Dehydration effects from contrails in a coupled contrail-climate model

2

3 U. Schumann¹, J. E. Penner², Y. Chen², C. Zhou², and K. Graf¹

⁴ ¹ Deutsches ZentruFm für Luft- und Raumfahrt, Institut für Physik der Atmosphäre,

5 Oberpfaffenhofen, Germany

⁶ ² University of Michigan, Department of Atmospheric, Oceanic, and Space Sciences, Ann

7 Arbor, Michigan, USA

8 Correspondence to: U. Schumann (<u>ulrich.schumann@dlr.de</u>)

9

10 Abstract

Uptake of water by contrails in ice-supersaturated air and release of water after ice particle 11 advection and sedimentation dehydrates the atmosphere at flight levels and redistributes 12 humidity mainly to lower levels. The dehydration is investigated by coupling a plume-scale 13 contrail model with a global aerosol-climate model. The contrail model simulates all the 14 individual contrails forming from global air traffic for meteorological conditions as defined 15 by the climate model. The computed contrail-cirrus properties compare reasonably with 16 theoretical concepts and observations. The mass of water in aged contrails may exceed 10^6 17 times the mass of water emitted from aircraft. Many of the ice particles sediment and release 18 water in the troposphere, on average 700 m below the mean flight levels. Simulations with 19 and without coupling are compared. The drying at contrail levels causes thinner and longer 20 lived contrails with about 15 % reduced contrail radiative forcing (RF). The reduced RF from 21 contrails is of the order 0.06 W m^{-2} , slightly larger than estimated earlier because of higher 22 23 soot emissions. For normal traffic, the RF from dehydration is small compared to interannual variability. A case with 100 times increased emissions is used to overcome statistical 24 uncertainty. The contrails impact the entire hydrological cycle in the atmosphere by reducing 25 the total water column and the cover of high and low-level clouds. For normal traffic, the 26 dehydration changes contrail RF by positive shortwave and negative longwave contributions 27 of order 0.04 W m⁻², with a small negative net RF. The total net RF from contrails and 28 dehydration remains within the range of previous estimates. 29

- 30
- 31

32 **1 Introduction**

Contrail ice particles grow by uptake of humidity from ambient ice-supersaturated air masses 33 and release their water content after sedimentation or advection with the wind into regions 34 35 with lower relative humidity. *Knollenberg* [1972] derived the ice mass inventory in a contrail for a single aircraft from measurements and found that there are at least four orders of 36 magnitude more water present as ice in the contrail than in the original aircraft exhaust. 37 Hence, contrails dry or dehydrate the atmosphere at places where they form, and redistribute 38 humidity to places in the atmosphere where they sublimate [Fahey and Schumann, 1999]. 39 Small relative changes of humidity in the troposphere and small absolute changes in the 40 tropopause region have large effects on radiative forcing [*Riese et al.*, 2012]. Ice is far more 41 efficient in radiative forcing than water vapor [Meerkötter et al., 1999; Chen et al., 2000; 42 43 Fusina et al., 2007; Wilcox et al., 2012]. The redistribution of humidity may make contrails thinner. In regions with heavy air traffic, contrail-cirrus persistence can modify or even 44 suppress natural cirrus formation [Unterstrasser, 2014], with consequences for radiative 45 forcing [Burkhardt and Kärcher, 2011]. Falling ice particles may enhance precipitation from 46 mixed-phase or warm clouds at lower altitudes, by increasing humidity and thus the liquid 47 water content or by the Wegener-Findeisen-Bergeron process, both of which are thought to 48 increase the likelihood of precipitation [Murcray, 1970; Korolev and Mazin, 2003; Yun and 49 Penner, 2012]. Dehydration from contrails may follow similar processes as dehydration by 50 thin cirrus at the tropical tropopause [Jensen et al., 1996; Fueglistaler et al., 2009]. 51 Contrails have been investigated in many observational and numerical studies [Schumann, 52 53 2002; Mannstein and Schumann, 2005; Burkhardt et al., 2010; Heymsfield et al., 2010; Yang et al., 2010; Unterstrasser and Gierens, 2010b; Minnis et al., 2013; Lewellen, 2014; Voigt et 54 al., 2015]. Nevertheless, the dehydration effects from contrails are not well known. Previous 55 assessments of the climate impact of aviation [Schumann, 1994; Brasseur et al., 1998; Penner 56 et al., 1999; Sausen et al., 2005; Lee et al., 2009; Lee et al., 2010; Boucher et al., 2013; 57 Brasseur et al., 2015] discussed the dehydration effects from contrails qualitatively. 58 Burkhardt and Kärcher [2011] were the first to quantify the dehydration effects within a 59 global climate model. Contrail formation was treated as a subgrid-scale (SGS) process which 60 included a separate cloud class for young contrails. They found that contrail cirrus causes a 61 significant decrease in natural cloudiness, which partly offsets their warming effect. They 62 estimated the cooling from reduced cirrus at about 7 mW m⁻² and called for further work to 63

64 more reliably quantify this effect.

65 Observations show ice particles precipitating from contrails in ice supersaturated air

- 66 [Heymsfield et al., 1998] and ~2 km deep fall streaks of quickly falling large ice particles
- below individual contrails at horizontal scales of ~5 km, far smaller than global model grid-
- scales [Schumann, 1994; Atlas et al., 2006]. Details of fall streaks below individual contrails
- 69 were simulated in large-eddy simulations (LES) [Jensen et al., 1998; Unterstrasser et al.,
- 2012]. Such fall streaks could not appear if the cirrus clouds are represented by mean values
- in the large grid cells of a global model. Obviously, the large scale separation between
- 72 individual contrails and global scales makes it difficult to assess the global impact of
- 73 dehydration from contrails.
- A contrail prediction model CoCiP has been developed to simulate the formation and decay of
- all individual contrail segments for given air traffic and ambient meteorology [Schumann,
- ⁷⁶ 2012] including contrail induced radiative forcing [*Schumann et al.*, 2012b]. CoCiP uses a
- simplified model designed to approximate the essential contrail physics for efficient
- simulation of contrails from global traffic over long periods. The contrail model bridges the
- scales from the aircraft wake to the global atmosphere. Various of the model results compare
- reasonably with observations [*Voigt et al.*, 2010; Schumann, 2012; Jeßberger *et al.*, 2013;
- 81 Schumann and Graf, 2013; Schumann et al., 2013a]. In the past, the model has been run in an
- offline mode for given meteorological fields, without exchange of humidity between contrailsand background air.
- In this study, the contrail model is coupled with the global climate model CAM3+/IMPACT
- [*Wang and Penner*, 2010], here also called CAM. The global model includes complex
- aerosol-cloud interactions, cirrus and ice supersaturation. The coupled CoCiP/CAM model is
- applied to quantify the impact of water exchange on contrail properties, large scale humidity
- distribution, and background climate. In order to isolate the effects of water uptake by ice
- particles without complicating effects from soot and other aerosols [*Penner et al.*, 2009;
- 90 Hendricks et al., 2011; Gettelman and Chen, 2013; Righi et al., 2013], this study is purposely
- restricted to the effects from exchanges of water. The ice nucleation properties of soot from
- aviation emissions might get changed when entering contrail ice [*Zhou and Penner*, 2014].
- 93 This is a possibly important effect which should be included in a future model application.
- 94 For small climate disturbances, to which aviation effects belong, the analysis of climate
- ⁹⁵ impact from free running climate simulations is hampered by the noise inherent in such
- climate models because of the chaotic nature of atmosphere dynamics. For a climate model
- study with a diagnostic linear contrail model, *Ponater et al.* [2005] used a factor of 20 larger

fuel consumption and Rap et al. [2010a] used 100 times enhanced contrail optical depth, to 98 obtain statistically significant results from 30- to 50-year climate simulations. This is a valid 99 approach as long as the climate response to the disturbances is about linear. Gettelman and 100 Chen [2013] and Chen and Gettelman [2013] were able to reduce the climate noise using a 101 20-year climate model (CAM5) simulation nudged to the pressure, winds and atmospheric 102 and sea surface temperatures from a previous one-year simulation. In order to quantify the 103 effects from this "nudging", one would need comparisons with and without nudging. Here, we 104 try to overcome climate noise by using enhanced emissions and estimate the linearity of the 105 responses. 106

107 2 Methods

108 2.1 CAM3+ /IMPACT model

109 The method is a new combination of CoCiP with CAM3+/IMPACT, with code changes to 110 allow for coupling with exchange of water between contrails and ambient air.

111 CAM3+/IMPACT is an updated version of the coupled aerosol-general circulation model

described in *Wang and Penner* [2010] and *Yun et al.* [2013]. CAM3 is the Community

113 Atmosphere Model version 3, which simulates the atmosphere. Here, it is run using fixed sea

surface temperature climatology with an overall time step of 1 h and spatial resolution of 2° in

115 latitude and 2.5° in longitude with 26 vertical model levels up to about 3.5 hPa. IMPACT is

the University of Michigan aerosol model, which treats a total of 17 aerosol types [*Zhou and*

117 *Penner*, 2014]. The model used here combines features added to CAM3 (called CAM3+) by

Liu et al. [2007], Wang and Penner [2010], Yun and Penner [2012] and Yun et al. [2013].

119 CAM3+ uses a two-moment cloud microphysics scheme for cloud ice, in which mass and

number concentrations are predicted by prognostic equations. The two-moment scheme treats

ice nucleation, evaporation, and melting, and allows for ice supersaturation. The cloud

fraction calculation accounts for new cloud cover by ice nucleation, treating homogeneous

and heterogeneous nucleation of ice. The surface emissions included are for the year 2000

124 [*Penner et al.*, 2009]. The model has previously been compared with observations [*Yun and*

125 *Penner*, 2012]. E.g., *Wang and Penner* [2010] showed that the model predicts the global

distribution of ice supersaturation, cloud cover, ice water content, and ice crystal

127 concentrations in reasonable agreement with observations.

128 2.2 The contrail simulation model CoCiP

CoCiP is a Lagrangian model which traces individual contrail segments forming along flight
 routes for many flights. The model is documented and discussed in *Schumann* [2012]. In the

following, the major features are explained with a few modifications. CoCiP simulates the 131 lifecycles of contrails from their formation behind individual aircraft until final dissipation. 132 Contrails are assumed to form when the Schmidt-Appleman criterion is satisfied for given 133 ambient temperature and humidity, given fuel (H₂O emission index 1.24, combustion heat 134 43.2 MJ kg⁻¹), and given overall propulsion efficiency [Schumann, 1996]. The model assumes 135 that the soot particles emitted into the young exhaust plume act as condensation nuclei for 136 contrail formation when humidity exceeds liquid saturation. The resultant droplets freeze soon 137 thereafter because of ambient temperature below homogeneous freezing limits. In the wake 138 phase, some ice particles get lost by adiabatic warming or by mixing with dry ambient air. 139 The initial contrail properties (depth, width, number of ice particles, initial ice water content) 140 are computed for given aircraft types. (The importance of aircraft size, speed, fuel 141 consumption, and emissions for contrail properties was subject of several recent studies 142 [Lewellen and Lewellen, 2001; Naiman et al., 2011; Voigt et al., 2011; Jeßberger et al., 2013; 143 Schumann et al., 2013; Unterstrasser and Görsch, 2014]). The contrail advection and the 144 shear and turbulence-driven spreading and mixing of plume air with ambient air are simulated 145 with a Gaussian plume model. Contrails spread vertically mainly by turbulent mixing excited 146 by shear and limited by stable stratification. In the model, particle sedimentation and 147 differential radiative heating contribute to enhanced vertical diffusivity. Shear tends to distort 148 plumes into vertically thin sheets enhancing vertical mixing. Horizontal diffusivities are larger 149 because horizontal motions are not limited by stratification. The contrail bulk ice physics is 150 approximated as a function of ice water content and ice particle number Nice per flight 151 distance assuming saturation inside the contrail, which is justified for dense ice clouds or slow 152 humidity changes [Korolev and Mazin, 2003; Kaufmann et al., 2014]. The local ice particle 153 concentration n_{ice} is computed from the number of ice particles per flight distance divided by 154 the plume cross-section. After contrail formation, the contrail ice water content grows by 155 uptake of ambient humidity entering the plume by mixing with ambient ice supersaturated air. 156 When mixing with subsaturated air, the ice water content shrinks accordingly. The number of 157 contrail ice particles is modelled as a function of soot emissions with some parameterized 158 losses during the wake vortex phase of the contrail. The number of ice particles per unit 159 plume length stays constant in the model except for aggregation between contrail particles 160 with cirrus particles, and turbulent mixing losses, which are parameterized. (For a discussion 161 of the aggregation model used, see Kienast-Sjögren et al. [2013]). In each contrail segment, 162 the volume mean particle radius r_{vol} is computed from the volume of the ice and the particle 163 number. For local optical depth and RF analysis, an effective radius r_{eff} is computed assuming 164

a fixed value C=r_{vol}/r_{eff}=0.9 [Schumann et al., 2011b]. The volume-mean ice particle size is 165 used to compute the mean fall speed [Spichtinger and Gierens, 2009]. The vertical motion of 166 the contrail follows the sum of ambient vertical velocity and fall speed. Because of crystal 167 size dispersion, sedimentation also contributes to vertical widening of the plume cross-168 section. The contrails terminate when all ice water content is sublimated (by mixing with dry 169 air, e.g., during subsidence) or by precipitating below the lower boundary of the CoCiP 170 domain. Contrail cover is computed on a fine grid with 5000×3600 longitude×latitude-grid 171 cells (about 5 km horizontal resolution) based on a threshold of 0.1 for optical depth (at 550 172 nm), accounting for overlapping with other contrails and with ambient cirrus. Hence, a thin 173 contrail overlapping with other thin cirrus may enlarge cover by enhancing the total optical 174 depth beyond the threshold. The radiative forcing (RF) induced by contrails is computed from 175 the sum of the contributions from each contrail; for each contrail, the RF is computed as a 176 function of contrail properties and top of the atmosphere radiances [Schumann et al., 2012b]. 177 The model is driven by air traffic waypoint data. Here, we use a global data set for the year 178 2006, including about 80000 flights per day, as provided within the ACCRI project 179 [Wilkerson et al., 2010; Brasseur et al., 2015]. The fuel consumption and the corresponding 180 water emissions from aircraft engines are available with these waypoint data. The overall 181 propulsion efficiency, mostly between 0.2 and 0.4, is deduced from the given speed, fuel 182 consumption and thrust. The number of soot particles emitted is set to be proportional to the 183 fuel consumption with fixed emission index $(10 \times 10^{14} \text{ kg}^{-1})$. The emission index used here is 184 larger than in earlier studies $(3.57 \times 10^{14} \text{ kg}^{-1})$ because recent experimental data indicate that 185 modern aircraft emit more (by number) soot particles acting as contrail ice nuclei than 186 estimated earlier [Schumann et al., 2013]. 187

CoCiP simulates contrail segments for each flight from departure until arrival for a maximum 188 life time, set to 36 h in this application. (Ages up to about a day have been observed [Minnis 189 et al., 1998; Haywood et al., 2009; Vázquez-Navarro et al., 2015]). In the original code 190 version, this required frequent readings of the input files. To reduce computing time, we split 191 the traffic data into hourly data. For each hour of integration over the year, first the contrail 192 segments from the previous flights, if existing, are integrated forward in time over the next 193 hour or until they die out. Thereafter, contrails from the new flight segments occurring during 194 the hour are treated. Contrails remaining active at the end of the time step are saved for the 195 196 next integration step.

The CoCiP model results depend on various critical model parameters; see Table 2 of 197 Schumann [2012]. In particular, plume diffusivities are modeled as in Schumann and Graf 198 [2013], with vertical plume diffusivities computed for $w'_{N} = 0.22 \text{ m s}^{-1}$; and the vertical 199 diffusivity is enhanced when radiative heating in the contrails causes convective instability. 200 With respect to particle losses, we found that the second-order Runge-Kutta scheme for 201 integration of the prognostic equations is stable and accurate enough without the need for 202 iterations, reducing computing time. We also found, partially because of a compensating code 203 error in the Runge Kutta scheme, that the loss of particles due to mesoscale fluctuations has a 204 small impact on the results and is no longer required (parameters E_T=0.1, E_{meso}=0, see Table 2 205 of Schumann [2012]). The humidity seen by CoCiP in the troposphere is assumed to be 206 enhanced by a factor of 1/RHi_c (RHi_c=0.9) compared to what is provided by the host model to 207 account for SGS variability and possible systematic deviations from observations. In a 208 previous study, we used numerical weather prediction results from the European Center for 209 Medium Range Weather Forecasts (ECMWF) with a SGS factor RHi_c=0.8 [Schumann and 210 Graf, 2013]. From the results of the present study, we learn that RHi_c=1 appears to give 211

satisfactory results and should be used in future applications.

213 **2.3 The coupling of CoCiP to CAM**

CAM calls CoCiP as a subroutine each time step providing the most recent meteorological
fields as input. The fields include three-dimensional (3-D) fields of wind, temperature,
humidity, ice water content, and cloud cover as a function of pressure. In addition, twodimensional fields are provided for surface pressure, outgoing longwave radiation, reflected
shortwave radiation, and incoming solar direct radiation. CoCiP interpolates in these fields
linearly in space and time to obtain the values at any position.

In the offline mode, each contrail segment is simulated for the given ambient meteorological

fields without changing background meteorology. This simplification is unavoidable when

222 CoCiP is driven by the output of numerical weather prediction models, as done in the past.

223 The offline mode allows for the efficient simulation of the contrails from millions of flights.

For the coupled model, CoCiP is run either offline or online.

In the online mode, CoCiP returns effective emissions (besides H₂O, the code can treat also

soot emissions) from aircraft after contrail processing. CoCiP accounts for the emissions

- exchanged between the background atmosphere and the contrails per time step and per CAM
- grid cell by tracking 3-D-fields EA, EC and CA (the sum of EA and CA is provided as a
- water source to CAM and treated as given emissions). EA (engine to atmosphere) records the

emission amount emitted from aircraft engines directly to the atmosphere, without processing 230 in contrails. EC (engine to contrail) is the amount emitted from aircraft engines into fresh 231 contrails. Positive CA (contrail to atmosphere) values are the amounts released from contrails 232 to the atmosphere, negative CA values are the amounts taken up by contrails from the 233 atmosphere. The emissions are split into EA and EC during contrail formation as a function of 234 the initial ice water content inside the freshly formed contrails relative to the amount of water 235 emitted from the engines. Hence, if no contrail forms, EA from this flight contains all 236 emissions and the contribution to EC is zero. After contrail initiation, in growing contrails, the 237 water contribution to CA becomes negative, because contrail ice grows by uptake of ambient 238 humidity. Later during the contrail life cycle, the contrail provides a positive CA contribution 239 when ice sublimates releasing water to the atmosphere. The local sign of CA depends on the 240 mix of growing and shrinking contrails within the grid cell. For diagnostics, CoCiP records 241 the inventory of the emission amount stored inside contrail particles per CAM grid cell in a 242 further 3-D field as a function of time. The sum of fields EA and CA and this inventory 243 244 include all aircraft emissions in the CoCiP domain. Hence, the H₂O mass passed between CoCiP and CAM is conserved. To reduce storage requirements, CoCiP operates on a limited 245 altitude domain where contrails form, covering 18 CAM model levels, from 916 to 100 hPa. 246 Aircraft emissions outside this altitude range (e.g., from airports) are included in CAM 247 separately in a consistent manner. 248

To avoid negative vapor concentrations in regions with many contrails forming during a time 249 step, CoCiP accounts for local H₂O exchange between the contrails and background air during 250 the integration time step. For this purpose, CoCiP uses a local copy of the background H₂O 251 252 concentration field provided by CAM and subtracts from it the amount of water vapor uptake by a contrail (and adds any released contrail water) immediately. The contribution from each 253 contrail segment is distributed over contrail neighboring grid points depending on the 254 respective distances, keeping H₂O mass conserved. Hence, the next contrail during the same 255 time step interval finds less humidity and is thinner. In this method, the results depend on the 256 sequence of flights. The aircraft which flies first has a thicker contrail than aircraft later in the 257 waypoint input. The accuracy of this approach depends on the ratio of the time step to the 258 contrail life time. The accuracy increases for smaller time step sizes. 259

260 We note that the coupling between CoCiP and CAM transfers grid cell mean values from

261 CAM to CoCiP and the sum of all contrail sources or sinks within a grid cell back from

262 CoCiP to CAM. As a consequence, the mass of H₂O uptake by a contrail during the time step

is spread over the grid cell immediately. Because of the large difference between contrail
scales (widths of order 0.1-10 km) and grid scales (about 200 km), humidity variations at
contrail scales cannot be resolved. A global model with far higher spatial resolution would be
required to overcome this problem.

267 **2.4 Model runs**

Three runs were performed with CAM3+/IMPACT/CoCiP for this study, see Table 1. Run 0 268 is the non-coupled (offline) reference case in which CAM runs without aviation emissions 269 while CoCiP is run using nominal aircraft emissions. Here, CoCiP uses the meteorological 270 fields from CAM in the same manner as it used numerical weather prediction results in the 271 past [Schumann and Graf, 2013]. Run 1 uses the coupled method (online) and simulates the 272 effects of contrails on the hydrological cycle for nominal aircraft emissions. Run 2 uses 273 aircraft emissions 100 fold increased to enhance the aviation effects beyond climate noise. 274 The results for runs 0 and 1 are from 30 years of simulation after several years of spin-up. 275 Because of limited computing resources, Run 2 includes just one year restarted from run 1 276 files. 277

278 3

3 Results and Discussion

279 **3.1 CoCiP results**

This section describes the contrail results in some detail to explain the physics simulated and to compare with observations. Some annual and global mean contrail properties for run 0 and 1 are given in Table 2. Unless otherwise stated, quantitative results are from run 1. The interannual variability of the 30-year mean values of CoCiP results as listed is small, and run 1-0 differences in Table 2 are significant.

285 **3.1.1 Basic contrail properties**

286 a. Traffic

The emissions included in CAM are derived from 182.2 Tg of annual fuel consumption of which CoCip analyses 83.2 % (the rest comes from emissions near airports which are added directly into the lower model levels of CAM). The global mean traffic density above 4.5 km altitude is 0.0072 km (km² h)⁻¹. About 92 % of all flight segments occur in the Northern Hemisphere. Maximum traffic occurs near 40°N over North America (70-115°W), Europe (7°W-15°E), and Asia (100-130°E).

293 b. Contrail formation

CoCiP computes the contrail properties for each given aircraft type. The average fuel 294 consumption, mass, speed, and overall propulsion efficiency of contrail forming aircraft are 295 4.60 kg km⁻¹, 116 Mg, 225 m s⁻¹, and 0.31, respectively. The contrail forming aircraft 296 consume slightly more fuel $(5.33 \text{ kg km}^{-1})$ than the rest of the fleet. About 15 % of all the 297 flight segments cause contrail formation in the CAM atmosphere. About 7 % occur in ice 298 supersaturated air causing persistent contrails. About 12 % of all fuel is consumed in regions 299 in which contrails form. (About two times larger fractions were computed for ECMWF input 300 with lower RHi_c [Schumann et al., 2011a].) Contrail forming aircraft fly mainly in the 301 troposphere, at 10.9 km mean altitude, at 220.3 K ambient temperature, at 116 % relative 302 humidity over ice (RHi, see Figure 1), with mean ambient wind shear of 0.0023 s⁻¹ and Brunt-303 Väisälä frequency of 0.013 s⁻¹. The computed RHi pdf is similar to observations [*Immler et* 304 al., 2008]. The global mean contrail temperature (-53.1°C) is about 5 to 10 K below the mean 305 threshold temperature for contrail formation, and close to the values of -52°C deduced for 306 contrails over the USA from day and night observations by Bedka et al. [2013], and -54.6°C 307 at cloud top deduced by Iwabuchi et al. [2012]. 308

309 c. Contrail properties

CoCiP computes that there are about 3100 contrail segments of 36 km mean length present at 310 a time on average within the CAM atmosphere. A total of 3×10^7 contrail segments are 311 simulated per year. For given shear, stratification, and plume scales, the mean diffusivity 312 values are 14 and 120 m² s⁻¹ in vertical and horizontal directions. The contrails spread to 8 km 313 mean width and 1 km mean total depth, with large variability. We define two results for the 314 315 depth. The total depth describes the vertical variance of contrail properties in the Gaussian plume model; the effective depth is the ratio of cross-section area to contrail width 316 [Schumann, 2012]. The latter is smaller because shear causes a horizontally inclined and 317 elongated cross-section. 318

- The aircraft emit on average 5.3×10^{12} m⁻¹ soot particles per flight distance. The contrails
- contain about 3×10^{12} m⁻¹ of ice particles per flight distance. Hence, about 56 % of the ice
- 321 particles survive wake, aggregation, and turbulent losses in the model. The ice water content
- 322 (IWC) in contrails (and cirrus) correlates with ambient temperature and ambient relative
- humidity [*Schiller et al.*, 2008]. Figure 2 compares the pdf of computed IWC with the
- approximate IWC/(mg m⁻³) = exp(6.97 + 0.103 T/°C) [Schumann, 2002]. This
- parameterization was used, e.g., by *Chen and Gettelman* [2013] to compute the contrail IWC;
- it gives reasonable estimates for the mean but underestimates IWC variability.

On average, the IWC in contrails is found to be equivalent to an amount of water vapor at

relative humidity over ice of about 15 %. This value is consistent with the mean RHi in the

ambient air. A growing contrail may contain less ice water and a shrinking contrail more ice

330 water than this mean value. Hence, as shown in Figure 1, long-lived contrails also exist in

subsaturated air, as observed [Kübbeler et al., 2011; Iwabuchi et al., 2012; Kaufmann et al.,

332 2014].

The total mean and median values of contrail properties per unit length vary over several 333 orders of magnitude; see Table 3. The values are averages over all contrail segments without 334 accounting for contrail overlap. The median values are smaller than the mean values which 335 are controlled by a few very thick old contrails. The ice mass per flight distance values (6-50 336 kg/m) is of a magnitude similar to LES results [Unterstrasser and Gierens, 2010b; Lewellen, 337 2014]. The integral numbers of Table 3 can be used to compute global mean contrail air 338 density, ice water content, ice particle size, optical depth, geometrical depth, extinction 339 coefficient etc. For example, the ratio of volume per distance divided by the mean width (area 340 per distance) defines an effective contrail depth (mean ~800 m, median ~400 m, ½-h-mean 341 145 m). The ratio of ice water mass to emission water mass is about 180 for young (age < 0.5342 h) contrails, 1800 in the median, and $\sim 1.8 \times 10^6$ in the mean of these simulations. The ratio is 343 close to one in the wake vortex phase [Vay et al., 1998] or sublimating contrails. For old 344 contrails in ice supersaturated air, the ratio may be far larger than found by *Knollenberg* 345

[1972], who measured in a contrail 18 min after generation. The maximum values are limited

by the number and mass of the largest ice particles relative to the mass of H_2O emissions.

Because of nearly constant ice number per flight distance but variable plume cross-section, 348 the volume concentration n_{ice} varies from more than 100 cm⁻³ in young contrails to less than 1 349 L⁻¹ in aged contrails, see Figure 2. The mean value depends strongly on how the average is 350 defined. When averaging linearly over all contrail segments (many stay narrow), we obtain a 351 high mean value of n_{ice} of 86 cm⁻³. When counting all contrail ice particles globally and 352 dividing by the total volume (segment length × cross-section area) of all contrail segments, 353 we find that the volume is huge and dominated by the wide old contrails. Hence, this mean 354 value of n_{ice} is far smaller (0.4 cm⁻³). 355

The mean volume radius varies over a large range, from about half a micrometer to half a

millimeter, see Figure 2. The lower bound results from the water mass and the number of soot

particles nucleating ice in fresh contrails. The upper size limit is determined by sedimentation.

The fall speed reaches values of order 0.5 m s⁻¹ for particle radii exceeding 100 μ m; the

average fall speed is 0.0026 m s⁻¹. Particles sedimenting in supersaturated air may grow 360 quickly. The linear arithmetic mean particle radius rvol is 14 µm. The median value of rvol is 361 smaller (9 µm). These sizes are representative for young and narrow contrails. Alternatively, 362 we compute a volume mean radius of the ensemble of all contrails from the total contrail ice 363 volume divided by the total number of contrail ice particles, and likewise an effective radius 364 from the ratio of total vertically projected particle cross-section area divided by total particle 365 volume, following common definitions, [McFarquhar and Heymsfield, 1998]. This results in 366 far larger integral mean sizes: $r_{vol}=27 \mu m$ and $r_{eff}=35 \mu m$. These large integral values are 367 dominated by the aged contrails with largest volume. 368

These particle sizes appear far larger than usually assumed for linear contrails. Bedka et al. 369

[2013] found an average particle effective radius of 9 µm in MODIS satellite data. Larger 370

mean particle sizes have been observed for contrail cirrus, 20-25 um [Minnis et al., 2013]. 371

The remote sensing methods may underestimate the particle sizes because the largest particles 372

may have fallen (e.g., in fall streaks) below a level visible to remote sensing from space. 373

The optical depth τ of contrails may be computed locally as a function of the particle cross-374 section πr_{area}^2 (with $r_{area}^2 = r_{vol}^3 / r_{eff}$ [Schumann et al., 2011b]), volume specific number

concentration n_{ice}, and the effective geometrical depth of the contrail plume. For various 376

contrail segments, τ varies strongly; see Figure 2; τ is large for young contrails because of 377

many ice particles grown by uptake of ambient humidity in narrow plumes with large depths. 378

This can be seen from observations and models [Voigt et al., 2011; Jeßberger et al., 2013]. 379

Later, τ may grow in rising air masses with increasing humidity but generally decreases and 380 approaches zero while the contrails spread laterally and finally sublimate. The pdf of $\log \tau$ has 381

a negative skewness: a few contrails get thick while most have small τ ; some are subvisible. 382

The same type of asymmetry in the pdf of log τ has been simulated by *Kärcher and Burkhardt* 383

[2013] for contrails and measured by Immler et al. [2008] for contrail-cirrus. The global mean 384

optical depth τ is 0.29, which is close to observed values [Voigt et al., 2011]. The global mean 385

value is slightly larger than the value for linear contrails derived by *Bedka et al.* [2013] from 386

MODIS (0.19-0.26). Contrails detected with an Automatic Contrail Tracking Algorithm 387

(ACTA) from Meteosat observations by Vázquez-Navarro et al. [2015] have very similar 388

optical thickness, mean: 0.34, median: 0.24. 389

375

The RF induced by contrail segments varies strongly, see Figure 3. In rough agreement with 390

observations [Vázquez-Navarro et al., 2015], individual contrail segments may cause local RF 391

values per contrail area (segment width \times length) exceeding 60 W m⁻², with mean values of 392

order 10 W m⁻². The frequent zero SW RF values result from nighttime contrails. The local

net RF may be positive or negative and far larger than the mean value. *Vázquez-Navarro et al.*

[2015] found larger mean values because their method mainly detects geometrically and

optically thick contrails. The shape of the SW and LW RF pdf's is similar to theory

397 predictions [*Kärcher and Burkhardt*, 2013], but negative RF values were not expected in that

398 study.

The age of the simulated contrails varies between a few minutes and 36 h. The mean age is 399 computed as the arithmetic mean of all contrail segment ages. The computed mean contrail 400 age is about 2 h. The contrail ages tend to increase for decreasing ambient humidity (run 1 401 compared to run 0) because of reduced sedimentation for lower humidity. The upper limit of 402 36 h is reached only 18 times globally in 30-years simulations. Ages of individual contrails 403 exceeding 10 h occur rarely, see Figure 4 (the pdf is generated from a 3 % subsample of 1-404 vear simulation data, hence, misses the few contrails with the upper limit age of 36 h). The 405 lifetimes are within the range of results derived with ACTA from Meteosat contrail 406 observations by Vázquez-Navarro et al. [2015]. 407

The lifetimes depend among other things on vertical motions in the ambient air. In the model, 408 the contrails experience larger mean uplift (100 m) than subsidence (74 m). Plume-spreading 409 in ambient ice supersaturated air causes ice particle growth, because the same ice particles 410 share in a growing amount of humidity. Sinking air warms adiabatically so that contrails 411 sublimate. Rising air tends to increase relative humidity. Strong adiabatic uplift may cause 412 strong growth of the ice particles so that they may start sedimenting and precipitate in fall 413 streaks. Hence, quickly rising contrails may have shorter lifetimes than slowly rising ones. All 414 these properties are consistent with findings from LES and observations [Iwabuchi et al., 415 2012; Lewellen, 2014]. 416

417 *d. Comparison with a theoretical concept for sedimentation influence on optical depth*

An important metric for contrail radiative properties as a whole, independent of the definition 418 of contrail width W or contrail depth D, is the total projected surface area S of all contrail ice 419 particles per unit contrail length, $S = N_{ice} \pi r_{area}^2$, where N_{ice} is the number of ice particles per 420 contrail length and πr_{area}^2 is the mean effective projected cross-section of the ice particles 421 422 [Schumann et al., 2011b; Lewellen et al., 2014; Lewellen, 2014]. (Mean values are listed in Table 3.) The importance of S can be seen from the fact that the optical depth τ of contrails is 423 $\tau = Q_{ext}$ S/W, where Q_{ext} is the mean extinction efficiency and W the effective width of the 424 contrail. The product $W\tau = Q_{ext} S$ is known as total extinction and is important for radiative 425

forcing of a contrail at a time [Unterstrasser and Gierens, 2010b]. Hence, τ does depend on 426 the width W and its definition, but W cancels when computing the global radiative forcing 427 RF, which is the sum of all contrail segment RF values weighted with contrail length and 428 width divided by the Earth surface. The value of S versus contrail age is plotted in Figure 5. 429 We see S increasing with contrail age for the first 2 hours and then approaching a constant 430 which is about 10^2 to 10^4 m² m⁻¹ in these simulations. S decreases for aged contrails in spite of 431 increasing contrail width. The magnitude of Qext S agrees with observations [Vázquez-432 Navarro et al., 2015]. The initial growth comes from particle growth in ice supersaturated air. 433 Later values are limited because large particles sediment quickly [Schumann, 1996]. Lewellen 434 [2014] noted the importance of the integral $\int S(t) dt$ over the contrail life-time as a measure for 435 the total climate impact of the contrail. This integral has similarities with the energy forcing 436 which we discussed elsewhere [Schumann et al., 2012a]. Since we did not save the integral 437 value in our simulations, we approximate the integral by S $t_{age}/2$. The results show that $\int S dt$ 438 approaches asymptotic values of order 10^8 m s for old contrails. The values are close to those 439 reported by Lewellen [2014] from LES of contrails with particle-size resolving microphysics. 440 He showed that the integral S relates to fall speed and the sedimentation depth Δz_{sed} by $\int S dt$ 441 $\cong \alpha N_{ice} \Delta z_{sed}$, where $\alpha = 18 \pi \eta/(g \rho_{ice})$ is a parameter resulting from the Stokes law for the 442 particle terminal fall velocity ($\eta \approx 14 \times 10^{-6}$ kg m⁻¹ s⁻¹ is the dynamic viscosity of air, $\rho_{ice} \approx 917$ 443 kg m⁻³ is the bulk density of ice, g= gravity). The sedimentation depth Δz_{sed} was computed 444 within CoCiP for each contrail segment. Figure 5 shows that the CoCiP results are roughly 445 consistent with the theory. The results illustrate the important link between the optical 446 properties of contrails and ice particle sedimentation in ice supersaturated air. The scatter 447 around the mean 1:1 correlation indicates that the effective S values depend also on other 448 parameters: Lewellen [2014] noted the importance of the depth of the ice supersaturated layer 449 below flight levels. In addition, we have non-steady and spatially variable meteorology, and 450 size-dependent fall speeds differing from the Stokes law. We see that the essential physics of 451 contrail optical depth formation as simulated by CoCiP is similar to LES results. 452

453 e. Comparison of contrail properties with observations from space

In addition to the comparisons mentioned, we compare the computed contrail properties with
satellite observations. *Iwabuchi et al.* [2012] used satellite pictures (MODIS) to identify linear
contrails and derived their altitude and thickness from collocated space lidar (CALIPSO)
observations. The method was applied for the domain 15-85°N and 180°W - 80°E, see Figure
6. Contrails were detected mainly over the North Atlantic. Although we find a larger share of

contrails over the continents, the vertical distribution of the contrails versus latitude in the 459 model is similar to that observed, see Figure 7. Some of the simulated (and observed) 460 contrails at low latitudes rise above 14 km altitude, above the maximum flight levels where 461 contrails form (13.1 km). This is a consequence of rising air masses as occurring in the tropics 462 over continents [*Pauluis et al.*, 2008]. The computed mean contrail altitude (10.5 ± 1.2 km) is 463 slightly lower than observed (10.9 ± 1 km). Some of the low-level contrails may result over 464 continents from aircraft during ascent or descent. Others may occur below thick high-level 465 clouds and be missed by lidar observations. 466

Figure 8 shows that the pdf of optical depth from CoCiP is close to that derived from MODIS 467

and CALIPSO. The differences between the model results for run 1 and 0 are significant but 468 comparable to the differences between the measurements in the two years (with slightly

different lidar properties [Iwabuchi et al., 2012]). Figure 9 compares the computed and 470

observed width and vertical geometrical depth of contrails. We note the large scatter of the 471

data. Perhaps, CoCiP slightly overestimates the total depth. The effective depth appears to fit 472

the observations better. The contrail width pdf (not shown) is a maximum at zero width and 473 decreases exponentially with 5 km median and 8.1 km mean width. The width range of ACTA 474

contrails is more limited (7.8±2 km) [Vázquez-Navarro et al., 2015]. 475

469

Figure 10 compares the difference in the diurnal cycle of cirrus cover and outgoing longwave 476 radiation (OLR) between the North Atlantic region (NAR, 45°-55°N, 10°-45°W), and a 477 corresponding South Atlantic Region (SAR, 45°-55°S, 10°-45°W) from the model with 478 results from 8 years of satellite observations. Cirrus cloud cover [Ewald et al., 2013] and 479 outgoing longwave radiation [Vázquez-Navarro et al., 2013] data were derived from Meteosat 480 Second Generation (MSG) infrared satellite observations. The anomalies have zero mean 481 values. Air traffic density in the SAR is practically zero while traffic in the NAR shows a 482 systematic double-wave diurnal cycle [Graf et al., 2012]. Anomalies of cirrus cloud cover and 483 OLR differences between NAR and SAR from MSG show similar patterns with 2-4 h delay. 484 This "aviation fingerprint" was used to quantify aviation induced cirrus changes [Graf et al., 485 2012; Schumann and Graf, 2013]. The delay can be interpreted as the time it takes to let ice 486 particles grow (see Figure 5) and spread from fresh contrails to extended cirrus cover. The 487 results suggest that contrail cirrus contribute about 2 % of cirrus cover and about 1 W m⁻² of 488 radiative forcing in this region. The diurnal cycle from the sum of CoCiP contrail cover and 489 CAM cirrus cover and corresponding longwave radiances is consistent in shape and amplitude 490

with the MSG results. They agree approximately also with results from the offline CoCiPECMWF combination in *Schumann and Graf* [2013].

Also, the interannual variability of the MSG results is comparable in magnitude to the
variability in the CoCiP results. This suggests that CoCiP simulates most of the processes
controlling this contrail cirrus signal. The ratio of regional LW RF to global LW RF (see
Table 2) is 6.12 and 6.13 in runs 0 and 1, respectively. The ratio was 5.71 in the previous
study with ECMWF meteorology. This ratio was used to extrapolate the regional LW RF to
the global RF. Hence, the coupling does not change the main conclusions from earlier CoCiP

499 studies.

500 We looked for a local response of cirrus cover and OLR to dehydration following the diurnal

traffic cycle. The results from CAM do not reflect such a diurnal cycle. Different time scales

of contrail cirrus and dehydration effects would be important when discussing mitigation

options. Also *Chen and Gettelman* [2013] computed a far smaller amplitude of a double-wave

diurnal cycle in global model results of LW RF for this region than observed. Hence, the
dehydration effects of the contrails within CAM are either slow or not large enough to excite
a semi-diurnal cycle. Note that most contrails are thinner than 1 km. Perhaps the coarse CAM

grid cells (about 1 km \times 180 km \times 220 km) smooth out any local response of cirrus to

508 dehydration.

509 *f.* Some global contrail properties

510 Figure 11 shows the annual mean global cirrus and contrail cover. The mean cirrus cover computed in these simulations in CAM is 40 %. The value of cloud cover depends critically on the 511 method used, and is specified here as a function of assumed probability density function of 512 supersaturation within each grid (Wang and Penner, 2010). The result is roughly consistent with a 513 range of satellite observations of thin and opaque high-level clouds [Stubenrauch et al., 2013]. The 514 mean contrail cover with optical depth τ >0.1 is nearly 100 times smaller: 0.50 %. Maximum 515 values of up to 12 % are computed for high-traffic regions in North America and Europe. The 516 mean product width \times length $\times \tau$ of all individual contrail segments divided by the Earth 517

- surface area is 0.29 %.
- The global contrail cover estimated in early assessments was below 0.1% [*Sausen et al.*, 1998;
- 520 Penner et al., 1999]. The computed contrail cover is about 5 times larger than derived from
- 521 linear contrails in satellite data [*Palikonda et al.*, 2005; *Meyer et al.*, 2007]. More recent
- observation results are larger [Minnis et al., 2013]. Burkhardt and Kärcher [2009] and
- 523 *Frömming et al.* [2011] show that the computed contrail cover depends strongly on the

- assumed threshold value of optical depth used to discriminate contrails from clear sky. *Rap et*
- 525 *al.* [2010b] estimated the global mean annual linear contrail coverage for air traffic of the year
- 526 2002 to be approximately 0.11 %. *Burkhardt and Kärcher* [2011] reported a contrail cirrus
- cover for year 2002 of about 0.23 %. *Schumann and Graf* [2013] for year 2006 computed a
- global mean cover of 0.23 %. The differences of the present study from previous results using
- 529 CoCiP come mainly from the larger soot number emission index $(10^{15} \text{ kg}^{-1} \text{ instead of})$
- $\sim 3.5 \times 10^{14} \text{ kg}^{-1}$). For a factor 2 increase of the soot emission index, we computed increases of
- visible contrail cover by 1.29, contrail age by 1.16, contrail width by 1.22, contrail
- geometrical depth by 1.14, and net contrail RF of 1.64 [*Schumann et al.*, 2013].
- As described above, we compute contrail RF defined by the difference in net incoming
- radiative fluxes at top of the atmosphere with and without contrails. The longwave (LW) part
- of this RF is always positive and warming, the shortwave (SW) part is negative and cooling,
- the net effect (sum of LW and SW RF) is often small compared to the LW forcing, and may
- be positive or negative locally. The global RF distribution is shown in Figure 12. The net RF
- reaches maximum values of more than 1 W m^{-2} locally over North America and Europe. The
- mean values are 0.584 \pm 0.045 Wm⁻² over mid Europe (10°W-20°E, 40°N-55°N) and
- 540 0.410 ± 0.018 W m⁻² over continental USA (65°W-130°W, 25°N-55°N). For run 1, CoCiP
- 541 computes a global mean net RF of 0.063 W m⁻² (LW: 0.14 W m⁻², SW: -0.08 W m⁻²). The
- annual mean net RF is positive everywhere on the globe. The global mean LW RF value is 12
- ⁵⁴³% larger than computed by CoCiP with ECMWF data [*Schumann and Graf*, 2013], mainly
- 544 because of the larger soot emission index.
- 545 The computed RF values are far larger than those estimated previously for linear contrails
- 546 [*Minnis et al.*, 1999; *Rap et al.*, 2010b; *Frömming et al.*, 2011; *Yi et al.*, 2012; *Chen and*
- 547 *Gettelman*, 2013; *Spangenberg et al.*, 2013], 5 times larger than the value estimated for
- contrail cirrus for the same traffic by *Chen and Gettelman* [2013], and nearly double the value
- estimated with a global contrail cirrus model for traffic of the year 2002 by *Burkhardt and*
- 550 *Kärcher* [2011].
- 551 As indicated, some of the comparisons point to possible overestimates of contrail cover and
- optical thickness by CoCiP. This would imply overestimates of SW and LW RF. As in
- previous CoCiP studies, the magnitude of the computed SW/LW ratio is quite large (0.56).
- 554 This SW/LW ratio varies between 0.2 and 0.8 in the literature [*Haywood et al.*, 2009; *Myhre*
- 555 *et al.*, 2009; Yi et al., 2012; Minnis et al., 2013; Schumann and Graf, 2013; Vázquez-Navarro
- *et al.*, 2015]. The ratio may get even larger for small ice particles and higher contrail

temperatures [Meerkötter et al., 1999; Zhang et al., 1999]. For fixed LW RF, a smaller 557 SW/LW ratio would imply a larger net RF value. Besides on contrail life times and diurnal 558 variations, the RF values depend on the radiances without contrails, cloud temperatures, ice 559 water path, optical ice particle properties, cloud overlap, and 3-D effects [Meerkötter et al., 560 1999; Markowicz and Witek, 2011; De Leon et al., 2012; Forster et al., 2012; Yi et al., 2012]. 561 Hence, the net RF may be both larger and smaller than 0.06 W m⁻². Correct modelling of the 562 optical properties may be more important than correct modelling of humidity exchange. Note 563 that the reported net RF includes only the contrail effects. Contributions from dehydration in 564 CAM are discussed below. 565

566 **3.1.2 Impact of changed background meteorology on contrail properties**

Figure 13 depicts the annual and zonal mean emissions of water from aircraft engines into the 567 atmosphere, either directly (EA) or into contrails (EC). The figure also depicts the water 568 released from contrails, CA. As explained above, the contrails take water from engine 569 emissions and from background humidity in ice-supersaturated air masses (negative CA) and 570 release water when sublimating in subsaturated air (positive CA). Since the amount of H₂O 571 taken from ambient air is far larger than the emission, we find negative "emissions" in the CA 572 field of H₂O at flight levels, and large positive values further down. The negative CA at flight 573 levels in the upper troposphere implies dehydration and the positive CA lower down implies 574 hydration contributions. For steady climate, the annual mean of CA becomes equal to EC, the 575 amount of H₂O entering young contrails. Here the total budget is the result of the uptake of 576 water by contrail minus the release and these exchanges are far larger than the net emissions. 577

The H₂O mass inventory in contrails amounts to 32 Tg for run 1, which is large; it 578 corresponds to 14 % of the annual aviation H_2O mass emissions. The young contrails (age < 579 0.5 h) contain 2.5 % of this mass (Table 3). The total ice mass content in all young contrails at 580 a given time is 7.4×10^8 kg. *Chen and Gettelman* [2013] estimated this to be about 1×10^7 kg; 581 the large difference may explain different RF values. The mean emission altitude from 582 engines into atmosphere z is derived from an integral $z_{EC} = \int z \, dm / \int dm$, where dm is the local 583 EC mass contribution. The value z_{EC} defines a mean contrail formation altitude. This altitude 584 is 10.9 km in run 1. The corresponding altitude of water release to the atmosphere z_{CA} is 700 585 m lower. For a mean contrail age of 2 h, this corresponds to a mean fall speed of 0.1 m s^{-1} , 586 which appears reasonable for the particle sizes computed. Perhaps the fall time has to be 587 added to the time of contrail formation and spreading to obtain the time scale of cirrus 588

- changes, so that the total time-scale may reach half a day. This may further explain why the
 semi-diurnal cycle in the NAR does not show up in the CAM results in Figure 10.
- 591 Contrail formation reduces ambient humidity locally (Figure 1) with the consequence of
- 592 getting fewer or thinner contrails (Figure 2), which are slightly longer living (Figure 4).
- 593 Contrail ice particle sedimentation brings humidity to lower levels. Even without
- sedimentation, contrails in subsiding air sublimate at lower levels. Contrails in rising air
- 595 masses occur often because relative humidity increases from adiabatic cooling. Hence, some
- hydration occurs at higher levels but does not show up in the longitudinal mean values.
- 597 The effect of humidity exchange on contrails and the background atmosphere can be
- quantified by comparing mean results of runs 0 and 1, see Table 2. The contrails in the
- quantified by comparing mean results of runs of and 1, see Tuble 2. The contrains in the
- coupled model run 1 have 5 % more ice particles, but 29 % less ice water content, and 23 %
- smaller effective radius than in run 0. The total H_2O mass inventory changes by 39 %. So the
- 601 coupling effect is important. The contrails have 14 % lower optical depth and 5 % larger age.
- They live longer because the smaller ice particles sediment more slowly. The change in the
- net radiative forcing, from ~0.07 to ~0.06 W m⁻², is comparably small, about 14 %.

604 **3. 2 CAM Results**

605 3.2.1 Normal Traffic Emissions

The redistribution of water by contrails in the atmosphere should have strongest effects on 606 humidity in the background atmosphere at northern mid-latitudes, where most contrails form. 607 For normal traffic, the CAM results show only small changes. The run 1 - 0 differences are 608 small compared to the interannual variability in the atmosphere, see Figure 14. In order to 609 understand this, we estimate the order of magnitude of the source rate required to cause an 610 appreciable change in background humidity. A background humidity mass concentration of 611 order 100 ppm and a life time of order 10 days (a 1 month life time cannot be excluded 612 [Forster et al., 2003]) corresponds to a background humidity source of order 100 ppm/10 d \cong 613 10^{-10} s⁻¹ or 3×10^{-4} /month. In the zonal and annual mean (Figure 12), the source rates from 614 contrail sublimation (CA) amounts to 10^{-5} month⁻¹ at maximum. Hence, the humidity 615 contributions from contrails are more than a factor of 30 smaller in magnitude than natural 616 water sources, apparently too small to be visible in 30-year climate mean values. 617

- Radiative forcing should respond strongly to humidity and cloud changes in the troposphere
- and the lower stratosphere [*Chen et al.*, 2000; *Riese et al.*, 2012]. Figure 15 shows the RF
- 620 computed from the difference in run 1-run 0. The interannual RF standard deviations are 0.2-

- 0.3 W m^{-2} . The interannual changes are smaller than the variability of top-of-the atmosphere
- radiances derived from satellites and from atmospheric-ocean climate models [*Kato*, 2009;
- 523 Stephens et al., 2015] and similar to the variability in CAM5 [Zhou and Penner, 2014], but far
- larger than the variability (<0.1 W m⁻²) of nudged models [*Chen and Gettelman*, 2013].
- Assuming N-2 independent results from N=30 years of simulations, the standard error is $\sqrt{28}$
- smaller, about 0.05 W m⁻². Hence, the mean LW RF is practically zero, and the SW and net
- 627 RF values are mostly positive, but only weakly significant. A positive net RF could not be
- explained with reduced cirrus clouds [*Burkhardt and Kärcher*, 2011].

The annual mean RF values vary from year to year and show significant correlations with other annual and global mean diagnostics from CAM. Figure 16 shows strong correlations of RF with liquid water path and with low-level cloud cover. For SW RF, the correlation with low cloud cover is stronger than with high-level cloud cover. Hence, the interannual variability in RF appears to be linked mainly to the variability in low-level cloudiness.

634 **3.2.2 Enhanced Traffic Emissions**

In order to increase the signal-to-noise ratio in the CAM simulations, we consider run 2 with 635 100 times enhanced traffic emissions. The increased traffic emissions are implemented in 636 CoCiP using the same number of flights but 100 times larger fuel consumption, implying 100 637 times larger water mass and soot number emissions. This causes large changes in the contrail 638 properties, see Table 4. We see 94 times larger number of ice particles per unit length, and 6 639 times larger ice particle number volume concentration, but 60 % less specific ice water 640 content. Hence, as expected, e.g., from Unterstrasser and Gierens [2010a], the increased soot 641 emission causes far more contrail ice particles while the enhanced water emissions are less 642 important. Moreover, CoCiP computes doubled mean contrail life time, 4 times larger optical 643 644 depth, 8 times more contrail cover, and about 14 times larger net contrail RF.

645 CAM does not see the soot but sees changes in water emissions CA (with a small contribution

- from EA). CoCiP computes about ten times larger contrail ice water mass inventory, and
- about the same sedimentation depth. Figure 13 (lower panels) shows the distributions of the
- 648 effective emissions CA for runs 1 and 2. We find similar distributions with about 10 times
- larger CA values in run 2. The ratios of the maximum, minimum, and global mean rms values
- of CA in runs 2 and 1 are 12.4, 9.8 and 12.9, respectively. Hence, the water inventory and the
- exchange between contrails and background atmosphere in run 2 is about ten times larger than
- 652 in run 1.

- Figure 14 shows that the mean humidity profile responds to the changed water exchange
- 654 significantly. The contrails cause a global dehydration mainly of the tropopause region
- 655 (including the lower stratosphere) and a local increase of humidity in the mid troposphere
- below the main flight levels at Northern mid-latitudes. The global mean humidity is
- decreasing. Hence, the redistribution of humidity by contrails changes the entire hydrological
- 658 cycle.
- Figure 17 plots the RF of dehydration derived by CAM from run 1 0 differences as a
- 660 function of contrail ice water inventory, which is used as a measure for the change in water
- exchange CA. The mean values are compared in Table 5. For run 2, the RF values are
- computed from one-year mean of run 2 and 30 annual mean values of run 0. The standard
- deviation from 30 years of run 2 might be a factor of $\sqrt{2}$ larger.
- The mean SW and LW RF results are significant at the 95 % level for enhanced fuel
- consumption. SW RF is positive in this case, suggesting that dehydration reduces cloud cover,
- both in the upper and lower atmosphere, causing lower Earth albedo and, hence, warming the
 atmosphere. LW RF is negative (cooling), which would be consistent with reduced cloud
 cover and reduced water vapor in the cold tropopause region. The net RF values are small and
 have different signs in runs 1 and 2.
- Table 5 shows that dehydration by contrails causes significant changes of CAM mean values
- for enhanced emissions. We find reduced cloud cover and reduced water path in all phases.
- All of these changes are consistent with a causal impact of humidity redistribution by
- contrails on the hydrological cycle. The results suggest that ice particles sedimenting from
- 674 contrails transport humidity downwards causing low-level cloud changes. The added humidity
- at lower levels may enhance liquid water content and cloud droplet sizes and, hence,
- precipitation. The available diagnostics do not allow us to decide whether the Wegener-
- Findeisen-Bergeron process acts and contributes to ice particle growth from evaporating cloud
- droplets, thereby enhancing precipitation.
- Low-level cloud changes by aviation aerosol have been found before [*Righi et al.*, 2013], but
- such effects from dehydration have not been reported before. The SW plus LW clear sky RF
- (see Table 5), mainly from reduced water vapor path, is of opposite sign and far larger in
- magnitude than the RF from aviation water emissions without contrail formation (about 0.001
- $W \text{ m}^{-2}$, [*Wilcox et al.*, 2012]), even when scaling the run 2 values by factors 10 to 100.
- Interpolating linearly in the ice mass inventories (Figure 17) suggests that the magnitudes of
- the SW and LW RF components of the dehydration effects for nominal traffic are about 0.04

- $W m^{-2}$. Because of the different signs of the SW and LW contributions, the net RF from
- dehydration is smaller, and not much different from the -0.007 W m^{-2} result estimated by
- *Burkhardt and Kärcher* [2011]. Hence, the dehydration may reduce the RF from contrails, but
- slightly. Our best estimate for the total net RF stays within the range 0.04-0.08 W m^{-2}
- estimated earlier [Schumann and Graf, 2013].
- 691

692 4 Conclusions

This paper studied the effects of contrails from aviation on the redistribution of humidity in 693 the atmosphere. For this purpose, we coupled the contrail model CoCiP with the climate 694 695 model CAM3+/IMPACT (CAM). The contrail model simulates all the individual contrails forming from global air traffic for meteorological conditions as defined by the climate model. 696 The climate model simulates aerosol-cloud processes in the global atmosphere. The coupled 697 model simulates the exchange of humidity between background atmosphere and contrails and 698 the resultant changes in the atmosphere, including cloudiness and the atmospheric part of the 699 hydrological cycle. The results are from two major model runs with and without contrail 700 701 water exchange, running hourly over 30 years. In addition, the coupled model was run with enhanced air traffic emissions for one year. 702

703 The major findings are as follows:

• The mean contrail ensemble properties are as expected from present understanding and consistent with available observations.

The computed optical depth values are close to those observed by lidar and satellites
 from space.

In agreement with previous studies, the optical properties of the contrails are strongly
 linked to ice particle sedimentation in ice supersaturated air.

• In the coupled model, contrail water content may be 10^3 to 10^6 times larger than the amount of H₂O emitted. About 3000 contrail segments are active at any time on average.

Contrail growth causes dehydration at flight levels, the large ice particles sediment, on
 average by 700 m, eventually sublimate and hydrate the atmosphere at lower levels. In rising
 air masses, hydration occurs locally at higher levels.

• The drying at flight levels changes mean contrail properties by +5 to -30 %: Contrails become thinner and with larger mean age. Net contrail RF is reduced by ~ 15 % from ~ 0.07 to ~ 0.06 W m⁻².

• The model simulates a diurnal cycle of cirrus properties in the North Atlantic which reflects the diurnal cycle of air traffic in that region and which is close to that observed by satellites. Dehydration-driven diurnal-cycle cirrus-changes in the global model were not detectable.

• The total dehydration RF is too small to be computed for nominal emissions because of climate noise in the freely running atmosphere climate model (interannual RF standard deviations about 0.2 W m⁻²).

• Scaling the fuel consumption by 100 shows significant changes. The contrails respond strongly to the increases in soot emissions causing a larger ice mass inventory in contrails and stronger water exchange between contrails and the background atmosphere. The larger contrail water exchange drives significant mean dehydration effects in the global atmosphere.

• Based on these simulations, the redistribution of water by contrails causes negative LW RF because of reduced humidity near the tropopause (opposite sign and far larger than RF from aviation water emissions without contrails) and positive SW from reduced cloud cover, with magnitudes for normal traffic likely less than ± 0.04 W m⁻². The net dehydration effect is estimated to be about -0.01 W m⁻². The sum of contrail and dehydration net RF stays within the range 0.04-0.08 W m⁻² derived for contrail cirrus from earlier studies.

In the global model, dehydration impacts the entire hydrological system, including
 high and low-level clouds. Both liquid and ice water paths and cloud cover of low and high level clouds are reduced.

The quantitative results are sensitive to model details. For example, the sedimentation is only 738 crudely simulated with CoCiP because the details depend on the particle size spectrum which 739 is not resolved in CoCiP. Possibly, the simulated contrails are slightly thicker than expected 740 741 from the observations. Thinner contrails would appear, e.g., for a smaller effective soot emission index. As a whole, the comparisons with observations show that the coupled model 742 provides results in reasonable agreement with observations. This is a positive indicator not 743 only for the quality of CoCiP but also the quality of the input fields provided by CAM, in 744 particular with respect to ice supersaturation which is crucial to the prediction of long-lived 745 contrails. 746

This paper discussed the effects of water exchange between contrails and ambient air. Aircraft aerosols from aircraft engines emissions, possibly changed in contrails, may also impact the entire hydrological cycle, and might be studied with an extension of this model in the future.

750

Author contribution. J.P. and U.S. designed research and wrote the paper. U.S., Y.C., C.Z.,
and K.G. coded the programs and data analysis and discussed the results.

753

- Acknowledgements. This research was supported by the Federal Aviation Administration
- (FAA) within the ACCRI project, and by DLR within the DLR-projects CATS and WeCare.
- J. E. Penner, Y. Chen and C. Zhou also acknowledge funding from National Science
- Foundation (NSF). Computing resources (ark:/85065/d7wd3xhc) were provided by the
- 758 Climate Simulation Laboratory at NCAR's Computational and Information Systems
- Laboratory, sponsored by the NSF and other agencies.
- 760

761 References

- Atlas, D., Z. Wang, and D. P. Duda (2006), Contrails to cirrus Morphology, microphysics,
 and radiative properties, *J. Appl. Meteorol. Clim.*, 45, 5-19, doi: 10.1175/JAM2325.1.
- Bedka, S. T., P. Minnis, D. P. Duda, T. L. Chee, and R. Palikonda (2013), Properties of linear
- contrails in the Northern Hemisphere derived from 2006 Aqua MODIS observations,

766 *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 40, 772-777, doi:10.1029/2012GL054363.

- Boucher, O., D. Randall, P. Artaxo, C. Bretherton, G. Feingold, P. Forster, V.-M. Kerminen,
- Y. Kondo, H. Liao, U. Lohmann, P. Rasch, S. K. Satheesh, S. Sherwood, B. Stevens, and
- X. Y. Zhang (2013), Clouds and Aerosols., in *Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science*
- 770 Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the
- *Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change* edited by T. F. Stocker, et al., pp. 571-657,
- Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA.
- 773 Brasseur, G. P., R. A. Cox, D. Hauglustaine, I. Isaksen, J. Lelieveld, D. H. Lister, R. Sausen,
- U. Schumann, A. Wahner, and P. Wiesen (1998), European scientific assessment of the
 atmospheric effects of aircraft emissions, *Atmos. Env.*, *32*, 2329 2418.
- 776 Brasseur, G. P., M. Gupta, B. E. Anderson, S. Balasubramanian, S. Barrett, D. Duda, G.
- Fleming, P. M. Forster, J. Fuglestvedt, A. Gettelman, R. N. Halthore, S. D. Jacob, M. C.
- Jacobson, A. Khodayari, K.-N. Liou, M. T. Lund, R. C. Miake-Lye, P. Minnis, S. C. Olsen,
- J. E. Penner, R. Prinn, U. Schumann, H. B. Selkirk, A. Sokolov, N. Unger, P. Wolfe, H.-
- W. Wong, D. W. Wuebbles, B. Yi, P. Yang, and C. Zhou (2015), Impact of aviation on
- climate: FAA's Aviation Climate Change Research Initiative (ACCRI) Phase II, *Bull*.
- 782 Amer. Meteorol. Soc., in press, doi: 10.1175/BAMS-D-13-00089.1, 2015.
- 783 Burkhardt, U., and B. Kärcher (2009), Process-based simulation of contrail cirrus in a global
- climate model, J. Geophys. Res., 114, 1-13, doi:10.1029/2008JD011491.

- Burkhardt, U., B. Kärcher, and U. Schumann (2010), Global modelling of the contrail and
- contrail cirrus climate impact, *Bull. Amer. Meteorol. Soc.*, *91*, 479-484, DOI:
- 787 10.1175/2009BAMS2656.1.
- Burkhardt, U., and B. Kärcher (2011), Global radiative forcing from contrail cirrus, *Nature Clim. Change*, *1*, 54-58, doi: 10.1038/NCLIMATE1068.
- Chen, C.-C., and A. Gettelman (2013), Simulated radiative forcing from contrails and contrail
 cirrus, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, *13*, 12525–12536, doi:10.5194/acp-13-12525-2013.
- Chen, T., W. B. Rossow, and Y. C. Zhang (2000), Radiative effects of cloud-type variations, *J. Clim.*, *13*, 264--286.
- De Leon, R. R., Krämer, M., Lee, D. S., and Thelen, J. C. (2012), Sensitivity of radiative properties of
 persistent contrails to the ice water path, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 12 7893-7901, doi:10.5194/acp-127893-2012.
- Ewald, F., L. Bugliaro, H. Mannstein, and B. Mayer (2013), An improved cirrus detection
 algorithm MeCiDA2 for SEVIRI and its evaluation with MODIS, *Atmos. Meas. Tech.*, *6*,
 309-322, doi:10.5194/amt-6-309-2013.
- Fahey, D. W., and U. Schumann (1999), Aviation-Produced Aerosols and Cloudiness, in
- 801 Aviation and the Global Atmosphere. A Special Report of IPCC Working Groups I and III,
- edited by J. E. Penner, et al., pp. 65-120, Cambridge University Press, New York.
- 803 Forster, C., A. Stohl, P. James, and V. Thouret (2003), The residence times of aircraft
- emissions in the stratosphere using a mean emission inventory and emissions along actual
 flight tracks, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *108*, 8524, doi:10.1029/2002JD002515.
- Forster, L., C. Emde, S. Unterstrasser, and B. Mayer (2012), Effects of three-dimensional
 photon transport on the radiative forcing of realistic contrails, *J. Atmos. Sci.*, 69, 22432255, doi: 10.1175/JAS-D-11-0206.1.
- Frömming, C., M. Ponater, U. Burkhardt, A. Stenke, S. Pechtl, and R. Sausen (2011),
- 810 Sensitivity of contrail coverage and contrail radiative forcing to selected key parameters,
- *Atmos. Env.*, *45*, 1483-1490, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2010.11.033.
- Fueglistaler, S., A. E. Dessler, T. J. Dunkerton, I. Folkins, Q. Fu, and P. W. Mote (2009),
- 813 Tropical tropopause layer, *Reviews of Geophysics*, 47, RG1004, DOI:
- 814 10.1029/2008RG000267.
- Fusina, F., P. Spichtinger, and U. Lohmann (2007), Impact of ice supersaturated regions and
- thin cirrus on radiation in the midlatitudes, J. Geophys. Res., 112, D24S14,
- doi:10.1029/2007JD008449.

- Gettelman, A., and C. Chen (2013), The climate impact of aviation aerosols, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, doi: 10.1002/grl.50520.
- Graf, K., U. Schumann, H. Mannstein, and B. Mayer (2012), Aviation induced diurnal North
 Atlantic cirrus cover cycle, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, *39*, L16804, doi: 10.1029/2012GL052590.
- Haywood, J. M., R. P. Allan, J. Bornemann, P. M. Forster, P. N. Francis, S. Milton, G. Rädel,
- A. Rap, K. P. Shine, and R. Thorpe (2009), A case study of the radiative forcing of
- persistent contrails evolving into contrail-induced cirrus, J. Geophys. Res., 114, D24201,
- doi:10.1029/2009JD012650.
- Hendricks, J., B. Kärcher, and U. Lohmann (2011), Effects of ice nuclei on cirrus clouds in a
 global climate model, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *116*, D18206, 10.1029/2010JD015302.
- Heymsfield, A., D. Baumgardner, P. DeMott, P. Forster, K. Gierens, and B. Kärcher (2010),
- 829 Contrail microphysics, *Bull. Amer. Meteorol. Soc.*, *90*, 465-472, doi:
- 830 10.1175/2009BAMS2839.1.
- Heymsfield, A. J., R. P. Lawson, and G. W. Sachse (1998), Growth of ice crystals in a
 precipitating contrail, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 25, 1335-1338, DOI: 10.1029/98GL00189.
- Immler, F., R. Treffeisen, D. Engelbart, K. Krüger, and O. Schrems (2008), Cirrus, contrails,
- and ice supersaturated regions in high pressure systems at northern mid latitudes, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, *8*, 1689--1699, doi:10.5194/acp-8-1689-2008.
- Iwabuchi, H., P. Yang, K. N. Liou, and P. Minnis (2012), Physical and optical properties of
- persistent contrails: Climatology and interpretation, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *117*, D06215,
 doi:10.1029/2011JD017020.
- Jensen, E. J., O. B. Toon, L. Pfister, and H. B. Selkirk (1996), Dehydration of the upper
 troposphere and lower stratosphere by subvisible cirrus clouds near the tropical tropopause, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 23, 825–828, DOI: 10.1029/96GL00722.
- Jensen, E. J., A. S. Ackermann, D. E. Stevens, O. B. Toon, and P. Minnis (1998), Spreading
 and growth of contrails in a sheared environment., *J. Geophys. Res.*, *103*, 13,557-513,567,
 doi:10.1029/98JD02594.
- Jeßberger, P., C. Voigt, U. Schumann, I. Sölch, H. Schlager, S. Kaufmann, A. Petzold, D.
- Schäuble, and J.-F. Gayet (2013), Aircraft type influence on contrail properties, *Atmos*.
- *Chem. Phys.*, *13*, 11965-11984, DOI: 10.5194/acp-13-11965-2013.
- 848 Kärcher, B., and U. Burkhardt (2013), Effects of optical depth variability on contrail radiative
- forcing, Q. J. R. Meteorol. Soc., 139, 1658-1664, DOI:10.1002/qj.2053.

- Kato, S. (2009), Interannual variability of the global radiation budget, *J. Clim.*, 22, 48934907, DOI: 10.1175/2009JCLI2795.1.
- Kaufmann, S., C. Voigt, P. Jeßberger, T. Jurkat, H. Schlager, A. Schwarzenboeck, M.
 Klingebiel, and T. Thornberry (2014), In-situ measurements of ice saturation in young

contrails, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, *NN*, NN, doi: 10.1002/2013GL058276.

- Kienast-Sjögren, E., P. Spichtinger, and K. Gierens (2013), Formulation and test of an ice
- aggregation scheme for two-moment bulk microphysics schemes, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, *13*,
 9021-9037, doi:10.5194/acp-13-9021-2013.
- Knollenberg, R. G. (1972), Measurements of the growth of the ice budget in a persisting
 contrail, J. Atmos. Sci., 29, 1367-1374.
- Korolev, A., and I. P. Mazin (2003), Supersaturation of water vapor in clouds, *J. Atmos. Sci.*,
 60, 2957--2974.
- Kübbeler, M., M. Hildebrandt, J. Meyer, C. Schiller, T. Hamburger, T. Jurkat, A. Minikin, A.
- Petzold, M. Rautenhaus, H. Schlager, U. Schumann, C. Voigt, P. Spichtinger, J.-F. Gayet,
- C. Gourbeyre, and M. Krämer (2011), Thin and subvisible cirrus and contrails in a
- subsaturated environment, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, *11*, 5853-5865, doi:10.5194/acp-11-58532011.
- Lee, D. S., D. W. Fahey, P. M. Forster, P. J. Newton, R. C. N. Wit, L. L. Lim, B. Owen, and
 R. Sausen (2009), Aviation and global climate change in the 21st century, *Atmos. Env.*, 43,
 3520-3537, doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2009.04.024.
- Lee, D. S., G. Pitari, V. Grewe, K. Gierens, J. E. Penner, A. Petzold, M. J. Prather, U.
- Schumann, A. Bais, T. Berntsen, D. Iachetti, L. L. Lim, and R. Sausen (2010), Transport
- impacts on atmosphere and climate: Aviation, *Atmos. Env.*, 44, 4678-4734,
- doi:10.1016/j.atmosenv.2009.06.005.
- Lewellen, D. C., and W. S. Lewellen (2001), The effects of aircraft wake dynamics on
 contrail development, *J. Atmos. Sci.*, 58, 390-406.
- Lewellen, D. C. (2014), Persistent contrails and contrail cirrus. Part II: Full lifetime behavior, *J. Atmos. Sci.*, *71*, 4420-4438, DOI: 10.1175/JAS-D-13-0317.1.
- Lewellen, D. C., O. Meza, and W. W. Huebsch (2014), Persistent contrails and contrail cirrus.
- Part I: Large-eddy simulations from inception to demise, J. Atmos. Sci., 70, 4399-4419,
- B80 DOI: 10.1175/JAS-D-13-0316.1.

- 881 Mannstein, H., and U. Schumann (2005), Aircraft induced contrail cirrus over Europe,
- 882 *Meteorol. Z.*, *14*, 549 554, 10.1127/0941-2948/2005/0058.
- Markowicz, K. M., and M. Witek (2011), Sensitivity study of global contrail radiative forcing
 due to particle shape, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *116*, D23203, doi:10.1029/2011JD016345.
- McFarquhar, G. M., and A. J. Heymsfield (1998), The definition and significance of an
 effective radius for ice clouds, *J. Atmos. Sci.*, 55, 2039-2052.
- Meerkötter, R., U. Schumann, P. Minnis, D. R. Doelling, T. Nakajima, and Y. Tsushima
 (1999), Radiative forcing by contrails, *Ann. Geophysicae*, *17*, 1080-1094, doi:
 10.1007/s00585-999-1080-7.
- Meyer, R., R. Buell, C. Leiter, H. Mannstein, S. Pechtl, T. Oki, and P. Wendling (2007),
- 891 Contrail observations over Southern and Eastern Asia in NOAA/AVHRR data and
- comparisons to contrail simulations in a GCM, Int. J. Rem. Sens., 28, 2049-2069,
- doi:10.1080/01431160600641707.
- Minnis, P., D. F. Young, D. P. Garber, L. Nguyen, W. L. Smith Jr., and R. Palikonda (1998),
 Transformation of contrails into cirrus during SUCCESS, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 25, 11571160, doi:10.1029/97GL03314.
- Minnis, P., U. Schumann, D. R. Doelling, K. Gierens, and D. W. Fahey (1999), Global
 distribution of contrail radiative forcing, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 26, 1853 1856, doi:
 10.1029/1999GL900358.
- Minnis, P., S. T. Bedka, D. P. Duda, K. M. Bedka, T. Chee, J. K. Ayers, R. Palikonda, D. A.
 Spangenberg, K. V. Khlopenkov, and R. Boeke (2013), Linear contrail and contrail cirrus
 properties determined from satellite data, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 40, 3220-3226, doi:
 10.1002/grl.50569.
- Murcray, W. B. (1970), On the possibility of weather modification by aircraft contrails, *Mon Wea. Rev.*, 98, 745–748, doi: 10.1175/1520-0493(1970)098<0745:OTPOWM>2.3.CO;2
- 906 Myhre, G., M. Kvalevag, G. Rädel, J. Cook, K. P. Shine, H. Clark, F. Karcher, K. Markowicz,
- 907 A. Karda, O. Wolkenberg, Y. Balkanski, M. Ponater, P. Forster, A. Rap, and R. Rodriguez
- de Leon (2009), Intercomparison of radiative forcing calculations of stratospheric water
 vapour and contrails, *Meteorol. Z.*, *18*, 585-596, DOI 10.1127/0941-2948/2009/0411.
- 910 Naiman, A. D., S. K. Lele, and M. Z. Jacobson (2011), Large eddy simulations of contrail
- development: Sensitivity to initial and ambient conditions over first twenty minutes, J.
- 912 Geophys. Res., 116, D21208, doi:10.1029/2011JD015806.

- Palikonda, R., P. Minnis, D. P. Duda, and H. Mannstein (2005), Contrail coverage derived
- from 2001 AVHRR data over the continental United States of America and surrounding
 areas, *Meteorol. Z.*, *14*, 525-536, DOI: 10.1127/0941-2948/2005/0051.
- Pauluis, O., A. Czaja, and R. Korty (2008), The global atmospheric circulation on moist
 isentropes, *Science*, *321*, 1075-1078.
- 918 Penner, J. E., D. H. Lister, D. J. Griggs, D. J. Dokken, and M. McFarland (1999), Aviation
- 919 *and the global atmosphere A special report of IPCC working groups I and III.*
- 920 *Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*, 365 pp., Cambridge University Press.
- Penner, J. E., Y. Chen, M. Wang, and X. Liu (2009), Possible influence of anthropogenic aerosols on cirrus clouds and anthropogenic forcing, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, *9*, 879-896, 10.5194/acp-9-879-2009.
- Ponater, M., S. Marquart, R. Sausen, and U. Schumann (2005), On contrail climate
 sensitivity, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 32, L10706, 10.1029/2005gl022580.
- Rap, A., P. M. Forster, J. M. Haywood, A. Jones, and O. Boucher (2010a), Estimating the
 climate impact of linear contrails using the UK Met Office climate model, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 37, L20703, doi:10.1029/2010GL045161.
- Rap, A., P. M. Forster, A. Jones, O. Boucher, J. M. Haywood, N. Bellouin, and R. R. D. Leon
 (2010b), Parameterization of contrails in the UK Met Office Climate Model, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *115*, D10205, doi:10.1029/2009JD012443.
- Riese, M., F. Ploeger, A. Rap, B. Vogel, P. Konopka, M. Dameris, and P. Forster (2012),
- Impact of uncertainties in atmospheric mixing on simulated UTLS composition and related
 radiative effects, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *117*, D16305, doi:10.1029/2012JD017751.
- Righi, M., J. Hendricks, and R. Sausen (2013), The global impact of the transport sectors on
 atmospheric aerosol: simulations for year 2000 emissions, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, 13, 9939–
- 937 9970, doi:10.5194/acp-13-9939-2013.
- Sausen, R., K. Gierens, M. Ponater, and U. Schumann (1998), A diagnostic study of the
- global distribution of contrails. Part I: Present day climate, *Theor. Appl. Climat.*, 61, 127 -
- 940 141, doi: 10.1007/s007040050058.
- Sausen, R., I. Isaksen, D. Hauglustaine, V. Grewe, D. S. Lee, G. Myhre, M. O. Köhler, G.
- 942 Pitari, U. Schumann, F. Stordal, and C. Zerefos (2005), Aviation radiative forcing in 2000:
- 943 An update on IPCC (1999), *Meteorol. Z.*, 14, 555 561, 10.1127/0941-2948/2005/0049.

- 944 Schiller, C., M. Krämer, A. Afchine, N. Spelten, and N. Sitnikov (2008), Ice water content of
- Arctic, midlatitude, and tropical cirrus, J. Geophys. Res., 113, D24208,
- 946 doi:10.1029/2008JD010342
- Schumann, U. (1994), On the effect of emissions from aircraft engines on the state of the
 atmosphere, *Ann. Geophysicae*, *12*, 365-384.
- Schumann, U. (1996), On conditions for contrail formation from aircraft exhausts, *Meteorol*. *Z.*, *5*, 4-23.
- Schumann, U. (2002), Contrail Cirrus, edited by D. K. Lynch, et al., pp. 231-255, Oxford
 Univ. Press, Oxford.
- 953 Schumann, U., K. Graf, and H. Mannstein (2011a), Potential to reduce the climate impact of
- aviation by flight level changes, in *3rd AIAA Atmospheric and Space Environments Conference, AIAA paper 2011-3376*, edited, pp. 1-22, Honolulu, Hawaii.
- 956 Schumann, U., B. Mayer, K. Gierens, S. Unterstrasser, P. Jessberger, A. Petzold, C. Voigt,
- and J.-F. Gayet (2011b), Effective radius of ice particles in cirrus and contrails, *J. Atmos. Sci.*, 68, 300-321, DOI: 10.1175/2010JAS3562.1.
- Schumann, U. (2012), A contrail cirrus prediction model, *Geosci. Model Dev.*, *5*, 543–580,
 doi: 10.5194/gmd-5-543-2012.
- Schumann, U., K. Graf, H. Mannstein, and B. Mayer (2012a), Contrails: Visible aviation
- 962 induced climate impact, in *Atmospheric Physics -- Background Methods Trends*, edited
- by U. Schumann, pp. 239-257, Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg, DOI: 10.1007/978-3-64230183-4_15.
- Schumann, U., B. Mayer, K. Graf, and H. Mannstein (2012b), A parametric radiative forcing
 model for contrail cirrus, *J. Appl. Meteorol. Clim.*, *51*, 1391-1406, doi: 10.1175/JAMC-D11-0242.1.
- Schumann, U., and K. Graf (2013), Aviation-induced cirrus and radiation changes at diurnal
 timescales *J. Geophys. Res.*, *118*, 2404-2421, doi: 10.1002/jgrd.50184.
- 970 Schumann, U., P. Jeßberger, and C. Voigt (2013), Contrail ice particles in aircraft wakes and
- 971 their climatic importance, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 40, 2867-2872 doi: 10.1002/grl.50539.
- 972 Spangenberg, P. Minnis, S. T. Bedka, R. Palikonda, D. P. Duda, and F. G. Rose (2013),
- 973 Contrail radiative forcing over the Northern Hemisphere from 2006 Aqua MODIS data,
- 974 *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 40, 595-600, doi: 10.1002/grl.50168.

- Spichtinger, P., and K. M. Gierens (2009), Modelling of cirrus clouds Part 1a: Model
 description and validation, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, 9, 685–706, doi:10.5194/acp-9-685-2009.
- Stephens, G. L., D. O'Brien, P. J. Webster, P. Pilewski, S. Kato, and J.-l. Li (2015), The
 albedo of Earth, *Rev. Geophys.*, *53*, 141–163, doi:10.1002/2014RG000449.
- 979 Stubenrauch, C. J., W. B. Rossow, S. Kinne, S. Ackerman, G. Cesana, H. Chepfer, L. D.
- 980 Girolamo, B. Getzewich, A. Guignard, A. Heidinger, B. C. Maddux, W. P. Menzel, P.
- 981 Minnis, C. Pearl, S. Platnick, C. Poulsen, J. Riedi, S. Sun-Mack, A. Walther, D. Winker, S.
- 282 Zeng, and G. Zhao (2013), Assessment of global cloud datasets from satellites. , Bull.
- 983 *Amer. Meteorol. Soc.*, *94*, 1031-1049, DOI:10.1175/BAMS-D-12-00117.1.
- 984 Unterstrasser, S., and K. Gierens (2010a), Numerical simulations of contrail-to-cirrus
- 985 transition Part 2: Impact of initial ice crystal number, radiation, stratification, secondary
- nucleation and layer depth, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, *10*, 2037-2051, doi:10.5194/acp-10-2037-
- 987 2010.
- 988 Unterstrasser, S., and K. Gierens (2010b), Numerical simulations of contrail-to-cirrus
- transition Part 1: An extensive parametric study, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, *10*, 2017-2036,
 doi:10.5194/acp-10-2017-2010.
- Unterstrasser, S., I. Sölch, and K. Gierens (2012), Cloud resolving modeling of contrail
 evolution, in *Atmospheric Physics Background Methods Trends*, edited by U.
- 993 Schumann, pp. 543-559, Springer, Heidelberg, doi: 10.11007/978-3-642-30183-4_33.
- ⁹⁹⁴ Unterstrasser, S. (2014), Large eddy simulation study of contrail microphysics and geometry
- during the vortex phase and consequences on contrail-to-cirrus transition, *J. Geophys. Res. Atmos.*, *119*, 7537-7555, doi:10.1002/2013JD021418.
- Unterstrasser, S., and N. Görsch (2014), Aircraft-type dependency of contrail evolution, J.
 Geophys. Res., 119, 14015.
- Vay, S. A., B. E. Anderson, G. W. Sachse, J. E. Collins, J. R. Podolske, C. H. Twohy, B.
 Gandrud, K. R. Chan, S. L. Baughcum, and H. A. Wallio (1998), DC-8-based observations
 of aircraft CO, CH4, N2O, and H2O(g) emission indices during SUCCESS, *Geophys. Res.*
- 1002 *Lett.*, 25, 1717-1720, DOI: 10.1029/98GL00656.
- 1003 Vázquez-Navarro, M., B. Mayer, and H. Mannstein (2013), A fast method for the retrieval of
- integrated longwave and shortwave top-of-atmosphere upwelling irradiances from
- 1005 MSG/SEVIRI (RRUMS), Atmos. Meas. Tech., 6, 2627-2640, doi:10.5194/amt-6-2627-
- 1006 2013.

Vázquez-Navarro, M., H. Mannstein, and S. Kox (2015), Contrail life cycle and properties
from one year of MSG/SEVIRI rapid-scan images, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, 15, 8739-8749,
doi:10.5194/acp-15-8739-2015, 2015..

1010 Voigt, C., U. Schumann, P. Jessberger, T. Jurkat, A. Petzold, J.-F. Gayet, M. Krämer, T.

Thornberry, and D. W. Fahey (2011), Extinction and optical depth of contrails, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, 38, L11806 doi:10.1029/2011GL047189.

- 1013 Voigt, C., A. Minikin, U. Schumann, and ML-CIRRUS_team (2015), ML-CIRRUS the
- 1014 HALO mission on mid latitude cirrus clouds, *Geophysical Research Abstracts*, 17,
- 1015 EGU2015-2758, http://meetingorganizer.copernicus.org/EGU2015/EGU2015-2758.pdf.
- 1016 Wang, M., and J. E. Penner (2010), Cirrus clouds in a global climate model with a statistical
- 1017 cirrus cloud scheme, Atmos. Chem. Phys., 10, 5449-5474, doi:10.5194/acp-10-5449-2010.
- Wilcox, L. J., K. P. Shine, and B. J. Hoskins (2012), Radiative forcing due to aviation water
 vapour emissions, *Atmos. Env.*, *63*, 1-13, doi: 10.1016/j.atmosenv.2012.08.072.
- Wilkerson, J. T., M. Z. Jacobson, A. Malwitz, S. Balasubramanian, R. Wayson, G. Fleming,
 A. D. Naiman, and S. K. Lele (2010), Analysis of emission data from global commercial
 aviation: 2004 and 2006, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, *10*, 6391-6408, doi:10.5194/acp-10-6391-
- 1023 2010.
- Yang, P., G. Hong, A. E. Dessler, S. S. C. Ou, K.-N. Liou, P. Minnis, and Harshvardhan
 (2010), Contrails and induced cirrus optics and radiation, *Bull. Amer. Meteorol. Soc.*, *91*,
 473--478.
- Yi, B., P. Yang, K.-N. Liou, P. Minnis, and J. E. Penner (2012), Simulation of the global
 contrail radiative forcing: A sensitivity analysis, *Geophys. Res. Lett.*, *39*, DOI:
 1029 10.1029/2012GL054042.
- Yun, Y., and J. E. Penner (2012), Global model comparison of heterogeneous ice nucleation
 parameterizations in mixed phase clouds, *J. Geophys. Res.*, *117*, 7203–7203,
- 1032 doi:10.1029/2011JD016506.
- 1033 Yun, Y., J. E. Penner, and O. Popovicheva (2013), The effects of hygroscopicity on ice
- nucleation of fossil fuel combustion aerosols in mixed-phase clouds, *Atmos. Chem. Phys.*, *13*, 4339–4348, doi:10.5194/acp-13-4339-2013.
- Zhang, Y., A. Macke, and F. Albers (1999), Effect of crystal size spectrum and crystal shape
 on stratiform cirrus radiative forcing, *Atmos. Res.*, *52*, 59-75, doi:10.1016/S01698095(99)00026-5.

- 1039 Zhou, C., and J. E. Penner (2014), Aircraft soot indirect effect on large-scale cirrus clouds: Is
- the indirect forcing by aircraft soot positive or negative?, *J. Geophys. Res.*, DOI:
- 1041 10.1002/2014JD021914.

10	42
----	----

1043 Tables

1044

1045Table 1. Schematic run specification

	Run	Coupling method	Emission amounts	Integration period
	0	offline	nominal	30 years
	1	online	nominal	30 years
	2	online	$100 \times increased$	1 year
1046				
1047				
1048				

1051	Table 2. Annual an	d global mean	contrail pr	roperties from	m run 0 and	1 with standard
------	--------------------	---------------	-------------	----------------	-------------	-----------------

1052 deviations σ of interannual fluctuations for run 1 and percentage difference relative to run 0.

	Run 0	Run 1		Rel.
Parameter	Offline	Online	σ	diff/%
Flight fraction with contrail formation	0.158	0.154	0.001	-3
Flight fraction in ice supersaturated air	0.074	0.068	0.001	-8
Number of contrails at a time	2926	2862	53	-2
Relative humidity over ice at contrail formation (%)	119	116	0.5	-4
Contrail optical depth tau in solar range	0.335	0.289	0.002	-14
Cover by contrails with tau>0.1 (%)	0.551	0.505	0.007	-8
Age of contrails (h)	1.9	2.0	0.01	5
Ice crystals in contrails (10^{12} m^{-1})	2.72	2.87	0.02	5
Ice particle number concentration (cm ⁻³)	0.388	0.438	0.003	13
Ice water content (mg m ⁻³)	10.6	7.5	0.05	-29
Effective radius (µm)	45.4	35.1	0.17	-23
Total H ₂ O mass inventory (Tg)	51.4	31.8	0.5	-38
Sedimentation distance in contrails (km)	0.713	0.734	0.008	3
Contrail RFLW in North Atlantic region (NAR) (W m ⁻²)	1.05	0.88	0.06	-16
Contrail radiative forcing, longwave, RFLW (W m ⁻²)	0.171	0.143	0.002	-16
Contrail radiative forcing, shortwave, RFSW (W m ⁻²)	-0.096	-0.080	0.002	-17
Contrail radiative forcing, net, RFSW+RFLW (W m ⁻²)	0.074	0.063	0.001	-14

parameter	mean	median	mean for
			age < 0.5 h
H ₂ O mass emission (kg m ⁻¹)	6.56×10 ⁻³	4.80×10 ⁻³	6.34×10 ⁻³
volume ($m^3 m^{-1}$)	6.62×10 ⁶	2.01×10^{6}	1.15×10 ⁵
air mass (kg m ⁻¹)	2.54×10^{6}	8.02×10 ⁵	4.23×10 ⁴
ice mass (kg m ⁻¹)	4.87×10^{1}	6.08×10^{0}	1.13×10 ⁰
ice particles, $N_{ice} (m^{-1})$	2.89×10 ¹²	2.21×10^{12}	3.99×10 ¹²
width (m)	8.14×10 ³	5.00×10 ³	7.92×10 ²
S=N _{ice} $\pi r_{area}^{2} (m^{2} m^{-1})$	1.11×10 ³	4.80×10^{2}	1.39×10 ²
optical depth (τ) × width (m)	2.25×10 ³	1.06×10^{3}	2.78×10 ²
ratio ice mass/H ₂ O mass emission	1.78×10 ⁶	1.78×10 ³	1.78×10 ²

1054 Table 3. Contrail properties per length unit in run 1.

1057Table 4. Change in contrail properties for 100 times larger fuel consumption

	Run 1	Run 2	Ratio
Parameter	online	100×fuel	runs 2/1
Fuel consumption in contrails (kg/km)	5.33	533	100
Ice crystals (10^{12} m^{-1})	2.87	272	94
Total ice mass inventory (Tg)	31.8	311	9.8
Sedimentation distance (m)	0.734	0.735	1.0
Age (h)	2.00	4.02	2.0
Width (km)	18.1	168	9.3
Effective depth (m)	829	2380	2.9
IWC (mg m^{-3})	7.5	3.1	0.42
Ice particle number concentration (cm ⁻³)	0.438	2.70	6.2
Effective radius (µm)	35.1	13.0	0.37
Ice mass content (kg/m)	138	155	1.1
Ice mass content per H_2O emission (1)	21100	2350	0.11
Contrail net RF (W m ⁻²)	0.063	0.87	13.81
Cover of contrails with τ >0.1 (%)	0.505	3.88	7.68
Optical depth of contrails with $\tau > 0.1$ (1)	0.367	1.375	3.75

Table 5. Annual and global mean CAM results for normal (run 1) and $100 \times \text{fuel}$ (run 2), with standard deviations of interannual variability (σ).

Abbreviation	Parameter	Run 1,		Run 2,		Unit
		mean	±σ	mean	±σ	
FSNT	SW net RF	0.077	0.301	0.272	0.190	W m ⁻²
FLNT	LW net RF	-0.007	0.181	-0.449	0.130	$W m^{-2}$
SWCF	SW cloud forcing	0.076	0.320	0.313	0.204	$W m^{-2}$
LWCF	LW cloud forcing	-0.017	0.132	-0.211	0.094	$W m^{-2}$
FSNTC	SW clear sky forcing	0.002	0.092	-0.042	0.062	W m ⁻²
FLNTC	LW clear sky forcing	0.010	0.112	-0.239	0.081	W m ⁻²
LWP	liquid water path	-0.201	0.778	-0.494	0.526	g m ⁻²
IWP	ice water path	-0.001	0.096	-0.186	0.071	g m ⁻²
WVM	water vapor path	0.011	0.086	-0.040	0.067	kg m ⁻²
CLDHGH	high-level cloud cover	-0.033	0.201	-0.642	0.103	%
CLDMED	mid-level cloud clover	-0.037	0.150	-0.241	0.123	%
CLDLOW	low-level cloud cover	-0.024	0.201	-0.365	0.131	%





1073

1074 Figure 1. Probability density function (pdf) of relative humidity over ice in the freshly

1075 forming contrail segments without (black: reference case, run 0) and with (red: coupled, run

1076 1) humidity exchange.





Figure 2. Pdf of contrail properties from CoCiP-CAM for run 0 (white symbols: reference) and 1 (red symbols: coupled): ice water content IWC (blue: computed from temperature [Schumann, 2002]); ice particle concentration n_{ice}, volume mean particle radius r_{vol}, solar optical depth τ , all in logarithmic scales. Mean, median, and maximum-probability values are listed for run 1.



Figure 3. Pdf of local radiative forcing by contrails in the shortwave (red) and longwave(blue) ranges (top), and net RF (bottom).



Figure 4. Pdf of contrail ages. Symbols for CoCiP runs 0 and 1 (significant below about 8 h
ages), with given mean/median values The straight lines enclose age results for contrails
tracked with the ACTA algorithm in infrared Meteosat data [*Vázquez-Navarro et al.*, 2015].



Figure 5. Ice particle cross section area S per contrail length (unit m^2/m) and its approximated time integral $\int Sdt \cong S t_{age}/2$ (in m s) versus plume age t_{age} (top panel) and versus the

approximating parameter suggested by *Lewellen* [2014] (see text). The line depicts a linear fit.



1106 Figure 6. Contrail occurrence computed with CoCiP-CAM (red upward triangles, run 1) and

analyzed from MODIS-CALIPSO observations (black downward triangles, data from

1108 *Iwabuchi et al.* [2012]), for 180°W – 60°E, 15°N– 85°N. The triangles represent single

1109 contrail events (a small random sub-set of computed contrails is plotted).

1110





1113 Figure 7. Contrail occurrence versus latitude as in Figure 6. Red symbols: CoCiP-CAM;

black: MODIS-CALIPSO data from *Iwabuchi et al.* [2012]. The colored lines are linear fits to

1115 the respective data.



1119 Figure 8. Pdf of solar optical depth of contrails in CoCiP-CAM simulations. Top: run 0,

bottom: run 1. The curves in both panels are the same and are Gamma functions

approximating MODIS-CALIPSO observations in 2007 and 2009 (full and dashed), as

- reported by *Iwabuchi et al.* [2012].
- 1123



1125

Figure 9. Contrail Gaussian plume depth D (black), and effective depth D_{eff} (red) versus

1127 contrail width W from CoCiP/CAM. The crosses show individual contrail results in the

domain as in Figure 6. The black/red curves show power-law regression results, D/km=0.68

1129 $(W/km)^{0.373}$, and $D_{eff}/km = 0.454 (W/km)^{0.420}$. The black dashed curve is the corresponding

1130 regression D/km= 0.29(W/km)^{0.513} as given by *Iwabuchi et al.* [2012].





1134

Figure 10. Diurnal cycle of anomalies of differences between a North Atlantic region and a South Atlantic region for air traffic density (top panel), cirrus cover (middle), and outgoing longwave radiation (bottom), versus universal time of day. The error bars denote the standard deviations of annual means. In the two lower panels, black symbols denote CAM results, red symbols the sum of CAM and CoCiP contributions, and blue symbols results derived from 8

years of satellite (Meteosat second generation, MSG) infrared observations [Graf et al., 2012; Schumann and Graf, 2013].



Figure 11. a) Global map of annual mean cirrus cover (mean 0.40) and b) cover by contrails exceeding an optical depth (at 550 nm) of 0.1 (mean 0.0050).



Figure 12. Global map of annual mean radiative forcing by contrails, a) SW (mean -0.080 W
m⁻²), b) LW (mean 0.143 W m⁻²), in logarithmic color scales.



1157 Figure 13. Zonal and annual mean water emission rates (in units of mass mixing ratio per

time) versus latitude and pressure a) from aircraft engines directly into the free atmosphere
(EA), b) from aircraft engines into contrails (EC), and c) from sublimating contrails into the
atmosphere (CA, negative values mean water deposition on contrail ice), for run 1. Panel d)
shows CA for run 2. Note different scales.





1166Figure 14. Vertical profiles of changes in normalized absolute humidity ($\Delta q/q$) from1167differences between run 1 or 2 and run 0 averaged over 20 (black), 30 (blue), 1 (red) years for

the northern mid latitudes (left) and globally (right). Run 1 uses normal traffic, run 2 uses 100
times increased fuel consumption. In this figure, error bars estimate significance limits from

the root-mean-square variances divided by $\sqrt{(N-2)}$, where N is the number of years available

1171 for averaging.

1172



1175 Figure 15. Annual and global mean shortwave (SW), longwave (LW) and net (SW+LW)

- radiative forcing (RF) from dehydration by contrails, as reflected in CAM by the net top of
- 1177 the atmosphere radiance difference run 1-run 0, versus years.





Figure 16. SW (left panels) and LW (right) RF correlations with liquid and ice water path (LWP, IWP), water vapor path (WVP), and high and low-level cloud cover in annual mean values of the differences of CAM results in run 1 and run 0.



Figure 17. SW and LW RF from humidity redistribution by contrails in CAM for nominal (run 1 - run 0) or 100 times increased air traffic emissions (run 2 - run 0) as a function of global ice mass in contrails. The error bars denote the standard deviations of interannual fluctuations; for run 2 these are computed from 30 years of run 0 and one year of run 2 results. The red/blue lines indicate linear interpolations between zero and SW/LW RF results from run 2.