Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 6, S4233–S4234, 2006 www.atmos-chem-phys-discuss.net/6/S4233/2006/ © Author(s) 2006. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons License.



ACPD

6, S4233–S4234, 2006

Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "Detection of organic compound signatures in infra-red, limb emission spectra observed by the MIPAS-B2 instrument" by J. J. Remedios et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 31 October 2006

This is an excellent paper reporting on observations of three organic species in the troposphere using a balloon-borne Fourier transform spectrometer. I have a few queries, comments and corrections: 1. Pg. 10024, line 25: Is the detector an arsenic-doped silicon detector (blocked impurity band), i.e., Si:As BIB? If so, then the text needs to be corrected. 2. Pg. 10028, line 4: the Greek nu is missing a tilde. 3. Pg. 10030: The aerosol part of the retrieval is clearly important because it interferes with the bands of interest. Could a little more information on it be supplied? For example, is aerosol extinction assumed to be without structure or is it assumed to be sulphate with appropriate spectral structure? 4. I find the agreement between observed and calculated residual spectra to be satisfactory and convincing. One aspect, however, puzzles me



somewhat. I expected that the calculated residual spectra would be smoother. In fact, the calculated residual spectra often show sharp structure, which I am assuming is due to the radiative transfer part of the simulation. Perhaps a comment on this point would be helpful. 5. The acetone lab data used in the retrievals should be published. Is there a paper in preparation? If so, it might be good to say so. If not, then this is a problem because other workers cannot retrieve acetone from their spectra to verify and extend the work reported here.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 6, 10021, 2006.

ACPD

6, S4233-S4234, 2006

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper