

***Interactive comment on “A new multi-gas constrained model of trace gas non-homogeneous transport in firn: evaluation and behavior at eleven polar sites” by E. Witrant et al.***

**V. Petrenko (Editor)**

vpetrenk@z.rochester.edu

Received and published: 2 November 2011

Dear Dr. Witrant et al.,

Both of the reviewer comments have now been posted. The reviewer's consensus (which I agree with) is that while this paper could be a valuable contribution to firn air modeling, it is unpublishable in its current form and would require major revisions. One of the reviewers also identified several misconceptions and errors in the manuscript.

Both reviewers are experts, and both found the manuscript so unreadable that they essentially gave up after the first half of the paper. If this paper is to be useful to the firn air community, it needs to be accessible to not only the top experts in the field, but

C11272

also to others who may have somewhat more tangential interests in polar firn air work, or those who wish to educate themselves further about firn air modeling.

I look forward to your "Final Response", which should address all of the reviewers' comments. Upon receipt and consideration of the Response, I may request that you submit a revised manuscript, which, in your case, would have to go out for further reviews.

Please note that I will be in the field in Antarctica and completely inaccessible between about Nov 15 and Jan 5.

Regards, Vasili Petrenko Guest Editor, ACP

---

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 11, 23029, 2011.