Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 9, C4579–C4580, 2009
www.atmos-chem-phys-discuss.net/9/C4579/2009/

Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics Discussions

Interactive comment on "Secondary organic material formed by methylglyoxal in aqueous aerosol mimics – Part 2: Product identification using Aerosol-CIMS" *by* N. Sareen et al.

A. Cordova

acordova@organ.su.se

Received and published: 8 September 2009

As we commented on the companion paper, because aldol condensation catalyzed by NH4+ is discussed in this paper as a potential pathway for the reaction studied, it would be important to quote the paper presenting this process in this journal (Noziere et al, ACPD, 9, 1, 2009) and the patent reporting the corresponding discovery in 2007 (Nozière & Córdova, A novel catalyst for aldol condensation reaction, WO2009045156, 2007), as both are essential to this discussion. Since these publications are the first to introduce the concept of catalysis of aldol condensation by NH4+, omitting them could give the reader the mistaking impression that this concept is presented here for the first

time, which would not be correct. Quoting these references would also have the advantage to spare the authors from having to demonstrate the existence of such catalytic processes all over again (identification of products by NMR, rate constants demonstrating the catalytic effect of NH4+...). We appreciate the efforts made otherwise in this paper to keep the references complete, and thank you in advance for including these references.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 9, 15567, 2009.