Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 10, C12776–C12778, 2011
www.atmos-chem-phys-discuss.net/10/C12776/2011/

Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics Discussions

Interactive comment on "Saharan and asian dust: similarities and differences determined by CALIPSO, AERONET and a coupled climate-aerosol microphysical model" *by* L. Su and O. B. Toon

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 25 January 2011

Review of " Saharan and asian dust: similarities and differences determined by CALIPSO, AERONET and a coupled climate-aerosol microphysical model" by L. Su and O. B. Toon

Recommendation: Accepted with stated minor revision

The dust aerosol has important effects on global and regional climate. This manuscript compares the Saharan and Asian dust mass transportation, deposition and dust aerosol optical depth, size distribution and single scattering albedo form a three-

dimensional coupled climate-aerosol microphysical model simulations and AERONET and CALIPSO observations. In general, I found the paper well written and appropriate for ACP audience. I recommend accepted this paper for publication in ACP with addressing those comments listed below:

1. Author should provide a subsection for describing the CALIPSO and Aeronet data. 2. The model simulation results cover the whole year of 2007, so we can see the monthly variations of Saharan and Asian dust transportation and deposition. However there are only one month observation data for optical depth and couple of days for size distribution and single-scattering albedo. Few observation data may not be sufficient to represent Saharan and Asian dust properties, and the author should be careful to draw the conclusions. 3. Author claimed that 'Fig. 17 shows two volume modes, one near 0.5 μm and one near 2 μm radius. The Saharan distribution is unimodal with a peak slightly smaller than 2 μm'. However the figure obviously is not the same as the author described. 4. Some study report that the SSA value of Asian dust are range from 0.73 to 0.85 at 0.5um, which is much smaller than those from Africa dust (Pandithurai et al., 2008, Ge et al., 2010). Author should refer those two results. 1) Ge, J., Su, J., T. P. Ackerman, Fu, Q., Huang, J., and Shi, J.: Dust aerosol optical properties retrieval and radiative forcing over northwestern China during the 2008 China-U.S joint field experiment, J. Geophys. Res., 115, D00K12, doi: 10.1029/1009JD013263, 2010. 2) Pandithurai, G., Dipu S., Dani K. K., Tiwari S., Bisht D. S., Devara P. C. S., and Pinker R. T.: Aerosol radiative forcing during dust events over New Delhi, India.. J. Geophys. Res., 113, D13209, doi: 10.1029/2008JD009804, 2008. 5. The units for y axises in Fig. 16 and 17 are wrong. 6. Page 29513, the first letter of 'asian' in the title should be capital. 7. Page 29532, line 20. 'there as' should be deleted 8. Page 29555. The title of Fig.6 is wrong. 'Modeled monthly dust wet deposition between 10_ S to 40_ N for longitudes between 10_ E to 35_W, 35_W–80_W, and 80_W–125_W for Saharan dust in' should be deleted. 9. Page 29558. The first two sentences in the figure title should be removed or make the figure caption more clear. 10. Page 29559. The first two sentences in the figure title should be removed or make the figure caption more

clear. 11. Page 29566 The first sentence in the title should be removed or make the figure caption more clear.

Interactive comment on Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss., 10, 29513, 2010.