and min relative humidity, short for meanRHU and minRHU), radiation (sunshine 571 duration<sup>3</sup> for the day, short for SSD), wind speed (mean wind speed, max wind speed, 572 extreme wind speed<sup>4</sup>, short for meanWIN, maxWIN and extWIN), wind direction (max 573 wind direction<sup>5</sup> for the day, short for dir\_maxWin). As there are one or more observation 574 stations for each city, the daily value for each meteorological factor for each city was 575 calculated using the mean value of all available observation stations within the target city. 576 To conduct time series comparison, we also collected meteorological data from March 1st, 577 2014 to February 28th, 2017.

## 578 2.2 Study sites

For a comprehensive understanding of meteorological influences on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations across China, all monitoring cities (except for Liaocheng and Zhuji, where continuous valid meteorological data were not available) during the study period were selected for this research. The 188 cities included most major cities (Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, etc.) in China. For regions (e.g. Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region) with heavy air pollution, the density of monitored cities was much higher than that in regions with good air quality.

#### 586 3 Methods

587 Due to complicated interactions in the atmospheric environment, it is highly difficult to 588 quantify the causality of individual meteorological factors on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations 589 through correlation analysis. Instead, a robust causality analysis method is required.

590 To extract the coupling between individual variables in complex systems, Sugihara et al. 591 (2012) proposed a convergent cross mapping (CCM) method. Different from Granger 592 causality (GC) analysis (Granger, 1980), the CCM method is sensitive to weak to

differences.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Sunshine duration represents the hours of sunshine measured during a day for a specific location on earth.
 <sup>4</sup> The max wind speed indicates the max mean wind speed during any 10 minutes within a day's time. The

extreme wind speed indicates the max instant (for 1s) wind speed within a day's time.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The max wind direction indicates the dominant wind direction for the period with the max wind speed.

593 moderate coupling in ecological time series. By analyzing the temporal variations of two 594 time-series variables, their bidirectional coupling can be featured with a convergent map. If the influence of one variable on the other variable is presented as a convergent curve 595 with increasing time series length, then the causality is detected; If the curve 596 597 demonstrates no convergent trend, then no causality exists. The predictive skill (defined 598 as  $\rho$  value), which ranges from 0 to 1, suggests the quantitative causality of one 599 variable on the other.

600 The principle of CCM algorithms is briefly explained as follows (Luo et al. 2014). Two 601 time series  $\{X\} = [X(1), ..., X(L)]$  and  $\{Y\} = [Y(1), ..., Y(L)]$  are defined as the temporal 602 variations of two variables X and Y. For r = S to L (S < L), two partial time series 603  $[X(1), ..., X(L_P)]$  and  $[Y(1), ..., Y(L_P)]$  are extracted from the original time series (r is the 604 current position whilst S is the start position in the time series). Following this, the 605 shadow manifold  $M_X$  is generated from  $\{X\}$ , which is a set of lagged-coordinate vectors  $x(t) = \langle X(t), X(t-t), \dots, X(t-(E-1)t) \rangle$  for t = 1+(E-1)t to t = r. To generate a 606 cross-mapped estimate of Y(t) ( $\hat{Y}(t)|M_X$ ), the contemporaneous lagged-coordinate vector 607 608 on  $M_X$ , x(t) is located, and then its E+1 nearest neighbors are extracted, where E+1 is the 609 minimum number of points required for a bounding simplex in an E-dimensional space 610 (Sugihara and May, 1990). Next, the time index of the E+1 nearest neighbors of x(t) is 611 denoted as t1, ..., tE+1. These time index are used to identify neighbor points in Y and then estimate Y(t) according to a locally weighted mean of E+1  $Y(t_i)$  values (Equation 1). 612

613 
$$\hat{Y}(t)|M_{X} = \sum_{i=1}^{E+1} w_{i}Y(t_{i})$$
(E1)

614 Where  $w_i$  is a weight calculated according to the distance between X(t) and its i<sup>th</sup> nearest 615 neighbor on  $M_X$ .  $Y(t_i)$  are contemporaneous values of Y. The weight  $w_i$  is determined according to 616 Equation 2.

617 
$$w_i = u_i / \sum_{j=1}^{E+1} u_j$$
(E2)

,

Where  $u_i = e^{-d\left[\underline{x}(t),\underline{x}(t_i)\right]/d\left[\underline{x}(t),\underline{x}(t_i)\right]}$ 618 whilst  $d[x(t), x(t_i)]$  represents the Euclidean distance between 619 two vectors.

620 In our previous research, interactions between the air quality in neighboring cities (Chen, 621 Z. et al., 2016), and bidirectional coupling between individual meteorological factors and 622 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations (Chen, Z. et al., 2017) were quantified effectively using the CCM 623 method. By comparing the performance of correlation analysis and CCM method, Chen, 624 Z. et al. (2017) suggested that correlation analysis may lead to a diversity of biases due 625 to complicated interactions between individual meteorological factors. Firstly, some 626 mirage correlations (two variables with a moderate correlation coefficient) extracted 627 using the correlation analysis were revealed effectively using the CCM method (the  $\rho$ 628 value between two variables was 0). Secondly, some weak coupling, which was hardly 629 detected using the correlation analysis (the correlation between the two variables were not significant), was extracted using the CCM method (a small  $\rho$  value). Meanwhile, 630 as Sugihara et al. (2012) suggested, the correlation between two variables could be 631 632 influenced significantly by other agent variables and thus the value of correlation 633 coefficient between two variables could not reflect the actual causality between them. 634 Chen et al. (2017) further revealed that the correlation coefficient between individual 635 meteorological factors and PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations was usually much larger than the  $\rho$ 636 value. This indicated that the causality of individual meteorological factors on PM2.5 concentrations was generally overestimated using the correlation analysis, due to the 637 638 influences from other meteorological factors. In this case, the CCM method is an 639 appropriate tool for quantifying bidirectional interactions between PM2.5 concentrations 640 and individual meteorological factors in complicated atmospheric environment.

#### 641 4 Results

642 Seasonal variations of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations have been proved by a large body of studies 643 (Cao et al., 2012; Shen et al., 2014; Yang and Christakos, 2015; Wang et al., 2015; Chen et al., 2015; Chen, Y. et al. 2016; Chen, Z. et al., 2016). Hence, the research period was 644 645 divided into four seasons. According to traditional season division for China, spring was 646 set as the period between March 1st, 2014 and May 31st, 2014; summer was set as the 647 period between June 1st, 2014 and August 31st, 2014; autumn was set as the period 648 between September 1st, 2014 and November 30th, 2014; and winter was set as the period 649 between December 1st, 2014 and February 28th, 2015. For each city, the bidirectional 650 coupling between individual meteorological factors and PM2.5 concentrations in different seasons was analyzed respectively using the CCM method. The CCM method is highly 651 652 automatic and only few parameters need to be set for running this algorithm: E (number 653 of dimensions for the attractor reconstruction),  $\tau$  (time lag) and b (number of nearest 654 neighbors to use for prediction). The value of E can be 2 or 3. A larger value of E 655 produces more accurate convergent maps. The variable b is decided by E (b = E + 1). A 656 small value of  $\tau$  leads to a fine-resolution convergent map, yet requires much more processing time. Through experiments, we found that the final results were not sensitive 657 to the selection of parameters and different parameters mainly exerted influences on the 658 659 presentation effects of CCM. In this research, to acquire optimal interpretation effects of convergent cross maps, the value of  $\tau$  was set as 2 days and the value of E was set 3. 660 661 For each meteorological factor, its causality coupling with PM2.5 concentrations can be 662 represented using a convergent map. Since it is not feasible to present all these 663 convergent maps here, we simply display some exemplary maps to demonstrate how 664 CCM works (Fig 1).



Fig 1. Illustrative CCM results to demonstrate the bidirectional coupling between
 meteorological factors and PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in Beijing (2014, winter)

668  $\rho$ : predictive skills. *L*: the length of time series. A xmap B stands for convergent cross mapping B 669 from A, in other words, the causality of variable B on A. For instance, PM<sub>2.5</sub> xmap meanRHU stands 670 for the causality of meanRHU on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. meanRHU xmap PM<sub>2.5</sub> stands for the

671 feedback effect of  $PM_{2.5}$  on meanRHU concentrations.  $\rho$  indicates the predictive skills of using 672 meanRHU to retrieve  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations.

673 According to Fig 1, one can see that the quantitative influence of individual 674 meteorological factors on PM2.5 was well extracted using the CCM method whilst the 675 feedback effect of PM2.5 on specific meteorological factors was revealed as well. For 676 Beijing, meanRHU and maxWIN exerted a strong influence on local PM2.5 677 concentrations in Winter ( $\rho > 0.4$ ) whilst SSD and minTEM also had a weaker 678 influence on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. ( $\rho$  close to 0.2). On the other hand, serious 679 haze weather (high PM2.5 concentrations) had an even stronger feedback influence on 680 meanRHU, maxWIN and SSD (p close to 0.6) whilst PM2.5 had little influence on 681 minTEM ( $\rho$  close to 0). The bidirectional coupling between PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations and 682 individual meteorological factors provides useful reference for a better understanding of 683 the form and development of serious haze events. For Beijing, low wind speed (high humidity and low SSD) in winter results in high PM2.5 concentrations, which in turn 684 685 causes lower wind speed (higher humidity and lower SSD). In consequence, PM<sub>2.5</sub> 686 concentrations are increased further by the changing wind (humidity and SSD) situation. 687 This mechanism causes a quickly rising PM2.5 concentrations, which brings the atmospheric environment to a comparatively stable status. In this case, the haze is 688 689 unlikely to disperse and persistent haze weather usually lasts for a long period in this 690 region. Similarly, bidirectional interactions between PM2.5 concentrations and other 691 meteorological factors can as well be quantified using the CCM method. Since the main 692 aim of this research is to understand the influence of individual meteorological factors on 693 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations across China, the feedback effect of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations on 694 specific meteorological factors is not explained in details herein.

The  $\rho$  value is a direct indicator of quantitative causality. For this research, the maximum  $\rho$  value of all sub-factors in the same category was used as the causality of this specific meteorological factor on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. E.g. for a specific city, the maximum  $\rho$  value of maxTEM, meanTEM, minTEM and difTEM is used as the influence of temperature on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. For this research, we collected 700 meteorological and  $PM_{2.5}$  data for three consecutive years. To avoid the analysis of

701 inconsecutive time series, which may influence the CCM result, we did not calculate the

702 general influence of individual meteorological factors on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations during

2014-2016 by analyzing three isolated periods (e.g. April- June, 2014, April-June, 2015,

and April- June, 2016) as a complete data set. Instead, for each city, we quantified the

ros influence of individual meteorological factors on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations for each season in

2014, 2015 and 2016 respectively and calculated the mean  $\rho$  value during 2014-2016

707 for each city.

708 Generally, it is difficult to properly demonstrate the influence of eight meteorological

709 factors on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations for all 188 cities on a comprehensive map. Therefore,

710 two cartography strategies were employed to explain the meteorological influences on

711 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations across China.

# 712 4.1 Comprehensive meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations in some

## 713 regional representative cities

When the  $\rho$  value for each meteorological factor was calculated, a wind rose, which 714 715 presents the quantitative influences of all individual meteorological factors on PM2.5 716 concentrations, can be produced for each city. It is not feasible to present all 188 wind 717 roses simultaneously, due to severe overlapping effects. Thus, considering the 718 social-economic factors, 37 regional representative cities (including all 31 provincial 719 capital cities in mainland China), which are the largest and most important cities for 720 specific regions, were selected to produce a wind rose map of meteorological influences 721 on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations across China (Fig 2).





/ 20

 $726 \qquad \mbox{Fig 2. Wind rose map of influences of eight individual meteorological factors on $PM_{2.5}$}$ 

727 concentrations across China (37 representative cities) during 2014-2016

- According to Fig 2, some spatial and temporal patterns of meteorological influences onPM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations at the national scale can be found as follows:
- 731 a. Like seasonal variations of PM2.5 concentrations, the influences of individual 732 meteorological factors on local PM2.5 concentrations vary significantly. For a specific city, 733 the dominant meteorological driver for PM2.5 concentrations in one season may become 734 insignificant in another season. E.g. in winter, one major meteorological influencing 735 factor for Beijing is wind, which exerts little influence on PM2.5 concentrations in 736 summer. Furthermore, it is noted that seasonal variations of meteorological influences on 737  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations apply to all these representative cities, as the shape and size of wind 738 rose for each city change significantly across different seasons.
- 739 b. In spite of notable differences in the shape and size of wind roses, meteorological 740 influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations cities are of some regional patterns. For instance, 741 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in cities within the North China region ( or the Northeast China 742 region) is are influenced by similar dominant meteorological factors, especially in winter, 743 when PM2.5 concentrations in these cities was high. Meanwhile, meteorological 744 influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in cities within the Yangtze River basin were also 745 highly similar in all seasons. As we can see, meteorological influences on PM2.5 746 concentrations in China are mainly controlled by geographical conditions (e.g. terrain 747 and landscape patterns).
- 748 c. For the heavily polluted North China region, the higher the local  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations, 749 the larger influence meteorological factors exerts on PM2.5 concentrations. PM2.5 750 concentrations are usually the highest in winter, causing serious haze episodes across 751 China, the North China region in particular. Meanwhile, PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in spring 752 and summer is are comparatively low. Accordingly, there are more influencing 753 meteorological factors on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations for cities within this region and the  $\rho$ 754 value of these meteorological factors is notably larger in winter. As explained, 755 bidirectional interactions between meteorological factors and PM2.5 concentrations may 756 lead to complicated mechanisms that further enhance local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations 757 significantly. Therefore, strong meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations in 758 winter are a major cause for the form and persistence of haze events within the North 759 China region.
- 760 Although some general patterns of meteorological influences on  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations  $^{27}$

across China may be concluded according to Fig 2, spatial and temporal variations of meteorological influences on  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations should be further examined in depth based on the statistics of all 188 monitoring cities. Hence, we employed another cartography strategy to demonstrate spatial and temporal variations of meteorological influences on local  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations across China.

#### 766 4.2 Spatial and temporal variations of the dominant meteorological influence on

## 767 local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations across China

Through statistical analysis, we selected the factor with the largest  $\rho$  value as the dominant meteorological factor for local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. The spatial and temporal variations of the dominant meteorological influence on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations across China are demonstrated as Fig 3. According to Fig 3, some spatio-temporal characteristics of meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations can be further concluded:

a. The dominant meteorological factor for  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations is closely related to geographical conditions. For instance, the factor of *precipitation* may exert a key influence on local  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations in some coastal cities and cities within the Yangtze River basin whilst this meteorological factor exerts limited influence on  $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations within some inland regions (e.g. the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region).

b. Some meteorological factors can be the dominant factor for cities within differentregions but some (e.g. *evaporation* and *SSD*) are mainly the dominant meteorological

factor for  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations in cities within some specific regions. In other words,

some factors can be regarded as regional and national meteorological factors for PM<sub>2.5</sub>
 concentrations, yet some meteorological factors are context-related influencing factors

for local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. For instance, such factors as *temperature*, wind and

*humidity* serve as the dominant meteorological factors in many regions, including Northeast, Northwest, coastal areas and inland areas; Meanwhile, such factors as *SSD* and *Wind direction* serve as the dominant meteorological factors mainly in some inland regions.

789 c. Similar to patterns revealed in Fig 2, the  $\rho$  value for the dominant meteorological 790 factors is much larger in winter than that in summer. Furthermore, it is noted that the

791 dominant meteorological factors demonstrate more regional similarity in winter. For

instance, the dominant meteorological factors for PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in the heavily

793 polluted North China region are more concentrated and homogeneously distributed in 794 winter (mainly the wind and humidity factor) whilst a diversity of dominant 795 meteorological factors (includes wind, temperature, wind direction and air pressure) for 796 PM2.5 concentrations is irregularly distributed within this region in summer. According to 797 this pattern, when a regional haze episode occurs in winter, the regional air quality is 798 more likely to be simultaneously improved by the same meteorological factor. This is 799 consistent with the common scene in winter that regional haze events in the 800 Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region can be considerably mitigated by strong northwesterly 801 synoptic winds, which are produced by presence of high air pressure in northwest 802 Beijing (NW-High) (Tie et al., 2015; Miao et al., 2015).- On the other hand, regional air 803 pollution in summer can hardly be solved simultaneously through one specific 804 meteorological factor.







 $809 \qquad \mbox{Fig 3. The dominant meteorological factor for local $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations in $188$}$ 



811 The size of symbols indicates the  $\rho$  value of the meteorological factor on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations.

# 812 4.3 Comparative statistics of the influence of individual meteorological factors on

## 813 local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations across China

814 In addition to meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations for individual cities,

815 we examined and compared the comprehensive influence of individual meteorological

816 factors on  $PM_{2.5}$  concentrations at a national scale. The results are presented as Table

817 1 and Fig 4.

# 818 Table 1. The comparison of the influence of individual meteorological factors on

819 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in 188 cities across China (2014-2016)

	· · · · · ·								
Season	Factor	TEM	SSD	PRE	EVP	PRS	RHU	WIN	Dir_WIN
	No. of cities <sup>1</sup>	76	1	13	3	13	17	64	1
a •	$_{\rm Mean} \ \rho_{\rm value}$	0.254	0.102	0.143	0.108	0.177	0.161	0.222	0.094
Spring	SD of $\rho_{value}$	0.106	0.071	0.088	0.081	0.123	0.105	0.102	0.077
	$_{\rm Max} \rho_{\rm value}$	0.572	0.366	0.385	0.397	0.653	0.475	0.595	0.429
	No. of cities	78	5	22	1	20	32	27	3
<b>C</b>	$_{\rm Mean} \ \rho_{\rm value}$	0.272	0.136	0.183	0.137	0.163	0.219	0.191	0.087
Summer	SD of $\rho$ value	0.098	0.086	0.099	0.088	0.109	0.118	0.095	0.062
	$_{\rm Max} \rho_{\rm value}$	0.604	0.433	0.536	0.399	0.518	0.562	0.453	0.311
	No. of cities	70	1	13	15	13	27	48	1
	$_{\rm Mean} \ \rho_{\rm value}$	0.316	0.164	0.191	0.181	0.199	0.247	0.265	0.104
Autumn	SD of $\rho_{value}$	0.109	0.098	0.093	0.117	0.091	0.125	0.089	0.074
	$_{\rm Max} \rho_{\rm value}$	0.702	0.479	0.430	0.514	0.524	0.662	0.488	0.331
	No. of cities	56	3	27	5	4	48	44	1
XX7° 4	Mean $\rho$ value	0.306	0.183	0.166	0.190	0.180	0.304	0.299	0.119
Winter	SD of $\rho$ value	0.094	0.129	0.115	0.130	0.086	0.161	0.136	0.092
	$_{\rm Max} \rho_{\rm value}$	0.527	0.615	0.473	0.595	0.427	0.755	0.623	0.560

820 No. of cities: the number of cities with this factor as the dominant meteorological factor (its  $\rho$  value

821 is the largest amongst eight factors) on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations.



822



825 No. of cities: the number of cities with this factor as the dominant meteorological factor (its

826  $\rho$  value is the largest amongst eight factors) on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. The shape of the 827 violin bars indicated the frequency distribution of  $\rho$  value for 188 cities.

828 We compared the influence of individual meteorological factors on  $PM_{2.5}$ 829 concentrations from different perspectives.

830 a. From a national perspective, temperature, humidity, and wind exert stronger 831 influences on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations than other factors. The annual mean  $\rho$  value 832 for temperature, wind and humidity was 0.287, 0.244 and 0.233, compared with wind 833 direction (0.101), SSD (0.146), evaporation (0.155), precipitation (0.171) and air 834 pressure (0.180). Amongst the eight factors, temperature was proved to be the most influential meteorological factor for general PM2.5 concentrations in China. In 835 addition to the largest mean  $\rho$  value, *temperature* was the dominant meteorological 836 837 factors for most cities in all seasons. Furthermore, the Coefficient of Variation (SD 838 /mean×100%) for temperature was much smaller than other factors, indicating the 839 consistent influence of temperature on local PM2.5 concentrations across China.

840 b. Although some meteorological factors exert a limited influence on  $PM_{2.5}$ 

- 841 concentrations at a national scale, these factors may be a key meteorological factor for
- 842 local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. As shown in Table 1, the max  $\rho$  value for each

meteorological factor was large than 0.35 for all seasons (except for the *wind direction* factor in summer and autumn), indicating a very strong influence on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in some specific regions. As a result, when analyzing meteorological influences on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations for a specific city, the influence of meteorological factors that have little influence on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations at a large scale should <u>also</u> be comprehensively considered arefully examined at the

849 local scale.

- 850 c. Some factors (e.g. *precipitation* in summer and winter) may be the dominant 851 meteorological factors for a large number of cities, though the mean  $\rho$  value 852 remained small. This may be attributed to the fact that these meteorological factors 853 mainly exert influence on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in those cities (seasons) where
- 854 (when) the general PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations is not high. <u>Taking the *precipitation* as an</u>
- 855 example. Luo et al. (2017). pointed out that there may be thresholds for the negative
- **856** <u>influences of precipitations on PM2.5 concentrations and Guo et al. (2016) found that</u>
- 857 the same amount of precipitation led to a weaker washing-off effect in areas with
- 858 higher PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. Hence, *precipitation* mainly exerts a dominant influence
- 859 on local PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in winter for Yangtze River Basin or coastal cities,
- **860** where the amount of precipitation is large and the  $PM_{2.5}$  concentration is low, whilst
- 861 precipitation exerts a limited role in northern China, where the amount of
- 862 precipitation is small and the PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration is high. In this case Therefore, as
- explained above, comprehensive meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations
  are limited considerably.

## 865 5 Discussion

866 Despite the lack of a comprehensive comparison of meteorological influences on 867 PM25 concentrations in different regions over China, some studies concerning 868 meteorology-PM2.5 relationship in specific areas have been conducted and 869 correlations between individual meteorological factors and PM2.5 concentrations have been analyzed in such mega cities as Nanjing ( Chen, T. et al., 2016; Shen and 870 871 Li., 2016;), Beijing (Huang et al., 2015; Yin et al., 2016), Wuhan ( Zhang et al., 872 2017), Hangzhou (Jian et al., 2012), Chengdu (Zeng and Zhang, et al. 2017) and 873 Hong Kong (Fung et al., 2014). These studies mainly employed correlation 874 analysis to quantify the influence of several meteorological factors on PM2.5 带格式的: 字体: 倾斜

#### 带格式的: 字体: 倾斜

875 concentrations and revealed suggested that meteorological influences on PM2.5 876 concentrations varied significantly across regions. The dominant meteorological 877 factors for P2.5 concentrations (presented as the largest correlation coefficients in 878 previous studies and the  $\rho$  value in this research ) demonstrated notable regional 879 differences-in different cities. For Nanjing (Chen, T. et al., 2016), a mega city in the 880 Yangtze River, and Hong Kong (Fung et al.), a mega coastal city, precipitation 881 exerted the strongest influence whilst wind speed exerted a weak influences on 882 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in winter. On the other hand, for winter, wind speed was the 883 dominant meteorological factor for PM2.5 concentrations in Beijing (Huang et al., 884 2015.), a mega city in North China, and precipitation played a weak role in 885 affecting local PM2.5 concentrations . These studies generally analyzed and compared 886 the influences of different meteorological factors on PM2.5 concentrations and 887 extracted the dominant meteorological influencing factors for specific areas. However, 888 most studies were conducted at the local scale and few studies have focused on the 889 comparison and statistics of meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations in 890 different areas. Meanwhile, although the correlation coefficient can be used to 891 understand and compare the general magnitude of the influence of individual 892 meteorological factors, the correlation analysis, as explained above, may lead to large 893 bias in quantifying the meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations. 894 895 Different from previous studies conducted at the local scale, this research conducted 896 at the national scale better understood spatial and temporal patterns of meteorological 897 influences on PM2.5 concentrations that will not be revealed in small-scale studies. 898 The finding from this research was consistent with and a major extension of that from 899 previous studies by quantifying the influence of individual meteorological factors in a 900 large number of cities across China, instead of several scattered cities, using a more 901 robust causality analysis method, other than the correlation analysis. Similar to 902 previous studies, this study also revealed notable differences in meteorological 903 influences on PM2.5 concentrations at the national scale, the major reason for which was different meteorological conditions and complicated mechanisms of 904 905 PM2.5-meteorology interactions. Firstly, notable differences existed in meteorological 906 conditions across China. For instance, in winter, the frequency and intensity of 907 precipitation are much higher and stronger in coastal areas than those in the North

908 China region, where the frequency of strong winds is high in winter. Therefore, 909 precipitation exerts a large influence on PM2.5 concentrations in coastal regions whilst 910 wind is the key influencing factor for PM2.5 concentrations in the North China region 911 in winter. Secondly, in addition to the large variations in the values of correlation 912 coefficients, the interaction mechanisms between individual meteorological factors 913 and PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations may also vary significantly across regions. For such meteorological influences as wind speed, its negative effect on PM2.5 concentrations 914 was consistent in China (He e al., 2017). On the other hand, He et al. (2017) 915 916 suggested that temperature and humidity were either positively or negatively 917 correlated with PM2.5 concentrations in different regions of China. In terms of 918 humidity, when the humidity is low, PM2.5 concentration increases with the increase of 919 humidity due to hygroscopic increase and accumulation of PM2.5 (Fu et al., 2016). 920 When the humidity continues to grow, the particles grow too heavy to stay in the air, 921 leading to dry (particles drop to the ground) (Wang, J., & Ogawa, S. (2015)) and wet 922 deposition (precipitation) (Li et al., 2015b), and the reduction of PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations. 923 Similarly, there may be thresholds for the negative influences of precipitations on 924 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations (Luo et al., 2017). Heavy precipitation can have a strong 925 washing-off effects on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations and notably reduce PM2.5 concentrations. 926 Meanwhile, slight precipitation may not effectively remove the high-concentration 927 PM2.5. Instead, the slight precipitation may induce enhanced relative humidity and 928 thus lead to the increase of PM2.5 concentrations. Meanwhile, the washing-off effect 929 from the same amount of precipitation on PM2.5 concentrations in Xi'an, a city with 930 higher PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations, was lower than that in Guangzhou (Guo et al., 2016), 931 indicating local PM2.5 concentrations also exerted a key role in the negative effects of 932 precipitation. Meanwhile, temperature can either be negatively correlated with PM2.5 933 concentrations by accelerating the flow circulation and promoting the dispersion of 934 PM<sub>2.5</sub> (Li et al., 2015b), or positively correlated with PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations through 935 inversion events (Jian et al., 2012). Given the complexity of interactions between 936 meteorological factors and PM2.5, characteristics and variations of influences of 937 individual meteorological factors on PM2.5 concentrations should be further 938 investigated for specific regions across China respectively based on long-term 939 observation data.
- 941 With rapidly growing haze events, meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations
- 942 have become a hot social-economic topic not only studied by scholars, but also
- 943 considered by government officials and decision makers. On December 1st, 2016,
- 944 Beijing published the latest regulations for the prevention and control of

945 meteorological hazards

946 (http://www.bjrd.gov.cn/zt/cwhzt1431/hywj/201612/t20161201\_168233.html) and

947 included haze events as one type of meteorological hazards, sparking widespread 948 controversy. Although the meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations are well 949 acknowledged, quantifying meteorological contribution, compared with exhaust 950 emission, to airborne pollution remains challenging. Hence, criticisms have been 951 raised that since traffic and industry induced exhaust emission is the main cause for 952 airborne pollution, the emphasis on the meteorological causes for haze hazards is to 953 avoid governmental responsibilities. Our previous research may provide reference for 954 a better understanding of this issue from different perspectives. Chen, Z. et al. (2016) 955 pointed out that more than 180 days in Beijing experienced notable and sudden air 956 quality change (the Air quality Index, AQI, difference between one day and its 957 previous day is larger than 50) in 2014. Considering that the industrial, automobile 958 and household exhaust emission, which are main sources for PM2.5 and other airborne 959 pollutants, is unlikely to change dramatically in one day, meteorological factors seem 960 to exert an important influence on local PM2.5 concentrations. Chen, Z. et al. (2017) 961 proved that such meteorological factors as SSD, wind and humidity exerted strong 962 influences on winter PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei Region. 963 Furthermore, Chen, Z. et al. (2017) quantified the interactions between different 964 meteorological factors and suggested that one meteorological factor may influence 965 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations through both direct and indirect means. Take winter PM<sub>2.5</sub> 966 concentrations in Beijing for instance. The wind factor has a strong negative influence 967 on PM2.5 concentrations. In addition, the wind factor decreases humidity, as well as 968 increases SSD and evaporation. Since the factor humidity (SSD and evaporation) has 969 a strong positive (negative) influence6 on local PM2.5 concentrations, increasing wind 970 speeds can reduce PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations indirectly through reduced (increased) 971 humidity (SSD and evaporation). In this research, we further revealed that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Although the CCM method did not give a positive(negative) direction of interactions between two variables, the direction of interactions can be easily understood according to the correlation coefficient <u>(Chen et al., 2017)</u>.--

972 meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations varied significantly across China. 973 In the most polluted winter, the dominant meteorological factors for PM2.5 974 concentrations in the North China region are mainly the wind and humidity factor 975 whilst the dominant meteorological factor on PM2.5 concentrations in coastal cities are 976 mainly precipitation and temperature. Furthermore, this research proved that the 977 meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations were the strongest in winter, when 978 the PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations was the highest. With strong bidirectional coupling between 979 individual meteorological factors and PM2.5 concentrations in winter, PM2.5 980 concentrations can be further enhanced through complicated atmospheric mechanisms, 981 leading to more haze events. Based on these studies, we are not attempting to 982 challenge the fundamental contribution of human-induced exhaust emission to PM2.5 983 concentrations. Instead, our research suggested that with a stable amount of exhaust 984 emission, meteorology was a key factor for the persistence and deterioration of haze 985 events, especially in winter. On one hand, the pollutant emission should be strictly 986 restricted, as human-induced emission is the major cause of haze pollution. 987 Meanwhile, since meteorological factors play an important role in the accumulation 988 and dispersion of PM2.5, meteorological influences should be comprehensively 989 considered for a better understanding and management of haze episodes.

990 In spite of a diversity of prediction models, air quality forecast, especially PM<sub>2.5</sub> 991 forecasting in China, remains challenging. Due to highly complicated atmospheric 992 environment and the difficulty in acquiring true data of exhaust emission, commonly 993 used models (e.g. CAMx, CMAQ and WRFCHEM) may lead to large biases and 994 uncertainty when applied to China. On the other hand, without prior knowledge of 995 mechanisms of haze formation and information of exhaust emission, statistical models 996 can achieve satisfactory forecasting results based on massive historical data (Cheng et 997 al., 2015). Compared with the static models, dynamic statistical models 998 comprehensively additionally consider the meteorological influences on PM2.5 999 concentrations and some meteorological factors that are of stable, representative and 1000 strong correlations with PM2.5 are selected for forecasting PM2.5 concentrations. 1001 Meanwhile, many recent studies (Cheng et al., 2017; Guo et al., 2017; Lu et al., 2017; 1002 Ni et al. 2017; etc) have recognized the meteorological influences on the evolution of 1003 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations and included some key meteorological factors in their models 1004 for PM2.5 estimation. However, most PM2.5 estimation and forecasting models mainly 38

1005 employed correlation analysis to reveal the influence of individual meteorological 1006 factors on PM2.5 concentrations. Due to complicated interactions in atmospheric 1007 environment, the correlation coefficient between meteorological factors and PM2.5 concentrations is usually much larger than the  $\rho$  value and overestimates the 1008 1009 influence of individual meteorological factors on PM2.5 concentrations. In this case, 1010 this research provides useful reference for improving existing statistical models. By incorporating the  $\rho$  value, instead of the correlation coefficient, of different factors 1011 1012 into corresponding GAM (Generalized Additive Models) and adjusting parameters 1013 accordingly, we may significantly improve the reliability of future estimation and 1014 forecasting of PM2.5 concentrations.

1015 With the understanding of strong meteorological influences on PM2.5 concentrations 1016 across China, especially in some heavily polluted regions, decision makers are placing 1017 special emphasis on improving local and regional air quality through meteorological 1018 means. Targeting this, quantified causality of individual meteorological factors on 1019 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations provides useful decision support for evaluating relevant 1020 environmental projects. Specifically, a forthcoming Beijing wind-corridor project 1021 (http://www.bj.xinhuanet.com/bjyw/yqphb/2016-05/16/c\_1118870801.htm) has 1022 become a hot social and scientific issue, yet its potential effects arouse wide 1023 controversies. Some scholars

1024 (http://china.cnr.cn/yxw/201411/t20141123\_516839830.shtml

1025 http://health.people.com.cn/n1/2016/0413/c398004-28271979.html) pointed out that 1026 the wind-corridor project could only exerted limited influence on the reduction of 1027 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations and major efforts should be made on emission-reduction. 1028 Herein, our research suggests that wind is a dominant meteorological factor for winter 1029 PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in Beijing and can significantly influence PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations 1030 through direct and indirect mechanisms. In consequence, the wind-corridor project 1031 may directly allow in more strong wind, which thus leads to a larger value of SSD and 1032 EVP and a smaller value of RHU. The change of SSD, RHU and EVP values can 1033 further induce the reduction of PM2.5 concentrations. From this perspective, the 1034 Beijing wind-corridor project has good potential to improve local and regional air 1035 quality. In addition to the wind-corridor project, some scholars and decision makers 1036 have proposed other meteorological means for reducing PM2.5 concentrations. For 1037 instance, Yu (2014) suggested that water spraving from high buildings and water 1038 towers in urban areas was an efficient way to reduce PM2.5 concentrations rapidly by 1039 simulating the process of precipitation. However, some limitations, such as the 1040 humidity control and potential icing risk, remained. In the near future, with growing 1041 attention on the improvement of air quality, more environmental projects should be 1042 properly designed and implemented. According to this research, meteorological 1043 influences on PM2.5 concentrations vary notably across China. Given the diversity of 1044 dominant meteorological factors on local PM2.5 concentrations in different regions 1045 and seasons, which has been proved by previous studies and this research, it is more 1046 efficient to design meteorological means accordingly. For the heavily polluted North 1047 China region, especially the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region, the northwesterly synoptic 1048 wind (Tie et al., 2015; Miao et al., 2015) is much stronger in winter than winds in 1049 summer and exerts a dominant influence on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations (Chen et al., 2017). 1050 Furthermore, in North China, PM2.5 concentration is much more sensitive to the 1051 change of wind speed than that of other meteorological factors (Gao et al., 2016). 1052 Meanwhile, wind-speed induced climate change led to the change of PM2.5 1053 concentrations by as much as 12.0 µgm<sup>-3</sup>, compared with the change of PM<sub>2.5</sub> 1054 concentrations by up to 4.0 µgm<sup>-3</sup> in south-eastern, northwestern and south-western 1055 China (Tai et al., 2010). Considering the strong winds in winter, the dominant 1056 influence of wind speed on PM2.5 concentrations and the sensitivity of PM2.5 1057 feedbacks to the change of wind speed, meteorological means for encouraging strong 1058 winds are more likely to reduce PM2.5 concentrations considerably in North China. 1059 Similarly, Luo et al. (2017) suggested that only precipitation with a certain magnitude 1060 can lead to the washing-off effect of PM2.5 concentrations whilst Guo et al. (2016) 1061 revealed that the variation of PM2.5 concentrations was more sensitive to the same 1062 amount of precipitation in areas with lower PM2.5 concentrations. Therefore, 1063 meteorological means for inducing precipitation are more likely to improve air quality 1064 in coastal cities and cities within the Yangtze River basin, where there is a large 1065 amount of precipitation and relatively low PM2.5 concentrations --1066 **6** Conclusions

1067 <u>Previous studies examined the correlation between individual meteorological</u>
 1068 influences and PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations in some specific cities and the comparison

带格式的: 上标

1069 between these studies indicated that meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> 1070 concentrations varied significantly across cities and seasons. However, these scattered 1071 studies conducted at the local scale cannot reveal regional patterns of meteorological 1072 influences on PM2.5 concentrations. Furthermore, previous studies generally selected 1073 different research periods and meteorological factors, making the comparison of 1074 findings from different studies less robust. Thirdly, these studies employed the 1075 correlation analysis, which may be biased significantly due to the complicated 1076 interactions between individual meteorological factors. This research is a major 1077 extension of previous studies. Based on on thea robust causality analysis method 1078 CCM CCM method, we quantified and compared the influence of eight 1079 meteorological factors on local PM2.5 concentrations for 188 monitoring cities across 1080 China using PM<sub>2.5</sub> and meteorological observation data from 2014.3 to 2017.2. 1081 Similar to previous studies conducted at the local scale, The results this research 1082 further proved that suggest that meteorological influences on PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentrations 1083 wereare of notable seasonal and spatial variations at the national scale. Furthermore, 1084 this research revealed some regional patterns and comprehensive statistics of the 1085 influence of individual meteorological factors on PM2.5 concentrations, which cannot 1086 be understood through small-scale case studies. For the heavily polluted North China 1087 region, the higher PM2.5 concentrations, the stronger influence meteorological factors 1088 exert on local PM2.5 concentrations. The dominant meteorological factor for PM2.5 1089 concentrations is closely related to geographical conditions. For heavily polluted 1090 winter, precipitation exerts a key influence on local PM2.5 concentrations in most 1091 coastal areas and the Yangtze River basin, whilst the dominant meteorological driver 1092 for PM2.5 concentrations is wind in the North China regions. At the national scale, the 1093 influence of temperature, humidity and wind on local PM2.5 concentrations is much 1094 larger than that of other factors, and *temperature* exerts the strongest and most stable 1095 influences on national PM2.5 concentrations in all seasons. The influence of individual 1096 meteorological factors on PM2.5 concentrations extracted in this research provides 1097 more reliable reference for better modelling and forecasting local and regional PM2.5 1098 concentrations. Given the significant variations of meteorological influences on PM2.5 1099 concentrations across China, environmental projects aiming for improving local air 1100 quality should be designed and implemented accordingly.

## 1101 Acknowledgement

This research is supported by National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant
Nos. 210100066), the National Key Research and Development Program of China
(NO.2016YFA0600104), the Fundamental Research Funds for the Central
Universities, Ministry of Environmental Protection (201409005) and Beijing Training
Support Project for excellent scholars (2015000020124G059).

## References

- Blanchard, C., Hidy, G., Tanenbaum, S., 2010. NMOC, ozone, and organic aerosol in the southeastern United States, 1999-2007: 2. Ozone trends and sensitivity to NMOC emissions in Atlanta, Georgia. Atmospheric Environment. 44 (38), 4840-4849.
- Cao, C., Jiang, W., Wang,B., Fang, J., Lang, J., Tian, G., Jiang, J., Zhu, T. 2014.Inhalable Microorganisms in Beijing's PM2.5 and PM10 Pollutants during a Severe Smog Event. Environmental Science and Technology. 48, 1499–1507.
- Cao, J., Shen, Z., Chow, J., Watson, J. G., Leed, S., Tie, X., Ho, K., Wang, G., Han, Y., 2012, Winter and Summer PM<sub>2.5</sub> Chemical Compositions in Fourteen Chinese Cities. Journal of the Air & Waste Management Association. 62(10), 1214-1226.
- 3.4. Chen, T., He, J., Lu, X., She, J., & Guan, Z. 2016. Spatial and temporal variations of PM2. 5 and its relation to meteorological factors in the urban area of Nanjing, China. International journal of environmental research and public health, 13(9), 921.
- 4-5. Chen, W., Zhang, H.T., Zhao, H. M. 2015. Diurnal, weekly and monthly spatial variations of air pollutants and air quality of Beijing. Atmospheric Environment. 119. 21-34.
- 5-6. Chen, Y., Schleicher, N., Fricker, M., Cen, K., Liu, X.L., Kaminski, U., Yu, Y., Wu, X.F., Norra, S. 2016. Long-term variation of black carbon and PM<sub>2.5</sub> in Beijing, China with respect to meteorological conditions and governmental measures. Environmental Pollution. 212, 269-278.
- 6-7. Chen, Z.Y., Cai, J., Gao, B.B., Xu, B., Dai, S., He, B., Xie, X.M., 2017. Detecting the causality influence of individual meteorological factors on local PM2.5 concentrations in the Jing-Jin-Ji region. Scientific Reports, 7.

- 7.8. Chen, Z.Y., Xu, B., Cai, J., Gao, B.B. 2016. Understanding temporal patterns and characteristics of air quality in Beijing: A local and regional perspective. Atmospheric Environment. 127, 303-315.
- 8.9. Cheng, N.L., Li, J.J., Li, Y.T., Sun, F. 2015 Development of PM2.5 dynamic partitioning statistical prediction model based on Matlab in Beijing (in Chinese). Chinese Journal of Environmental Engineering. 9(10), 4965-4970.
- 9-10. Cheng, Z., Li, L., & Liu, J. (2017). Identifying the spatial effects and driving factors of urban pm 2.5, pollution in china. Ecological Indicators,82, 61-75.
- 10.11. El-Metwally, M., Alfaro, S.C. 2013. Correlation between meteorological conditions and aerosol characteristics at an East-Mediterranean coastal site. Atmospheric Research. 132–133, 76–90.
- 12. Fu, X., Wang, X., Hu, Q., Li, G., Xiang, D., Zhang, Y., et al. (2016). Changes in visibility with pm2.5 composition and relative humidity at a background site in the pearl river delta region. Journal of Environmental Sciences, 40(2), 10-19.
- H.1.13. Fung, W. Y., & Wu, R. (2014). Relationship between intraseasonal variations of air pollution and meteorological variables in Hong Kong. Annals of GIS, 20(3), 217-226.
- 14. Galindo, N., Varea, M., Moltó, J.G., Yubero, E. Nicolás, J. 2011. The Influence of Meteorology on Particulate Matter Concentrations at an Urban Mediterranean Location. Water Air Soil Pollution.215, 365–372.
- 12.15. Gao, M., Carmichael, G. R., Saide, P. E., Lu, Z., Yu, M., Streets, D. G., Wang, Z. 2016. Response of winter fine particulate matter concentrations to emission and meteorology changes in North China. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics, 16(18), 11837.
- 13.16. Garrett, P., Casimiro, E., 2011. Short-term effect of fine particulate matter (PM2.5) and ozone on daily mortality in Lisbon, Portugal. Environmental Science and Pollution Research. 18(9), 1585-1592.
- <u>14.17.</u> Granger, C. W. J. 1980. Testing for causality: A personal viewpoint. Journal of Economic Dynamics and Control. 2, 329-352.
- 15.18. Grundstrom, M., Hak, C., Chen, D., Hallquist, M., Pleije, H. 2015. Variation and co-variation of PM<sub>10</sub>, particle number concentrations, NOx and NO<sub>2</sub> in the urban air- Relationships with wind speed, vertical temperature gradient and weather type. Atmospheric Environment. 120, 317-327.

19. Gu, J., Du, S., Han, D., Hou, L., Yi, J., Xu, J., Liu, G., Han, B., Yang, G., Bai, Z., 2014. Major chemical compositions, possible sources, and mass closure analysis of PM<sub>2.5</sub> in Jinan, China. Air Quality, Atmosphere & Health. 7(3), 251-262.

## 20.

16. Guo, L. C., Zhang, Y., Lin, H., Zeng, W., Liu, T., Xiao, J., et al. 2016. The washout effects of rainfall on atmospheric particulate pollution in two chinese cities . Environmental Pollution, 215, 195-202.

## <u>21.</u>

- 17.–Guo, Y., Tang, Q., Gong, D. Y., & Zhang, Z. (2017). Estimating ground-level\* pm 2.5, concentrations in beijing using a satellite-based geographically and temporally weighted regression model. Remote Sensing of Environment, 198, 140-149.
- 18.22. Guo,S., Hu, M., Guo, Q., Zhang, X., Zheng, M., Zheng, J., Chang, C., Schauer, J.J., Zhang, R. Y. 2012. Primary Sources and Secondary Formation of Organic Aerosols in Beijing, China. Environmental Sciences & Technology, 46, 9846–9853.
- 19.23. He, J., Gong, S., Ye, Y., Yu, L., Lin, W., Mao, H., et al. (2017). Air pollution characteristics and their relation to meteorological conditions during 2014 – 2015 in major chinese cities. Environmental Pollution, 223, 484-496.
- 24. Hu, J. Qi, Y., Wang, Y., Zhang, H. 2015. Characterizing multi-pollutant air pollution in China: Comparison of three air quality indices. Environment International, 2015, 84:17-25.
- 20:25. Huang, F., Li, X., Wang, C., Xu, Q., Wang, W., Luo, Y., Cao, K. 2015. PM2. 5 Spatiotemporal Variations and the Relationship with Meteorological Factors during 2013-2014 in Beijing, China. PloS one, 10(11), e0141642.
- 26. Jacobson, M. Z. 2001. Global direct radiative forcing due to multicomponent anthropogenic and natural aerosols. Journal of Geophysical Research Atmospheres, 106(D2), 1551-1568.
- 27. Jian, L., Zhao, Y., Zhu, Y. P., Zhang, M. B., Bertolatti, D. (2012). An application of arima model to predict submicron particle concentrations from meteorological factors at a busy roadside in hangzhou, china. Science of the Total Environment, 426(2), 336-345.
   21.-

带格式的:无项目符号或编号

**带格式的:** 缩进: 左侧: 0.74 厘米, 无项目符号或编号

带格式的: 缩进: 左侧: 0.74 厘米, 无项目符号或编号

- 22.28. Juneng, L., Latif, M.T., Tangang, F. 2011. Factors influencing the variations of PM<sub>10</sub> aerosol dust in Klang Valley, Malaysia during the summer. Atmospheric Environment. 45, 4370-4378.
- 23.29. Kong, L.B., Xin, J.Y., Zhang, W.Y., Wang, Y.S. 2016. The empirical correlations between PM<sub>2.5</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub> and AOD in the Beijing metropolitan region and the PM<sub>2.5</sub>, PM<sub>10</sub> distributions retrieved by MODIS. Environmental Pollution. 216, 350-360.
- 24.30. Lanzinger, S., Schneider, A., Breitner, S., Stafoggia, M., Erzen, I., Dostal, M. et al. 2015. Associations between ultrafine and fine particles and mortality in five central European cities Results from the UFIREG study. Environment International. 88(2): 44-52.
- 31. Li, Y., Ma, Z., Zheng, C., Shang, Y., 2015<u>a</u>. Ambient temperature enhanced acute cardiovascular-respiratory mortality effects of PM2.5 in Beijing, China International Journal of Biometeorology. 10.1007/s00484-015-0984-z
- 25.32. Li, Y., Chen, Q., Zhao, H., Wang, L., Tao, R. 2015b. Variations in pm10, pm2.5 and pm1.0 in an urban area of the sichuan basin and their relation to meteorological factors. Atmosphere, 6(1), 150-163.
- 26.33. Liu, Q.Y., Baumgartner, J., Zhang, Y., Liu, Y., Sun, Y., Zhang, M. 2014. Oxidative Potential and Inflammatory Impacts of Source Apportioned Ambient Air Pollution in Beijing. Environmental Sciences & Technology. 48, 12920–12929.
- 27.34. Lu, D., Xu, J., Yang, D., & Zhao, J. (2017). Spatio-temporal variation and influence factors of pm 2.5 concentrations in china from 1998 to 2014. Atmospheric Pollution Research.
- <u>35.</u> Luo, C., Zheng, X., Zeng, D. 2014. Causal Inference in Social Media Using Convergent Cross Mapping. IEEE. Intelligence and Security Informatics Conference. 260-263.
- 28.36. Luo, X. S., Zhao, Z., Chen, Y., Ge, X. L. Huang, Y., Suo, C. Zhang, D. 2017. Effects of emission control and meteorological parameters on urban air quality showed by the 2014 youth olympic games in china. Fresenius Environmental Bulletin, 26(7), 4798-4807.
- 37. Ma, Z., Hu, X., Huang, L., Bi, J., Liu, Y., 2014. Estimating Ground-Level PM<sub>2.5</sub> in China Using Satellite Remote Sensing. Environmental Science & Technology. 45

48 (13), 7436-7444.

- 29.38. Miao, Y., X.-M. Hu, S. Liu, T. Qian, M. Xue, Y. Zheng, Wang, S.2015, Seasonal variation of local atmospheric circulations and boundary layer structure in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region and implications for air quality, J. Adv. Model. Earth Syst., 7, 1602–1626,
- 30.39. Ni, X. Y., Huang, H., & Du, W. P. (2017). Relevance analysis and short-term prediction of pm2.5 concentrations in beijing based on multi-source data. Atmospheric Environment, 150, 146-161.
- 31.40. Pasca, M., Falq, G., Wagner, V., Chatignoux, E., Corso, M., Blanchard, M., Host, S., Pascala, L., Larrieua,S., 2014. Short-term impacts of particulate matter (PM<sub>10</sub>, PM<sub>10-2.5</sub>, PM<sub>2.5</sub>) on mortality in nine French cities. Atmospheric Environment. 95, 175–184.
- 32.41. Pearce, J.L., Beringer, J., Nicholls, N., Hyndman, R.J., Tapper, N.J., 2011. Quantifying the influence of local meteorology on air quality using generalized additive models. Atmospheric Environment. 45, 1328-1336.
- 33.42. Qiao, L.P., Cai, J., Wang, H.L., Wang, W.L., Zhou, M., Lou, S.R., Chen, R.J., Dai, H.X., Chen, C.H., Kan, H.D. 2014. PM<sub>2.5</sub> Constituents and Hospital Emergency-Room Visits in Shanghai, China. Environmental Science and Technology. 48 (17), 10406–10414.
- 43. Shen, G., Yuan, S., Xie, Y., Xia, S., Li, L., Yao, Y., Qiao, Y., Zhang, J., Zhao, Q., Ding, A., Li,B., Wu, H. 2014. Ambient levels and temporal variations of PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> at a residential site in the mega-city, Nanjing, in the western Yangtze River Delta, China. Journal of Environmental Science and Health, Part A: Toxic/Hazardous Substances and Environmental Engineering. 49(2), 171-178.
- 34.44. Shen, C. H., Li, C. L. 2016. An analysis of the intrinsic cross-correlations between API and meteorological elements using DPCCA. Physica A: Statistical Mechanics and its Applications, 446, 100-109.
- 35.45. Sugihara, G., May, R. 1990. Nonlinear forecasting as a way of disting uishing chaos from measurement error in time series. Nature, 344(6268), 7 34–741.
- <u>46.</u> Sugihara, G., May, R., Ye, H., Hsieh, C., Deyle, E., Fogarty, M., Munch, S. 2012. Detecting Causality in Complex Ecosystems. Science, 338, 496-500.
- 47. Tai, A. P., Mickley, L. J., Jacob, D. J. 2010. Correlations between fine particulate 46

带格式的: 下标

matter (PM<sub>4.2.5</sub>) and meteorological variables in the United States: Implications for the sensitivity of PM 2.5 to climate change. Atmospheric Environment, 44(32), 3976-3984.

- 36.48. Tie, X., Zhang, Q., He, H., Cao, J., Han, S., Gao, Y., et al. 2015. A budget analysis of the formation of haze in beijing. Atmospheric Environment, 100, 25-36.
- 37.49. Wang, G., Cheng, S., Li, J., Lang, J., Wen, W., Yang, X., Tian, L. 2015. Source apportionment and seasonal variation of PM<sub>2.5</sub> carbonaceous aerosol in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei Region of China. Environmental Monitoring and Assessment. 10.1007/s10661-015-4288-x.
- 38.50. Wang, G., Cheng, S., Li, J., Lang, J., Wen, W., Yang, X., Tian, L. 2015. Source apportionment and seasonal variation of PM<sub>2.5</sub> carbonaceous aerosol in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei Region of China. Environmental Monitoring and Assessment. 10.1007/s10661-015-4288-x.
- 39.51. Wei, S., Huang, B., Liu, M., Bi, X., Ren, Z.F., Sheng, G., Fu, J. 2012. Characterization of PM<sub>2.5</sub>-bound nitrated and oxygenated PAHs in two industrial sites of South China. Atmospheric Research. 109-110, 76-83.
- 40.52. Yadav, R., Beig, G, Jaaffrey, S.N.A. 2014. The linkages of anthropogenic emissions and meteorology in the rapid increase of particulate matter at a foothill city in the Arawali range of India. Atmospheric Environment. 85, 147-151.
- 53. Yang, Y., Christakos, G. 2015. Spatiotemporal Characterization of Ambient PM2.5 Concentrations in Shandong Province (China). Environmental Sciences & Technology. 49 (22), 13431–13438.
- 41.54. Yin, Q., Wang, J., Hu, M., Wong, H. 2016. Estimation of daily PM 2.5 concentration and its relationship with meteorological conditions in Beijing. Journal of Environmental Sciences, 48, 161-168.
- 55. Yu, S.C. 2014. Water spray geoengineering to clean air pollution for mitigating haze in China's cities. Environmental Chemistry Letters. 12(1), 109–116.
- 56. Zeng, S., & Zhang, Y. (2017). The Effect of Meteorological Elements on Continuing Heavy Air Pollution: A Case Study in the Chengdu Area during the 2014 Spring Festival. Atmosphere, 8(4), 71.
- 42.57. Zhang, B., Jiao, L., Xu, G., Zhao, S., Tang, X., Zhou, Y., Gong, C. 2017. Influences of wind and precipitation on different-sized particulate matter 47

concentrations (PM2. 5, PM10, PM2. 5–10). Meteorology and Atmospheric Physics, 1-10.

- 43.<u>58.</u> Zhang, F., Wang, Z., Cheng, H., Lv, X., Gong, W., Wang, X., Zhang, G., 2015, Seasonal variations and chemical characteristics of PM<sub>2.5</sub> in Wuhan, central China. Science of The Total Environment. 518, 97–105.
- 44.<u>59.</u> Zhang, H. F., Wang, Z. H., Zhang, W. Z. 2016. Exploring spatiotemporal patterns of PM<sub>2.5</sub> in China based on ground-level observations for 190 cities. Environmental Pollution. 89-90, 212-221.
- 45.60. Zhang, H., Wang, Y., Hu, J., Ying, Q., Hu, X. 2015b. Relationships between meteorological parameters and criteria air pollutants in three megacities in China. Environmental Research, 140, 242-254.
- 46.61. Zhang, R., Jing, J., Tao, J., Hsu, S., C., Wang, G., Cao, J., et al., 2013. Chemical characterization and source apportionment of PM2.5 in Beijing: seasonal perspective. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics, 13, 7053-7074.
- 47.62. Zhen, C, Luo L, Wang S, Wang, Y., Sharma, S., Shimadera, H., Wang, X., et al. 2016. Status and characteristics of ambient PM<sub>2.5</sub> pollution in global megacities. Environment International. 89–90, 212-221.