

Interactive comment on “Characterization of minerals in air dust particles in the state of Tamilnadu, India through ftir spectroscopy” by R. Senthil Kumar and P. Rajkumar

U. Kramar (Referee)

utz.kramar@kit.edu

Received and published: 6 September 2013

Using FTIR for Mineral identification in Air dust is an interesting Approach. Nevertheless the Information about the data Evaluation is missing. It is not clear wether there are use only single lines in the FTIR spectra (poor solution) or if Modell spectra are fitted into the sample spectra by least square fit or better partial least squares.

I doubt that in all presented samples asbestos is present at a Level of approx. 5%. This makes no sense until the possible sources: geology, antropogenic from buildings, car freins which are Asbestos free since at least 15 years. The results have to be

C6583

(self)-critical evaluated. I fear, that the Asbestos values at a Level of 5% can be easily an artefact . No Information about detection limits and reproducibilty (al least between different preparations of the same sample) are given.

Especially the occurence of asbest should be verified e.g. by SEM

Please also note the supplement to this comment:

<http://www.atmos-chem-phys-discuss.net/13/C6583/2013/acpd-13-C6583-2013-supplement.pdf>

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 13, 22221, 2013.