Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 9, C473–C474, 2009
www.atmos-chem-phys-discuss.net/9/C473/2009/

Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics Discussions

Interactive comment on "Concurrent observations of air pollutants at two sites in the Pearl River Delta and the implication of regional transport" *by* H. Guo et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 1 May 2009

Guo et al. present the results of an intensive field study at two sites in China: in the Pearl River Delta and in Hong Kong. The measurements are an interesting and useful dataset and should be published for the benefit of the community. The dataset seems to be of high quality.

However, I don't believe that the level of scientific analysis is sufficient to justify publication of this paper in ACP. The analysis mainly consists of a laundry list of average values and average ratios, and it's not clear how it makes a substantial contribution to scientific progress. The main findings, namely 1) pollutants were higher in Hong Kong, except NOx, 2) high ozone occurred with stable weather systems, 3) air masses were

Full Screen / Esc
Printer-friendly Version
Interactive Discussion
Discussion Paper

more aged in the small town than in Hong Kong, and 4) "regional transport of air pollution has a complex and significant impact", seem obvious. I don't see what the reader really learns from this.

I encourage the authors to submit this work to a lower profile journal, or alternatively to undertake a more thoughtful analysis of their potentially very interesting dataset before resubmitting to ACP.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 9, 9747, 2009.