Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 10, C6949–C6950, 2010 www.atmos-chem-phys-discuss.net/10/C6949/2010/ © Author(s) 2010. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribute 3.0 License.



Interactive comment on "Production, growth and properties of ultrafine atmospheric aerosol particles in an urban environment" *by* I. Salma et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 30 August 2010

The manuscript presents data which can be of great interest in the scientific community. However, the analysis is inconclusive, superficial and partly flawed

The number of observations is statistically significant with respect to 24h periods and variability like the dark and light periods of the day and not with respect to annual seasonality.

There are references to other studies in the text mostly referring to nucleation frequency and growth rates. However, it is better to organize these in tables and also compare number concentration levels for the different modes.

A major problem in the discussion and the conclusions is the fact that the authors list C6949

a number of arguments and reasoning based on meteorological conditions and levels of gaseous precursors without giving quantitative examples or presenting this sort of data from their study.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 10, 13689, 2010.