

***Interactive comment on “Investigating the use of  
secondary organic aerosol as seed particles in  
simulation chamber experiments” by  
J. F. Hamilton et al.***

**Anonymous Referee #2**

Received and published: 20 December 2010

General Comments

This paper describes results from a series of simulation chamber experiments to investigate the use of SOA, generated from photo-oxidation of beta-caryophyllene, as seed particles in SOA formation from the photo-oxidation of another precursor (limonene). A range of on-line and off-line techniques have been used to probe the characteristics of the SOA and the results indicate that this may be a useful approach for future studies.

I think the paper could have been improved by performing experiments with inorganic seed particles and also in the absence of seeds, as this would have enabled a more

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



comprehensive evaluation of the approach. Nevertheless, the article is well written and the results are presented in a clear and logical manner. The experimental data are of high quality and the interpretation and discussion of the results is generally appropriate.

I recommend publication following revision of the manuscript in line with the following comments.

### Specific Comments

1. There appear to be some slightly unusual aspects regarding the use of NO<sub>x</sub> in these experiments and clarification is required on a number of issues.

(i) The source of NO<sub>x</sub> should be stated in section 2.2, where only details for NO<sub>2</sub> addition are provided. In classical photo-oxidation experiments, NO<sub>x</sub> is typically added as NO, which becomes partially oxidized to NO<sub>2</sub>, with the result that the NO mixing ratio is several factors larger than that of NO<sub>2</sub>. However, as shown in figure 1, the initial NO<sub>2</sub> levels are higher than those of NO. Was this deliberate or was it due to the method for introducing NO<sub>x</sub>? Some comment is required here.

(ii) For the photo-oxidation of limonene, only NO<sub>2</sub> was added. This resulted in an even larger ratio for NO<sub>2</sub> to NO. Why was NO<sub>2</sub> added instead of NO<sub>x</sub>?

(iii) Figure 1 indicates that the NO mixing ratio appears to increase as the chamber is being flushed, while both NO<sub>2</sub> and O<sub>3</sub> decrease considerably at this time. Is there an explanation for this?

(iv) Why did the authors want to achieve a VOC:NO<sub>x</sub> value of 2?

2. Page 25133, line 19: The composition of beta-caryophyllene SOA is only briefly discussed as it will be reported in more detail in another publication. Nevertheless, the authors should at least refer to the work of Jaoui et al. (2007), which first identified beta-caryophyllinic acid as a photo-oxidation product of beta-caryophyllene. It should also be noted that Li et al. (2010) generated SOA from the ozonolysis of beta-caryophyllene, rather than photo-oxidation.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

3. Page 25135, line 20 and Table 2: The species in limonene SOA are identified from LC-MS data. The results should be compared to those of Jaoui et al. (2006), who determined many compounds in limonene SOA.

#### Minor Comments

1. Page 25119, line 7: Sulfate is the spelling recommended by IUPAC.
2. Page 25120, line 7: Chamber instead of chambers
3. Page 25123, line 14: ...was generated from the photo-oxidation of beta-caryophyllene...
4. Page 25124, line 11: Maybe change title to Gas Phase Measurements?
5. Page 25127, line 8: How did the authors know that 10-20 mg of a filter was being cut?
6. Page 25129, line 16: ...the mass concentration...
7. Page 25131, line 14: ...a series of experiments was carried out...
8. Page 25131, line 22: increases instead of increase
9. Page 25132, line 22: ppbV instead of ppb

#### References

Jaoui, M, Corse, E., Kleindienst, T. E., Offenberg, J. H., Lewandowski, M., Edney, E. O.: Analysis of secondary organic aerosol compounds from the photooxidation of d-limonene in the presence of NO<sub>x</sub> and their detection in ambient PM<sub>2.5</sub>, Environ. Sci. Technol., 40, 3819-3828, 2006.

Jaoui, M, Lewandowski, M., Kleindienst, T. E., Offenberg, J. H., Edney, E. O.: Beta-caryophyllenic acid: An atmospheric tracer for beta-caryophyllene secondary organic aerosol, Geophys. Res. Lett., 34, L05816, doi:10.1029/2006GL028827.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)[Printer-friendly Version](#)[Interactive Discussion](#)[Discussion Paper](#)

Li, Y. J., Chen, Q., Guzman, M. I., Chan, C. K., and Martin, S. T.: Second-generation products of beta-caryophyllene ozonolysis are the dominant contributors to particle mass concentration, *Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss.*, 10, 17699–17726, doi:10.5194/acpd-10-17699-2010, 2010.

---

Interactive comment on *Atmos. Chem. Phys. Discuss.*, 10, 25117, 2010.

ACPD

10, C11300–C11303,  
2010

---

Interactive  
Comment

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

C11303

