**Atmospheric
Chemistry
and Physics
Discussions**

Interactive comment on "The effects of aerosols on precipitation and dimensions of subtropical clouds; a sensitivity study using a numerical cloud model" *by* A. Teller and Z. Levin

K. Carslaw

CARSLAW@ENV.LEEDS.AC.UK

Received and published: 19 October 2005

Daniel Rosenfeld has suggested that it is inappropriate for Teller and Levin to cite an unrefereed paper in their ACP paper. The paper in question is Ayers (2005), Air pollution and climate change: has air pollution suppressed rainfall over Australia?,in "Clean Air and Environmental Quality, 39 (2), 51-57.". Rosenfeld states that citation of unrefereed literature could undermine work that is published in reviewed journals.

My decision as editor of the Teller and Levin paper is to allow this citation to remain in the text and in the reference list. The basis of this decision is that the Ayers paper

Full Screen / Esc

Print Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

EGU

has appeared in the open literature and may be cited in full (with volume and page numbers), thereby allowing others to find and read the work. This is the purpose of the reference list: it is a list of traceable literature that has been influential in the preparation of the paper and does not make judgements about the quality of the work that is listed. Judgements about the quality of work that is cited should, if appropriate, appear in the main text of the article. It is the duty of the authors to ensure that work is cited appropriately and accurately, and that the work is accessible for others to consult if necessary.

Restricting the reference list to refereed papers creates some obvious problems that ACP would wish to avoid. For example, someone might wish to write a refereed paper refuting claims made in a widely available published but unrefereed paper. If we prevented authors from citing unrefereed literature then such a paper could not be written in any sensible fashion.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 5, 7211, 2005.

EGU