

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Summertime contributions of isoprene, monoterpenes, and sesquiterpene oxidation to the formation of secondary organic aerosol in the troposphere over Mt. Tai, Central East China during MTX2006” by P. Q. Fu et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 30 September 2009

General comments:

This manuscript deals with a detailed organic aerosol characterization/speciation study at a high mountain site in Central East China, and contains a valuable aerosol data set. The data are interpreted in the light of available current knowledge on secondary organic aerosol (SOA) formation processes and tracers, and the recent literature on this topic is fairly well cited. An interesting finding is that SOA formation from the photoox-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



idation of isoprene is an important aerosol process at this high mountain site and is enhanced relative to ground level, and that it is more important than SOA formation from monoterpenes and sesquiterpenes. An issue of concern is the method used for the quantitative determination of the various tracers, as outlined in the specific comments. In the opinion of this reviewer a major revision is needed. The English usage also needs to be improved.

Specific comments:

Page 16943 – line 8: It is more correct to write: “All the biogenic SOA tracers did not show clear diurnal variations, suggesting that they are formed during long-range transport or over relatively long time scales.”

Page 16944 – line 9: I suggest to update this sentence and provide some information on recent global estimates of biogenic SOA: “In addition to monoterpenes and sesquiterpenes, isoprene is currently also believed to be a large biogenic source of SOA mass. Global model bottom-up estimates for biogenic SOA are in the range of 9 – 50 Tg C yr⁻¹ (Kanakidou et al., 2005), while recent top-down estimates, including isoprene SOA, are as high as 185 Tg C yr⁻¹ (Hallquist et al., 2009).” Ref.: Hallquist et al., ACP, 9, 5155-5236, 2009.

Page 16944 – line 3: I suggest to delete the sentence “They estimated its SOA production to be 2 Tg yr⁻¹”, but to add some references containing more recent estimates in the last sentence of the paragraph: “. predicted SOA formation seriously (Henze and Seinfeld, 2006; Tsigaridis and Kanakidou, 2007).”

Page 16946 – line 17: It is not clear how the calibrations were done for the quantitative determinations. The authors state on line 27 that the data were not corrected for the recoveries, but how did they account for losses during sample workup? This issue should be clarified.

Page 16947 – lines 15-16: the concentrations for the 2-methyltetrols given here differ

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

from those given in Table 1. Please, check whether this is also the case for other tracer concentrations.

Page 16947 – line 24: The report on the C5-alkene triols is not so recent anymore and dates already from 2005. I suggest to update this sentence and add a more recent relevant reference: “C5-alkene triols, which are also photooxidation products of isoprene (Wang et al., 2005) and unique isoprene SOA tracers under low-NO_x conditions (Surratt et al., 2006), were detected”.

Page 16950 – line 22: I suggest to rephrase two sentences: “As expected, MBTCA and 3-HG, which are higher-generation photooxidation products of a-/b-pinene, did not show a peak during this episode. The enhanced concentrations of pinic and pinonic acids, which are lower-generation photooxidation products compared to MBTCA and 3-HG (Szmigielski et al., 2007; Kourtchev et al., 2009), suggest that the photooxidation of a-/b-pinene was not complete.”

Page 16952 – line 9: I suggest to weaken the statement relating to the presence of norpinic acid and MBTCA in cluster 3: “. . . . are also in cluster 3, suggesting that these compounds may have the same source regions as the isoprene oxidation products.” The atmospheric behaviors of the isoprene and a-/b-pinene SOA tracers are quite different, with the isoprene SOA tracers being much more polar/hydrophilic than a-/b-pinene SOA tracers.

Page 16954 – line 24: I feel the sentence “The relatively “ is redundant and suggest to delete it. It is fairly well established that isoprene SOA formation involves OH-initiated reactions (see line 20 just above).

Page 16955 – line 26: I suggest to rephrase this sentence: “Thus, we propose here that the Riso/mono value can be used to estimate”; it is hard to consider this ratio as a tracer.

Page 16956 – line 20: Comparisons with data available for European sites should also

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

be included, i.e., Finland (Kourtchev et al., 2008a), Hungary (Ion et al., 2005) and Germany (Kourtchev et al., 2008b).

Page 16957 – lines 11-12: Also here, I noted that the values differ from the ones given in Table 1.

Page 16957 – line 18: I suggest to delete the first part of this sentence (Due to the tracer-based calculation); I feel it is redundant.

Table 1: the authors should carefully check whether the values correspond with those reported in the main text.

Technical corrections:

The English usage needs to be improved. I suggest that the revised version is copy-edited. Below is a list of suggested corrections, but this list is certainly not complete.

Page 16943 – line 8: ... tracers did not show clear ...

Page 16943 – line 24: ... at high altitudes

Page 16944 – line 4: ... can have an impact on ...

Page 16944 – line 18: ... at high altitudes ...

Page 16945 – line 11: ... simultaneous measurements of ozone ... and hydroxyl radicals ...

Page 16945 – line 24: ... the observatory ...

Page 16945 – line 26: ... a high-volume air sampler.

Page 16946 – line 8: The GC instrument (GC is the abbreviation for gas chromatography)

Page 16946 – line 12: ... in the electron ionization (EI) mode ... (the term “electron ionization” is recommended by IUPAC; the term “electron impact” is deprecated)

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Page 16956 – line 13: ... scanned in the m/z range 50 to 650.

Page 16946 – line 25: ... onto pre-combusted

Page 16948 – line 20: ... 2 times higher than pinic acid.

Page 16948 – line 26: Two novel alpha-pinene SOA tracers were ...

Page 16948 – line 29: ... with UV-radiation ...

Page 16949 – line 23: did not show clear

Page 16949 – line 25: ... showed very similar temporal trends.

Page 16951 – line 6: ... mainly originated from

Page 16951 – line 14: ... due to adsorption onto preexisting aerosol.

Page 16951 – line 22: ... likely originate from forest fires in South China, since they enhance emissions of BVOCs.

Page 16952 – line 3: ... is mainly associated ...

Page 16952 – line 12: ... the same pattern as that at daytime.

Page 16953 – line 18: ... at high altitudes

Page 16954 – line 8: ... in the aerosol phase.

Page 16954 – line 20: Ozonolysis is a minor

Page 16955 – line 6: ... model study indicating that

Page 16955 – line 15 (and other places in this paragraph): ... at lower latitudes ... at mid-latitudes, ... at higher latitudes

Page 16957 – line 25: ... BVOC oxidation

Page 16957 – line 6: ... from aircraft observations that reveal very high OC mass

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

loadings over the Northwest Pacific ...

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 9, 16941, 2009.

ACPD

9, C5428–C5433, 2009

Interactive
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C5433

