

Editor's decision about revised ms. acp-2015-1025 by D. Founda et al., entitled "Long term visibility variation in Athens (1931-2013): A proxy for local and regional atmospheric aerosol loads".

By François Dulac, 26 July 2016

Thank you for your revision. I am glad to accept your paper for publication pending editorial and technical corrections listed hereafter. Please especially check many missing spaces between words. I confirm my suggestion of your paper to the ACP editorial board for a journal highlight.

Editorial and technical corrections:

- Line 24: insert a space before "visibility".
- Line 26: specify "AVHRR and MODIS satellite-derived"...
- Line 27: insert a space before "confirmed".
- Line 31: change the comma position in "daylight (WMO, 1992)".
- Line 34: "loading in".
- Line 45: insert a space before and after "play".
- Line 57: insert a space before "A "; "decrease in".
- Line 75: in addition to within the abstract, specify again "aerosol optical depth (AOD)".
- Line 88: insert a space before "behind" and before "during".
- Line 91: insert a space after "load".
- Lines 109, 110, 115, 118, 132, 187, 220, 230, 283, 285, 292, 297 (within parentheses): insert a space between the number and its unit.
- Line 112: add a space before "wet"; change "for the eastern".
- Line 115: space before and not after ">".
- Line 118: no space before "August".
- Line 120: insert a space before "rainy".
- Line 126: specify "a 10-yr climatology (2005-2014)".
- Line 127: after "trajectories", specify the arrival level at which air trajectories are computed.
- Line 128: insert a space before "N Africa".
- Line 129: insert a space after "events" and after "Mediterranean".
- Line 130: "the Balkans".
- Line 133-135: better move the last sentence of this paragraph to its beginning (line 126); specify the type of trajectories computed regarding vertical movements.
- Line 141: replace "has" by "is".
- Line 166: insert a space after "Regarding".
- Line 174: insert a space after "AOD_{550nm}".
- Line 179: insert a space before "subsequent".
- Line 187: insert a space after "located".
- Line 190: insert "local standard time" after "14:00".
- Line 195: insert a space before "Meteorological".
- Line 215: insert a space after "origin".
- Lines 221-222: change to "2330-km wide swath" (missing hyphen and space).
- Line 227: remove the space after "±".
- Line 228: insert a space after "AOD".
- Line 234: replace "is" by "was".
- Line 240: insert a space after "daily".
- Line 241: insert a space before "The above".
- Lines 241- 242: change to "within the distance of 70 km from".

- Line 243: insert a space after “used”.
- Line 244: insert a space before “It”.
- Line 245: replace “:” by “;” between the two refs.
- Line 246: insert a space before “2011”.
- Line 247: insert a space before and after “PM₁₀”.
- Line 248: replace the comma by a space in “station,at”.
- Line 255: shift the comma from before the opening parenthesis to after the closing one.
- Line 256: insert a space before “Africa”.
- Line 260: “trends in”.
- Line 261: insert a space after “development”.
- You might wish to include a comment on Fig. 4: I guess that the year-to-year variability in the visibility plot of Fig. 4 is associated to the very different resolutions (in km) of the visibility classes at high and low visibility, resulting in a decreasing fluctuation with decreasing visibility.
- Line 266: insert a space before “-2.8” and before “p”.
- Line 267: insert a space before “corresponding”.
- Line 268: specify “statistical sensitivity tests”.
- Line 270: “of the first”.
- Line 272: remove the space after “<”.
- Line 273: “insert a space before “recent”.
- Line 276: insert a space after “3.2”.
- Line 277: change to “three sub-periods as described above follows changing trends”.
- Line 279: insert a space before “Figure”.
- Line 280: specify “for those 4 different sub-periods”.
- Line 282: insert a space before “between”.
- Line 283: insert a space before “Very”.
- Line 284: insert a space before “of” and before “poor”.
- Line 285: insert a space before “than” and before “occurred”.
- Lines 289, 292 and 294: insert a comma before “respectively”.
- Line 290: insert a space before “The” and after “negligible”.
- Line 292: better write “Visibility lower than”; add a space before “10”.
- Line 297: insert a space before “rises”.
- Line 298: insert a space after “lower”.
- Lines 300 and 301: remove the space after “>”.
- Line 303: add a comma before the year of the 2 references.
- Line 305: insert a space before “area”.
- Line 316: insert a space before “improvement”.
- Line 317: insert a space before “enhance”.
- Line 319: insert a space after “cycle”.
- Line 320: insert a space before “Although”.
- Line 326: “value of 67%”.
- Line 332: no space in “March-July”.
- Line 348: “decrease in RH levels”.
- Line 355: insert a space before “resulting”.
- Line 356: insert a space before “precipitation”.
- Line 357: insert a space before “at” and after “trends”.
- Line 355: insert a space before “As”.
- Lines 360 and 362: “day_decade⁻¹”.
- Line 361: insert a space before “while”.

- Line 363: insert a space before "<".
- Line 363: insert a space before "year".
- Line 370: insert a space after "regarding".
- Line 374: insert a space before "period".
- Line 378: insert a space before "other".
- Lines 380 and 393: replace "(p<0.01) by "at the 99% confidence level".
- Line 382: add "from the beginning".
- Line 383: from the figure, "until the mid-1990s" seems more appropriate than "until the late 1970s".
- Line 385: insert a space after "influence".
- Line 409: insert a space before "higher".
- Line 418: ";," between the 2 references; "2007 and 2009".
- Line 421: "disposing of".
- Line 422: insert a space before "most".
- Line 423: insert a space after "year,".
- Line 427: insert a space within "the_time".
- Line 428: insert a space before ">" and "<".
- Line 430: insert a space before "during".
- Line 433: remove the comma after "that".
- Lines 436, 438, 440: insert a space after "SO₂".
- Line 440: "increase in".
- Line 441: insert a space before "sharp".
- Lines 446 and 448: insert a space after "NO_x".
- Line 447: "tendency to".
- Line 448: "all emission sectors".
- Line 449: "by air mass".
- Line 450: "N-NE" (no space).
- Line 452: insert a space before "have".
- Line 455: insert a space before "According".
- Line 456-457: "total emissions in the 1970s".
- Line 459: insert a space before "Stjern"; change "et al. (2011)" by "et al., 2011)".
- Line 465: insert a space before "finding" and before "trends".
- Line 467: insert a space after "that".
- Lines 472 and 473: 3 spaces missing between words in each line.
- Line 474: insert a space before "unpublished".
- Line 475: Ref. by Vautard should come first due to alphabetic order and same year.
- Line 491: 2 spaces missing between words.
- Line 492: 4 spaces missing between words.
- Line 493: 2 spaces missing between words.
- Line 495: insert a space after "series".
- Line 497: insert a space after "2014".
- Line 507: remove the 1st occurrence of "km".
- Line 510-511: remove the sentence starting with "It has to be noted" since the information is already given in line 503.
- Line 511-512: better shift the last sentence of the paragraph after "Fig. 13" in line 502.
- Line 513: "consistss".
- Line 514: "satellite_based".
- Line 521: insert a space after "Athens" and after "14".
- Lines 523, 526, 529, 531, 533, 537, and 578: insert a space after "PM₁₀".

- Line 524: insert a space before “Despite”.
- Line 528: “decrease in”.
- Line 529: insert a space before “between”.
- Lines 530, 531 and 532 (2 times): remove the space after “<” or “>”.
- Lines 531 and 532: insert a space before “>” or “<”.
- Line 533: insert spaces in “of_the_annual”.
- Line 535: “tendency in”.
- Line 536: “scales₹”.
- Line 537: “trend in”; insert a space after “slight”.
- Line 541: “the long historical”.
- Line 545: insert a space before “unique”.
- Line 546: “into 4 sub-periods”.
- Line 550: insert a space after “distinct”.
- Line 554: insert a space before “Visibility”.
- Line 555: remove “on visibility”.
- Line 556: insert a space after “winds,”.
- Line 560: replace “poorer” by “larger”.
- Line 564: insert a space before and after “4 km”; change “corresponding to” by “observed during”.
- Line 566: 4 spaces missing between words.
- Lines 573-575: to follow the order of figures, interchange the 2 sentences but leave “also” in the second.
- Line 577: insert a space before “consistent”.
- Line 579: specify “new transport”.
- Line 580: insert a space before “the”.
- Line 582: insert a space before “Besides” and before “regional”.
- Line 583: insert a space before “which”.
- Line 584: “for the first time”.
- Line 586: space missing within “to_the”.
- Line 587: replace “as the” by “showing an”.
- Line 588: specify “from the 1930s to the 2000s” at the end of the sentence.
- Line 590: insert a space after “Acknowledgements.”; prefer English version with an additional “e”.
- Line 594: 2 spaces missing between words.
- Lines 597-599: “The contributions” ... “are”.
- Line 598: insert a space after “data”.
- Line 616: no space in pages 649-660”.
- Line 622: remove “vol. “ and also “2013. ” before doi.
- Lines 641, 699, 701, and 765: insert a space before the year of the reference.
- Lines 643, 654, 707, 714, 741, 767, at least: check missing spaces after commas.
- Line 648: “Renew.”.
- Line 691: specify University of the given Thesis.
- Line 705: add a final dot.
- Line 716: remove the journal number after the volume number; you probably have a double space before “315”.
- Table 1: homogenize the use of a space before and not after “±”; shift the space from before to after “1” in “(>1 mm)”.
- Line 806: insert a space before “used”.
- Table 2: insert a space between numbers and unit “m” or “km” (4 instances).
- Legends of Fig. 1, 2b, 3, 8, 9, and 13: insert a space between “Fig.” and the number.-Line 837: specify “The grey surface in the coloured map represents”.
- Line 879: replace “on the sectors” by “following the sectors”.

-Fig. 3: "Relative frequency" is a more appropriate legend for the y axis; in the legend box within the plot, insert a space between numbers and units and between units and remove the space between numbers and character "<" or ">" (e.g. "5< wsp <10 m s⁻¹"); you should remove the small intermediate ticks on the horizontal axis since they do not correspond to anything.

-Lines 902-905: specify "Relative frequencies"; check many missing spaces; add a space between "wsp" and character "<" or ">"; add a space between units in "m_s⁻¹" (4 instances); add a space within "10_m" in line 904; please specify that "100% is the integral of the upper curve." before "For instance" (as I understand).

-Line 937: "Relative frequency distribution".

Fig. 6: you can probably enlarge a bit the 4 plots and character size in legends for a better readability; you should use the range 10-80 (or 0-70) for the RH axis to match the 2 vertical axes on the same vertical grid lines.

-Line 953: insert a space before "Vertical".

-Fig. 7 and line 972: rather use "day yr⁻¹" than "days" or "days/year"; change the position of the space in ">1 mm".

-Fig. 9: Specify "15-yr running" in the title box of the plot; the upper "99% CL" should better be moved over the upper dashed line; I suggest using a different colour for the two curves, and write their title ("wind speed-visibility" or "RH-visibility") using the respective colour of the plot.

-Line 1020: write "and 99% confidence levels (CL; dashed lines) between".

-Fig. 10: use decimal dot and bold characters for numbers in the y axis legend.

-Line 1044: insert a space before and after "of".

-Lines 1066-1069: many spaces are missing after punctuation signs including ")", ".", and ","; specify "annual average visibility"; for the last reference, remove the comma and put the year within ().

-Fig. 12: to improve readability, please add intermediate ticks in the x-axis and use bolder points in plot 12a; possibly enlarge the width of the figure.

-Line 1082: insert a space before "b)".

-Line 1083: insert a space before "trends".

-Fig. 13: using green would be more appropriate than blue for the MODIS 550-nm wavelength.

-Line 1092: inset a space between numbers and unit "nm" (2 instances).

-Line 1093: insert a space before "mean".

-Line 1103: empty page?

-Fig. 14: use bold characters for numbers in y axes.

-Line 1110: missing space after "Frequencies" and "PM₁₀"; specify "Relative frequencies".

-Lines 1110 and 1131: missing space after "PM₁₀".

-Fig. 15: check quality of original, it looks a bit blurred.

-Supplement, top of p. 3: "This resulted into".

-Supplement, p. 4: "trends in visibility"; move the 1st instance of "days" after the right parenthesis; remove the space after "<" within the parentheses and at the end of the page.

-Figs. S3 and S4: please add intermediate ticks (every 2 or 5 yrs).
