

acp-2013-1025 Submitted on 23 Dec 2013

Comparison of ice particle characteristics simulated by the Community Atmosphere Model (CAM5) with in-situ observations

T. Eidhammer, H. Morrison, A. Bansemer, A. Gettelman, and A. J. Heymsfield

Manuscript Type: Research Article

Handling Editor: Xiaohong Liu, xliu6@uwyo.edu

Response of Reviewer #3 to author's comments:

The authors have generally done an adequate job in responding to my review comments. However, there is one point I would still like to see them address:

1. Page 16, regarding the use of K in equation 11: It is understood that the use of K is "justified" since it is cited in another publication, but that publication does not say anything about how this K value of 0.54 was obtained, but rather cites other articles, and those articles do not explain how this value was derived either. In contrast, Foote and du Toit (1969, JAS) dedicated a large part of a paper explaining how K was ~ 0.4 for raindrops. You would be doing the atmospheric sciences community a favor by acknowledging a lack of literature support for this value of K (unless you can find a reference describing how it was obtained). Otherwise, you will be perpetuating something that has not been verified. You can defend using this value of K based on what you have stated: "Our intent for this publication was also to run the model in the default state ...", but you can also acknowledge the lack of literature support for this value of K.