Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 15, C2979–C2980, 2015 www.atmos-chem-phys-discuss.net/15/C2979/2015/ © Author(s) 2015. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



ACPD 15, C2979–C2980, 2015

> Interactive Comment

Interactive comment on "Heavy air pollution episodes in Beijing during January 2013: inorganic ion chemistry and source analysis using Highly Time-Resolved Measurements in an urban site" by B. Han et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 26 May 2015

The paper of Han et al. 2015 attempts to present the inorganic ion chemistry and the source analysis with hourly data collected in Beijing (China) during 2013.

Whilst the English is sound, the scientific analysis is very week. This not only is not suitable for the standards of ACP, but I doubt it would meet the standard of any peer reviewed journal. I suggest the authors to carry out a much in dept analysis of the eight species analysed. The PMF analysis is not well supported.

It is a pity that a paper cited (Huang et al. 2014 ACPD) did not meet the standard for



Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



ACP either. I suggest to read the reasons of the rejection of the Huang et al. (2014) to understand why the current paper can only be rejected at this stage. The data analysis is simply too weak and there are not major scientific findings worth of publication in ACP.

A much in dept analysis, along with potentially additional data (as reviewer 2 suggests, there may be additional data to be used), may encourage a resubmission as new manuscript.

ACPD	
15, C2979–C2980,	2015

Interactive Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 15, 11111, 2015.