

Interactive comment on “The stratospheric response to external factors based on MERRA data using linear multivariate linear regression analysis” by M. Kozubek et al.

C. Garfinkel

chaim.garfinkel@mail.huji.ac.il

Received and published: 21 September 2014

I found this paper very interesting, but there are several other papers that should be discussed in the context of the ENSO/EMI results. Here is a list of some of the more salient ones. These studies tended to focus on one particular season (or analyze the response in several calendar month) as opposed to the annual average, and I strongly recommend that the authors perform their analysis for these seasons only and compare the results. In particular, the third one on the list below demonstrates that there is significant sensitivity to the precise parameters used to define the EMI, such that a slightly different EMI definition could lead one to a completely opposite conclusion as

C7301

to the stratospheric response.

Hurwitz, M.M., P.A. Newman, L.D. Oman, and A.M. Molod (2011). Response of the Antarctic stratosphere to two types of El Niño events. *J. Atm. Sci.*, 68, 812-822, doi:10.1175/2011JAS3606.1.

Zubiaurre I., Calvo N. (2011): The ENSO Modoki signal in the stratosphere. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 117, D06109, doi:10.1029/2011JD016690

Garfinkel, C. I., M. M. Hurwitz, D. W. Waugh, A.H. Butler (2012), Are the Teleconnections of Central Pacific and Eastern Pacific El Nino Distinct in Boreal Wintertime?, *Climate Dynamics*, doi:10.1007/s00382-012-1570-2.

Finally, the authors should note the limitations of a linear analysis. Several papers note that the stratospheric response to ENSO and the QBO, to ENSO and the Solar cycle, and to the QBO and the solar cycle, are fundamentally nonlinear. These subtleties will be lost given the authors' methodology. While there is still value in performing and publishing such a linear analysis, care must be taken when interpreting the results. For example, please see

Garfinkel, C.I., and D.L. Hartmann (2007), Effects of the El-Nino Southern Oscillation and the Quasi-Biennial Oscillation on polar temperatures in the stratosphere, *J. Geophys. Res. Atmos.*, 112, D19112, doi:10.1029/2007JD008481.

Calvo N., Marsh D.R. (2011): The combined effects of ENSO and the 11 year solar cycle on the Northern Hemisphere polar stratosphere. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 116, D23112, doi:10.1029/2010JD015226.

Camp, Charles D., and Ka-Kit Tung. "The influence of the solar cycle and QBO on the late-winter stratospheric polar vortex." *Journal of the atmospheric sciences* 64.4 (2007): 1267-1283.